

Palgrave Studies in the History of Social
Movements

Series Editors
Stefan Berger
Institute for Social Movements
Ruhr University Bochum
Bochum, Germany

Holger Nehring
Contemporary European History
University of Stirling
Stirling, UK

Around the world, social movements have become legitimate, yet contested, actors in local, national and global politics and civil society, yet we still know relatively little about their longer histories and the trajectories of their development. This series seeks to promote innovative historical research on the history of social movements in the modern period since around 1750. We bring together conceptually-informed studies that analyse labour movements, new social movements and other forms of protest from early modernity to the present.

We conceive of ‘social movements’ in the broadest possible sense, encompassing social formations that lie between formal organisations and mere protest events. We also offer a home for studies that systematically explore the political, social, economic and cultural conditions in which social movements can emerge. We are especially interested in transnational and global perspectives on the history of social movements, and in studies that engage critically and creatively with political, social and sociological theories in order to make historically grounded arguments about social movements. This new series seeks to offer innovative historical work on social movements, while also helping to historicise the concept of ‘social movement’. It hopes to revitalise the conversation between historians and historical sociologists in analysing what Charles Tilly has called the ‘dynamics of contention’.

More information about this series at
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14580>

Claas Kirchhelle

Bearing Witness

Ruth Harrison and British Farm Animal
Welfare (1920–2000)

palgrave
macmillan

Claas Kirchhelle
University College Dublin
Dublin, Ireland



ISSN 2634-6559 ISSN 2634-6567 (electronic)
Palgrave Studies in the History of Social Movements
ISBN 978-3-030-62791-1 ISBN 978-3-030-62792-8 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-62792-8>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2021. This book is an open access publication.

Open Access This book is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this book are included in the book's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the book's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Sidney Wheeler / Stockimo / Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Für Clara

SERIES EDITORS' PREFACE

Around the world, social movements have become legitimate, yet contested, actors in local, national, and global politics and civil society, yet we still know relatively little about their longer histories and the trajectories of their development. Our series reacts to what can be described as a recent boom in the history of social movements. We can observe a development from the crisis of labour history in the 1980s to the boom in research on social movements in the 2000s. The rise of historical interests in the development of civil society and the role of strong civil societies as well as non-governmental organisations in stabilising democratically constituted polities has strengthened the interest in social movements as a constituent element of civil societies.

In different parts of the world, social movements continue to have a strong influence on contemporary politics. In Latin America, trade unions, labour parties, and various left-of-centre civil society organisations have succeeded in supporting left-of-centre governments. In Europe, peace movements, ecological movements, and alliances intent on campaigning against poverty and racial discrimination and discrimination on the basis of gender and sexual orientation have been able to set important political agendas for decades. In other parts of the world, including Africa, India, and South East Asia, social movements have played a significant role in various forms of community building and community politics. The contemporary political relevance of social movements has undoubtedly contributed to a growing historical interest in the topic.

Contemporary historians are not only beginning to historicise these relatively recent political developments; they are also trying to relate them to a longer history of social movements, including traditional labour organisations, such as working-class parties and trade unions. In the *longue durée*, we recognise that social movements are by no means a recent phenomenon and are not even an exclusively modern phenomenon, although we realise that the onset of modernity emanating from Europe and North America across the wider world from the eighteenth century onwards marks an important departure point for the development of civil societies and social movements.

In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries the dominance of national history over all other forms of history writing led to a thorough nationalisation of the historical sciences. Hence social movements have been examined traditionally within the framework of the nation state. Only during the last two decades have historians begun to question the validity of such methodological nationalism and to explore the development of social movements in comparative, connective, and transnational perspective taking into account processes of transfer, reception, and adaptation. Whilst our book series does not preclude work that is still being carried out within national frameworks (for, clearly, there is a place for such studies, given the historical importance of the nation state in history), it hopes to encourage comparative and transnational histories on social movements.

At the same time as historians have begun to research the history of those movements, a range of social theorists, from Jürgen Habermas to Pierre Bourdieu and from Slavoj Žižek to Alain Badiou as well as Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe to Miguel Abensour, to name but a few, have attempted to provide philosophical-cum-theoretical frameworks in which to place and contextualise the development of social movements. History has arguably been the most empirical of all the social and human sciences, but it will be necessary for historians to explore further to what extent these social theories can be helpful in guiding and framing the empirical work of the historian in making sense of the historical development of social movements. Hence the current series is also hoping to make a contribution to the ongoing dialogue between social theory and the history of social movements.

This series seeks to promote innovative historical research on the history of social movements in the modern period since around 1750. We bring together conceptually informed studies that analyse labour

movements, new social movements, and other forms of protest from early modernity to the present. With this series, we seek to revive, within the context of historiographical developments since the 1970s, a conversation between historians on the one hand and sociologists, anthropologists, and political scientists on the other.

Unlike most of the concepts and theories developed by social scientists, we do not see social movements as directly linked, a priori, to processes of social and cultural change and therefore do not adhere to a view that distinguishes between old (labour) and new (middle-class) social movements. Instead, we want to establish the concept 'social movement' as a heuristic device that allows historians of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries to investigate social and political protests in novel settings. Our aim is to historicise notions of social and political activism in order to highlight different notions of political and social protest on both left and right.

Hence, we conceive of 'social movements' in the broadest possible sense, encompassing social formations that lie between formal organisations and mere protest events. But we also include processes of social and cultural change more generally in our understanding of social movements: this goes back to nineteenth-century understandings of 'social movement' as processes of social and cultural change more generally. We also offer a home for studies that systematically explore the political, social, economic, and cultural conditions in which social movements can emerge. We are especially interested in transnational and global perspectives on the history of social movements and in studies that engage critically and creatively with political, social, and sociological theories in order to make historically grounded arguments about social movements. In short, this series seeks to offer innovative historical work on social movements, while also helping to historicise the concept of 'social movement.' It also hopes to revitalise the conversation between historians and historical sociologists in analysing what Charles Tilly has called the 'dynamics of contention.'

Claas Kirchhelle's *Bearing Witness: Ruth Harrison and British Farm Animal Welfare (1920–2000)* is an extremely readable and fascinating account of one of the most well-known animal rights' activists in Britain in the twentieth century who has been, at the same time, strangely neglected to date by academic research. She has been an inspiration to generations of other activists and the opposition to 'factory farming'—her concept—would be unthinkable without her path-breaking work. Born into a family of Edwardian radicals practicing vegetarianism, pacifism, feminism, and

socialism, Harrison was a life-long reformist campaigner for animal rights believing in the power of social movements to achieve change for the better in democratically constituted societies.

Kirchhelle's book is outstanding not only in tracing Harrison's biography, uncovering a wealth of new material from archives and through interviewing a range of fellow activists and others who had an intimate knowledge of Harrison's life and work. The author is also adept at relating the animal rights activism of Harrison and her associates with wider ethical and social concerns that were prominently discussed in twentieth-century Britain, such as wider environmental concerns and questions surrounding animal-human relationships.

Harrison is perhaps best known for her work *Animal Machines* that she published in 1964. It catapulted her to international fame and put her centre-stage in the civic activism surrounding animal rights' issues. Among all the social movements that have been studied in the twentieth century it would be fair to say that so far the animal rights' movement has not been the most prominent. Hence the book is also a call on social movement researchers to look more closely at a movement that has exceptional contemporary relevance but also deep historical roots.

Kirchhelle demonstrates how Harrison's activism was built around the twin pillars of moral improvement and welfare. The way in which humans treated animals was immoral and against the welfare of animals, but it also denigrated the humanity of humans who allowed such treatment of animals to be legal. Using animals for scientific research, for example, could only be justified when animals were treated humanely, because science itself had to be oriented towards humanism. Intensive food production could not be justified, if it was unethical. The Brambell Committee on Animal Welfare and its 1965 report built on the insights in Harrison's 1964 bestseller and was to have a major impact on future discussions about animal welfare in Britain.

What emerges as remarkable about Harrison is her ability to move between different generations and also to be active at one and the same time in establishment and anti-establishment circles. Her own self-styling as a 'lone wolf' allowed this precarious existence between camps usually seen as being at loggerheads with each other.

From the 1970s onwards the setting of welfare standards for animals became the most contested site for welfare activism and Kirchhelle traces the role of Harrison as a key figure mediating between scientists,

legislators, and protesters. Working on various British and European welfare committees, Harrison campaigned actively to see several of her demands that she had made in her 1964 book, fulfilled, for example, the abolition of veal crates. She often took a middling position between the more radical demands of those seeing in the treatment of animals by humans nothing but 'speciest exploitation' and those who argued that there was a decisive difference between humans and animals but that it was incumbent on humans for religious and moral reasons to treat animals well. Overall Kirchhelle has provided us with an extremely insightful history of a key British animal rights' campaigner of the twentieth century whose actions and publications had a global ring and whose life hopefully will inspire others to take up the theme of social movements working on behalf of animal rights.

Bochum, Germany
Stirling, Scotland

Stefan Berger
Holger Nehring

TIMELINE

Ca. 1892	Birth Clara Birnberg
1893	Birth Samuel ('Simy') Weinstein
1910–1912	Birnberg attends Slade School of Art
1911	Samuel Weinstein joins Young Socialists Britain introduces Protection of Animals Act
1915	Isaac Rosenberg enlists and paints Clara Birnberg (<i>Girl in a Red Dress</i>)
1916	Samuel Weinstein, John Rodker, and Jonas Birnberg object to conscription. Weinstein and Rodker are imprisoned as conscientious objectors
Post-1918	The Weinsteins anglicise their names to Clare and Stephen Winsten
1920	Birth Ruth Harrison (<i>née Winsten</i>) in London
1926	Foundation UFAW
1939	Ruth Harrison enrolls in Bedford College, London University Evacuation to Cambridge, where Ruth Harrison joins the Society of Friends and likely meets W.H. Thorpe
1940	The Winstens move to Ayot St Lawrence and become neighbours of George Bernard Shaw
1943–1945	Ruth Harrison works for the Friends' Ambulance Unit (FAU) as a nurse in Whitechapel, Lichfield, and Islington
1945–1946	Harrison aids Friends' Ambulance Unit relief efforts in the Ruhr area and Schleswig-Holstein (Germany)
1946–1948	Harrison enrolls in the Royal Academy of Dramatic Art (RADA)
1949	Niko Tinbergen moves from Leiden to Oxford
1951	Festival of Britain

- 1954 Marriage to Dexter ('Dex') Harrison
Rationing lifted in Britain
- 1957 Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament (CND) formed
- 1959 3Rs published by Russell and Burch
- Ca. 1960 Crusade Against All Cruelty to Animals pushes leaflet under Ruth Harrison's door
- 1960 John Dugdale introduces Animals (control of intensified methods of food production) Bill
- 1961 Ruth Harrison begins work on *Animal Machines*
Protests against 'field sports' at RSPCA meeting
- 1962 US publication of *Silent Spring* (UK publication 1963)
Ruth Harrison contacts Rachel Carson in November
- 1963 Rachel Carson agrees to write foreword for *Animal Machines* in May
The Observer agrees to publish articles on 'factory farming'
Hunt Saboteurs Association formed
- 1964 Publication of *Observer* articles and *Animal Machines* in March
MAFF decides to establish committee to review "intensive husbandry methods" in late March
Death of Rachel Carson in April
- 1964–1965 Brambell Committee reviews intensive farming
- 1965 Brambell Report is published in December with annexe on four freedoms by W.H. Thorpe
- 1966 MAFF announces decision to enact a new welfare bill and establish FAWAC
- 1967 Establishment of FAWAC; Ruth Harrison is appointed
Ruth Harrison registers Ruth Harrison Welfare Trust (soon renamed into Ruth Harrison Research Trust)
MAFF announces outline of Agriculture (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill
- 1968 First meeting of Ruth Harrison Research Trust
FAWAC submits welfare code proposals to MAFF
- 1969 Ruth Harrison is appointed to RSPCA council in April
Welfare codes are resubmitted to FAWAC
Ruth Harrison leaks BFSS letter to the League Against Cruel Sports
- 1970 RSPCA Reform Group founded and members elected to RSPCA Council
Richard Ryder coins 'speciesism'
- 1971 Publication of UK's first voluntary welfare codes

- Publication of *Animals Men and Morals* by members of the Oxford Group; contains a contribution by Ruth Harrison
- 1972 First Meeting RSPCA Farm Animal Livestock Committee
RSPCA advisory expert committees on animal experimentation is founded
West German Protection of Animals Act
- 1973 Election of Reform Group members to RSPCA Council
Ruth Harrison loses libel suit against Nadia Nerina in May and is ordered to pay £30,000
Nobel Prize in Physiology or Medicine for Tinbergen, Lorenz, and Frisch (ethology)
First RSPCA conference on animal experimentation
Arson attack on Hoechst Pharmaceuticals in Milton Keynes by the Band of Mercy (predecessor ALF)
- 1974 Partial enactment of FAWAC ban recommendations on the docking of cattle, the winging of and surgical castration of poultry
Ruth Harrison Research Trust renamed into FACT
- 1974–1975 Reforms of RSPCA structure
- 1975 Personal bankruptcy of Ruth Harrison in April
Publication of Peter Singer's *Animal Liberation*
- 1976 RSPCA votes to oppose hunting with hounds and refocuses campaigning to include farm animals
Britain ratifies the European Convention for the Protection of Animals Kept for Farming Purposes
- 1977 FACT begins to support strawyard experiments by John Webster
RSPCA Animal Rights Conference at Trinity College, Cambridge
- 1977–1979 Richard Ryder RSPCA Council chairmanship
- 1979 Foundation of FAWC; Ruth Harrison is appointed
- 1980 Foundation Eurogroup for Animals
- 1980s Ruth Harrison attends European meetings of T-AP
- 1984 FAWC publishes 117 recommendations for animal welfare
- 1986 British ban of individually penned calf crates
Ruth Harrison awarded an OBE
- 1987 Death Dexter Harrison
- 1988 Significant increase of FACT funding
- 1989 Death of Clare Winsten
- 1990 Veal crate ban is enacted
- 1991 Harrison retires from FAWC
Death Stephen Winsten
- 1994 Launch RSPCA Freedom Foods

- Ca. 1996 Cancer diagnosis Ruth Harrison
- 1999 Sow and tether stalls are banned in Britain
Announcement of battery cage ban by 2012
Ruth Harrison resigns FACT chairmanship in September
- 2000 Death Ruth Harrison in June
November FACT Memorial Meeting at University of Westminster
(200 letters of support and government, NGO, and press attendees)
- 2013 “Rachel Carson & Ruth Harrison: 50 Years on Conference” at
Oxford University—launch of second edition of *Animal Machines*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Six years ago, I became interested in the life and work of Ruth Harrison while conducting my doctoral research on antibiotics. Although many authors have acknowledged the importance of *Animal Machines*, I was intrigued by the fact that none had focused on the wider life and work of its author and was surprised by how much there was to discover. What started as a side-enquiry into Harrison's life quickly turned into a full-blown book project on Harrison and the fascinating world she inhabited.

Many people have helped 'grow' this project. Prof. Mark Harrison patiently allowed me to become distracted by Ruth Harrison for prolonged periods of my PhD and read several drafts of the book. Dr Thomas Le Roux, Dr John Clark, Dr Robert Kirk, and Dr Roderick Bailey provided valuable comments and encouragement during the early stages of the project. Oxford University's 2013 conference on Rachel Carson and Ruth Harrison allowed me to establish contacts to people who knew Ruth Harrison. Dr Frank Uekötter encouraged me to continue looking for publishers, and a 2019 workshop by the Animal Research Nexus inspired me to integrate an analysis of the wider world of welfare research. The resulting manuscript has been immeasurably improved thanks to generous comments by Dr Dmitriy Myelnikov, Prof. Henry Buller, Prof. Donald Broom, and Dr Ashley Maher. My reviewers deserve double praise for their invaluable feedback and for rigorously reviewing a book amidst a global pandemic. All remaining mistakes are my own.

I am also grateful to the many organisations and individuals who granted me access to the written material and memories that lie at the heart of this study. The Whitechapel Gallery provided me access to Clare

Winsten's autobiography. Prof. Marian Stamp Dawkins agreed to be interviewed for this project, granted access to FACT's files, established contact with other FACT Trustees, and read drafts of this project. Prof. Donald Broom also agreed to be interviewed and allowed me to usurp his group's common room to pore over FACT's archives. Dr Ruth Layton provided valuable details about Ruth Harrison's later campaigning as well as Harrison's own copy of *Animal Machines*. I owe a special debt of gratitude to Phil Browning and the RSPCA for allowing me to access their archives—not once but twice because of a broken camera. I am also grateful to Prof. Peter Singer, Dr Richard Ryder, and Jonathan Harrison for answering queries about Ruth Harrison. The British Library provided access to Richard Ryder's papers, Yale's Beinecke Library to Ruth Harrison's correspondence with Rachel Carson, and the Library of the Society of Friends (London) to Harrison's Friends Ambulance Unit records, Cambridge University Library to William Homan Thorpe's papers, and the British National Archives to MAFF files on *Animal Machines*, the Brambell Committee, and FAWAC/FAWC. My research was financed by the Wellcome Trust and supported by the Oxford Martin School.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their inexhaustible love and support. Charlotte, Clara, and Emil are more important to my research than they will ever appreciate. Countless dinner discussions with my wider family about animal welfare, consumer values, and expensive toys for pigs were also never far from my mind.

ABSTRACT

Bearing Witness is the biography of one of Britain's foremost animal welfare campaigners and of the world of activism, science, and politics she inhabited. In 1964, Ruth Harrison's bestseller *Animal Machines* triggered a gear change in modern animal protection by popularising the term 'factory farming' alongside a new way of thinking about animal welfare. Here, historian Claas Kirchhelle explores Harrison's *avant-garde* upbringing, Quakerism, and how animal welfare debates were linked to concerns about the wider ethical and environmental trajectories of post-war Britain. Breaking the myth of Harrison as a one-hit wonder, Kirchhelle reconstructs Harrison's 46 years of campaigning and the rapid transformation of welfare politics and science during this time. Exacerbated by Harrison's own actions, the decades after 1964 saw a polarisation of animal politics, a professionalisation of British activism, and the rise of a new animal welfare science. Harrison's belief in incremental reform allowed her to form ties to leading scientists but alienated her from more radical campaigners. Many of her 1964 demands gradually became part of mainstream politics. However, farm animal welfare's increasing marketisation has also led to a relative divorce from the wider agenda of social improvement that Harrison once bore witness to.

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
Part I	Radical Roots (1920–1961)	19
2	Meet the Winstens: A ‘Downstart’ Anglo-Jewish family	21
3	Becoming an Activist: Ruth Harrison’s Turn to Animal Welfare	35
Part II	Synthesis: The Post-war Landscape of Welfare Science and Activism (1945–1964)	49
4	Between Physiology and Psychology—Ethology and Animal Feelings	51
5	Ideals and Intensification: Welfare Campaigns in a Nation of Animal Lovers	65

6	Staging Welfare: Writing <i>Animal Machines</i>	79
Part III	Impact (1964–1968)	93
7	From Author to Adviser: Ruth Harrison and the <i>Animal Machines</i> Moment	95
Part IV	Defining Welfare (1967–1979)	125
8	A “minority of one”: Harrison and the FAWAC	127
9	Ruth the Ruthless: Activism, Welfare, and Generational Change	149
10	Slippery FACTs: The Rise of a “mandated” Animal Welfare Science	175
Part V	From Éclat to Consensus (1979–2000)	203
11	From Protest to ‘Holy Writ’: The Mainstreaming of Welfare Politics	205
12	Non-conform Evidence: The Impasse of 1990s Welfare Research	223
13	Conclusion	239
	Bibliography	249
	Index	267

ABBREVIATIONS

ALF	Animal Liberation Front
BF	British Farmer
BFSS	British Field Sports Society
BVA	British Veterinary Association
CND	Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament
DB	Donald Broom Ruth Harrison Papers
EEC	European Economic Community
FACT	Farm Animal Care Trust
FAWAC	Farm Animal Welfare Advisory Committee
FAWC	Farm Animal Welfare Council
FW	Farmers Weekly
HSTA	Bayerisches Hauptstaatsarchiv [<i>Bavarian Main State Archive</i>]
LACS	League Against Cruel Sports
LSF	Library of the Society of Friends (London)
MAFF	Ministry of Agriculture Fisheries and Farms
MD	Marian Dawkins Ruth Harrison Papers
NFU	National Farmers' Union of England and Wales
OBE	Order of the British Empire
RADA	Royal Academy of Dramatic Art
RCVS	Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons
RSPCA	Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals
RVC	Royal Veterinary College
SVS	State Veterinary Service
T-AP	Standing Committee of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals Kept for Farming Purposes
TNA	The British National Archives

UFAW	Universities Federation for Animal Welfare
WFPA	World Federation for the Protection of Animals
WSPA	World Society for the Protection of Animals
YBL	Yale Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library

LIST OF IMAGES

Image 2.1	Clare Winsten, Portrait by Isaac Rosenberg, oil on canvas 1916 (image courtesy of UCL Art Gallery and Bridgeman Images)	24
Image 2.2	Winsten Family Portrait of Clare, Theodora, Ruth, and Stephen, Photograph ca. 1922 (image courtesy of Jonathan Harrison)	30
Image 2.3	George Bernard Shaw by Clare Winsten, pencil on paper laid on board, 1949, NPG 6891 (image courtesy of National Portrait Gallery)	33
Image 3.1	Picture in Friends' Ambulance Unit Card Register (image courtesy of Friends' Library, London)	39
Image 3.2	Ruth Winsten Personnel File (image courtesy of Friends' Library, London)	40
Image 3.3	Theodora and Stephen Winsten, George Bernard Shaw, Ruth Winsten, Devdas Gandhi (son of Mohandas Gandhi) and Clare Winsten at Ayot St. Lawrence (ca. 1949) (image courtesy of Jonathan Harrison)	43
Image 3.4	Dex Harrison's pleasure gardens at the 1951 Festival of Britain (image courtesy of Jonathan Harrison)	44
Image 3.5	Leaflet by the Crusade Against All Cruelty To Animals pushed through Harrison's letterbox around 1960 (image courtesy of Marlene Halverson)	47
Image 6.1	Cover of <i>Animal Machines</i> (Ruth Harrison's personal copy) (image courtesy of Ruth Layton)	82
Image 6.2	<i>Animal Machines</i> image of a veal calf looking out of its crate with the neighbouring crate shut (image courtesy of Jonathan Harrison)	83

Image 11.1	Ruth Harrison and Klaus Vestergaard observe a sow at the Swedish Pig Park in 1988 (image courtesy of Bo Algers)	216
Image 11.2	Ruth Harrison at a Danish mink farm in 1997 (image courtesy of Marlene Halverson)	221