

ON THE EXISTENCE OF GOD

NIJHOFF INTERNATIONAL PHILOSOPHY SERIES

VOLUME 29

General Editor: JAN T.J. SRZEDNICKI (Contributions to Philosophy)

Editor: LYNNE M. BROUGHTON (Applying Philosophy)

Editor: STANISLAW J. SURMA (Logic and Applying Logic)

Editorial Advisory Board:

R.M. Chisholm, Brown University, Rhode Island. Mats Furberg, Göteborg University, D.A.T. Gasking, University of Melbourne, H.L.A. Hart, University College, Oxford. S. Körner, University of Bristol and Yale University. H.J. McCloskey, La Trobe University, Bundoora, Melbourne. J. Passmore, Australian National University, Canberra. A. Quinton, Trinity College, Oxford. Nathan Rotenstreich, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Franco Spisani, Centro Superiore di Logica e, Scienze Compare, Bologna. S.J. Surma, Auckland University, New Zealand. R. Ziedins, Waikato University, New Zealand.

For a list of volumes in this series see final page of the volume.

Franz Brentano

On the Existence of God

Lectures given at the Universities of
Würzburg and Vienna (1868–1891)

Edited and Translated by Susan F. Krantz

1987 **MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS**
a member of the KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS GROUP
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LANCASTER



Distributors

for the United States and Canada: Kluwer Academic Publishers, P.O. Box 358, Accord Station, Hingham, MA 02018-0358, USA

for the UK and Ireland: Kluwer Academic Publishers, MTP Press Limited, Falcon House, Queen Square, Lancaster LA1 1RN, UK

for all other countries: Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, Distribution Center, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Brentano, Franz Clemens, 1838-1917.
On the existence of God.

(Nijhoff international philosophy series ; v. 29)

Translation of: Vom Dasein Gottes.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

I. God--Proof. I. Krantz, Susan F. II. Title.

III. Series.

B3212.V662E6 1987 212'.1 87-12195

ISBN-13: 978-94-010-8125-2

e-ISBN-13: 978-94-009-3633-1

DOI:10.1007/ 978-94-009-3633-1

Copyright

© 1987 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht.

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1987

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers,

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht,
The Netherlands.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction to the English Translation, by Susan F. Krantz	1
Foreword	6
Introduction: The Theoretical and Practical Interest of the Question of God's Existence	11

PART ONE: PRELIMINARY INQUIRIES

FIRST PRELIMINARY INQUIRY: IS THE INQUIRY SUPERFLUOUS?	20
I. Superficial Arguments	20
II. The Ontological Argument	23
SECOND PRELIMINARY INQUIRY: IS IT EVIDENT A <i>PRIORI</i> THAT THE EXISTENCE OF GOD IS IMPOSSIBLE TO PROVE?	51
I. Reasons Which Are Supposed to Make it Evident <i>a priori</i> that God Does Not Exist	51
II. Arguments the Purpose of Which is to Show <i>a priori</i> that a Certain Proof of the Existence of God Cannot Be Produced	59
A. Skeptical Reservations of a General Nature	
1. <i>Universal Skepticism</i>	59
2. <i>The Mitigated Skepticism of the New Academy</i>	60
3. <i>The Limited Skepticism of David Hume</i>	62
4. <i>Kant's Transcendental Idealism</i>	63
<i>Critique of Kant's Doctrine</i>	66
<i>Critique of Hume's Doctrine</i>	92
<i>The True Nature of Inferences From One Matter of Fact to Another</i>	101
<i>A priori Proof of the Causal Law</i>	107
5. <i>Further Arguments of a General Sort</i>	118
B. Skeptical Arguments Which Are Specially Adapted to Our Subject.	123

**PART TWO: THE PROOFS OF THE
EXISTENCE OF GOD**

**A SURVEY OF THE PROOFS ATTEMPTED THROUGHOUT
THE HISTORY OF PHILOSOPHY**

THE TELEOLOGICAL PROOF

FIRST PART: THE APPEARANCE OF TELEOLOGY

I.	The Foundation In Experience	155
	<i>The Appearance of Teleology in the Realm of Living Things.</i>	156
	<i>The Appearance of Teleology in the Realm of Inorganic Nature</i>	162
II.	Objections Against the Appearance of Teleology in Nature	172
	A. Against the Appearance of Teleology Generally	172
	B. Objections Against the Appearance of a Superhuman Teleology	174
III.	Reply to the Arguments Against the Appearance of Teleology	
	A. The Objections to Teleology in General	180
	B. Reply to the Objections Against the Appearance of a Superhuman Teleology	192

SECOND PART: THE REALITY OF TELEOLOGY

I.	The Hypothesis of Blind Necessity	
	A. Older and More Recent Forms of This Hypothesis.	213
	<i>The Darwinian Theory of Natural Selection</i>	215
	B. Critique of the Hypothesis of Blind Necessity	218
	<i>Darwin's Explanation is Not a Safe Assumption</i>	224
	<i>The Darwinian Hypothesis is Highly Improbable</i>	228
	<i>The Impossibility of the Darwinian Hypothesis</i>	230
	<i>New Theories for Explaining Evolution</i>	242
II.	Comparison of the Hypothesis of An Ordering Intelligence With the Hypothesis of Chance	249

THIRD PART OF THE TELEOLOGICAL PROOF: FROM AN ORDERING INTELLIGENCE TO A CREATOR	259
THE PROOF FROM MOTION	268
1. <i>Proof of the Prime Mover, Based on the Law of the Conservation of Energy and the Law of Entropy</i>	270
2. <i>Proof of the Prime Mover on the Basis of a Contradiction in the Concept of Motion Without a Beginning</i>	281
THE PROOF FROM CONTINGENCY	285
THE PSYCHOLOGICAL PROOF	290
COMPLETION OF THE PROOF OF THE EXISTENCE OF GOD	302

**THE TRAIN OF THOUGHT IN THE PROOF
OF GOD'S EXISTENCE (1915)**

PART ONE: ON THE NECESSITY OF ALL EXISTING THINGS	308
PART TWO: ON THE FIRST, DIRECTLY NECESSARY CAUSE	315
PART THREE: CONCERNING THEODICY	330
<i>Editor's Foreword to the German Edition, by Alfred Kastil</i>	338
<i>Editorial Notes by Alfred Kastil</i>	348
<i>Index</i>	358