

The Aristotelian Tradition and the Rise of British Empiricism

STUDIES IN HISTORY
AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

VOLUME 32

General Editor:

STEPHEN GAUKROGER, *University of Sydney*

Editorial Advisory Board:

RACHEL ANKENY, *University of Adelaide*

PETER ANSTEY, *University of Otago*

STEVEN FRENCH, *University of Leeds*

KOEN VERMEIR, *Katholieke Universiteit, Leuven*

OFER GAL, *University of Sydney*

JOHN SCHUSTER, *Campion College & University of Sydney*

RICHARD YEO, *Griffith University*

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/5671>

Marco Sgarbi

The Aristotelian Tradition and the Rise of British Empiricism

Logic and Epistemology in the British
Isles (1570–1689)

 Springer

Marco Sgarbi
Via Brusca 6
Stradella di Bigarello, 46030
Mantova, Italy

ISSN 0929-6425

ISBN 978-94-007-4950-4

ISBN 978-94-007-4951-1 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-4951-1

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012946205

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

The Warburg Library has quietly and consistently endeavoured to gather materials for research in intellectual and cultural history. And it has done much more besides. With a forcefulness that is rare, it has held up before us the principles which must govern such research. In its organization and in its intellectual structure, the Library embodies the idea of the methodological unity of all fields and all currents of intellectual history.

Ernst Cassirer to Aby Warburg on his Sixtieth Birthday
Individuum und Kosmos in der Philosophie der Renaissance

Notes on the Texts

All Greek and Roman authors are cited in their most familiar single-name form, both in the text and in the bibliography, e.g. Cicero (not Marcus Tullius Cicero) and Quintilian (not Marcus Fabius Quintilianus). Titles of Greek works are given in their most familiar Latin form (for example, I speak of Aristotle's *Analytica posteriora*). All other titles are given in the original language. My general rule has been to preserve original spelling and punctuation, even when erroneous, except where there are critical editions. Sometimes, when fitting quotations around the text, I have silently changed a lower case initial letter to an upper, or vice versa, as the sentence requires. When transcribing early modern Latin I have expanded all contractions, while dropping diphthongs and omitting diacritical marks. I have also modernised ‘:’ with ‘;’ or ‘,’ where required for the comprehension of the sentence. The extensive use of Latin quotations in the footnotes serve the purpose of having an immediate reference to sometimes rare sources.

Acknowledgments

I gratefully acknowledge the help and support of numerous people and institutions while I was working on this book. This research has been possible thanks to a Frances A. Yates Short-Term Fellowship at The Warburg Institute, to an Assegno di ricerca at the Dipartimento di Filosofia, Psicologia e Pedagogia of the Università di Verona and to an Accademia dei Lincei-British Academy Fellowship.

While any list of reasonable length would be undoubtedly incomplete, I nonetheless want to acknowledge the great support of Constance Blackwell, Giorgio Bernardi Perini, Enrico Berti, Marco Bertozzi, Martin J. Burke, Stefano Caroti, Stephen Clucas, Paolo Cristofolini, Eva Del Soldato, Germana Ernst, Marta Fattori, Mordechai Feingold, Guido Giglioni, Lucia Girelli, Tullio Gregory, Howard Hotson, Sarah Hutton, Per Landgren, Seung-Kee Lee, Peter Mack, Laura A. Macor, Ferdinando L. Marcolungo, Ann E. Moyer, Lodi Nauta, Gianenrico Paganini, Enrico Peruzzi, Vittoria Perrone Compagni, Gregorio Piaia, Antonino Poppi, Riccardo Pozzo, Tad Schmaltz, Richard W. Serjeantson, Quentin Skinner, Maurizio Torrini and Cesare Vasoli.

A special thanks to Stephen Gaukroger and the editorial board of 'Studies in History and Philosophy of Science', who have accepted so benevolently my book in this prestigious series. I am greatly indebted to Jill Kraye, who supervised my work during my stay at the Warburg Institute, and I am particularly grateful to Anthony Ossa-Richardson for his help in revising my book and for all his valuable suggestions. Despite the invaluable assistance of many people, any and all errors or shortcomings in this book are mine, and mine alone.

To the Warburg Institute, to its library and to all those who have worked and are still working at this institution I dedicate this book.

October 2012

Contents

| | | |
|----------|--|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 | Matters of Method..... | 1 |
| 1.2 | ‘Aristotelianism’ and ‘Empiricism’ | 8 |
| 1.3 | Status Quaestionis | 12 |
| 2 | Logic in the British Isles During the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries | 17 |
| 2.1 | From Scholastic Logic to Humanist Logic | 17 |
| 2.2 | The Rise and Fall of Ramism (1574–1585)..... | 23 |
| 2.3 | The Advent of Aristotelianism..... | 27 |
| 3 | Logic in the Universities of the British Isles | 35 |
| 3.1 | Cambridge..... | 35 |
| 3.2 | Oxford | 39 |
| 3.3 | Scottish Universities | 44 |
| 3.4 | Dublin | 51 |
| 4 | Jacopo Zabarella’s Empiricism | 53 |
| 4.1 | The Nature of Logic..... | 53 |
| 4.2 | Knowledge and Experience | 59 |
| 4.3 | The Habit of Principles and the Induction | 65 |
| 4.4 | Scientific Method | 70 |
| 4.5 | Experiential Empiricism | 76 |
| 5 | Early Aristotelianism Between Humanism and Ramism | 79 |
| 5.1 | Aristotelianism, Humanism and Scholasticism | 79 |
| 5.2 | Digby’s Eclectic Aristotelianism and Anti-Ramist Polemic..... | 81 |
| 5.3 | John Case and the Early Dissemination of Paduan Aristotelianism..... | 91 |

6 The Influence of Paduan Aristotelianism and the Genesis of the British School 99

6.1 Griffith Powell and Paduan Aristotelianism 99

6.2 Giulio Pace in the British Isles..... 101

6.3 British Aristotelians on the Continent..... 107

6.4 Flavell’s Methodological Aristotelianism..... 110

7 Continental Aristotelians in the British Isles..... 115

7.1 German Aristotelianism 115

7.2 Logical Jesuit School 127

7.3 Dutch Aristotelianism 137

8 The Empiricism of Seventeenth-Century Aristotelianism 147

8.1 Samuel Smith’s Introduction to Logic 147

8.2 Edward Brerewood’s Elements of Logic 151

8.3 Robert Sanderson’s Empiricism..... 152

8.4 Crakanthorpe’s Doctrine of Induction 158

8.5 Aristotelianism During the 1620s and 1630s..... 162

9 The Reformers of Aristotelian Logic..... 167

9.1 Francis Bacon and the Problem of Induction..... 167

9.2 William Harvey and the Return of Paduan Aristotelianism..... 180

9.3 Hobbes and Logic as Calculus..... 184

10 Late Seventeenth-Century Aristotelianism 197

10.1 Aristotelianism, 1650–1670..... 197

10.2 Aristotelianism of the 1670s and 1680s..... 209

11 Conclusion 231

Bibliography 235

Index..... 251