

PERSONS, MORAL WORTH, AND EMBRYOS

Philosophy and Medicine

VOLUME 111

Founding Co-Editor

Stuart F. Spicker

Senior Editor

H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., *Department of Philosophy, Rice University,
and Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas*

Associate Editor

Lisa M. Rasmussen, *Department of Philosophy, University of North Carolina
at Charlotte, North Carolina*

CATHOLIC STUDIES IN BIOETHICS

Series Founding Co-Editors

John Collins Harvey, *Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., U.S.A.*

Francesc Abel, *Institut Borja de Bioetica, Center Borja, Barcelona, Spain*

Series Editor

Christopher Tollefsen, *University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC, U.S.A.*

Editorial Advisory Board

Joseph Boyle, *St. Michael's College, Toronto, Canada*

Thomas Cavanaugh, *University of San Francisco, San Francisco, CA, U.S.A.*

Mark Cherry, *St. Edward's University, Austin, TX, U.S.A.*

Ana Smith Iltis, *Wake Forest University, Winston-Salem, NC, U.S.A.*

PERSONS, MORAL WORTH, AND EMBRYOS

A Critical Analysis of Pro-Choice Arguments

Edited by

STEPHEN NAPIER

National Catholic Bioethics Center, Philadelphia, PA, USA

 Springer

Editor
Stephen Napier
National Catholic Bioethics Center
6399 Drexel Rd
19151 Philadelphia
PA, USA
snapier@ncbcenter.org

ISSN 0376-7418

ISBN 978-94-007-1601-8

e-ISBN 978-94-007-1602-5

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-1602-5

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011930731

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2011

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the following persons for helping with this project either as a reviewer or through constructive and helpful guidance: Mike Austin, Joseph Shaw, Barry Smith, David Manley, Chris Kaposy, Father Martin Rhonheimer, Phillip Montague, Tal Brewer, Hud Hudson, James Cutsinger, Lori Gruen, Father Alfred Cioffi, Rosalind Hursthouse, and Patrick Yeung. Many of these people do not share the views expressed herein, and their help exudes the kind of charitable and intellectually just discourse this volume aims to realize. I would like especially to thank Christopher Tollefsen whose guidance on this project was indispensable.

Contents

1	Introduction: What Are Persons? What Is Valuable?	1
	Stephen Napier	
Part I Philosophical Considerations		
2	I Was Once a Fetus: That Is Why Abortion Is Wrong	19
	Alexander R. Pruss	
3	Brain Life and the Argument from Potential: Affirming the Ontological Status of Human Embryos and Fetuses	43
	Jason T. Eberl and Brandon P. Brown	
4	The Human Being, a Person of Substance: A Response to Dean Stretton	67
	Francis J. Beckwith	
5	The Concept of Person in Bioethics	85
	Anselm Winfried Müller	
6	Abortion and Virtue Ethics	101
	Mathew Lu	
7	Embryos, Four-Dimensionalism, and Moral Status	125
	David B. Hershenov	
8	The Christian Hypothesis	145
	David W. Fagerberg	
9	Fetal Interests, Fetal Persons, and Human Goods	163
	Christopher Tollefsen	
Part II Scientific Considerations		
10	Fetal Pains and Fetal Brains	187
	A.A. Howsepian	
11	A Biological Definition of the Human Embryo	211
	Maureen L. Condic	

Part III Perspectives from Law and Political Philosophy

12 Public Reason and Abortion Revisited 239
David Thunder

13 Abortion, Sexual Markets and the Law 255
Helen M. Alvaré

Index 281

Contributors

Helen M. Alvaré George Mason University School of Law, Arlington, VA, USA, halvare@gmu.edu

Francis J. Beckwith Department of Philosophy, Baylor University, Waco, TX, USA, Francis_Beckwith@baylor.edu

Brandon P. Brown Indiana University School of Medicine, Indianapolis, IN, USA, brpbrown@iupui.edu

Maureen L. Condic Department of Neurobiology and Anatomy, University of Utah School of Medicine, Salt Lake City, UT, USA, mlcondic@neuro.utah.edu

Jason T. Eberl Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis, Indianapolis, IN, USA, jeberl@iupui.edu

David W. Fagerberg Department of Theology, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN, USA, Fagerberg.1@nd.edu

David B. Hershenov Department of Philosophy, University of Buffalo, Buffalo, NY, USA, dh25@buffalo.edu

A.A. Howsepian Fresno Medical Education Program, Department of Psychiatry, University of California, San Francisco, Fresno, CA, USA, howsepian@sbcglobal.net

Mathew Lu Department of Philosophy, University of St. Thomas, St. Paul, MN, USA, mathewlu@stthomas.edu

Anselm Winfried Müller Department of Philosophy, University of Trier, Trier, Germany, muellera94@hotmail.de

Stephen Napier National Catholic Bioethics Center, Philadelphia, PA, USA, snapier@ncbcenter.org

Alexander R. Pruss Department of Philosophy, Baylor University, Waco, TX, USA, Alexander_Pruss@baylor.edu

David Thunder Department of Political Science, Villanova University, Villanova, PA, USA, david.thunder@villanova.edu

Christopher Tollefsen Department of Philosophy, University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC, USA, christopher.tollefsen@gmail.com

About the Authors

Helen Alvaré, J.D. is an Associate Professor of Law at the George Mason University School of Law in Arlington, Virginia. There she teaches and publishes in the areas of property law, family law, and Catholic social thought. From 2000 to Spring, 2008, Professor Alvaré taught at the Catholic University Columbus School of Law. Professor Alvaré also lectures widely in the United States and Europe on matters concerning marriage, family and respect for human life. She is a consultant to ABC News and to the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops' (USCCB) Marriage and Pro-Life Committees. In 2008, Pope Benedict XVI named Professor Alvaré a Consultor to the Pontifical Council for the Laity. Professor Alvaré is also Senior Law Fellow at the Culture of Life Foundation.

Francis J. Beckwith Ph.D. is Professor of Philosophy & Church-State Studies at Baylor University. He teaches in the departments of philosophy and political science as well as the J. M. Dawson Institute of Church-State Studies, where he served as its Associate Director from July 2003 until January 2007. He is also a Resident Scholar in Baylor's Institute for Studies of Religion (ISR). In 2008–2009 he served on the faculty of the University of Notre Dame as the Mary Ann Remick Senior Visiting Fellow in Notre Dame's Center for Ethics & Culture. His publications include the following: *Defending Life: A Moral and Legal Case Against Abortion Choice* (Cambridge University Press, 2007); *Do the Right Thing: Readings in Applied Ethics and Social Philosophy*, 2nd edition (Wadsworth, 2002); and with L. P. Pojman, *The Abortion Controversy 25 Years After Roe v. Wade: A Reader*, 2nd edition (Wadsworth, 1998). His articles include: "Defending Abortion Philosophically: A Review-Essay of David Boonin's *A Defense of Abortion*." *Journal of Medicine & Philosophy* 31 (April 2006): 177–203; "Of Souls, Selves, and Cerebrums: A Reply to Himma." *Journal of Medical Ethics* 31.1 (January 2005): 56–60; w/ John Peppin, "Physician-Value Neutrality: A Critique" *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 28.1 (Spring 2000): 67–77; "Theism, Miracles, and the Modern Mind." *The Rationality of Theism*. Edited by Paul Moser and Paul Copan, (New York: Routledge, 2003), 221–236.

Brandon P. Brown M.D. received his BA in Political Philosophy from the University of Dallas in 2003. He then completed an MD and MA in Philosophy-Bioethics from Indiana University-Indianapolis in 2008. He is presently completing specialty training in Radiology. When not in the hospital, he teaches in the department of Philosophy and Religion at Butler University in Indianapolis, IN. He lives on a farm in Indiana with his wife Noelle and their four children.

Maureen L. Condic Ph.D. is associate professor of neurobiology and anatomy at the University of Utah. She has published widely on stem cell research, neuro-regeneration research and has addressed theoretical issues in biology, namely, what is an organism. She received her Ph.D. from the University of California—Berkeley.

Jason T. Eberl Ph.D. is associate professor of philosophy and co-director of the graduate program in philosophy at Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis. He received his Ph.D. in 2003 from Saint Louis University, and during his graduate training was the recipient of the distinguished James Collins Memorial Scholarship, and competed successfully for a dissertation fellowship. His research interests include the philosophy of human nature and the philosophical thought of Thomas Aquinas. He is the author of *Thomistic Principles and Bioethics* (Routledge, 2006) and has published over two dozen articles in journals such as *The National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly*, *Review of Metaphysics*, *International Philosophical Quarterly*, *The Modern Schoolman*, *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*, and *Bioethics*.

David Fagerberg Ph.D. David Fagerberg joined the Department of Theology at the University of Notre Dame as an associate professor in 2003, and was appointed concurrent director of the Notre Dame Center for Liturgy the year after. He holds an M.Div. from Luther Northwestern Seminary; an M.A. in liturgical studies from St. John's University, Collegeville; an S.T.M. from Yale Divinity School, and Ph.D. in liturgical theology from Yale University.

From 2001–2003 he was an associate professor at the Liturgical Institute at the University of St Mary of the Lake in Mundelein, and served as acting director his second year there. From 1988 to 2001 he taught in the Religion Department of Concordia College, Moorhead, MN.

He has published articles on liturgy, sacraments, and liturgical theology in various academic journals, including *Worship*, *America*, *New Blackfriars*, *Pro Ecclesia*, *Diakonia*, *Touchstone*, and *Antiphon*. He is the author of three books: *Theologia Prima* (Hillenbrand Books, 2003), *What is Liturgical Theology?* (Liturgical Press, 1992), *The Size of Chesterton's Catholicism* (University of Notre Dame Press, 1998). He also serves on the editorial board of *The Chesterton Review*, and is a contributing editor to *Gilbert Magazine* where his column "All I Survey" appears regularly. In 1995 he was the Richardson Fellow at the University of Durham, U.K.

David B. Hershenov Ph.D. is an associate professor and Chair of the philosophy department at the University of Buffalo. He received his Ph.D. in philosophy from the University of California at Santa Barbara. He has numerous articles

in prestigious journals. The following is a representative list: “Organisms and their Bodies.” *Mind*. Forthcoming; “A Hylomorphic Account of Personal Identity Thought Experiments,” *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* 82 (3) (2008); “Lowe’s Defense of Constitution and the Principle of Weak Extensionality,” *Ratio*, 21 (2) (2008): 168–181; “The Memory Criterion of Identity and the Problem of Backward Causation,” *International Philosophical Quarterly*, 47 (2) (2007): 181–185; “How a Hylomorphic Metaphysics Constrains the Abortion Debate,” *National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly*, 5 (4) (2005): 751–764; “Do Dead Bodies Pose a Problem for the Biological Account of Identity?” *Mind*, 114 (2005): 31–59.

A.A. Howsepian M.D. Ph.D. is a board certified psychiatrist and holds a Ph.D. in philosophy from the University of Notre Dame. He currently holds several positions including an adjunct professorship in bioethics at Trinity University, and an adjunct position in psychiatry at the University of California—San Francisco. Furthermore, he is in private practice in psychiatry. He has published widely in bioethics, philosophy of religion and psychiatry. He is currently a principal investigator for two clinical studies in psychiatry. In addition to his academic accomplishments, Dr. Howsepian has been an expert witness in numerous court proceedings, and is involved in cross-section of forensic psychiatry and religious belief.

Anselm W. Müller Ph.D. is a professor of philosophy at the University of Trier. He studied under Elizabeth Anscombe at Oxford University and has published primarily in the area of ethical theory, action theory, and practical ethics. Representative publications include several books in German including, *Laßt uns Menschen machen, Ende Der Moral (Argumente 1)*, and *Die Gute Universitat*. And he has published several articles in English including “Radical Subjectivity: Morality Versus Utilitarianism,” *Ratio* (1977): 115–132.

Stephen Napier Ph.D. is a research ethicist with the National Catholic Bioethics Center (NCBC). He has also completed a two-year post-doctoral fellowship in clinical and research ethics at St. Thomas hospital in Nashville, during which he performed numerous ethics consults and was involved in the hospital’s Institutional Review Board (IRB). Before joining the NCBC he was a Human Protections Analyst at Cincinnati Children’s Hospital and Medical Center (ranked among the top 5 children’s hospitals in the nation) and directed ethics education for the IRB there. He currently serves on an IRB at the University of Pennsylvania. He has published a book entitled *Virtue Epistemology: Motivation and Knowledge* (Continuum, 2008). Additionally, he has contributed to the journals *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*, *Sophia*, *The National Catholic Bioethics Quarterly*, *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and the *Linacre Quarterly*.

Alexander R. Pruss Ph.D. is an associate professor of philosophy at Baylor University.

He received a Ph.D. in Mathematics from the University of British Columbia, and Ph.D. in philosophy from the University of Pittsburgh. He is the recipient of several distinguished awards and honors both as a graduate student and

post-graduate. His publications include the following books: *The Principle of Sufficient Reason: A Reassessment*, (Cambridge University Press, 2006); and with Richard Gale edited *The Existence of God*, with a 30,000 word introduction, (International Research Library of Philosophy, Aldershot, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2003). Representative articles include: “A Gödelian ontological argument improved”, *Religious Studies* (forthcoming); “Conjunctions, disjunctions and Lewisian semantics for counterfactuals”, *Synthese* 156 (2007): 33–52; “David Lewis’s counterfactual arrow of time”, *Noûs* 37 (2003): 606–637.

David Thunder Ph.D. is in the Department of Political Science at Villanova University. Previously he was postdoctoral fellow at the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions at Princeton University. He was the recipient of the Phillip Moore Dissertation Fellowship at the University of Notre Dame 2003. His publications include the following articles: “Am I My Brother’s Keeper? Grounding and Motivating an Ethos of Social Responsibility in a Free Society.” *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*. (Forthcoming); “Why Value Pluralism Does Not Support the State’s Enforcement of Liberal Autonomy: A Response to Crowder.” *Political Theory*, 37 (1) (2009), pp. 154–160; and the following book chapter among others: “Public Discourse Without God? Moral Disposition in Democratic Deliberation.” In *Ethics Without God? The Divine in Contemporary Moral and Political Thought*, ed. Fulvio Di Blasi, Joshua P. Hochschild, and Jeffrey Langan. (St. Augustine Press, 2007), 49–64.

Christopher Tollefsen Ph.D. is a professor of philosophy at the University of South Carolina. He was a 2004–2005 Visiting Fellow at the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions at Princeton University. He has authored over forty articles or book chapters on bioethics, meta-ethics, and natural law ethics, and he is the author of two recently published books, *Biomedical Research and Beyond: Expanding the Ethics of Inquiry* (Routledge, 2007) and *Embryo: A Defense of Human Life*, co-authored with Robert P. George (DoubleDay, 2008). He is the editor of the Springer book series Catholic Studies in Bioethics, and is both James Madison Fellow and Fellow of the Witherspoon Institute in Princeton, New Jersey. He holds a doctorate in philosophy from Emory University.