

IMISCOE Research Series

This series is the official book series of IMISCOE, the largest network of excellence on migration and diversity in the world. It comprises publications which present empirical and theoretical research on different aspects of international migration. The authors are all specialists, and the publications a rich source of information for researchers and others involved in international migration studies.

The series is published under the editorial supervision of the IMISCOE Editorial Committee which includes leading scholars from all over Europe. The series, which contains more than eighty titles already, is internationally peer reviewed which ensures that the book published in this series continue to present excellent academic standards and scholarly quality. Most of the books are available open access.

For information on how to submit a book proposal, please visit: <http://www.imiscoe.org/publications/how-to-submit-a-book-proposal>.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13502>

Rainer Bauböck
Editor

Debating European Citizenship

 Springer Open

Editor
Rainer Bauböck
European University Institute
San Domenico di Fiesole, Italy



ISSN 2364-4087 ISSN 2364-4095 (electronic)
IMISCOE Research Series
ISBN 978-3-319-89904-6 ISBN 978-3-319-89905-3 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-89905-3>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018953168

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019. This book is an open access publication.
Open Access This book is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license and indicate if changes were made.

The images or other third party material in this book are included in the book's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the book's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Acknowledgements

This volume brings together three forums originally published online and as Robert Schuman Centre Working Papers and adds to these an original essay by Jo Shaw. Each of the debates was co-edited by myself with the authors of the lead essays introducing them. The forum ‘Should EU Citizens Living in Other Member States Vote There in National Elections?’ was kicked off and co-edited by Philippe Cayla and Catriona Seth, the forum ‘Freedom of Movement Under Attack: Is It Worth Defending as the Core of EU Citizenship?’ by Floris de Witte, and the forum ‘Should EU Citizenship Be Duty-Free?’ by Maurizio Ferrera. I am very grateful to them for agreeing to this book publication as well as to the altogether 41 authors in this book whose contributions have engaged with the controversial questions we asked them to answer in a spirit of a respectful and frank debate. My most profound thanks go to Jelena Dzankic and Oriane Caligaro who were involved in these debates at different times as coordinators of the EUDO Citizenship project, as well as to Anna Kyriazi who has provided extremely competent and reliable assistance in editing this book.

Robert Schuman Centre
European University Institute
Fiesole, Italy

Rainer Bauböck

Preface

Are the nationals of EU member states also citizens of the European Union? This is what Art. 20 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union says they are. But what precisely does it mean to be a citizen of a union which some observers still describe as an international organization that just coordinates the interests of its member states across a wider range of policies than most others do?

The present volume addresses this question in an unusual way. There is already a large number of excellent books on the topic that collect stand-alone chapters from authors presenting different answers.¹ Readers interested in historical, legal and political science perspectives on EU citizenship should consult these volumes. Yet in such publications, scholars rarely speak and behave as citizens are supposed to do – they present their views without engaging with each other in a dialogue on questions that citizens are concerned about. The present book is different; it is a collection of debates, each of which asks a question that is at the core of the present EU citizenship dilemmas.

In a political debate, speakers are expected to listen to each other and to address each other. The three debates in this book are the results of online debates that have been actually structured like a conversation. The first contribution in each debate is a kick-off that defends a specific answer to the lead question. The subsequent contributions were not all commissioned at the same time but over several months and each author was asked to respond not only to the question and the kick-off text, but to take into account or criticise also the views of the previous responses without repeating points already made by others. Contributions are short, written in a non-technical

¹ See e.g. Bellamy, R. and Warleigh, A. (eds.) (2001), *Citizenship and governance in the European Union*. London, New York: Continuum; Bellamy, R., Castiglione, D. and Santoro, E. (eds.) (2004), *Lineages of European Citizenship: Rights, Belonging and Participation in Eleven Nation-States*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan; Isin, E. F. and Saward, M. (eds.) (2013), *Enacting European Citizenship*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; Kochenov, D. (ed.) (2017), *EU Citizenship and Federalism: The Role of Rights*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; Thym, D. (ed.) (2017), *Questioning EU citizenship: judges and the limits of free movement and solidarity in the EU*. Oxford; Portland, Oregon: Hart Publishing.

language and addressed to a broader audience than the respective discipline of the author. We have also deliberately invited non-academic authors whose practical knowledge or civic engagement provides important insights. This format should be very useful for teaching purposes at undergraduate as well as graduate level. I sincerely hope that the book will also be read by practitioners and those often insultingly called ‘ordinary citizens’ who are interested in the future of Europe.

In the past, organising such a conversation across a wide range of countries and academic disciplines would have been extraordinarily difficult. Today, this can be done on the Internet. All three debates in this book have been originally published online in the Forum section of the EUDO CITIZENSHIP observatory, which has recently expanded into [GLOBALCIT](#), the Global Citizenship Observatory. The book also meets another important requirement for debates among citizens: they must be public and freely accessible to all. This was of course true for the original online publication of the three debates. Yet it is still exceptional for academic books to be freely accessible under a ‘golden open access’ licence. I am therefore very grateful to the IMISCOE editorial committee and to Springer for accepting to publish the book in their open access series.

There is one way in which the debates in this book differ from the ideal of political deliberation among citizens in the public sphere. These debates do not aim to reach conclusions in the sense of a political decision taken by majority vote or a consensus achieved through the force of the better argument. They leave the initial question open. One reason is that it is really hard to make academic scholars change their views. The other and more important reason is that it is not for them to decide these questions. The aim of these debates is thus to inform readers about a wide range of views presented by authors who respectfully disagree with each other even after having made strong efforts to engage with each other. What the reader gets from this is, hopefully, different and also less time consuming than what she can learn from ploughing through thick academic volumes.

The three debates collected in this volume concern all three dimensions of citizenship that T. H. Marshall identified in his seminal essay of 1949: the civil, political and social aspects of EU citizenship. The first debate was held in 2012, before the 2014 European Parliament elections and should be picked up again before the forthcoming ones in May 2019. It raises the question of why mobile EU citizens can vote in local and EP elections in their host EU member state, but not in national elections. For some authors this is a serious democratic deficit, for others it illustrates that the EU is not a federation but a union of states.

The second debate addresses the civil right of free movement, which is at the core of EU citizenship. The context for this debate was the Brexit referendum, in which EU free movement became the most controversial policy issue and before which the UK government had negotiated concessions that included new powers to restrict temporarily access of EU citizens to certain welfare benefits. The question posed to the authors is whether free movement should still be defended and expanded because it enhances freedom from state interference, or whether this dimension has been overstretched through decisions by the Court of Justice of the European Union at the expense of the political will of majorities in the member states and of national welfare regimes.

The third and most recent debate continues in many ways the second one. It starts from the question of why EU citizenship does not include any citizen duties, although the Treaties speak in a general way about the rights and duties of the citizens of the Union. This puzzle leads very quickly to a general controversy about the ‘weight’ of EU citizenship and its main beneficiaries. Several authors regard EU citizenship as a progressive force precisely because it protects individual liberties beyond the nation-state without imposing legal duties or thicker identities on them, while others advocate a stronger social component that would also address cleavages resulting from rising social inequality and the populist backlash among the less mobile Europeans. This debate in particular discusses also practical policy proposals for EU duties and social rights.

Although the debates were held at different periods over the last six years, none of them has become irrelevant or outdated. There are, however, important aspects of EU citizenship that are not covered in them. These concern in particular the impact of EU citizenship on the citizenship of member states from which it is derived and the – as yet unknown – solutions to the loss of EU citizenship rights enjoyed by UK citizens in Europe and of EU citizen rights in the UK after Brexit. The three debates are therefore complemented by an introductory essay on these topics specifically written for this volume by Jo Shaw, a prominent EU lawyer and co-director of the GLOBALCIT observatory.

This book has a companion volume on the ‘Transformations of National Citizenship’ that will be published in the same series later this year and that collects four more GLOBALCIT forum debates on current challenges for citizenship in democratic states.

Contents

<i>EU citizenship: Still a Fundamental Status?</i>	1
Jo Shaw	
Part I: Should EU Citizens Living in Other Member States Vote There in National Elections?	
<i>EU-Citizens Should Have the Right to Vote in National Elections</i>	21
Philippe Cayla and Catriona Seth	
<i>EU Citizens Should Have Voting Rights in National Elections, But in Which Country?</i>	23
Rainer Bauböck	
<i>A European or a National Solution to the Democratic Deficit?</i>	27
Alain Brun	
<i>EU Accession to the ECHR Requires Ensuring the Franchise for EU Citizens in National Elections</i>	31
Andrew Duff	
<i>How to Enfranchise Second Country Nationals? Test the Options for Best Fit, Easiest Adoption and Lowest Costs</i>	33
David Owen	
<i>What's in a People? Social Facts, Individual Choice, and the European Union</i>	37
Dimitry Kochenov	
<i>Testing the Bonds of Solidarity in Europe's Common Citizenship Area</i>	43
Jo Shaw	
<i>'An Ever Closer Union Among the Peoples of Europe': Union Citizenship, Democracy, Rights and the Enfranchisement of Second Country Nationals</i>	47
Richard Bellamy	
<i>Five Pragmatic Reasons for a Dialogue with and Between Member States on Free Movement and Voting Rights</i>	51
Kees Groenendijk	

<i>Don't Start with Europeans First. An Initiative for Extending Voting Rights Should also Promote Access to Citizenship for Third Country Nationals</i>	55
Hannes Swoboda	
<i>Voting Rights and Beyond</i>	57
Martin Wilhelm	
<i>One Cannot Promote Free Movement of EU Citizens and Restrict Their Political Participation</i>	61
Dora Kostakopoulou	
<i>Second Country EU Citizens Voting in National Elections Is an Important Step, but Other Steps Should Be Taken First</i>	69
Ángel Rodríguez	
<i>A More Comprehensive Reform Is Needed to Ensure That Mobile Citizens Can Vote</i>	73
Sue Collard	
<i>Incremental Changes Are not Enough – Voting Rights Are a Matter of Democratic Principle</i>	77
Tony Venables	
<i>Mobile Union Citizens Should Have Portable Voting Rights Within the EU</i>	81
Roxana Barbulescu	
<i>Concluding Remarks: Righting Democratic Wrongs</i>	85
Philippe Cayla and Catriona Seth	
 Part II: Freedom of Movement Under Attack: Is it Worth Defending as the Core of EU Citizenship?	
<i>Freedom of Movement Needs to Be Defended as the Core of EU Citizenship</i>	93
Floris De Witte	
<i>The Failure of Union Citizenship Beyond the Single Market</i>	101
Daniel Thym	
<i>State Citizenship, EU Citizenship and Freedom of Movement</i>	107
Richard Bellamy	
<i>Free Movement as a Means of Subject-Formation: Defending a More Relational Approach to EU Citizenship</i>	113
Päivi Johanna Neuvonen	
<i>Free Movement Emancipates, but What Freedom Is This?</i>	117
Vesco Paskalev	

<i>Free Movement and EU Citizenship from the Perspective of Intra-European Mobility</i>	121
Saara Koikkalainen	
<i>The New Cleavage Between Mobile and Immobile Europeans</i>	125
Rainer Bauböck	
<i>Whose Freedom of Movement Is Worth Defending?</i>	129
Sarah Fine	
<i>The Court and the Legislators: Who Should Define the Scope of Free Movement in the EU?</i>	133
Martijn van den Brink	
<i>Reading Too Much and Too Little into the Matter? Latent Limits and Potentials of EU Freedom of Movement</i>	139
Julija Sardelić	
<i>What to Say to Those Who Stay? Free Movement is a Human Right of Universal Value</i>	145
Kieran Oberman	
<i>Union Citizenship for UK Citizens</i>	149
Glyn Morgan	
<i>UK Citizens as Former EU Citizens: Predicament and Remedies</i>	153
Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler	
<i>'Migrants', 'Mobile Citizens' and the Borders of Exclusion in the European Union</i>	163
Martin Ruhs	
<i>EU Citizenship, Free Movement and Emancipation: A Rejoinder</i>	169
Floris De Witte	
Part III: Should EU Citizenship Be Duty-Free?	
<i>EU Citizenship Needs a Stronger Social Dimension and Soft Duties</i>	181
Maurizio Ferrera	
<i>Liberal Citizenship Is Duty-Free</i>	199
Christian Joppke	
<i>Building Social Europe Requires Challenging the Judicialisation of Citizenship</i>	205
Susanne K. Schmidt	
<i>EU Citizenship Should Speak Both to the Mobile and the Non-Mobile European</i>	211
Frank Vandenbroucke	

<i>The Impact and Political Accountability of EU Citizenship</i>	219
Dorte Sindbjerg Martinsen	
<i>'Feed them First, Then Ask Virtue of Them': Broadening and Deepening Freedom of Movement</i>	223
Andrea Sangiovanni	
<i>EU Citizenship, Duties and Social Rights</i>	231
Martin Seeleib-Kaiser	
<i>Why Compensating the 'Stayers' for the Costs of Mobility Is the Wrong Way to Go</i>	235
Julia Hermann	
<i>Balancing the Rights of European Citizenship with Duties Towards National Citizens: An Inter-National Perspective</i>	239
Richard Bellamy	
<i>Grab the Horns of the Dilemma and Ride the Bull</i>	245
Rainer Bauböck	
<i>Why Adding Duties to European Citizenship Is Likely to Increase the Gap Between Europhiles and Eurosceptics</i>	257
Theresa Kuhn	
<i>Enhancing the Visibility of Social Europe: A Practical Agenda for 'The Last Mile'</i>	261
Ilaria Madama	
<i>Towards a 'Holding Environment' for Europe's (Diverse) Social Citizenship Regimes</i>	267
Anton Hemerijck	
<i>Imagine: European Union Social Citizenship and Post-Marshallian Rights and Duties</i>	279
Dora Kostakopoulou	
<i>Why the Crisis of European Citizenship is a Crisis of European Democracy</i>	287
Sandra Seubert	
<i>Regaining the Trust of the Stay-at-Homes: Three Strategies</i>	293
Philippe Van Parijs	
<i>Social Citizenship, Democratic Values and European Integration: A Rejoinder</i>	299
Maurizio Ferrera	

About the editor

Rainer Bauböck is currently a part time professor at the Robert Schuman Centre of the European University Institute. He held the chair in social and political theory at the Department of Political and Social Sciences of the EUI from 2007 to 2018 and was Dean of Graduate Studies from 2012 to 2016. Rainer Bauböck is also a corresponding member of the Austrian Academy of Sciences and chair of its Commission on Migration and Integration Research.

His research interests are in normative political theory and comparative research on democratic citizenship, migration, European integration, nationalism and minority rights. Together with Jo Shaw (University of Edinburgh) and Maarten Vink (University of Maastricht), he coordinates [GLOBALCIT](#), an online observatory on citizenship and voting rights.

His most recent book publications are: [Democratic Inclusion](#). Rainer Bauböck in Dialogue, Manchester University Press: Manchester, 2017; [The Oxford Handbook of Citizenship](#) (Ayelet Shachar, Rainer Bauböck, Irene Bloemraad, Maarten Vink, eds.). Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017; [Transnational Citizenship and Migration](#) (Rainer Bauböck, ed., London: Routledge, 2017).

Contributors

Roxana Barbulescu University Academic Fellow in New Migrations in UK and Europe, School of Sociology and Social Policy, University of Leeds

Richard Bellamy Professor of Political Science and Director of the Max Weber Programme, European University Institute

Alain Brun Former officer of the European Commission

Philippe Cayla Européens sans frontières, Paris, France

Sue Collard Senior Lecturer in French Politics and Contemporary European Studies, University of Sussex Department of Politics, Sussex European Institute, Sussex Centre for Migration Research

Floris de Witte Associate Professor, Department of Law, London School of Economics and Political Science

Andrew Duff President of the Spinelli Group and Visiting Fellow at the European Policy Centre

Maurizio Ferrera Professor of Political Science, Department of Social and Political Sciences, University of Milan

Sarah Fine Senior Lecturer in Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, King's College London

Kees Groenendijk Emeritus Professor of Sociology of Law, founder and Research Fellow of the Centre for Migration Law, Radboud University

Anton Hemerijck Professor of Political Science and Sociology, Director of Graduate Studies, Department of Political and Social Sciences, European University Institute

Julia Hermann Post-doctoral research fellow, Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies, Utrecht University

Christian Joppke Professor of General Sociology, Institute of Sociology, University of Bern

Dimitry Kochenov Chair in EU Constitutional Law, Faculty of Law, University of Groningen

Saara Koikkalainen University researcher, University of Lapland

Dora Kostakopoulou Professor of European Union Law, European Integration and Public Policy, School of Law, University of Warwick

Theresa Kuhn Associate Professor of Political Science, Department of Political Science, University of Amsterdam

Ilaria Madama Associate Professor of Political Science, Department of Social and Political Sciences, University of Milan

Glyn Morgan Associate Professor of Political Science, Maxwell School, Syracuse University and Collegio Alberto

Päivi Johanna Neuvonen Academy of Finland Postdoctoral Researcher, Faculty of Law, University of Helsinki

Kieran Oberman Lecturer in Politics, School of Social and Political Science, Edinburgh University

David Owen Professor of Social and Political Philosophy, Division of Politics and International Relations, University of Southampton

Vesco Paskalev Lecturer, School of Law and Politics, University of Hull

Ángel Rodríguez Full Professor of Constitutional Law, Facultad de Derecho, University of Málaga

Martin Ruhs Chair in Migration Studies and Deputy Director of the Migration Policy Centre, European University Institute

Andrea Sangiovanni Professor of Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, King's College London

Julija Sardelić Marie Skłodowska Curie Postdoctoral Fellow, Leuven International and European Studies, University of Leuven

Susanne K. Schmidt Professor of Political Science, Bremen International Graduate School of Social Sciences, University of Bremen

Martin Seeleib-Kaiser Professor of Comparative Public Policy, Institute of Political Science, Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen

Catriona Seth Marshal Foch Professor of French Literature, All Souls College, University of Oxford

Sandra Seubert Professor of Political Theory, Department of Political Science, Goethe University Frankfurt

Jo Shaw Salvesen Chair of European Institutions, School of Law, University of Edinburgh

Dorte Sindbjerg Martinsen Professor of Political Science, Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen

Hannes Swoboda Former member of the European Parliament (Austria) and President of the Progressive Alliance of Socialists and Democrats in the European Parliament

Daniel Thym Jean-Monnet-Chair of European, International and Public Law and managing Director of the Research Centre Immigration and Asylum Law, University of Konstanz

Martijn van den Brink Postdoctoral researcher, Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity

Philippe Van Parijs Hoover Chair of Economic and Social Ethics, Centre for Ethics, Social and Political Philosophy, University of Louvain

Frank Vandenbroucke University Professor, University of Amsterdam

Tony Venables Founder of the European Citizen Action Service

Martin Wilhelm Director of Citizens For Europe

Reuven (Ruvi) Ziegler Associate Professor in International Refugee Law, School of Law, University of Reading