

## REFERENCE TO ABSTRACT OBJECTS IN DISCOURSE

# Studies in Linguistics and Philosophy

---

Volume 50

---

## *Managing Editors*

GENNARO CHIERCHIA, *University of Milan*  
PAULINE JACOBSON, *Brown University*  
FRANCIS J. PELLETIER, *University of Alberta*

## *Editorial Board*

JOHAN VAN BENTHEM, *University of Amsterdam*  
GREGORY N. CARLSON, *University of Rochester*  
DAVID DOWTY, *Ohio State University, Columbus*  
GERALD GAZDAR, *University of Sussex, Brighton*  
IRENE HEIM, *MIT, Cambridge*  
EWAN KLEIN, *University of Edinburgh*  
BILL LADUSAW, *University of California at Santa Cruz*  
TERRENCE PARSONS, *University of California, Irvine*

*The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.*

# REFERENCE TO ABSTRACT OBJECTS IN DISCOURSE

*by*

NICHOLAS ASHER

*Department of Philosophy and  
Center for Cognitive Science,  
The University of Texas at Austin, U.S.A.*



SPRINGER-SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, B.V.

## Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Asher, Nicholas.

Reference to abstract objects in discourse / by Nicholas Asher.  
p. cm. -- (Studies in linguistics and philosophy ; v. 50)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-94-010-4751-7 ISBN 978-94-011-1715-9 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-011-1715-9

1. Anaphora (Linguistics) 2. Discourse analysis. 3. Grammar,  
Comparative and general--Nominals. 4. Semantics. 5. Abstraction.  
I. Title. II. Series.

P299.A5A8 1993

415--dc20

93-14793

ISBN 978-94-010-4751-7

---

*Printed on acid-free paper*

**All Rights Reserved**

©1993 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 1993

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1993

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	ix
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1 -- FROM EVENTS TO PROPOSITIONS: A TOUR OF ABSTRACT ENTITIES, EVENTUALITIES AND THE NOMINALS THAT DENOTE THEM	15
1. Distributional Data and the Typology of Abstract Entities	18
1.1 Events and Propositions: The Poles of the Spectrum	18
1.2 States and Other Sorts of Eventualities	23
1.3 Situations	24
1.4 Divisions Among Proposition-like Entities	26
2. Quantification, Abstract Object Anaphora and the Typology of Abstract Objects	32
2.1 Quantification	32
2.2 Anaphora	34
3. Principles of Summation and Structured Domains for Abstract Entities	40
3.1 Events	41
3.2 Propositions	48
3.3 States	51
3.4 Facts	55
4. Provisional Conclusions	57
CHAPTER 2 -- A CRASH COURSE IN DRT	63
1. A Philosophical Overview of the Aims of Discourse Representation Theory	63
2. The Basic Fragment	66
2.1 DRSs and Truth Conditions	66
2.2 The Basic Construction Procedure	69
2.3 DRS Construction, Multiple Sentence Discourse, and Intersentential Anaphora	73
2.4 Every and if...then	74
2.5 SubDRSs, Accessibility, and Anaphora	75
2.6 Scopes for Quantifiers in DRT and Other Constraints on Anaphora	79
2.7 Other Determiners and Operators in the Basic Fragment	81
2.8 External Anchors and Definites	82
3. Expanding the Fragment: Events in DRT	85
4. Plurals in DRT	91

4.1	DRS Construction for Plurals and Basic Plural Anaphora	91
4.2	Plural Anaphora	92
5.	Appendix: Formalization of DRS Construction and DRS Interpretation	95
5.1	Definition of DRSs	95
5.2	Model Theory	96
5.3	The Construction Procedure and its Semantics	98
CHAPTER 3 -- ATTITUDES AND ATTITUDE DESCRIPTIONS		111
1.	Attitudes and Attitude Formation	111
2.	Attitudes, Operators, and Predicates	115
3.	Interpreting Attitude Ascriptions	118
4.	Concepts and Attitudes	122
5.	Attitudes, Propositions, and Representations	128
6.	Conclusions	135
CHAPTER 4 -- THE SEMANTIC REPRESENTATION FOR SENTENTIAL NOMINALS		138
1.	Syntactic and Semantic Assumptions and Basic Principles	141
1.1	Assumptions about Syntax and the Syntax-Semantics Interface	141
1.2	Additional Semantic Principles and the Effects of the DP Analysis on DRS Construction	144
2.	Derived Nominals	149
2.1	The Distinction between Process and Result Nominals	150
2.2	Process Nominals	152
2.3	Result Nominals	157
2.4	Propositional and Fact Readings of Derived Nominals	159
2.5	Remarks on Property Derived Nominals	162
3.	<i>Of-ing</i> Gerund Phrases and Bare Nominals	163
3.1	Analysis of <i>of-ing</i> Gerund Phrases	163
3.2	The Aspectual Force of <i>-ing</i> in <i>Of-ing</i> Gerunds	167
3.3	Bare Gerunds and Nominals	168
4.	<i>That</i> Clauses	171
4.1	<i>That</i> Clauses Differ from DPs	171
4.2	N'-CP Constructions	172
4.3	<i>That</i> Clause Constructions, Factive Presuppositions, and Individual Anaphora	178
5.	More Abstract Nominals: Infinitivals and Projective Propositions	180
5.1	Analysis of Infinitivals	180
5.2	Chierchia's Analysis of Infinitivals	184
CHAPTER 5 -- PROBLEMS FOR THE SEMANTICS OF NOMINALS		190
1.	IP Gerunds and Some Data About Them	190
2.	The Syntactic and Semantic Analysis of IP Gerunds	193
2.1	ACC- <i>ing</i> Constructions as IPs	193
2.2	POSS- <i>ing</i> Constructions as IPs	197
3.	Naked Infinitives	204
4.	Correspondences and Connections Between Abstract Objects	206
4.1	The Structure of Abstract Object Domains in Natural Language Metaphysics	206

4.2	The Spectra of Nouniness and World Immanence Do Not Correlate Completely	207
4.3	Proposition Readings for Fact Nominals: Shifts up the Spectrum of World Immanence	207
4.4.	Predicate Incompatibilities and Polymorphic Characterizing Structures	210
4.5	Metaphysical Relations Between Eventualities and Abstract Objects in Natural Language Metaphysics	212
5.	The Problem of Event Negation Solved	214
5.1	Three Tests for Negation and Event Descriptions	215
5.2	Negation Without Wide Scope Adverbials	217
5.3	Negation and Wide Scope Adverbials	218
5.4	Negation and Event Nominals	219
6.	Conclusions Concerning DRS Construction for Nominals: Lessons for Natural Language Metaphysics	221
<b>CHAPTER 6 -- ANAPHORA AND ABSTRACT ENTITIES</b>		<b>225</b>
1.	Toward a Unified Analysis of Abstract Entity Anaphora	225
2.	Event Anaphora	232
3.	Event-Type Anaphora and Using Event-Types to Construct Event Sums	235
4.	Proposition Anaphora	241
5.	Fact Anaphora	245
6.	Concept Anaphora in DRT	246
6.1	Concept Anaphora with Explicit Anaphors	246
6.2	VP Ellipsis in DR Theory	251
<b>CHAPTER 7 -- A THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE FOR AN ANALYSIS OF ABSTRACT ENTITY ANAPHORA</b>		<b>256</b>
1.	The Problem of Discourse Structure and Anaphora	258
2.	Discourse Structure and Discourse Representation Theory	262
3.	Discourse Relations and Their Semantics	263
4.	Principles of Discourse Segmentation and SDRS Constituent Construction	269
4.1	Constraints on Attachment	270
4.2	Inferring Discourse Relations	272
4.3	Rules for Attachment	275
5.	Revision of Constituents after Updating	284
6.	Taking Stock	297
7.	Appendix of Definitions and Constraints in Chapter 7	299
7.1	Basic Definitions for SDRSs and Their Constituents	299
7.2	Axioms and Meaning Postulates for Discourse Relations	300
7.3	Basic Definitions and Axioms for SDRS Updating	302
7.4	Constituent Revision	304
<b>CHAPTER 8 -- APPLYING THE THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE TO THE ANAPHORIC PHENOMENA</b>		<b>312</b>
1.	Constraints on Abstract Object Anaphora Derived from an SDRS: Availability and Well-Foundedness	312
2.	Some Examples of Proposition Anaphora	318

3.	Availability, Anaphora and Constituent Revision	321
3.1	Availability and Parallelism and Contrast	321
3.2	Availability and Topic Revision	330
3.3	The Limits of Availability	338
4.	Discourse Subordination	339
5.	Event and Plural Anaphora Revisited	345
6.	Anaphoric Connections Across Different Abstract Types	349
7.	Conclusions About Abstract Anaphora	351
CHAPTER 9 -- APPLICATIONS OF THE THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE TO CONCEPT ANAPHORA AND VP ELLIPSIS		354
1.	Extending SDRS Theory	354
2.	Examples of Overt Concept Anaphora	357
3.	VP Ellipsis	361
4.	Sloppy Identity	370
5.	Concluding Thoughts on Abstract Entity Anaphora	381
6.	Appendix of Definitions and Constraints for Concept Anaphora	382
CHAPTER 10 -- MODEL THEORY FOR ABSTRACT ENTITIES AND ITS PHILOSOPHICAL IMPLICATIONS		387
1.	First Order or Higher Order DRT?	388
2.	Intentional Frames and Intensional Contents	391
3.	Problems of Self-Reference	395
4.	Two Arguments for a Representational Theory of Abstract Entities	407
5.	Metaphysical Representationalism and Metaphysical Reduction	413
6.	Technical Appendix	419
6.1	Intentional Frames and Frege Structures	419
6.2	Intensional Contents	424
6.3	The Semantics for the Expanded Construction Procedure	429
CONCLUSION		434
BIBLIOGRAPHY		436
INDEX		451



## PREFACE

I have many to thank for what is good in this book--friends, colleagues, and family. At Texas I have received support and helpful comments on drafts from many. I would like to thank especially Maria Bittner, Dan Bonevac, Maggie Browning, Herbert Hochberg, Manfred Krifka, Per Lindström, Joanna Seibt, Carlota Smith, and my students, Paul Losiewicz, David Newman, Ben Rode, Andrew Schwartz, Munindar Singh, and Katsuhito Yabushita. I also would like to thank the University of Texas University Research Institute and the National Science Foundation, grant number IRI8719064, for financial support during my labors on this book. The Center for Cognitive Science at the University of Texas has also generously provided computer and technical support for this project. Without Adrienne Diehr and Marj Troutner of the Cognitive Science Center, this manuscript would have been replete with typographical errors and sloppy drawings--a special thanks to them. A special thanks is also due to Deborah Nichols, who read over much of the manuscript and improved its style and accuracy. I also want to thank colleagues and friends at the University of Stuttgart in Stuttgart, Germany. I was able to do considerable work on this book at Stuttgart, thanks to the generous support of the Sonderforschungsbereich 340 and to the efforts of Hans Kamp and Christian Rohrer to bring me there. I owe a special debt to Hans Kamp, who has been a friend, colleague, intellectual guide, and collaborator on DRT and related topics for ten years. But there are many others from Stuttgart to thank--Rainer Bäuerle, Kurt Eberle, Veerle van Geenhoven, Fritz Hamm, Michael Morreau, and especially Antje Roßdeutscher. Finally, I would like to thank David Beaver, Kathy Dahlgren, Claire Gardent, Franz Guentner, Alex Lascarides, Carol Lord, Joyce McDowell, Fredericke Moltmann, Jeff Pelletier, Rob van der Sandt, Jerry Seligman, Frank Veltman, and Alessandro Zucci for their helpful comments on drafts and discussions about topics in the book.