AUTONOMY, AUTHORITY AND MORAL RESPONSIBILITY

Law and Philosophy Library

VOLUME 33

Managing Editors

FRANCISCO J. LAPORTA, *Department of Law,
Autonomous University of Madrid, Spain*

ALEKSANDER PECZENIK, *Department of Law, University of Lund, Sweden*

FREDERICK SCHAUER, *John F. Kennedy School of Government,
Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., U.S.A.*

Former Managing Editors

AULIS AARNIO, MICHAEL D. BAYLES[†], CONRAD D. JOHNSON[†], ALAN MABE

Editorial Advisory Board

AULIS AARNIO, *Research Institute for Social Sciences,
University of Tampere, Finland*

ZENON BANKOWSKY, *Centre for Criminology and the Social and Philosophical
Study of Law, University of Edinburgh*

PAOLO COMANDUCCI, *University of Genua, Italy*

ERNESTO GARZÓN VALDÉS, *Institut für Politikwissenschaft,
Johannes Gutenberg Universität Mainz*

JOHN KLEINIG, *Department of Law, Police Science and Criminal
Justice Administration, John Jay College of Criminal Justice,
City University of New York*

NEIL MacCORMICK, *Centre for Criminology and the Social and
Philosophical Study of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Edinburgh*

WOJCIECH SADURSKI, *Faculty of Law, University of Sydney*

ROBERT S. SUMMERS, *School of Law, Cornell University*

CARL WELLMAN, *Department of Philosophy, Washington University*

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

THOMAS MAY
*Clinical Ethics Center,
Memorial Medical Center
and
Department of Medical Humanities,
Southern Illinois University,
School of Medicine,
Springfield, Illinois, U.S.A.*

AUTONOMY, AUTHORITY AND MORAL RESPONSIBILITY

SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA. B.V.

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-90-481-4949-0 ISBN 978-94-015-9030-3 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-015-9030-3

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved

©1998 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 1998

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1998

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project evolved over a number of years. It began while studying philosophy at Bowling Green State University, and continued through a year at the University of Minnesota, to my present position as Director of the Clinical Ethics Center, Memorial Medical Center and Southern Illinois University, School of Medicine.

I owe thanks to a number of people who read and discussed portions of this work at various stages. These include Antony Flew, John Gray, Joseph Raz, Michael Bradie, Paul Tudico, and Jim Spence. Special thanks are due to Mark Aulisio, James Child, Christopher Morris and Loren Lomasky for reading through several drafts.

My greatest debt of gratitude, however, must go to two people who helped see the project through both intellectually and emotionally. The first is Jana Craig, who tolerated a constant mess as research gathered and drafts were discarded. Without Jana's emotional support, this book could not have been completed. The second, and by far the largest debt of gratitude, must go out to Ray Frey, who as my Ph.D. supervisor saw the early stages of the work through the revisions done long after I left Bowling Green. More than this, however, Ray taught me to do philosophy, never pushing my ideas in any direction but allowing me to develop a position which at times he disagrees with. In this, Ray taught me to judge the merit of philosophical work through the strength of the arguments, rather than the conclusion reached.

I would also like to acknowledge the following journals, where some of the material in this book has appeared:

- 1.) A version of Chapter Three appeared under the title "The Concept of Autonomy", American Philosophical Quarterly, vol.31, no.2 (April, 1994).
- 2.) Portions of Chapter Seven appeared under the title "On Raz and the Obligation to Obey the Law", Law and Philosophy, vol.16 (January, 1997).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
PART ONE: AUTONOMY	9
CHAPTER ONE: THE IMPORTANCE OF AUTONOMY	11
Autonomy as a Presupposition of Rules	17
The Presupposition of Self-Control in the Law	20
The Relationship Between Autonomy and Rules	23
Self-Control and Threats to Responsibility	25
CHAPTER TWO: THE CONCEPT OF AUTONOMY	33
Autonomy as Autarkeia	38
Autarkeia in Aristotle	38
Autarkeia in Kant	40
The Inadequacy of Autarkeia for Practical Autonomy	47
Autonomy as Self-Rule	48
CHAPTER THREE: DEVELOPING THE HELMSMAN METAPHOR	55
Identifying Helmsmanship	62
Compulsion	64
Coercion	66
The Sensible Man	68
An Adequate Range of Options	71
Conclusion	72
CHAPTER FOUR: ADDRESSING KANT'S CONCERNS	75
Desires and Motivation	78
Freedom of Will vs. Freedom of Action	80
Motivation vs. Causation	83
Akrasia	85
Summary of "Part One: Autonomy"	94

PART TWO: AUTHORITY	97
Introduction to Part Two	99
 CHAPTER FIVE: AUTONOMY AND NORMATIVE	
OBLIGATION	107
Practical Reason and Obligation	113
The Concept of Second-Order Reasons	115
A Second Concept of Second-Order Reasons	117
The Importance of the Distinction	119
Normative Principles	121
 CHAPTER SIX: AUTHORITY AND OBLIGATION	125
I. The Nature of Authority	127
Varieties of Authoritative Directives	130
The Simple Requirement of Action	130
Sophisticated Directives	133
Conditional Directives	133
The Exclusion of Behavior Theory	134
II. Reconciling Autonomy and Authority	136
Voluntary Slavery	137
The Dependence Thesis	139
The Dependence Thesis Revised	141
The Limits of Authority	144
 CHAPTER SEVEN: AUTONOMY AND THE AUTHORITY	
OF LAW	149
On the Obligation to Obey the Law	155
Arguments Against An Obligation to Obey the Law	158
The Debate in Context	163
A Two-Level Model of the Obligation to Obey the Law	165
The Revised Dependence Thesis and the Law	168
Toward a Prima Facie Obligation to Obey the Law	171
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	175