

Incompetency and Competency Training

Arch Woodside • Rouxelle de Villiers •
Roger Marshall

Incompetency and Competency Training

Improving Executive Skills in Sensemaking,
Framing Issues, and Making Choices

 Springer

Arch Woodside
Boston College
Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts
USA

Rouxelle de Villiers
Department of Marketing
University of Waikato
Hamilton, New Zealand

Roger Marshall
Department of Marketing,
Advertising, Retailing & Sales
Auckland University of Technology
Auckland, New Zealand

ISBN 978-3-319-39106-9 ISBN 978-3-319-39108-3 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-39108-3

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016946486

© Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2016

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG Switzerland

This book is dedicated to Canada, Denmark, and Finland for the nations' frequently exercised cultural tolerance, avoidance of hubris, and competency in decision-making and acuteness in identifying and nonacceptance of incompetency training relating to issues in education, nuclear energy, weapons (guns), health care, religion, gender, and international affairs (e.g., calls to war in Vietnam, Iraq, and Syria).

Preface

This book covers the theory and practice of competency and incompetency training. Incompetency training includes the work of convicted investment confidence men (e.g., Bernie Madoff), President George W. Bush’s messages about Iraqi weapons of mass destruction, most work of grief counselors, and product portfolio tools in MBA degree programs. The book provides substantial evidence that incompetency training is pervasive and effective. “Incompetency training” includes formal and informal instruction that consciously (purposely) or unconsciously imparts knowledge, attitudes, beliefs, and behavior (including procedures) that are useless, inaccurate, misleading, and/or will lower performance outcomes of the trainee versus no training or training using alternative training methods. “Imparts” in the definition refers to exposing a trainee to incompetency training; such exposure is not a guarantee that the training increases the trainee’s incompetence. This book offers an early workbench model of incompetency training theory. The theory includes the proposition that executives and associates in firms, academia, and government organizations consciously as well as unknowingly offer incompetency training in many contexts. Increasing trainees’ vigilance and ability to recognize exposure to incompetency training may help trainees to decrease the effectiveness (impact) of exposures to incompetency training—advancing incompetency training theory and knowledge of incompetency training practice may be necessary conditions for remedying negative outcomes that follow from trainees receiving such training. Available evidence supports the first proposition and, to a limited extent, the second proposition. The book includes a series of laboratory experiments on tools advocated in the literature as aids in increasing incompetency and/or competency. Reading this book provides a comprehensive review of the literature on (in) competency training.

Chestnut Hill, MA
Hamilton, New Zealand
Auckland, New Zealand

Arch Woodside
Rouxelle de Villiers
Roger Marshall

Contents

1 Foundations for Theory and Practice of Competence and Incompetence Training	1
1.1 The Complexity of Competent Decision-Making	2
1.2 The Problem and Its Current Status	2
1.2.1 Evidence from the Real World	2
1.2.2 The Problem in Business Schools	3
1.2.3 Central Philosophies	4
1.2.4 Masters in Business Administration (MBA)	5
1.3 Making the Cut	6
1.3.1 Contextual or Ecological Rationality	6
1.3.2 Fast and Frugal Heuristics	7
1.3.3 When Less Is More	7
1.3.4 Blink Before You Decide	8
1.3.5 The Effects of Other People on Decision Competence	9
1.3.6 The Impact of Overconfidence and Blocking Dissent	10
1.4 Method	11
1.5 This Study’s Implications	12
References	13
2 Incompetency Training: Theory, Practice, and Remedies	19
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 Defining Incompetency Training	20
2.3 Incompetency Training Theory	23
2.3.1 Purposive, Individual-Level, Incompetency Training	23
2.3.2 Purposive, Public Level, Incompetency Training	29
2.3.3 State, National, Global Trainer Unconscious Imparting of Incompetency Training	31
2.3.4 Unconscious Individual and Firm Level Incompetency Training	33

2.4	Actions Useful for Overcoming Incompetency Training	40
2.5	Call for Papers	42
	References	44
3	Understanding and Modeling Configural Causality	49
3.1	Introduction	49
3.2	Research Design and QCA Procedures	49
3.2.1	General Overview of the Method and Operational Propositions	49
3.2.2	Research Design	51
3.3	Justification of the Paradigm and Methods	52
3.3.1	Selecting Appropriate Tools	52
3.3.2	Justification of the Use of QCA at Epistemological and Methodological Levels	54
3.3.3	Justification of Case-Based Methods	54
3.3.4	QCA as Method and Set of Tools	55
3.3.5	Justification of the Use of Laboratory Experiments	60
3.3.6	Justification of the Application of Simulated Interaction (SI)	60
3.3.7	In-baskets as an Andragogical Method	62
3.3.8	In-baskets as Research Method	63
3.4	Thought Experiments	67
3.5	Summary	68
	References	69
4	Laboratory Experiments of Configural Modeling	75
4.1	Design of the Laboratory Experiments	75
4.1.1	Administration of the Experimental Treatments	78
4.1.2	Competency and Incompetency Teaching Aids	80
4.2	Application of Qualitative Comparative Analysis (QCA) as Method	80
4.2.1	Definition of the Outcome of Interest	82
4.2.2	Selecting Cases	82
4.2.3	Selecting Causal Conditions	85
4.2.4	Scoring Cases: Conditions and Outcomes	89
4.2.5	Calibrating the Outcome: Decision Competency or Incompetency	90
4.2.6	Constructing the Truth Table	92
4.3	Validity of the Method, Procedures and Treatments	96
4.3.1	Internal Validity	97
4.3.2	External Validity: Equifinality and Predictive Validity	106
4.4	Constructing Conjunctive Recipes	108
4.5	Ethical Considerations	108
4.5.1	Principles of Partnership, Participation and Protection	108
4.6	Summary	110
	References	110

- 5 Analytics and Findings for Overall Competency** 115
 - 5.1 QCA Approach to Investigate Configurations of Conditions
for Overall Decision Competence 115
 - 5.2 Data and Truth Table 116
 - 5.2.1 Cases and Fuzzy Scores 116
 - 5.2.2 Fuzzy Truth Table: Evaluating Consistency
and Coverage 118
 - 5.2.3 Necessary and Sufficient Conditions 120
 - 5.3 Findings and Interpretations of Overall Decision Competence
and Decision Confidence 121
 - 5.3.1 Aggregate of All In-basket Simulations: Decision
Success 122
 - 5.3.2 Aggregate of All In-baskets Assessments: Decision
Confidence 133
 - 5.3.3 Summary of Core Findings 136
 - References 139
- 6 Analytics and Findings for Competency and Confidence** 141
 - 6.1 Findings and Interpretations of Decision Competence
and Decision Confidence: In-basket 1 141
 - 6.1.1 In-basket 1: Assessments of Decision Success
Causal Paths 142
 - 6.1.2 In-basket 1: Assessment of Decision Confidence Models . . . 146
 - 6.2 Findings and Interpretations of Decision Competence
and Decision Confidence: In-basket 2 150
 - 6.2.1 In-basket 2: Assessments of Decision Success
Causal Paths 150
 - 6.2.2 In-basket 2: Assessment of Decision
Confidence Models 156
 - 6.3 Findings and Interpretations of Decision Competence
and Decision Confidence: In-basket 3 160
 - 6.3.1 In-basket 3: Assessments of Decision Success
Causal Paths 160
 - 6.3.2 In-basket 3: Assessment of Decision
Confidence Models 162
 - 6.4 Findings and Interpretations of Decision Competence
and Decision Confidence: In-basket 4 168
 - 6.4.1 In-basket 4: Assessments of Decision Success
Causal Paths 168
 - 6.4.2 In-basket 4: Assessment of Decision
Confidence Models 170
 - 6.5 Discussion, Conclusions and Implications 172
 - 6.5.1 Discussion 172
 - 6.5.2 Comparative Analysis 175
 - 6.5.3 Finding, Interpretations and Implications 178
 - References 183

7 Delimiting Performance Outcomes 187

7.1 Rationalising Investigating Decision Incompetence and Decision Doubt 187

7.2 Examining Decision Incompetence (DI) and Decision Doubt (DD) Aggregated Over All In-baskets 190

7.2.1 DI of All In-basket Assessments 190

7.2.2 DD of all In-basket Assessments 195

7.3 Examining Decision Incompetence (DI) and Decision Doubt (DD) for In-basket 1 197

7.3.1 DI (In-basket 1) 197

7.3.2 DD (In-basket 1) 198

7.4 Examining DI and DD for In-basket 2 199

7.4.1 DI (In-basket 2) 199

7.4.2 DD (In-basket 2) 199

7.5 Examining DI and DD for In-basket 3 200

7.5.1 DI (In-basket 3) 200

7.5.2 DD (In-basket 3) 203

7.6 Examining DI and DD for In-basket 4 203

7.6.1 DI (In-basket 4) 203

7.6.2 DD (In-basket 4) 204

7.7 Summary 205

References 208

8 Contributions to Theory, Method, and Practice 211

8.1 Core Principles 211

8.2 Contribution of This Study 213

8.3 Limitations and Insights Useful for Designing Repeat Studies 215

8.3.1 Pre-existing Experience and Skills 216

8.3.2 Time and Timing 216

8.3.3 Bounded Rationality 217

8.3.4 Consensus 217

8.3.5 Group Dynamics 218

8.3.6 Range of Topics 218

8.3.7 Multiple Choice 219

8.3.8 Confidence and Likelihood to Change Decisions 220

8.4 A Final Thought 220

References 221

Appendices 223

Exhibit 1(i): Advertising Media Selection 225

5 Steps for Better Advertising Return 225

Exhibit 1(ii): A Guide to Managing Media and Public Relations 229

Exhibit 1(iii): Advertising that Expands Consumption 231

Exhibit 1A: Evidence on the Relationship Between a ROI and GNF1 Effectiveness of Advertising Campaigns 233

Exhibit 2A: Evidence on the Relationship Between Market Share and Profitability, Market Share and Firm Survival 235

Exhibit 2B: Information on Setting Price 237

In-Basket Task #2: Pricing Decision 239

Exhibit 2(i): Boston Consulting Group (BCG) Growth Share Matrix . . . 241

Exhibit 2(ii): The Experience Curve 243

Task #3: Hotel Selection 245

Exhibit 3B: Satisficing as Decision Strategy Useful Rules for Evaluating Hotel Scenarios 249

 Fast and Frugal Heuristics: Example from the Medical Industry 249

 Deciding Under Constraints 250

Exhibit 3A: GBF1 Decision About Conference Facility Attributes: Studies over a Decade 253

Exhibit 3(i) Steps in Rational Decision-Making/Weighted Priority Matrix 255

In-Basket Task #3: RISC Selection of a Hotel 257

 Your Consulting Report to the RED International Sales Manager 258

Instructions (Cont.) Group Rules for Effective Idea Generation 259

Briefing Document (Groups & GBS Only): Objectives & Your Role as Vice-President: XXX 261

The Objectives: (INDIVIDUALS * ~GBS) 263

In-Basket Task #4: Performance Management at ABConsulting 265

Exhibit 4A: Decision Aid: Information on Retaining Key Clients & Key Staff 269

Exhibit 4(i): Information on Retaining Key Clients 273

The Objectives (GROUP * ~GBS) 275

The Devil’s Advocate’s Perspective (GROUP) 277

**Briefing Document: Objectives & Hats You Need to Wear
(INDIVIDUALS *GBS) 279**