The Politics of Nuclear Power

A History of the Shoreham Nuclear Power Plant

Technology, Risk, and Society

An International Series in Risk Analysis

VOLUME 5

Editors

Vincent T. Covello, *Columbia University, New York, USA*

Jeryl Mumpower, *State University of New York, Albany, USA*

Stuart F. Spicker, *School of Medicine, University of Connecticut Health Center, Farmington, USA*

Pieter-Jan M. Stallen, *Institute for Environment and System Analysis, Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

International Advisory Board

Berndt Brehmer, *Psykologiska Institutionen, Uppsala Universitet, Sweden*

Timothy O'Riordan, *School of Environmental Studies, University of East Anglia, UK*

Henrique Machado-Jorge, *S. and T. Resources Survey and Analysis Service, JNICT, Lisboa, Portugal*

Giancarlo Pinchera, *ENEA-Direzioni Centrale Studi, Roma, Italy*

Saburo Ikeda, *Institute of Socio-Economic Planning, University of Tsukuba, Japan*

Francis Fagnani, *Centre d'Etude sur l'Evaluation de la Protection dans le Domaine Nucléaire (CEPN), Fontenay-aux-Roses, France*

Ian Burton, *Institute for Environmental Studies, University of Toronto, Canada*

B. Bowonder, *Center for Energy, Environment, and Technology, Administrative Staff College of India, Hyderabad, India*

Howard Kunreuther, *Department of Decision Sciences, The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA*

Robert Kates, *World Hunger Program, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA*

Ortwin Renn, *Center for Technology, Environment and Development, Clark University, Worcester, Massachusetts, USA*

Herbert Paschen, *Abteilung für Angewandte Systemanalyse, Gesellschaft für Kernforschung GmbH, Karlsruhe, FRG*

Kristin Shrader-Frechette, *Department of Philosophy, University of South Florida, Tampa, USA*

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The Politics of Nuclear Power

A History of the Shoreham Nuclear Power Plant

By

David P. McCaffrey

*Department of Public Administration and Policy,
and Organizational Studies Program,
University at Albany,
State University of New York, U.S.A.*

SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, B.V.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

McCaffrey, David P., 1930-

The politics of nuclear power : a history of the Shoreham Nuclear Power Plant / by David P. McCaffrey.

p. cm. -- (Technology, risk, and society ; v. 5)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-94-010-5471-3

1. Shoreham Nuclear Powerplant (N.Y.)--History. 2. Nuclear power plants--Government policy--United States--History. 3. Nuclear industry--Government policy--United States--History. 4. Electric utilities--Government policy--United States--History. 5. Energy policy--United States--History. I. Title. II. Series.

HD9698.U54S546 1990

333.792'4'0974727--dc20

90-19154

ISBN 978-94-010-5471-3

ISBN 978-94-011-3332-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-011-3332-6

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved

© 1991 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 1991

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION	1
Technological Factors: Discoveries, Uncertainties, and Limits on Safety Strategies	4
Discoveries and Uncertainties	4
Limits on Safety Strategies	4
Economic Factors: Shifting Electricity Demand and Financing Problems	6
Shifting Electricity Demand	6
Financing Problems	8
Managerial Factors	9
Political Attitudes	16
Differences in Scientific and Broader Public Attitudes	17
The Decline in Public Support for Nuclear Power	20
Summary and Outline of the Book	21
2. SHOREHAM'S BEGINNINGS	25
The Early Development of Nuclear Power	25
Early Federal Support for Nuclear Power	25
Developmental Problems	27
Liabilities from Nuclear Accidents	27
Economic Problems	28
The Surge in Orders	29
The Decision to Build Shoreham	33
Basic Design of the Plant	34
Key Early Decisions	35
LILCO's Selection of a Reactor and Containment System	36
The Decision to Use Stone and Webster as Construction Manager and Architect/Engineer	37
The Decision to Increase Shoreham's Generating Capacity	41
Summary	44

Appendix to Chapter 2	45
3. THE EARLY POLITICS OF SHOREHAM	47
The Contrasting Reactions to Shoreham and Lloyd Harbor	47
The Purpose of AEC/NRC Hearings	49
The Licensing Process	50
Shoreham's Hearings	53
Two Views of the Hearings	56
Appendix to Chapter 3	59
4. SHOREHAM'S CONSTRUCTION	62
The Review of Construction	62
Oversight by LILCO's Board of Directors and Others	63
LILCO's Management of the Regulatory System	66
New Piping Standards	67
Pipe Break Outside Containment	68
The Pressure Suppression Issue	69
The Size of the Reactor Building	70
LILCO's Relations with the NRC	71
The Failure of Engineering to Support Construction	72
The Decision to Suspend Engineering	73
The Dispersion of the Stone and Webster Site Team	75
The Effects of the Engineering Lag: Two Examples	76
Metal Embedments	76
Field-Generated Engineering Changes	77
LILCO's Relationship with Stone and Webster	78
Labor Productivity	80
The Failure of the Diesel Generators	82
Disallowance of Costs	83
Appendix to Chapter 4	86
5. THE EMERGENCY PLANNING CONTROVERSY	95
The Strengthening of Planning Requirements	95
The County's Split with LILCO	99
Early Cooperation	99
The County's Withdrawal from Planning	102
The Marburger Panel	106
The Issue of Plant Safety	109
Radiation Risk	109
The Likelihood of Major Radiation Release	110
Panel's Conclusions Regarding Low-Level Radiation	110

Panel's Conclusions Regarding LILCO's Ability to Manage the Plant Safely	112
Panel's Conclusions Regarding Construction Quality	113
The Issue of Shoreham's Economic Value	116
The Issue of State Intervention in Emergency Planning	117
Impact of the Fact-Finding Panel	120
LILCO's Tax Maneuver and Cohalan's Switch	123
The Federal Test of Emergency Planning	126
The Federal Response to State and Local Opposition	129
Appendix to Chapter 5	136
 6. TAKEOVER, SETTLEMENT, OR SHOREHAM?	 142
The Establishment of the Long Island Power Authority	143
Takeover or Negotiated Settlement?	147
Negotiations	149
The Settlement	154
Projected Costs of the Settlement and Alternatives	156
Appendix to Chapter 6	163
 7. THE POLITICS OF SETTLING SHOREHAM	 167
The Reactions to the Settlement	167
LILCO's Progress in Licensing Shoreham	169
Legislative Action on the Settlement	172
The RICO Suit	176
The Initial Verdict and Attempts to Settle the Suit	176
Judge Weinstein's Dismissal of the RICO Case	179
The Revised Shoreham Settlement	183
The Federal Government's Opposition to the Settlement	187
The Administration's Opposition to the Settlement	188
The Congressional Reaction to the Settlement	189
The Economic Evaluation of the Settlement	191
Planning Horizon and Financing	192
Planning Horizon	192
Financing	192
Reliability	194
Maintenance, Oil, and Other Costs	196
Operating and Maintenance Cost	197
Future Price of Oil	197
Cost of Settlement's Conservation Programs	198
Book Life of Investments and Decommissioning	199
The Revised Comparison of the Settlement and Shoreham	200

The Denouement at Shoreham	202
Conclusion	205
Appendix to Chapter 7	208
8. CONCLUSION	214
LILCO'S Problems and Changes	214
LILCO Managed Its Way into Much of the Crisis	215
Electricity Demand Softened as Shoreham	
Neared Completion	217
LILCO's High Electricity Rates Damaged Its	
Credibility	217
The Movement to Eliminate LILCO	220
LILCO's Organizational Performance Improved in the	
Mid-1980s	221
State and Local Opposition	224
Policy, Personal Stakes, and Decision Momentum	225
REFERENCES	228
APPENDIX: CHRONOLOGY OF SIGNIFICANT EVENTS IN THE SHOREHAM PROJECT	234
Index	255