

Studies in Universal Logic

Series Editor

Jean-Yves Béziau (*Federal University of Rio de Janeiro and Brazilian Research Council, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil*)

Editorial Board Members

Hajnal Andréka (*Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest, Hungary*)

Mark Burgin (*University of California, Los Angeles, USA*)

Răzvan Diaconescu (*Romanian Academy, Bucharest, Romania*)

Josep Maria Font (*University of Barcelona, Barcelona, Spain*)

Andreas Herzig (*Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Toulouse, France*)

Arnold Koslow (*City University of New York, New York, USA*)

Jui-Lin Lee (*National Formosa University, Huwei Township, Taiwan*)

Larissa Maksimova (*Russian Academy of Sciences, Novosibirsk, Russia*)

Grzegorz Malinowski (*University of Łódź, Łódź, Poland*)

Darko Sarenac (*Colorado State University, Fort Collins, USA*)

Peter Schröder-Heister (*University Tübingen, Tübingen, Germany*)

Vladimir Vasyukov (*Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, Russia*)

This series is devoted to the universal approach to logic and the development of a general theory of logics. It covers topics such as global set-ups for fundamental theorems of logic and frameworks for the study of logics, in particular logical matrices, Kripke structures, combination of logics, categorical logic, abstract proof theory, consequence operators, and algebraic logic. It includes also books with historical and philosophical discussions about the nature and scope of logic. Three types of books will appear in the series: graduate textbooks, research monographs, and volumes with contributed papers.

Jean-Yves Béziau • Dale Jacquette
Editors

Around and Beyond the Square of Opposition

Editors

Jean-Yves Béziau
Institute of Philosophy
Federal University of Rio de Janeiro
Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

Dale Jacquette
Institute of Philosophy
University of Bern
Bern, Switzerland

ISBN 978-3-0348-0378-6

ISBN 978-3-0348-0379-3 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-3-0348-0379-3

Springer Basel Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012938884

Mathematics Subject Classification: 03-XX, 03Axx, 03Bxx

© Springer Basel 2012

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

Preface

The theory of inferences and oppositions among categorical propositions, based on Aristotelian term logic, is pictured in a striking square diagram. The graphic representation of contradictories, contraries, subcontraries and subalterns intended as a foundation for syllogistic logic can be understood and applied in many different ways with interesting implications for various disciplines, notably including epistemology, linguistics, mathematics, psychology. The square can also be generalized in other two-dimensional and multi-dimensional graphic depictions of logical and other relations, extending in breadth and depth the original Aristotelian theory. The square of opposition is accordingly a very attractive theme which has persisted down through the centuries with no signs of disappearing or even diminishing in fascination. For the last 10 years, there has been a new growing interest for the square due to new discoveries and challenging interpretations. This book presents a collection of previously unpublished papers by well-regarded specialists on the theory and interpretation of the concept and application of the square of opposition from all over the world. We thank all the authors who have contributed a paper to this book, and the referees who have analyzed, commented on, and made invaluable recommendations for improving the essays.

Rio de Janeiro, Brazil
Bern, Switzerland

Jean-Yves Béziau
Dale Jacquette

Contents

Part I Historical and Critical Aspects of the Square

The New Rising of the Square of Opposition	3
Jean-Yves Béziau	
Logical Oppositions in Arabic Logic: Avicenna and Averroes	21
Saloua Chatti	
Boethius on the Square of Opposition	41
Manuel Correia	
Leibniz, Modal Logic and Possible World Semantics: The Apulean Square as a Procrustean Bed for His Modal Metaphysics	53
Jean-Pascal Alcantara	
Thinking Outside the Square of Opposition Box	73
Dale Jacqueline	
John Buridan’s Theory of Consequence and His Octagons of Opposition	93
Stephen Read	
Why the Fregean “Square of Opposition” Matters for Epistemology	111
Raffaella Giovagnoli	

Part II Philosophical Discussion Around the Square of Opposition

Two Concepts of Opposition, Multiple Squares	119
John T. Kearns	
Does a Leaking O-Corner Save the Square?	129
Pieter A.M. Seuren	
The Right Square	139
Hartley Slater	
Oppositions and Opposites	147
Fabien Schang	

Pluralism in Logic: The Square of Opposition, Leibniz' Principle of Sufficient Reason and Markov's Principle	175
Antonino Drago	
Part III The Square of Opposition and Non-classical Logics	
The Square of Opposition in Orthomodular Logic	193
H. Freytes, C. de Ronde, and G. Domenech	
No Group of Opposition for Constructive Logics: The Intuitionistic and Linear Cases	201
Baptiste Mèlès	
The Square of Opposition and Generalized Quantifiers	219
Duilio D'Alfonso	
Privations, Negations and the Square: Basic Elements of a Logic of Privations	229
Stamatios Gerogiorgakis	
Fuzzy Syllogisms, Numerical Square, Triangle of Contraries, Inter-bivalence .	241
Ferdinando Cavaliere	
Part IV Constructions Generalizing the Square of Opposition	
General Patterns of Opposition Squares and 2n-gons	263
Ka-fat Chow	
The Cube Generalizing Aristotle's Square in Logic of Determination of Objects (LDO)	277
Jean-Pierre Desclés and Anca Pascu	
Hypercubes of Duality	293
Thierry Libert	
Part V Applications of the Square of Opposition	
How to Square Knowledge and Belief	305
Wolfgang Lenzen	
Structures of Oppositions in Public Announcement Logic	313
Lorenz Demey	
Logical Opposition and Collective Decisions	341
Srećko Kovač	
A Metamathematical Model for A/O Opposition in Scientific Inquiry	357
Mark Weinstein	

Contributors

Jean-Pascal Alcantara Centre Georges Chevrier-UMR 5605, Université de Bourgogne, Dijon, France

Jean-Yves Béziau CNPq – Brazilian Research Council, UFRJ – University of Brazil, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Ferdinando Cavaliere Cesenatico, FC, Italy

Saloua Chatti Department of Philosophy, Faculté des Sciences Humaines et Sociales, University of Tunis, Tunis, Tunisia

Ka-fat Chow The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hong Kong, China

Manuel Correia Facultad de Filosofía, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile, Santiago de Chile, Chile

Duilio D’Alfonso University of Calabria, Arcavacata di Rende, CS, Italy

C. de Ronde Departamento de Filosofía “Dr. A Korn”, Universidad de Buenos Aires-CONICET, Buenos Aires, Argentina; Center Leo Apostel and Foundations of the Exact Sciences, Vrije Universiteit Brussel, Brussels, Belgium

Lorenz Demey Center for Logic and Analytical Philosophy, Institute of Philosophy, KU Leuven – University of Leuven, Leuven, Belgium

Jean-Pierre Desclés LaLIC (Langues, Logiques, Informatique et Cognition), Université de Paris Sorbonne, Paris, France

G. Domenech Instituto de Astronomía y Física del Espacio, Buenos Aires, Argentina

Antonino Drago University of Pisa, Pisa, Italy

H. Freytes Università degli Studi di Cagliari, Cagliari, Italy; Instituto Argentino de Matemática, Buenos Aires, Argentina

Stamatios Gerogiorgakis University of Erfurt, Erfurt, Germany

Raffaella Giovagnoli Pontifical Lateran University, Vatican City, Italy

Dale Jacquette University of Bern, Bern, Switzerland

John T. Kearns Department of Philosophy and Center for Cognitive Science, University at Buffalo, the State University of New York, Buffalo, NY, USA

Srećko Kovač Institute of Philosophy, Zagreb, Croatia

Wolfgang Lenzen Dept. of Philosophy, University of Osnabrueck, Osnabrueck, Germany

Thierry Libert Département de mathématiques, Université Libre de Bruxelles (U.L.B.), Brussels, Belgium

Baptiste Méléès Université Blaise Pascal, Clermont-Ferrand, France

Anca Pascu LaLIC, Université de Bretagne Occidentale Brest, Brest Cedex 03, France

Stephen Read Department of Philosophy, University of St Andrews, St Andrews, Scotland, UK

Fabien Schang LHSP Henri Poincaré (UMR7117), Université de Lorraine, Nancy, France

Pieter A.M. Seuren Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics, Nijmegen, The Netherlands

Hartley Slater University of Western Australia, Crawley, WA, Australia

Mark Weinstein Department of Educational Foundations, Montclair State University, Upper Montclair, NJ, USA