

Difficulty in Poetry

“Castiglione’s work is a triumph of clarity and rigour in a field all too often plagued by vagueness. His comprehensive account of prior approaches to poetic difficulty is both respectful and critical. He then demonstrates, via experiments and clear exposition, how we can investigate a complex literary phenomenon such as poetic difficulty without sacrificing scientific standards.”

—Lesley Jeffries, *University of Huddersfield, UK*

“Drawing on a range of scholarship across stylistics, cognitive poetics, and literary studies, and grounded in the detailed analysis of numerous examples, this monograph presents a rigorous and comprehensive framework for the analysis of difficulty in poetry. This original and significant work will be of interest to researchers and advanced students across literary studies and stylistics.”

—Nigel McLoughlin, *University of Gloucestershire, UK*

Daide Castiglione

Difficulty in Poetry

A Stylistic Model

palgrave
macmillan

Davide Castiglione
Department of English Philology
Vilnius University
Vilnius, Lithuania

ISBN 978-3-319-97000-4 ISBN 978-3-319-97001-1 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-97001-1>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018949314

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover image: © L.Dep illustrations/Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature
Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

*To my parents,
with love and gratitude*

Acknowledgements

Wallace Stevens' 'What We See Is What We Think' is reprinted by permission of Random House and Faber and Faber. 'What We See Is What We Think' from *The Collected Poems of Wallace Stevens* by Wallace Stevens, copyright © 1954 by Wallace Stevens and copyright renewed 1982 by Holly Stevens. Used by permission of Alfred A. Knopf, an imprint of the Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, a division of Penguin Random House LLC. All rights reserved.

Susan Howe's, 'The Midnight', copyright © 2003 Susan Howe. Reprinted by permission of New Directions Publishing Corp.

Extracts from 'Speech! Speech!' by Geoffrey Hill, copyright © 2002 by Geoffrey Hill. Reprinted with permission of Counterpoint Press.

Dylan Thomas' 'When once the twilight locks no longer' is printed with permission of Weidenfeld & Nicolson and New Directions Publishing Corp copyright © 1939 by New Directions Publishing Corp.

Charles Bernstein's 'Safe Methods of Business', copyright © by Charles Bernstein is reprinted with permission from the author and reprinted from Los Angeles: Sun & Moon Press, 1987; rpt. Salt Publishing 2004.

Contents

1 Introduction	1
Bibliography	9
Part I Theorising Poetic Difficulty	
2 Previous Routes to Difficulty in Poetry	13
2.1 Scholarly Traditions	13
2.2 Side Themes	36
2.3 Summary and Conclusion	57
Bibliography	60
3 New Coordinates of Difficulty: An Interdisciplinary Framework	65
3.1 Introduction: Redefining Poetic Difficulty	65
3.2 Empiricism and the Scientific Method	66
3.3 Stylistics, Foregrounding and Systemic-Functional Grammar	69
3.4 Language Processing and Comprehension	74

3.5	Components of Significance and Literary Comprehension	79
3.6	A Pragmatics of Reading: Relevance Theory	85
3.7	Summary and Conclusion	87
	Bibliography	90
4	Genes of Difficulty: The Indicators	95
4.1	Readerly Indicators	96
4.2	Linguistic Indicators	102
4.3	Summary and Conclusion	156
	Bibliography	159
 Part II Analysing Poetic Difficulty		
5	Organisms of Difficulty: The Data	169
5.1	Selecting Primary Data: The Corpus of Poems	170
5.2	Eliciting Secondary Data the Empirical Tests and Readers' Background	181
5.3	Summary and Conclusion	191
	Bibliography	192
6	Processing Baseline: The Easy Poem	197
6.1	Establishing the Category: Mark Strand's 'The Late Hour'	198
6.2	Testing the Category: John Betjeman's 'Loneliness'	213
6.3	Conclusion	217
	Bibliography	219
7	Transient Difficulty: Utterances Towards Obscurity	223
7.1	Establishing the Category: Wallace Stevens's 'What We See Is What We Think'	225
7.2	Testing the Category: Hart Crane's 'at Melville's Tomb' and Dylan Thomas's 'Once the Twilight Locks no Longer'	241

7.3	Problematising the Category: Geoffrey Hill's Stanza 33	254
7.4	Conclusion	271
	Bibliography	275
8	Permanent Difficulty: Against Thematic Significance	279
8.1	Difficulty as Literal Resistance: Formal Symbolism as Icon of Disorder	280
8.2	Difficulty as Persuasive Nonsense: Semantic Deviance and Argumentation	316
8.3	Conclusion	332
	Bibliography	333
9	General Conclusions	337
9.1	Integrating the Main Approaches	338
9.2	Addressing Side Themes	348
9.3	Envoy	364
	Bibliography	364
	Author Index	367
	Concept Index	375

List of Figures

Fig. 3.1	A definition of difficulty in poetry	66
Fig. 3.2	Stages in the development of a science (Adapted from Cohen et al. 2000: 16)	68
Fig. 3.3	Kintsch's construction-integration model (Adapted from Harley 2008)	76
Fig. 3.4	Overview of the frameworks at work in the model	88
Fig. 5.1	The pencil-and-paper questionnaire for the comprehension task	183
Fig. 5.2	On-screen instructions for the reading task	186
Fig. 5.3	The personal questionnaire (Study 1)	187
Fig. 5.4	The personal questionnaire (Study 2)	189
Fig. 6.1	'The Late Hour': breakdown of easiness (text effects and lack of LIDs)	212
Fig. 6.2	'Loneliness': breakdown of easiness (text effects and lack of LIDs)	216
Fig. 7.1	Linguistic classification of enjambment types (Adapted from Levin 1971: 183)	236
Fig. 7.2	'What We See Is What We Think': breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	240
Fig. 7.3	'At Melville's Tomb': breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	253

Fig. 7.4	‘When Once the Twilight Locks No Longer’: breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	254
Fig. 7.5	Stanza 33 and ‘The Late Hour’: two interpretive comments by a participant	269
Fig. 7.6	Stanza 33: breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	271
Fig. 8.1	Extract from <i>Canto LXXXI</i> : breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	294
Fig. 8.2	‘A Small Swatch Bluish-Green’: an interpretive comment by a participant	304
Fig. 8.3	‘Never to be’ in discourse: data from COCA	309
Fig. 8.4	‘A Small Swatch Bluish-Green’: breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	315
Fig. 8.5	Extract from <i>Patriarchal Poetry</i> : breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	315
Fig. 8.6	‘A Box’: breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	330
Fig. 8.7	‘Safe Methods of Business’ (first stanza): breakdown of difficulty (text effects and LIDs)	330
Fig. 9.1	Difficulty: sequential application of the model	339
Fig. 9.2	Participants’ enjoyment of five poems	341

List of Tables

Table 2.1	Main conceptual differences between obscurity and difficulty	56
Table 4.1	RIDs according to previous empirical research	98
Table 4.2	RIDs and posited prototypical text effects	102
Table 4.3	LID 1—Orthographic deviation	105
Table 4.4	LID 2—Graphological deviation	108
Table 4.5	LID 3—Morphological deviation	110
Table 4.6	LID 4—Phonological foregrounding	114
Table 4.7	Sample behavioural data on imageability from the MRC Psycholinguistic Database	120
Table 4.8	LID 5—Difficulty of vocabulary—relevant dimensions	125
Table 4.9	Common source and target domains	134
Table 4.10	LID 6—Semantic dimensions	137
Table 4.11	LID 7—Syntactic dimensions	145
Table 4.12	LID 8—Aspects of discourse	157
Table 5.1	The corpus of poems: an overview	173
Table 6.1	Wordlist for responses to Q3—‘The Late Hour’	200
Table 7.1	Wordlist for responses to Q3—‘What We See Is What We Think’	227

Table 7.2	Transitivity analysis of deviant verb–noun collocations in ‘At Melville’s Tomb’ and in ‘Once the Twilight Locks No Longer’	244
Table 7.3	Wordlist for responses to Q3—Stanza 33	257
Table 7.4	Sample occurrences of ‘Yes I know’ in the COCA	259
Table 8.1	Wordlist for responses to Q3—Pound’s extract from <i>Canto LXXXI</i>	282
Table 8.2	Wordlist for responses to Q3—Howe’s ‘A Small Swatch Bluish-Green’	298
Table 8.3	Head–modifier parsing possibilities in the first prepositional phrase of ‘A Small Swatch Bluish-Green’	300
Table 9.1	The four typologies: breakdown of difficulty based on LIDs and RIDs	345