

HOBBS'S 'SCIENCE OF NATURAL JUSTICE'

HOBBS'S 'SCIENCE OF NATURAL JUSTICE'

Edited by
C. WALTON and P.J. JOHNSON

Directors: P. Dibon (Paris) and R. Popkin (Washington Univ., St. Louis)
Editorial Board: J.F. Battail (Uppsala); F. Duchesneau (Montreal); T. Gregory (Rome); J.D. North (Groningen); M.J. Petry (Rotterdam); Ch.B. Schmitt (Warburg Inst., London).
Advisory Editorial Board: J. Aubin (Paris); J. Collins (St. Louis Univ.); P. Costabel (Paris); A. Crombie (Oxford); H. de la Fontaine Verwey (Amsterdam); H. Gadamer (Heidelberg); H. Gouhier (Paris); K. Hanada (Hokkaido University); W. Kirsop (Melbourne); P.O. Kristeller (Columbia Univ.); Elisabeth Labrousse (Paris); A. Lossky (Los Angeles); J. Malarczyk (Lublin); E. de Olaso (C.I.F. Buenos Aires); J. Orcibal (Paris); Wolfgang Röd (München); J. Roger (Paris); G. Rousseau (Los Angeles); H. Rowen (Rutgers Univ., N.J.); J.P. Schobinger (Zürich); G. Sebba (Emory Univ., Atlanta); R. Shackleton (Oxford); J. Tans (Groningen).

HOBBS'S 'SCIENCE OF NATURAL JUSTICE'

Edited by

C. WALTON and P.J. JOHNSON

1987 **MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS**
a member of the KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS GROUP
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LANCASTER



Distributors

for the United States and Canada: Kluwer Academic Publishers, P.O. Box 358, Accord Station, Hingham, MA 02018-0358, USA

for the UK and Ireland: Kluwer Academic Publishers, MTP Press Limited, Falcon House, Queen Square, Lancaster LA1 1RN, UK

for all other countries: Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, Distribution Center, P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Hobbes's science of natural justice.

(International archives of the history of ideas ;
v. 111)

Includes index.

1. Hobbes, Thomas, 1588-1679--Contributions in
political science--Addresses, essays, lectures.
2. Justice--Addresses, essays, lectures. I. Walton,
Craig, 1934- . II. Johnson, P. J. (Paul J.)
III. Series: Archives internationales d'histoire des
idées ; 111.

JC153.H66H57 1986 320.1'092'4 85-18793

ISBN-13: 978-94-010-8060-6

e-ISBN-13: 978-94-009-3485-6

DOI: 10.1007/978-94-009-3485-6

Copyright

© 1987 by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dordrecht.

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1987

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publishers,

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht,
The Netherlands.

CONTENTS

Dedication	VII
Notes on Contributors	IX
Abbreviations	XIII
Editor's Introduction	1
I. Task of the 'Science of Natural Justice'	19
1. The Philosophical Implications of Hobbes's State of Nature <i>Jean Mathiot</i>	21
2. Hobbes's Theory of Natural and Social Sciences <i>Nikhil Bhattacharya</i>	33
3. Obligations: Science and Philosophy in the Political Writings of Hobbes <i>Ross Rudolph</i>	57
II. Logic and Language of this Science	69
4. Hobbes on the Natural and the Artificial <i>Craig Walton</i>	71
5. Hobbes's Entanglement with the Excluded Middle in his Theory of Man and Politics <i>Bertram Morris</i>	89
6. Hobbes: Language and the Is-Ought <i>Martin A. Bertman</i>	99
7. 'Insinuations to the Will': Hobbes's Style and Intention in <i>Leviathan</i> Compared to his Earlier Political Works <i>Cornelis W. Schoneveld</i>	111
III. Natural Right and the State of Nature	121
8. Hobbes's <i>Conatus</i> and the Roots of Character <i>Brian Stoffel</i>	123
9. Hobbes and the Wolf-man <i>Paul J. Johnson</i>	139

VI

10. Metamorphosis of the Idea of Right in Thomas Hobbes's Philosophy <i>Simone Goyard-Fabre</i>	153
11. The Peculiarity of Hobbes's Concept of Natural Right <i>C.A.J. Coady</i>	165
12. Thomas Hobbes: The Mediation of Right <i>Gary B. Herbert</i>	181
IV. Generating the Commonwealth	201
13. Hobbes, Revolution and the Philosophy of History <i>Philip J. Kain</i>	203
14. Thomas Hobbes from <i>Behemoth</i> to <i>Leviathan</i> <i>Herbert W. Schneider</i>	219
15. Covenant: Hobbes's Philosophy of Religion and his Political System 'More Geometrico' <i>Klaus-Michael Kodalle</i>	223
V. Justice and Equity in the Commonwealth	239
16. Hobbes on Equity and Justice <i>Larry May</i>	241
17. Commentary on Professor May's 'Hobbes on Equity and Justice' <i>William Mathie</i>	253
18. Justice and Equity: an Inquiry into the Meaning and Role of Equity in the Hobbesian Account of Justice and Politics <i>William Mathie</i>	257
VI. Hobbes Today	277
19. The <i>Leviathan</i> , Old and New <i>Isabel C. Hungerland</i>	279
20. Hobbes and Macroethics: the Theory of Peace and Natural Justice <i>Howard Warrender</i>	297
Index	309

DEDICATION

We gratefully dedicate this volume to the late Professor Herbert W. Schneider, who first called our attention to the theme of these studies, and whose encouragement enabled us to seek out the parts of the whole. Since Professor Schneider's 1958 Library of Liberal Arts edition of *Leviathan*, his studies and discussions have prompted students and colleagues toward a wider and deeper reading of Hobbes. In the 1974 *Thomas Hobbes in His Time*, which he coedited with Ralph Ross and Theodore Waldman, he further developed this work, and it was his inspiration that motivated the initial planning for the 1979 Hobbes Tercentenary Congress. Some of the papers delivered at the Congress developed into contributions included in this volume. Without Professor Schneider's contributions to Hobbes studies and his unfailing encouragement, the present volume would not have been undertaken.

Craig Walton
Paul J. Johnson

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Martin A. BERTMAN was educated at Syracuse and Columbia Universities. Presently, he is Professor of Philosophy at State University of New York at Potsdam. He edits AGORA and co-edits URAM. Aside from numerous publications on a wide variety of philosophical subjects, he has published over a dozen papers on Hobbes and the book *Hobbes: The Natural and Artificated Good* (1981).

Nikhil BHATTACHARYA is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Chairman of the Division of Liberal Arts at the Rhode Island School of Design. He has taught previously at the University of Texas at San Antonio, and works primarily in the areas of epistemology, social and political philosophy.

A.J. COADY is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Melbourne, Australia. He has published work in leading philosophical journals such as *The American Philosophical Quarterly*, *Philosophy*, *Mind*, and the *Philosophical Review*. He has held visiting fellowships at St. John's College and Churchill College, Cambridge and at Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

Simone GOYARD-FABRE is Professeur Agrégée and Docteur des Lettres, and has held the Philosophy chair at the University of Caen since 1967; she directs the *Equipe de Recherche de Philosophie politique et juridique* and is the founder of the *Cahiers de Philosophie politique et juridique*.

Gary B. HERBERT is a member of the Philosophy Department of Loyola University in New Orleans. He teaches in the areas of political philosophy, 17th century philosophy and metaphysics. His articles on Hobbes have appeared in several journals.

Isabel C. HUNGERLAND is Professor Emeritus, University of California, Berkeley. She has published in the fields of aesthetics, epistemology and philosophy of language. Publications on Hobbes are 'Hobbes's Theory of Signification' (with

George R. Vick), *Journal of the History of Philosophy* (October, 1973), pp. 459–482; editor (with George Vick) of the translation by Aloysius Martinich of Part I (Logic) of *De Corpore*, and (with George Vick) author of the introductory essay.

Paul J. JOHNSON is Professor of Philosophy at California State College, San Bernardino. He is the author of a number of papers on Hobbes, Locke and Herbert Marcuse. He was co-director of the Hobbes Tercentenary Congress and is a consulting editor for the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*.

Philip J. KAIN teaches in the Western Culture Program at Stanford University. He is the author of *Schiller, Hegel, and Marx* and is presently at work on books dealing with Marx's epistemology and ethics.

Klaus Michael KODALLE (1943) teaches philosophy in the Theological Faculty of the Universität Hamburg. He is the author of *Thomas Hobbes-Logik der Herrschaft und Vernunft des Friedens* (München, 1971), and editor with U. Bermbach of *Furcht und Freiheit: Leviathan-Diskussion 300 Jahre nach Thomas Hobbes* (Opladen, 1982), among others. For the past two years he has been working on Søren Kierkegaard and the history of his work.

William MATHIE (1941) is associate Professor of Politics and Coordinator of the Liberal Studies Program at Brock University, St. Catharine's, Ontario, Canada. He is the author of "Justice and the Question of Regimes in Ancient and Modern Political Science: Aristotle and Hobbes" (1976) and forthcoming articles on "Reason and Rhetoric in Hobbes's *Leviathan*", and "Political and Distributive Justice in Aristotle's Political Science.

Jean MATHIOT (1941) studied philosophy and economics. He is Professor (maître-assistant) of the Department of Philosophy of the Université de Provence (Aix en Provence, France), and mainly interested in political philosophy and economics.

Larry MAY received his Ph-D from the New School for Social Research in 1977 with a dissertation on Hobbes's moral and legal philosophy. He is presently Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Purdue University. His publications in the areas of moral, political and legal philosophy, have appeared in such journals as: *J. History of Philosophy, Social Theory and Practice, American Phil. Quarterly* and *Philosophical Studies*.

Bertram MORRIS (1908–1981) was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado (1947–1977), and served as Trustee for the Consortium of Colorado State Colleges. He published *The Aesthetic Process, Institutions of Intelligence* and *Philosophical Aspects of Culture*, and co-authored *Science, Folklore and Philosophy*.

Ross RUDOLPH was educated at University of Alberta (B.A. Honours, Political Science), Brandeis University (M.A., History of Ideas), and Columbia University (Ph. D., Political Science). He is currently Associate Professor, and Director of Graduate Programme, Dept. of Political Science, York University. His *Hobbes's Philosophic Politics* is nearing completion.

Herbert W. SCHNEIDER (1892–1984) was Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at Columbia University and Claremont Graduate School. His published work includes *A History of American Philosophy*, *The Puritan Mind*, *Morals for Mankind* and *Ways of Being*; he was co-editor of *Thomas Hobbes in His Time* and editor of the Library of Liberal Arts edition of Hobbes's *Leviathan*.

Cornelis W. SCHONEVELD (1935), of Dutch nationality, graduated in English at the University of Leiden, where he now holds a teaching post in English literature in the rank of senior lecturer. He recently completed a doctoral dissertation on Anglo-Dutch translations in the 17th Century, in which one chapter is devoted to Hobbes. He has also published on Sir Thomas Browne.

Brian STOFFEL, after undergraduate work in Western Australia, and graduate studies at U.B.C., taught for two years in Adelaide, and currently at the University of Melbourne. Main interests are history of philosophy and history of ideas more generally.

Craig WALTON (1934) teaches in philosophy at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas. He has published a study of Malebranche's ethics, edited *Philosophy & the Civilizing Arts*, and authored articles on Hobbes's first philosophy, on Ramus, Bacon, Hume and the Socratic paradoxes.

Howard WARRENDER was Professor and Head of Department of Political Theory and Institutions, the University of Sheffield, UK (formerly at the Universities of Oxford, Glasgow & Belfast) He was author of *The Political Philosophy of Hobbes* (Oxford, 1957), among others and completed two volumes of the critical edition of the *Works* of Thomas Hobbes.

ABBREVIATIONS

Contributions to this study cite the works of Hobbes according to the following standardized scheme, using the indicated abbreviations in the text parenthetically (as, e.g., *Leviathan*, page 116 = '(EWIII, 116)').

EW I = *English Works*, ed. Sir Wm. Molesworth (London: Bohn, 1839).

OL I = *Opera Latina*, ed. Sir Wm. Molesworth (London: Bohn, 1839).

E = *Elements of Law*, ed. Maurice Goldsmith (London: Cass, and New York: Barnes & Noble, 1969).

B = *Behemoth*, ed. Maurice Goldsmith (London: Cass, and New York: Barnes & Noble, 1969).

D = *A Dialogue Between a Philosopher and a Student of the Common Laws of England*, ed. Jos Gropsey (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971).

W = *Thomas White's De Mundo Examined*, trans. H.W. Jones (London: Bradford Univ. Press, 1976).

H = *De Homine* (Of Man) and *De Cive* (Philosophical Rudiments Concerning Government and Society), in *Man and Citizen*, ed. B. Gert (Garden City, New York: Anchor Books, 1972).

Th = *Hobbes's Thucydides*, ed. R. Schlatter (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1975).