PHILOSOPHICAL LOGIC

SYNTHESE LIBRARY

MONOGRAPHS ON EPISTEMOLOGY,
LOGIC, METHODOLOGY, PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE,
SOCIOLOGY OF SCIENCE AND OF KNOWLEDGE,
AND ON THE MATHEMATICAL METHODS OF
SOCIAL AND BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES

Editors:

DONALD DAVIDSON, *Princeton University*

JAAKKO HINTIKKA, *University of Helsinki and Stanford University*

GABRIËL NUCHELMANS, *University of Leyden*

WESLEY C. SALMON, *Indiana University*

PHILOSOPHICAL LOGIC

Edited by

J. W. DAVIS, D. J. HOCKNEY, AND W. K. WILSON

The University of Western Ontario

D. REIDEL PUBLISHING COMPANY / DORDRECHT-HOLLAND

ISBN-13: 978-94-010-9616-4 e-ISBN-13: 978-94-010-9614-0
DOI: 10.1007/978-94-010-9614-0

© 1969. D. Reidel Publishing Company, Dordrecht, Holland

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm, or any other means, without permission from the publisher

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1969

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this brief introduction is to describe the origin of the papers here presented and to acknowledge the help of some of the many individuals who were involved in the preparation of this volume. Of the eighteen papers, nine stem from the annual fall colloquium of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario held in London, Ontario from November 10 to November 12, 1967. The colloquium was entitled 'Philosophical Logic'. After some discussion, the editors decided to retain that title for this volume.

Von Wright's paper 'On the Logic and Ontology of Norms' is printed here after some revision. A. R. Anderson commented on the paper at the colloquium, but his comments here are based upon the revised version of the von Wright paper. The chairman of the session at which von Wright's paper was read and discussed was T. A. Goudge. Åqvist's paper 'Scattered Topics in Interrogative Logic', and Belnap's comments, 'Åqvist's Corrections-Accumulating Question-Sequences', are printed as delivered. The chairman of the Åqvist-Belnap session was R. E. Butts. Wilfrid Sellars' paper 'Some Problems about Belief' is printed as delivered at the colloquium, but 'Quantifiers, Beliefs, and Sellars' by Ernest Sosa is a revision of his comments at the colloquium. That session was chaired by G. D. W. Berry. Ackermann's paper 'Some Problems of Inductive Logic', as well as Skyrms' comments, are printed as delivered. Wesley Salmon, who attended the colloquium, kindly agreed to provide an additional commentary on Ackermann's paper, and Ackermann has provided a rejoinder to his critics. The chairman of the session at which Ackermann's first paper and Skyrms' comments were given was A. W. Burks.

Hintikka's paper 'Semantics for Propositional Attitudes' is printed here for the first time; a shorter version of this paper is Hintikka's contribution to the Fourteenth International Congress of Philosophy held in Vienna in September 1968. Hilpinens' paper 'An Analysis of Relativised Modalities', Smokler and Rohr's paper 'Confirmation and Translation', Harrison's paper 'The Unanticipated Examination in View of Kripke's Semantics for

Modal Logic', and the paper by McCall and Vander Nat, 'The System S9', are all also published here for the first time.

Davidson's paper 'Truth and Meaning' was first published in *Synthese* 17 (1967) 304–333. The paper by Stenius, 'Mood and Language Game', was also published first in *Synthese* in the same volume, 254–280. And finally, the paper by Lemmon, Meredith, Meredith, Prior and Thomas, known in the literature for some time as 'LMMPT', is here published in its entirety for the first time with a new postscript by Prior. A portion of the LMMPT paper appeared previously as 'An Investigation into Implicational S5' by C. A. Meredith and A. N. Prior, in *Zeitschrift für Mathematische Logik und Grundlagen der Mathematik* 10 (1964) 203–220. The editors wish to thank Professor Prior and the editors of the *Zeitschrift* for permission to reprint, as well as all the contributors to this volume and participants in the colloquium.

The editors wish to extend special thanks to Professor Jaakko Hintikka, general editor of the *Synthese Library*, for his kindness in providing an important paper of his own and for his assistance in obtaining several other papers. Professor A. R. Anderson was consulted at several points and unfailingly took the time to offer good advice. R. E. Butts and R. W. Binkley of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario were consulted so often that they became collaborators in the venture.

The secretarial staff of the Department of Philosophy under the direction of Mrs. O. M. Hitchins typed with unfailing good humour a manuscript which at times seemed to them to resemble the Rosetta stone. In particular, thanks go to Mrs. O. M. Hitchins, Mrs. Pauline Campbell, Miss Judy Walsh, Mrs. Doris Dunham, and Mrs. Marion Sherman.

The editors also wish to thank the University of Western Ontario Committee on Publication in the Humanities and Social Sciences for a generous subvention in aid of publication, and to recognize the support given to the venture from its inception by Dean J. G. Rowe, former Dean of Talbot College of the University of Western Ontario. Thanks are also extended to Mr. Brian Cupples for help with the indexes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	v
DONALD DAVIDSON Truth and Meaning	1
JAAKKO HINTIKKA Semantics for Propositional Attitudes	21
WILFRID SELLARS Some Problems about Belief	46
ERNEST SOSA Quantifiers, Beliefs, and Sellars	66
CRAIG HARRISON The Unanticipated Examination in View of Kripke's Semantics for Modal Logic	74
GEORG HENRIK VON WRIGHT On the Logic and Ontology of Norms	89
ALAN ROSS ANDERSON Comments on von Wright's 'Logic and Ontology of Norms'	108
LENNART ÅQVIST Scattered Topics in Interrogative Logic	114
NUEL D. BELNAP, JR. Åqvist's Corrections-Accumulating Question-Sequences	122
ROBERT ACKERMANN Some Problems of Inductive Logic	135
BRIAN SKYRMS Comments on Ackermann's 'Problems'	152

WESLEY SALMON

Induction and Intuition: Comments on Ackermann's 'Problems'	158
--	-----

ROBERT ACKERMANN

Rejoinder to Skyrms and Salmon	164
--------------------------------	-----

HOWARD SMOKLER AND MICHAEL DAVID ROHR

Confirmation and Translation	172
------------------------------	-----

RISTO HILPINEN

An Analysis of Relativised Modalities	181
---------------------------------------	-----

STORRS MCCALL AND ARNOLD VANDER NAT

The System S9	194
---------------	-----

E. J. LEMMON, C. A. MEREDITH, D. MEREDITH, A. N. PRIOR, AND
I. THOMAS

Calculi of Pure Strict Implication	215
------------------------------------	-----

ERIC STENIUS

Mood and Language-Game	251
------------------------	-----

INDEX OF NAMES	272
----------------	-----

INDEX OF SUBJECTS	274
-------------------	-----