

**EVALUATION AND EXPLANATION IN THE
BIOMEDICAL SCIENCES**

PHILOSOPHY AND MEDICINE

Editors:

H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT, JR.

University of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston, Tex., U.S.A.

STUART F. SPICKER

University of Connecticut Health Center, Farmington, Conn., U.S.A.

VOLUME 1

EVALUATION AND EXPLANATION IN THE BIOMEDICAL SCIENCES

PROCEEDINGS OF THE FIRST TRANS-DISCIPLINARY SYMPOSIUM
ON PHILOSOPHY AND MEDICINE
HELD AT GALVESTON, MAY 9-11, 1974

Edited by

H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT, JR.

University of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston, Tex., U.S.A.

and

STUART F. SPICKER

University of Connecticut Health Center, Farmington, Conn., U.S.A.



D. REIDEL PUBLISHING COMPANY

DORDRECHT-HOLLAND / BOSTON-U.S.A.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Trans-disciplinary Symposium on Philosophy and Medicine, 1st, Galveston,
1974.

Evaluation and explanation in the biomedical sciences.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Medicine—Philosophy—Congresses. I. Engelhardt, Hugo Tristram,
1941— ed. II. Spicker, Stuart F., 1937— ed. III. Title.
[DNLM: 1. Philosophy, Medical—Congresses. W1 PH614 v. 1 /
W61 T772e 1974]

R723.T7 1974 610'.1 74-34167

ISBN-13:978-94-010-1771-8 e-ISBN-13:978-94-010-1769-5

DOI: 10.1007/978-94-010-1769-5

Published by D. Reidel Publishing Company,
P.O. Box 17, Dordrecht, Holland

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico
by D. Reidel Publishing Company, Inc.
306 Dartmouth Street, Boston,
Mass. 02116, U.S.A.

All Rights Reserved

Copyright © 1975 by D. Reidel Publishing Company, Dordrecht, Holland
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1975

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm,
or any other means, without written permission from the publisher

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
SECTION I / VALUE AND EXPLANATION: HISTORICAL ROOTS	
LESTER S. KING / Some Basic Explanations of Disease: An Historian's Viewpoint	11
CHESTER R. BURNS / Diseases Versus Healths: Some Legacies in the Philosophies of Modern Medical Science	29
SECTION II / PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE IN TRANSITION TO A PHILOSOPHY OF MEDICINE	
STEPHEN TOULMIN / Concepts of Function and Mechanism in Medicine and Medical Science (Hommage à Claude Bernard)	51
MARX W. WARTOFSKY / Organs, Organisms and Disease: Human Ontology and Medical Practice	67
PATRICK A. HEELAN / Comments on "Concepts of Function and Mechanism in Medicine and Medical Science" and "Organs, Organisms and Disease"	85
SECTION III / ETHICS AND MEDICINE	
ALASDAIR MACINTYRE / How Virtues Become Vices: Values, Medicine and Social Context	97
SAMUEL GOROVITZ / Moral Philosophy and Medical Perplexity: Comments on "How Virtues Become Vices"	113
SECTION IV / CONCEPTS IN MEDICAL THEORY	
H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT, JR. / The Concepts of Health and Disease	125

LORETTA KOPELMAN / On Disease: Theories of Disease and the Ascription of Disease: Comments on "The Concepts of Health and Disease"	143
SECTION V / BODY AND SELF: PHENOMENOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVES	
RICHARD M. ZANER / Context and Reflexivity: The Genealogy of Self	153
ANDRÉ SCHUWER / Comments on "Context and Reflexivity"	175
STUART F. SPICKER / The Lived-Body as Catalytic Agent: Reac- tion at the Interface of Medicine and Philosophy	181
ANDRÉ SCHUWER / Comments on "The Lived-Body as Catalytic Agent"	205
SECTION VI / THE ROLE OF PHILOSOPHY IN THE BIOMEDICAL SCIENCES: CONTRIBUTION OR INTRUSION?	
ROUND-TABLE DISCUSSION	211
H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. / Chairman's Remarks	211
Chester R. Burns	212
Jerome Shaffer	215
Kenneth Vaux	219
Marx W. Wartofsky	222
Edmund D. Pellegrino	228
NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS	235
INDEX	237