

KANT'S PRACTICAL PHILOSOPHY RECONSIDERED

128

YIRMIYAHU YOVEL
(editor)

KANT'S
PRACTICAL PHILOSOPHY
RECONSIDERED

*Papers presented at the
Seventh Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter, December 1986*

Directors: P. Dibon (Paris) and R. Popkin (Washington University, St. Louis)

Editorial Board: J.F. Battail (Paris); F. Duchesneau (Montreal); A. Gabbey (Belfast); T. Gregory (Rome); S. Hutton (Hatfield Polytechnic); J.D. North (Groningen); M.J. Petry (Rotterdam); J. Popkin (Lexington)

Advisory Editorial Board: J. Aubin (Paris); P. Costabel (Paris); A. Crombie (Oxford); H. de la Fontaine Verwey (Amsterdam); H. Gadamer (Heidelberg); H. Gouhier (Paris); K. Hanada (Hokkaido University); W. Kirsop (Melbourne); P.O. Kristeller (Columbia University); Elisabeth Labrousse (Paris); A. Lossky (Los Angeles); J. Malarczyk (Lublin); E. de Olaso (C.I.F. Buenos Aires); J. Orcibal (Paris); Wolfgang Rödel (München); J. Roger (Paris); G. Rousseau (Los Angeles); H. Rowen (Rutgers University, N.J.); J.P. Schobinger (Zürich); J. Tans (Groningen)

KANT'S
PRACTICAL PHILOSOPHY
RECONSIDERED

*Papers presented at the Seventh
Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter, December 1986*

edited by

YIRMIYAHU YOVEL

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem



SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, B.V.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter (7th : 1986)

Kant's practical philosophy reconsidered : papers presented at the Seventh Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter, December 1986 / edited by Yirmiyahu Yovel.

p. cm. -- (Archives internationales d'histoire des idées ; 128)

Includes bibliographies and index.

ISBN 978-90-481-4054-1 ISBN 978-94-017-2016-8 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-2016-8

1. Kant, Immanuel, 1724-1804--Contributions in ethics--Congresses.
2. Ethics, Modern--18th century--Congresses. I. Yovel, Yirmiyahu.
II. Title. III. Series.

B2799.E8J47 1986

170'.92--dc20

89-15449

ISBN 978-90-481-4054-1

printed on acid free paper

Prepared in cooperation with
Ms Eva Shorr, Managing Editor
The S.H. Bergman Center for Philosophical Studies
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Typeset by Studio 'Efrat', Jerusalem, Israel.

All Rights Reserved

© 1989 by Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 1989

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>ix</i>

I: Fundamentals of Moral Action

Henry E. Allison:	Empirical and Intelligible Character in the <i>Critique of Pure Reason</i>	1
Christine M. Korsgaard:	Morality as Freedom	23
Nathan Rotenstreich:	On the Formalism of Kant's Ethics	49
Onora S. O'Neill:	Agency and Anthropology in Kant's <i>Groundwork</i>	63
Amihud Gilead:	The Submission of our Sensuous Nature to the Moral Law in the Second <i>Critique</i>	83

II: Moral Practice and Knowledge

Gerold Prauss:	Theory as Practice in Kant	93
Carl J. Posy:	Autonomy, Omniscience and the Ethical Imagination: From Theoretical to Practical Philosophy in Kant	106
Yirmiyahu Yovel:	The Interests of Reason: From Metaphysics to Moral History	135

III: From Morality to Justice and History

Otfried Höffe:	Kant's Principle of Justice as Categorical Imperative of Law	149
Alexis Philonenko:	Histoire et Guerre chez Kant	168
Megumi Sakabe:	Freedom as a Regulative Principle: On Some Aspects of the Kant-Herder Controversy on the Philosophy of History	183

IV: *Kant in Contemporary Contexts*

David Heyd:	How Kantian is Rawls's "Kantian Constructivism"?	196
Adi Ophir:	The Ideal Speech Situation: Neo-Kantian Ethics in Habermas and Apel	213
Victor J. Seidler:	Kant: Respect, Individuality and Dependence	235
<i>Index</i>		255

Preface

That Kant's ideas remain vitally present in ethical thinking today is as impossible to deny as it is to overlook their less persisting aspects and sometimes outdated idiom. The essays in this volume attempt to reassess some crucial questions in Kant's practical philosophy both by sketching the lines for new systematic interpretations and by examining how Kantian themes apply to contemporary moral concerns.

In the previous decade, when Kant was primarily read as an answer to utilitarianism, emphasis was mainly laid on the *fundamentals* of his moral theory, stressing such concepts as universalization, duty for its own sake, personal autonomy, unconditional imperatives or humanity as end-in-itself, using the *Groundwork* and its broader (if less popular) systematic parallel, the Analytic of the *Critique of Practical Reason*, as main sources. In recent years, however, emphasis has shifted and become diversified. The present essays reflect this diversification in discussing the extension of Kantian ethics in the domains of law, justice, politics and moral history, and also in considering such meta-philosophical questions as the relation between the various "interests of reason" (as Kant calls them), above all between knowledge and moral practice.

The papers were first presented at the Seventh Jerusalem Philosophical Encounter, held at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem in December 1986. The *Jerusalem Philosophical Encounters* are a series of bi-annual international symposia, in which philosophers of different backgrounds meet in Jerusalem to discuss a common issue. Organized by the S.H. Bergman Center for Philosophical Studies of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, the series of Encounters have so far produced the following books: *Philosophy of History and Action*, ed. Y. Yovel (Reidel, 1978); *Meaning and Use*, ed. A. Margalit (Reidel, 1979); *Spinoza — His Thought and Work*, ed. N. Rotenstreich (The Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities, 1983); *The Philosophy of Franz Rosenzweig*, ed. P. Mendes-Flohr (University Press of New England, 1988); *Nietzsche as Affirmative Thinker*, ed. Y. Yovel (Nijhoff, 1985); *Maimonides and Philosophy* (Nijhoff, 1986).

The Encounter owes much of its success to Mr Zev Birger, the Managing Director of the Jerusalem Convention Center and his staff, especially Linda Futterman. I am, as always, grateful to Eva Shorr, Managing Editor of the Hebrew Philosophical Quarterly *Iyyun*, for her meticulous care in preparing

the manuscript and her tactful prodding of authors and editor to meet, or approach, the set deadlines. I cordially acknowledge the cooperation of Dr. Alexander Schimmelpenninck, Head of the Humanities and Social Sciences Division at Kluwer, and a philosopher himself, with whom I have already published two former Jerusalem Encounters (on Nietzsche and on Maimonides). Thanks are also due to my colleagues on the Board of the S.H. Bergman Center at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Professor Zvi R.J. Werblowski (Chair) and Father Marcel Dubois, for their counsel and support in making this series possible.

Yirmiyahu Yovel

*The S.H. Bergman Center for Philosophical Studies
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

List of Abbreviations

Citations from Kant's writings are identified by an abbreviated form or acronym of their German title. The Arabic numerals refer to the volume and pagination of the Akademie edition of Kant's *Gesammelte Schriften* (GS) (Berlin, 1902-) and to their English translation, separated by a slash; e. g., Rel. 6: 179/167.

Abbreviations used in citing particular works of Kant are as follows:

- A/B — *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, quoted by the pagination of the first (A) and the second (B) original editions.
Critique of Pure Reason, tr. N. Kemp Smith (London: Macmillan, 1963). Also referred to as the first *Critique*.
- Anth.— *Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht*, GS 7.
Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View, tr. M. J. Gregor (The Hague: Nijhoff, 1974)
- G — *Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten*, GS 4.
Foundations of the Metaphysics of Morals, tr. L.W. Beck (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1956).
Groundwork of the Metaphysic of Morals, in *The Moral Law*, tr. H. J. Paton (London: Hutchinson, 1953).
- I — *Idee zu einer allgemeinen Geschichte in weltbürgerlicher Absicht*, GS 8.
Idea for a Universal History from a Cosmopolitan Point of View, tr. L. W. Beck, in *Kant on History* (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1963).
- KpV — *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft*, GS 5.
Critique of Practical Reason, tr. L. W. Beck (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1956). Also referred to as the second *Critique*.
- KU — *Kritik der Urteilskraft*, GS 5.
Critique of Judgement, tr. J. C. Meredith (Oxford: Clarendon, 1952). Also referred to as the third *Critique*.
- MN — *Metaphysische Anfangsgründe der Naturwissenschaft*, GS 4.
Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science, tr. J. Ellington (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1970).
- MS — *Metaphysik der Sitten*, GS 6.
The General Introduction to the Metaphysics of Morals, tr. J. Elling-

x *List of Abbreviations*

- ton, in *Kant: Ethical Philosophy* (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1983).
- RL I. *Rechtslehre*
Metaphysical Elements of Justice, tr. (in parts) J. Ladd (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1965).
- TL II. *Tugendlehre*
The Doctrine of Virtue (DV), tr. M.J. Gregor (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964).
The Metaphysical Principles of Virtue (MP), tr. J. Ellington, in *Kant: Ethical Philosophy*.
- Mut. — *Mutmasslicher Anfang der Menschengeschichte*, GS 8.
Conjectural Beginning of Human History, tr. E.L. Fackenheim, in *Kant on History*.
- Prol. — *Prolegomena zu einer jeden künftigen Metaphysik*, GS 4.
Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics, tr. L.W. Beck (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1950).
- Rei. — *Die Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der blossen Vernunft*, GS 6.
Religion within the Limits of Reason Alone, tr. T.M. Greene and H.H. Hudson (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1960).
- Rez. — Recensionen von I.G. Herders *Ideen zur Philosophie der Geschichte der Menschheit*, Theil 1. 2., GS 8.
Reviews of Herder's *Ideas for a Philosophy of the History of Mankind*, tr. R.E. Anchor, in *Kant on History*.
- ZeF — *Zum ewigen Frieden*, GS 8.
Perpetual Peace, tr. L.W. Beck, in *Kant on History*.
- TP — *Über den Gemeinspruch: Das mag in der Theorie richtig sein, taugt aber nicht für die Praxis*, GS 8.
“On the Common Saying: This May be True in Theory, But it Does not Apply in Practice,” in *Kant's Political Writings*, ed. H. Reiss, tr. H.B. Nisbet (Cambridge University Press, 1970).
- UG — *Über den Gebrauch teleologischer Principien in der Philosophie*, GS 8.
- WiA — *Beantwortung der Frage: Was ist Aufklärung?* GS 8.
“An Answer to the Question: What is Enlightenment?” in *Kant's Political Writings*.