

Reasonableness and Responsibility:
A Theory of Contract Law

Law and Philosophy Library

VOLUME 101

Series Editors:

FRANCISCO J. LAPORTA, *Department of Law,
Autonomous University of Madrid, Spain*
FREDERICK SCHAUER, *School of Law, University of Virginia, U.S.A.*
TORBEN SPAAK, *Uppsala University, Sweden*

Former Series Editors:

AULIS AARNIO, MICHAEL D. BAYLES[†], CONRAD D. JOHNSON[†],
ALAN MABE, ALEKSANDER PECZENIK[†]

Editorial Advisory Board:

AULIS AARNIO, *Secretary General of the Tampere Club, Finland*
HUMBERTO ÁVILA, *Federal University of South Brazil, Brazil*
ZENON BANKOWSKI, *Centre for Law and Society, University of Edinburgh,
United Kingdom*
PAOLO COMANDUCCI, *University of Genoa, Italy*
HUGH CORDER, *University of Cape Town, South Africa*
DAVID DYZENHAUS, *University of Toronto, Canada*
ERNESTO GARZÓN VALDÉS, *Institut für Politikwissenschaft, Johannes
Gutenberg Universität, Mainz, Germany*
RICCARDO GUASTINI, *University of Genoa, Italy*
JOHN KLEINIG, *Department of Law, Police Science and Criminal Justice
Administration, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, City University of New York,
U.S.A.*
PATRICIA MINDUS, *Università Degli Studi di Torino, Italy*
YASUTOMO MORIGIWA, *Nagoya University, Japan*
GIOVANNI BATTISTA RATTI, *“Juan de la Cierva” Fellow in Law, Faculty of
Law, University of Girona, Spain*
WOJCIECH SADURSKI, *European University Institute, Department of Law,
Florence, Italy*
HORACIO SPECTOR, *Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Argentina*
ROBERT S. SUMMERS, *School of Law, Cornell University, U.S.A.*
MICHEL TROPER, *Membre de l’Institut Universitaire de France, France*
CARL WELLMAN, *Department of Philosophy, Washington University, U.S.A.*

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/6210>

Martín Hevia

Reasonableness and Responsibility: A Theory of Contract Law

 Springer

Martín Hevia
School of Law
Universidad Torcuato Di Tella
Buenos Aires, Argentina

ISSN 1572-4395

ISBN 978-94-007-4604-6

ISBN 978-94-007-4605-3 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-4605-3

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012943588

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Setting the Scene: Distributive Justice, Corrective Justice, and Monism in Political Philosophy and Contract Law	9
2.1	Distributive and Corrective Justice	9
2.2	Monism in Political Philosophy and in the Law of Contracts	14
3	The Distributive Understanding of Contract Law: Kronman on Contract Law and Distributive Justice	19
3.1	Kronman’s Argument.....	20
3.2	The Failures of the Paretian Principle.....	26
3.2.1	The Structure of a Contract.....	26
3.2.2	The Paretian Principle and Responsibility for Breach of Contract	27
3.2.3	The Paretian Principle, Consent, and Autonomy.....	30
3.3	Final Thoughts	31
4	Libertarianism and the Law of Contracts	33
4.1	The Main Tenets of Nozick’s Libertarianism: The Entitlement Theory	33
4.1.1	The Principle of Justice in Acquisition	34
4.1.2	The Principle of Justice in Transfer	35
4.1.3	The Rectification of Injustice in Holdings	36
4.2	Libertarianism, Contract Law, and the State.....	36
4.2.1	Nozick on Distributive Justice	39
4.3	Why the Wilt Chamberlain Example Doesn’t Work.....	42
4.4	Conclusion	44
5	The Division of Responsibility and Contract Law	45
5.1	A Fair System of Social Cooperation	47
5.2	The Well-Ordered Society	50
5.3	The Political Conception of the Person	50
5.4	The Idea of Free Citizens	51

5.5	The Idea of Equal Citizens.....	52
5.6	The Reasonable and the Rational.....	52
5.7	The Division of Responsibility	53
5.8	Relational Duties, Private Law, and Contract Law	54
5.9	Contract Law and Distributive Justice	56
5.10	Nonrelational Duties	58
5.11	The Original Position and the Veil of Ignorance	59
5.12	The Principles of Justice	61
5.13	The List of Primary Goods	62
5.14	Conclusion	64
6	Explaining Contract Doctrine.....	67
6.1	Introduction.....	67
6.2	The Legal Classification of Obligations.....	68
6.3	A Kantian Account of Private Law	70
6.4	The Nature of Contractual Rights, Duties, and Remedies	75
6.4.1	The Kantian View: <i>Contractual Rights</i> <i>as Rights In Personam</i>	75
6.4.2	Remedies for Breach: Why Expectation and Consequential Damages?	83
6.4.3	Misfeasance, Nonfeasance, and Contractual Remedies	88
7	The Objective Standard of Interaction in Contract Law: The Reasonable Person.....	91
7.1	The Reasonable Person Standard.....	92
7.2	Subjective or Objective Tests?	97
7.3	Some Objections: The Communitarian and Feminist Challenges	99
8	Fuller, Fried, and the Nature of Contractual Rights and Remedies.....	103
8.1	Introduction.....	103
8.2	Against Fuller and Perdue.....	105
8.3	Against Fried.....	109
8.4	Conclusion	114
9	Contracts and Third Parties	115
9.1	The Privity of Contract Rule.....	116
9.2	The Privity Rule, Limits on Freedom of Contract, and the Well-Being of Third Parties from the Rawlsian Perspective.....	118
9.2.1	<i>Donoghue v. Stevenson</i>	118
9.2.2	The Economic Analysis of Law.....	120
9.2.3	The Rawlsian Framework	122

- 9.3 Are Third Parties Bound? If So, How? 126
 - 9.3.1 Introduction..... 126
 - 9.3.2 Economic Loss and the Exclusionary Rule 128
- 9.4 Inducing Breach of Contract..... 134
 - 9.4.1 Before and after Lumley V. Gye 134
 - 9.4.2 Theoretical Discussion..... 138
- 9.5 Contracts for the Benefit of Third Parties 142
 - 9.5.1 Introduction..... 142
 - 9.5.2 Historical Account 144
 - 9.5.3 Current Law 149
 - 9.5.4 Theoretical Discussion..... 152
- 9.6 Final Thoughts 156
- 10 Material Nondisclosure, Corrective Justice,
and the Division of Responsibility 157**
 - 10.1 Promises and Precontractual Disclosure:
Robust Corrective Justice and Material Disclosure 160
 - 10.2 Ramsay on Nonrobust Corrective Justice
and Material Nondisclosure 163
 - 10.3 The Division of Responsibility and Material Nondisclosure..... 166
 - 10.4 Final Thoughts 169
- Acknowledgments 171**
- Bibliography 173**
- Index 179**

