

Paradigms and Theories Influencing Policies in the South African and International Water Sectors

Richard Meissner

Paradigms and Theories Influencing Policies in the South African and International Water Sectors

PULSE³, A Framework for Policy Analysis



Richard Meissner
Council for Scientific and Industrial
Research (CSIR)
Pretoria
South Africa

and

Centre for Water Resources Research
University of KwaZulu-Natal
Private Bag X01Scottsville 3209
South Africa

ISBN 978-3-319-48546-1 ISBN 978-3-319-48547-8 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-48547-8

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016955080

© Springer International Publishing AG 2017

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Marius Claassen for involving me in the Water Sustainability Flagship project and for encouraging me to develop PULSE³. The framework would not have been possible without a number of field trips undertaken for the project. Karen Nortje, Elliot Moyo, Nikki Funke, Winile Masangane, Cebile Ntombela, and Shanna Nienaber played varying roles in organising the field trips to the Greater Sekhukhune District Municipality. The field trips to the wastewater treatment plants gave valuable insight into the interaction between humans and the environment. Karen Nortje encouraged me to tell the story of my research journey (see appendix 1). I am also grateful to Inga Jacobs-Mata and Reyhana Mahomed for helping me in better communicating the PULSE³ framework for analysis to different audiences. During sessions where we discussed the framework, I realised just how difficult it can be to communicate one's scientific knowledge and that a critical eye can go a long way in improving matters.

I would also like to acknowledge the work of our subject librarian, Engela van Heerden. Her skilled literature searches have helped the research in many ways. I would also like to thank Juanette John for reading parts of the manuscript and the critical reflections she provided. To Hennie Lötter at the University of Johannesburg's Department of Philosophy, I owe a huge debt of gratitude. He agreed to read the PULSE³ framework and encouraged me to develop the theory of water research. Rudra Sil from the University of Pennsylvania also gave valuable inputs into the use of the concept 'analytic eclecticism'. He was willing to look at the use of the concept he elaborated upon with Peter J. Katzenstein at short notice and responded with exquisite insights. Deon Geldenhuys, from the University of Johannesburg's Department of Politics and International Relations, also gave valuable inputs after I showed him the framework over lunch in Melville. For his insight, I am very grateful. Sabine Stuart-Hill from the University of KwaZulu-Natal's Centre for Water Resource Research assisted greatly in my trip to Germany in July 2015 where I gave a presentation of PULSE³ at the University of Osnabrück's Institute for Environmental Systems Research. From this institute, I would like to thank Claudia Pahl-Wostl, Kathrin Knüppe, Elizabeth Ehling and

Christian Stein, and a host of other staff researchers for their participation and comments during the presentation. I would also like to thank Chad Harris and Catherine Botha from the Department of Philosophy at the University of Johannesburg for arranging a seminar where I presented the framework and case studies to a group of philosophers and other experts in the field of water resource governance and management. Present at this seminar, amongst others, were: Rafael Winkler, Hennie Lötter, Veli Mitova, Basil Fick and Jane Anderson. To these philosophers my heartfelt thanks.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Fritz Schmuhl from Springer who encouraged and guided me throughout the production and publication process. Without such dedication as Fritz's, a book like this would remain a pipe dream. I would furthermore like to express my gratitude to my friend Jeroen Warner who, over *eisbein* and beers in Osnabrück, also commented on the framework. Jeroen encouraged me to take the research further and gave some good pointers on strategies I could use to improve the text and thinking. Last but not least, I would like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments. Their suggestions on how to make the book more readable added immense value to the manuscript and the argumentation contained herein. Although numerous individuals were involved in making suggestions and reading various parts of the book, I bear full responsibility for any errors.

Contents

1	Water Research in South Africa	1
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	The Myths We Rely on	1
1.3	Science as Constant Critique	5
1.3.1	Acid Mine Drainage	7
1.3.2	Integrated Water Resources Management	8
1.3.3	Transboundary River Cooperation	11
1.4	Rethinking Inquiry in the Water Sector	13
1.5	Critical Solidarity	15
1.6	How the Rest of the Book Unfolds	19
1.7	Conclusion	19
	References	20
2	Water Governance and Management and Climate Change	25
2.1	Introduction	25
2.2	Climate Adaptation Strategies in Australia and South Africa	25
2.2.1	Climate Change Assessment and Adaptation	27
2.2.2	Paradigm Assessment of Adapting South African Cities and Towns'	27
2.2.3	Paradigm Assessment of Climate Change Vulnerability in South East Queensland	30
2.2.4	The South African and Australian Adaptation Plans Through the Lens of Analytic Eclecticism	32
2.2.5	Theory for Practice: Social Learning and Policy Paradigms	35
2.2.6	Discussion	40
2.3	South Africa's National Water Resource Strategy, Second Edition	44
2.3.1	Introduction	44
2.3.2	Paradigm Assessment of the NWRS2	45

2.3.3	The NWRS2 Through the Lens of Analytic Eclecticism	50
2.3.4	Theories for Practice	53
2.3.5	Discussion.	56
2.4	The UNDP’s Water and Ocean Governance Focus Area	59
2.4.1	Introduction.	59
2.4.2	Paradigm Assessment of the Focus Area.	60
2.4.3	The UNDP’s Webcontent Through the Lens of Analytic Eclecticism	68
2.4.4	Theory for Practice: Social Constructivism	75
2.4.5	Discussion.	76
	References.	80
3	Active Substantiation: A Theory of Water Research	89
3.1	Introduction	89
3.2	Active Substantiation	89
3.3	The Active ‘Loom’.	91
3.4	Water on Mars	92
3.5	Air France Flight 447.	93
3.6	At the Behest of Active Substantiation.	95
3.7	Conclusion	97
	References.	97
4	PULSE³: A Framework for Analysis	99
4.1	Introduction	99
4.2	The Rationale for PULSE ³	99
4.3	PULSE ³ ’s Characteristics	100
4.3.1	Component #1: Research Paradigm Assessment	101
4.3.2	Component #2: The Ethos of Analytic Eclecticism.	113
4.3.3	Component #3: Theories for Practice	119
4.4	Operationalising Analytic Eclecticism and the Repertoire of Theories	122
4.5	Conclusion	127
	References.	127
5	Paradigms and Theories: Popular Labels and Their Delimitation	131
5.1	Introduction	131
5.2	Paradigms and Theories	131
5.3	The Importance of Paradigms and Theories	135
5.4	Causality.	139
5.5	The Unproductive Disdain for Research Paradigms and Theories.	142
5.6	Conclusion	149
	References.	149

6 Advancing Different Ideas	155
6.1 Introduction	155
6.2 Constant Critique as a Travelling Companion	155
Appendix 1: My Research Journey	158
Appendix 2: Theories for Practice	169
References	241
Index	249