

# ONE HUNDRED YEARS OF PHENOMENOLOGY

DAN ZAHAVI AND FREDERIK STJERNFELT (EDS.)

ONE HUNDRED YEARS OF PHENOMENOLOGY  
*Husserl's Logical Investigations Revisited*

Editorial Board:

Director: R. Bernet (Husserl-Archief, Leuven) Secretary: J. Taminiaux (Centre d'études phénoménologiques, Louvain-la-Neuve) Members: S. Jsseling (Husserl-Archief, Leuven), H. Leonardy (Centre d'études phénoménologiques, Louvain-la-Neuve), U. Melle (Husserl-Archief, Leuven), B. Stevens (Centre d'études phénoménologiques, Louvain-la-Neuve)

Advisory Board:

R. Bernasconi (Memphis State University), D. Carr (Emory University, Atlanta), E.S. Casey (State University of New York at Stony Brook), R. Cobb-Stevens (Boston College), J.F. Courtine (Archives-Husserl, Paris), F. Dastur (Université de Nice), K. Düsing (Husserl-Archiv, Köln), J. Hart (Indiana University, Bloomington), K. Held (Bergische Universität Wuppertal), D. Janicaud (Université de Nice), K.E. Kaehler (Husserl-Archiv, Köln), D. Lohmar (Husserl-Archiv, Köln), W.R. McKenna (Miami University, Oxford, USA), J.N. Mohanty (Temple University, Philadelphia), E.W. Orth (Universität Trier), P. Ricœur (Paris), K. Schuhmann (University of Utrecht), C. Sini (Università degli Studi di Milano), R. Sokolowski (Catholic University of America, Washington D.C.), B. Waldenfels (Ruhr-Universität, Bochum)

# ONE HUNDRED YEARS OF PHENOMENOLOGY

Husserl's *Logical Investigations* Revisited

*edited by*

DAN ZAHAVI

*University of Copenhagen*

and

FREDERIK STJERNFELT

*University of Copenhagen*



SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, B.V.

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-90-481-6056-3      ISBN 978-94-017-0093-1 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-0093-1

---

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved

© 2002 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 2002

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

In meinen LU habe ich uralte ungefügtes Gestein der Erkenntnislehre wie mit Dynamitpatronen zersprengt. Es gibt viel rohes Geschiebe u. Gerölle, aber Mancherlei ist an den Tag getreten, was verborgen war, an Problem[en] u. Ergebnissen.

Letter from Husserl to William  
Ernest Hocking, September 7,  
1903

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	9
ABBREVIATIONS	11
PREFACE	15
PART I. PROBLEMS OF LOGIC	
Rudolf Bernet: Different Concepts of Logic and Their Relation to Subjectivity	19
John J. Drummond: The <i>Logical Investigations</i> : Paving the Way to a Transcendental Logic	31
Jocelyn Benoist: Non-Objectifying Acts	41
David Woodruff Smith: What is “Logical” in Husserl’s <i>Logical Investigations</i> ? The Copenhagen Interpretation	51
PART II. REALISM AND IDEALISM	
Dallas Willard: The World Well Won: Husserl’s Epistemic Realism One Hundred Years Later	69
Richard Cobb-Stevens: “Aristotelian” Themes in Husserl’s <i>Logical Investigations</i>	79
Dan Zahavi: Metaphysical Neutrality in <i>Logical Investigations</i>	93
PART III. CATEGORIAL INTUITION	
Ullrich Melle: Husserl’s Revision of the Sixth Logical Investigation	111
Dieter Lohmar: Husserl’s Concept of Categorical Intuition	125
Frederik Stjernfelt: Categories, Diagrams, Schemata: The Cognitive Grasping of Ideal Objects in Husserl and Peirce	147
PART IV. SEMIOTICS, ALTERITY, COGNITIVE SCIENCE	
Robert Sokolowski: Semiotics in Husserl’s <i>Logical Investigations</i>	171
Bertrand Bouckaert: The Puzzling Case of Alterity in Husserl’s <i>Logical Investigations</i>	185
Dieter Munch: The Relation of Husserl’s <i>Logical Investigations</i> to Descriptive Psychology and Cognitive Science	199
APPENDIX	
Dorion Cairns: The First Motivation of Transcendental Epoché	219
INDEX	233

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Most of the articles collected in this volume stem from a conference on Husserl's *Logical Investigations* which was held at the University of Copenhagen in May 2000. The organization of the conference would not have been possible without the generous support from a number of individuals and institutions. For financial support we wish to thank the Danish Research Council for the Humanities, the Carlsberg Foundation, the French Embassy in Copenhagen, the Goethe Institute in Copenhagen, and last but not least the University of Copenhagen (Department of Comparative Literature, Department of Education, Philosophy, and Rhetoric, and the Faculty of the Humanities). Eva Hjelm was of invaluable assistance in the preparation and holding of the conference. We are also indebted to Gerol Petruzella and Berit Brogaard for their help with the proofreading of the manuscript. Finally, it was as always a pleasure cooperating with Maja de Keijzer from Kluwer Academic Publishers.

## ABBREVIATIONS

References to the writings of Husserl have often been included in the text according to the following abbreviations.

### The Husserliana edition

- Hua I            *Cartesianische Meditationen und Pariser Vorträge*, edited by S. Strasser (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1950, rpt. 1973).
- Hua II            *Die Idee der Phänomenologie. Fünf Vorlesungen*, edited by W. Biemel (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1950, rpt. 1973).
- Hua III/1-2      *Ideen zu einer reinen Phänomenologie und phänomenologischen Philosophie. Erstes Buch. Allgemeine Einführung in die reine Phänomenologie*, edited by K. Schuhmann (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1976).
- Hua IV            *Ideen zu einer reinen Phänomenologie und phänomenologischen Philosophie. Zweites Buch. Phänomenologische Untersuchungen zur Konstitution*, edited by M. Biemel (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1952).
- Hua V            *Ideen zu einer reinen Phänomenologie und phänomenologischen Philosophie. Drittes Buch: Die Phänomenologie und die Fundamente der Wissenschaften*, edited by M. Biemel (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1952, rpt. 1971).
- Hua VI            *Die Krisis der europäischen Wissenschaften und die transzendente Phänomenologie. Eine Einleitung in die phänomenologische Philosophie*, edited by W. Biemel (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1954, rpt. 1962).
- Hua VII           *Erste Philosophie (1923/24). Erster Teil. Kritische Ideengeschichte*, edited by R. Boehm (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1956).
- Hua VIII          *Erste Philosophie (1923/24). Zweiter Teil. Theorie der phänomenologischen Reduktion*, edited by R. Boehm (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1959).
- Hua IX            *Phänomenologische Psychologie. Vorlesungen Sommersemester 1925*, edited by W. Biemel (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1962).
- Hua X            *Zur Phänomenologie des inneren Zeitbewusstseins (1893–1917)*, edited by R. Boehm (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1966).
- Hua XI            *Analysen zur passiven Synthesis. Aus Vorlesungs- und Forschungsmanuskripten 1918–1926*, edited by M. Fleischer (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1966).
- Hua XII           *Philosophie der Arithmetik*, edited by L. Eley (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1970).
- Hua XIII          *Zur Phänomenologie der Intersubjektivität. Texte aus dem Nachlass. Erster Teil: 1905–1920*, edited by I. Kern (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1973).



- Hua XIV *Zur Phänomenologie der Intersubjektivität. Texte aus dem Nachlass. Zweiter Teil: 1921–1928*, edited by I. Kern (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1973).
- Hua XV *Zur Phänomenologie der Intersubjektivität. Texte aus dem Nachlass. Dritter Teil: 1929–1935*, edited by I. Kern (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1973).
- Hua XVI *Ding und Raum. Vorlesungen 1907*, edited by U. Claesges (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1973).
- Hua XVII *Formale und transzendente Logik. Versuch einer Kritik der logischen Vernunft*, edited by P. Janssen (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1974).
- Hua XVIII *Logische Untersuchungen. Erster Band. Prolegomena zur reinen Logik*, edited by E. Holenstein (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1975).
- Hua XIX/1-2 *Logische Untersuchungen. Zweiter Band. Untersuchungen zur Phänomenologie und Theorie der Erkenntnis*, edited by U. Panzer (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1984).
- Hua XXI *Studien zur Arithmetik und Geometrie*, edited by I. Strohmeier (Den Haag, Martinus Nijhoff, 1983).
- Hua XXII *Aufsätze und Rezensionen (1890–1910)*, edited by B. Rang (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1979).
- Hua XXIII *Phantasie, Bildbewußtsein, Erinnerung*, edited by E. Marbach (Den Haag: Martinus Nijhoff, 1980).
- Hua XXIV *Einleitung in die Logik und Erkenntnistheorie. Vorlesungen 1906/07*, edited by U. Melle (Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff, 1984).
- Hua XXV *Aufsätze und Vorträge (1911–1921)*, edited by T. Nenon and H. R. Sepp (Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff, 1987).
- Hua XXVI *Vorlesungen über Bedeutungslehre. Sommersemester 1908*, edited by U. Panzer (Dordrecht: Martinus Nijhoff, 1987).
- Hua XXVII *Aufsätze und Vorträge (1922–1937)*, edited by T. Nenon and H. R. Sepp (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1989).
- Hua XXVIII *Vorlesungen über Ethik und Wertlehre (1908–1914)*, edited by U. Melle (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1988).
- Hua XXIX *Die Krisis der europäischen Wissenschaften und die transzendente Phänomenologie. Ergänzungsband. Texte aus dem Nachlass 1934–1937*, edited by R. N. Smid (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1993).
- Hua XXX *Logik und allgemeine Wissenschaftstheorie*, edited by U. Panzer (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1996).
- Hua XXXI *Aktive Synthesen: Aus der Vorlesung 'Transzendente Logik' 1920–21. Ergänzungsband zu 'Analysen zur passiven Synthesis'*, edited by R. Breuer (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2000).
- Hua XXXII *Natur und Geist. Vorlesungen Sommersemester 1927*, edited by M. Weiler (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001).

- Hua XXXIII *Die 'Bernauer Manuskripte' über das Zeitbewußtsein 1917/18*, edited by R. Bernet and D. Lohmar (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001).
- LI *Logical Investigations*, translated by J. N. Findlay (London and Henley: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970).
- Hua Dok III *Briefwechsel. Husserliana Dokumente III/1-10*, edited by K. Schuhmann and E. Schuhmann (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1994).
- EU *Erfahrung und Urteil*, edited by L. Landgrebe (Hamburg: Felix Meiner, 1985).

## PREFACE

Husserl regarded *Logical Investigations* (1900-1901) as his 'breakthrough' to phenomenology, and it stands out not only as one of Husserl's most important works, but also as a key text in 20. Century philosophy. The work had a tremendous influence on the subsequent development of phenomenology, and it also left its mark on disciplines such as linguistics, comparative literature, psychology, cognitive science, and mathematics. By predating the split between 'analytical philosophy' and 'continental philosophy', *Logical Investigations* remains of particular interest to those concerned with the possibility of a rapprochement between the two traditions.

One of the most striking features of *Logical Investigations* is its incredible richness. It is a work that is literally brimming over with new, fresh, and in many cases, revolutionary ideas. Not only does it contain Husserl's first treatment of a whole range of phenomenological key-concepts, it also contains some quite devastating criticisms of a number of traditional views. The following are some of the most important analyses found in the *Logical Investigations*:

- A refutation of psychologism
- A defence of the irreducibility of ideality
- A sketch of a general 'theory of theories'
- An outline of the process of eidetic variation
- A presentation of the program of descriptive phenomenology
- A rejection of the mental-image theory of meaning
- A criticism of nominalism and empiricist theories of abstraction
- The outline of a general mereology
- A new interpretation of the synthetic a priori
- The distinction between material (or regional) and formal ontology
- A theory of pure grammar
- The introduction of the concept of foundation
- A revolutionary theory of intentionality
- A criticism of representationalism
- A distinction and analysis of different modes of givenness
- An introduction and analysis of notions like 'adumbrational givenness' and 'bodily presence'
- A description of the process of constitution
- An introduction of the concept of categorial intuition
- A theory of truth and justification based on the notion of intentional fulfilment and evidence
- A distinction between synthetic and ideative acts

After its publication, *Logical Investigations* quickly gained in reputation, and received positive reviews and mention by thinkers such as Mach, Schuppe, Natorp, Stumpf, Dilthey, Wundt, and Lipps. As to its *Wirkungsgeschichte*, its most obvious impact was of course to be found in the subsequent development of phenomenology, be it in the

“eidetic” and “realistic” phenomenology of the Münchener phenomenologists and of Husserl’s Göttingen students (Lipps, Daubert, Reinach, Geiger, Stein etc.), or in Husserl’s own development of a transcendental phenomenology. But even for post-Husserlian phenomenologists *Logical Investigations* remained a work of crucial inspiration and importance, as is testified by, e.g., Heidegger’s *Prolegomena zur Geschichte des Zeitbegriffs* (1925) and his *Zur Sache des Denkens* (1969), Sartre’s *La transcendance de l’ego* (1936), and Derrida’s *La voix et le phénomène* (1967). This in some sense ‘official’ line of influence leading from the fountain of the *Logical Investigations* to the many later works of Husserl, to the works of his personal students, and to the works of the post-Husserlian phenomenologists is relatively well known and well documented, but in fact the influence of *Logical Investigations* reaches much further. Another legacy is to be found in linguistics, primarily via Roman Jakobson who very early on read Gustav Spet’s Russian translation of the *Logical Investigations*. Even though Jakobson did not himself conceal this inspiration, for a long time it passed largely unnoticed that the very founder of linguistic structuralism imported crucial parts of his conceptual apparatus from the *Logical Investigations*, especially from the First, Third, and Fourth Investigations. Jakobson used, among other things, the idea of foundation in his phonology (the “distinctive feature” as a moment of the phoneme). From Jakobson, this inspiration passed—often unnoticed or via inscrutable connections—into mainstream linguistics and semiotics; thus it is striking to see Husserl’s three basic dependency relations between parts surface in exactly identical form in Louis Hjelmslev’s *Prolegomena* of 1943. The Third and Fourth Investigations also inspired and influenced the Polish logicians—in particular Lesniewski’s idea of a formal mereology, which was initially formed in order to dismantle Russell’s paradox, and Ajdukiewicz’s idea of categorial grammar, defining word classes by dependency relations. Through Roman Ingarden (*Das literarische Kunstwerk* from 1931), the idea of describing the structure of the intentional act by means of a series of interrelated moments proved highly influential in phenomenological theory of literature and, later on, in reader-oriented criticism (Jauss, Iser, Eco). The same parts of the work also influenced Gestalt psychology through the main philosophical figure in the Berlin School, Max Wertheimer. As for the flourishing Cognitive Science such debts are all over the places, though often tacitly present in second or third hand forms.

There is plenty of reason to immerse oneself in a close reading of the *Logical Investigations*. This volume celebrates and commemorates its centenary by subjecting the work to a comprehensive critical analysis. It contains new contributions by leading scholars addressing some of the most central analyses to be found in the *Logical Investigations*.