

Argumentation Library

Volume 31

Series Editor

Frans H. van Eemeren, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Editorial Board

Bart Garssen, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Scott Jacobs, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA

Erik C.W. Krabbe, University of Groningen, The Netherlands

John Woods, University of British Columbia, Canada

Since 1986 Springer, formerly Kluwer Academic Publishers, publishes the international interdisciplinary journal *Argumentation*. This journal is a medium for distributing contributions to the study of argumentation from all schools of thought. From a journal that published guest-edited issues devoted to specific themes, *Argumentation* has developed into a regular journal providing a platform for discussing all theoretical aspects of argumentative discourse. Since 1999 the journal has an accompanying book series consisting of volumes containing substantial contributions to the study of argumentation. The *Argumentation Library* aims to be a high quality book series consisting of monographs and edited volumes. It publishes texts offering important theoretical insights in certain major characteristics of argumentative discourse in order to inform the international community of argumentation theorists of recent developments in the field. The insights concerned may pertain to the process of argumentation but also to aspects of argumentative texts resulting from this process. This means that books will be published not only on various types of argumentative procedures, but also on the features of enthymematic argumentation, argumentation structures, argumentation schemes and fallacies. Contributions to the series can be made by scholars from a broad variety of disciplines, ranging from law to history, from linguistics to theology, and from science to sociology. In particular, contributions are invited from argumentation theorists with a background in informal or formal logic, modern or classical rhetoric, and discourse analysis or speech communication. A prerequisite in all cases is that the contribution involved is original and provides the forum of argumentation theorists with an exemplary specimen of advanced scholarship. The *Argumentation Library* should enrich the study of argumentation with insights that enhance its quality and constitute a fruitful starting point for further research and application. All proposals will be carefully taken into consideration by the editors. They are to be submitted in fourfold. If the prospects for including a certain project in the series are realistic, the author(s) will be invited to send at least three representative chapters of their manuscript for review to the editors. In case the manuscript is then judged eligible for publication, the complete manuscript will be reviewed by outside expert referees. Only then a final decision can be taken concerning publication.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/5642>

Paula Olmos
Editor

Narration as Argument

 Springer

Editor

Paula Olmos
Department of Linguistics, Modern
Languages, Logic and Philosophy
of Science, Theory of Literature
and Comparative Literature
Autonomous University of Madrid
Madrid, Spain

ISSN 1566-7650

ISSN 2215-1907 (electronic)

Argumentation Library

ISBN 978-3-319-56882-9

ISBN 978-3-319-56883-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-56883-6

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017939863

© Springer International Publishing AG 2017

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature

The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Contents

1	Introduction: Narratives, Narrating, Narrators	1
	Paula Olmos	
Part I Narratives as Sources of Knowledge and Argument		
2	Narratives and the Concept of Argument	11
	Christopher Tindale	
3	Arguing with Stories	31
	Floris Bex and Trevor Bench-Capon	
4	Narrative Fiction as a Source of Knowledge	47
	Mitchell Green	
5	Analogy, Supposition, and Transcendentality in Narrative Argument	63
	Gilbert Plumer	
6	Parables: Crossroads Between the Cognitive Theory of Metaphor and Argumentation Theory	83
	Eduardo de Bustos	
Part II Argumentative Narratives in Context		
7	Narratives and Pragmatic Arguments: Ivens' <i>The 400 Million</i>	103
	Paul van den Hoven	
8	The Sample Convention, or, When Fictionalized Narratives Can Double as Historical Testimony	123
	Leona Toker	

9	From Narrative Arguments to Arguments That Narrate.....	141
	Adrien Frenay and Marion Carel	
10	Narrative as Argument in Atul Gawande’s “On Washing Hands” and “Letting Go”	177
	James Phelan	
11	On Thought Experiments and Other Narratives in Scientific Argument	193
	Paula Olmos	
12	How to Win Wars: The Role of the War Narrative.....	215
	Tone Kvernbekk and Ola Bøe-Hansen	

Contributors

Trevor Bench-Capon University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

Floris Bex Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands

Ola Bøe-Hansen Department of Veterans Affairs, Norwegian Armed Forces, Oslo, Norway

Marion Carel Centre des Sciences des Littératures en Langue Française (CSLF), Université Paris Nanterre, Paris, France

Eduardo de Bustos Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, Madrid, Spain

Adrien Frenay Centre des Sciences des Littératures en Langue Française (CSLF), Université Paris Nanterre, Paris, France

Mitchell Green University of Connecticut, Storrs, CT, USA

Tone Kvernbekk Department of Education, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

Paula Olmos Department of Linguistics, Modern Languages, Logic and Philosophy of Science, Theory of Literature and Comparative Literature, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Madrid, Spain

James Phelan Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA

Gilbert Plumer Law School Admission Council (retired), Newtown, PA, USA

Christopher Tindale University of Windsor, Windsor, ON, Canada

Leona Toker The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem, Israel

Paul van den Hoven Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands

About the Authors

Trevor Bench-Capon

University of Liverpool (United Kingdom)

Trevor Bench-Capon has a DPhil from St John's College Oxford. After working in Computer Science at the University of Liverpool for 25 years, he retired in September 2012 and is now an honorary visiting professor in the department. He remains interested in all aspects of advanced informatics systems, particularly their application to law. Current focus is on dialogue and argument.

Floris Bex

Utrecht University (The Netherlands)

Floris Bex has a PhD in law and artificial intelligence from the University of Groningen. He currently works as a lecturer in intelligent systems at the University of Utrecht's Department of Information and Computing Sciences. His main areas of investigation are the computational, philosophical, and linguistic aspects of argumentation, linking mathematical models with more natural representations of argument and discourse.

Ola Bøe-Hansen

Defense Staff (Norway)

Commander (RNoN) Ola Bøe-Hansen is currently deputy chief of veterans affairs, Department of Veterans Affairs in the Norwegian Armed Forces. He worked for many years at the Norwegian Defense University College. He has written extensively on military theory, specializing in narrative research and research on strategic communication. Cdr Bøe-Hansen has served in operations in Afghanistan and on the Horn of Africa.

Marion Carel

EHESS-CNRS (France)

Marion Carel is a full professor of semantics at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales (EHESS). Her main areas of interest are the study of argumentation and the utterance act. She has published in 2011 *L'Entrelacement argumentatif. Lexique, discours et blocs sémantique* (Editions Honoré Champion).

Eduardo de Bustos

Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (Spain)

Eduardo de Bustos is professor of logic and philosophy of science and teaches philosophy of language in the Spanish distance-learning university UNED. He has also lectured at the University of Barcelona and several universities in Latin-American countries. He has been visiting professor at the University of Cambridge and the Institute of Cognitive Science of the University of California at Berkeley. He is author of *Introducción a la filosofía del lenguaje* (1982), with J.J Acero and D. Quesada; *Pragmática del español: negación, cuantificación y modo* (1986); *Filosofía del lenguaje* (1999); *La metáfora: ensayos transdisciplinarios* (2000); *Lenguaje, comunicación y cognición* (2004); and *Metáfora y argumentación* (2014).

Adrien Frenay

EHESS-CNRS (France)

Adrien Frenay is a professeur certifié de lettres modernes at the Université Paris Nanterre. He specializes in nineteenth- and twentieth-century French literature with a focus on space, place, and mobility. He is the coeditor of *Epreuves*, an independent scholarly journal about literature, translation, and social science.

Mitchell Green

University of Connecticut (USA)

Mitchell Green is a philosopher whose interests include the philosophy of language, the philosophy of art, and the philosophy of mind. Much of his research has also fallen within the broad category of pragmatics, as well as the evolutionary biology of communication. Green's publications include the book *Self-Expression* (Oxford) and the coedited volume *Moore's Paradox: New Essays on Belief, Rationality and the First Person* (Oxford). Green's articles have appeared in such journals as *Linguistics and Philosophy*, *Pragmatics & Cognition*, *Mind & Language*, *Nous*, *Mind*, *Philosophical Studies*, *Acta Analytica*, and *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*. He is currently completing a textbook in the philosophy of language and another book entitled *Know Thyself: On the Value and Limits of Self-Knowledge*.

Tone Kvernbekk

University of Oslo (Norway)

Tone Kvernbekk is professor in the Department of Education at the University of Oslo. She was adjunct professor at the Norwegian Defense University College for three consecutive periods. Her work centers on three main domains: philosophy of science, argumentation theory, and narrative theory – all three as applied to various problems and topics in educational theorizing and research.

Paula Olmos

Universidad Autónoma de Madrid (Spain)

Paula Olmos is lecturer in the area of logic and philosophy of science at Madrid's Autonomous University. Her research interest covers general argumentation theory and rhetoric and, more recently, argumentation in science. She has published papers

on these subjects in *Argumentation, Informal Logic* and *Revista Iberoamericana de Argumentación*, as well as in different collective volumes (e.g., *Systematic Approaches to Argument by Analogy* (ed. H.J. Ribeiro, 2014) and *Reflections on Theoretical Issues in Argumentation Theory* (eds. F.H. van Eemeren & B. Garssen, 2015), both in Springer's Argumentation Library). She is also coeditor, together with L. Vega of the *Compendio de Lógica, Argumentación y Retórica* (2011, 2012, 2013, 2016PB) and with H. Marraud, of the collective volume *De la demostración a la argumentación. Ensayos en honor de Luis Vega* (2015).

James Phelan

Ohio State University (USA)

James Phelan, distinguished university professor of English at Ohio State University and editor of *Narrative*, has written extensively about the rhetorical theory of narrative. His books include *Worlds from Words* (1981); *Reading People, Reading Plots* (1989); *Narrative as Rhetoric* (1996); *Living to Tell About It* (2005); *Experiencing Fiction* (2007); *Reading the American Novel, 1920-2010*; and *Somebody Telling Somebody Else* (2017). He is a founding member of Project Narrative at Ohio State.

Gilbert Plumer

Law School Admission Council (USA)

Gilbert Plumer is retired associate director for Assessment Projects and Research, Law School Admission Council (USA), and taught philosophy at Illinois State University, Parkland College, and in the University of Wisconsin. He has published papers in such journals as *Argumentation, Informal Logic, Dialectica, Southern Journal of Philosophy, Logique et Analyse, Philosophy and Phenomenological Research, Philosophical Quarterly*, and *Mind*.

Christopher Tindale

University of Windsor (Canada)

Christopher W. Tindale is director of the Centre of Research in Reasoning, Argumentation, and Rhetoric and professor of philosophy at the University of Windsor, where he is also coeditor of *Informal Logic* and the book series *Windsor Studies in Argumentation*. He is the author of many papers in argumentation theory, and his most recent books are *Reason's Dark Champions* (USC Press 2010) and *The Philosophy of Argument and Audience Reception* (Cambridge 2015).

Leona Toker

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem (Israel)

Leona Toker is professor in the English Department of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and author of *Nabokov: The Mystery of Literary Structures* (1989), *Eloquent Reticence: Withholding Information in Fictional Narrative* (1993), *Return from the Archipelago: Narratives of Gulag Survivors* (2000), and *Towards the Ethics of Form in Fiction: Narratives of Cultural Remission* (2010). She is the editor of *Commitment in Reflection: Essays in Literature and Moral Philosophy* (1994) and coeditor of *Rereading Texts/Rethinking Critical Presuppositions: Essays in*

Honour of H.M. Daleski (1996) as well as of *Knowledge and Pain* (2012). She has founded and is editing *Partial Answers: A Journal of Literature and the History of Ideas*, a semiannual peer-reviewed periodical published by Johns Hopkins University Press.

Paul van den Hoven

Utrecht University (The Netherlands)

Paul van den Hoven is professor of language and communication at Utrecht University and chair professor at Xiamen University. His research concerns the relation between socially and ideologically motivated rhetoric in text and the linguistic forms and other sign systems that constitute this rhetoric. Being trained as a lawyer as well as a linguist, Paul van den Hoven published on the rhetoric of legal discourse, judicial discourse in particular. Recently, he published *Gold Mining: The Art of Rhetorical Discourse Analysis* (Xiamen University Press).