

International Political Theory

Series Editor

Gary Browning, Oxford Brookes University, Oxford, UK

The Palgrave International Political Theory Series provides students and scholars with cutting-edge scholarship that explores the ways in which we theorise the international. Political theory has by tradition implicitly accepted the bounds of the state, and this series of intellectually rigorous and innovative monographs and edited volumes takes the discipline forward, reflecting both the burgeoning of IR as a discipline and the concurrent internationalisation of traditional political theory issues and concepts. Offering a wide-ranging examination of how International Politics is to be interpreted, the titles in the series thus bridge the IR-political theory divide. The aim of the series is to explore international issues in analytic, historical and radical ways that complement and extend common forms of conceiving international relations such as realism, liberalism and constructivism. This series is indexed by Scopus.

More information about this series at
<https://link.springer.com/bookseries/14842>

James Souter

Asylum as Reparation

Refuge and Responsibility for the Harms
of Displacement

palgrave
macmillan

James Souter
School of Politics and International Studies
University of Leeds
Leeds, UK

ISSN 2662-6039

ISSN 2662-6047 (electronic)

International Political Theory

ISBN 978-3-030-62447-7

ISBN 978-3-030-62448-4 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-62448-4>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2022

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Oleksiy Maksymenko/Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbstrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have accumulated many debts as this work has made its long journey from MSc dissertation, to doctoral thesis, to its current form a decade later. First and foremost, my supervisor throughout my postgraduate studies, Matthew Gibney, has deeply shaped my understanding of the ethics and politics of asylum and refugee protection, and I am grateful for his invaluable support, guidance and encouragement. During these studies, I was fortunate to receive very helpful written and/or oral feedback on my work in progress from Jenny Allsopp, Megan Bradley, Roger Duthie, Marcus Carlsen Häggrot, Rob Heimburger, Diletta Lauro, Susan MacDougall and Jonathan Seglow, as well as from audiences at conferences and seminars in Oxford, Copenhagen, Sibiu and Cairo. My examiners at various stages of the doctorate—namely Alexander Betts, Daniel Butt, Dawn Chatty, Katy Long and David Miller—also really helped me to develop my work. My postgraduate studies were only made possible by a full scholarship from the Economic and Social Research Council.

As the manuscript gradually made its way to completion, I have benefited from further feedback and support. I would like to thank Blair Peruniak, who has offered me very valuable input and encouragement throughout this project, providing challenging comments during long conversations not only on my draft doctoral thesis, but also on the book manuscript. Since moving to Leeds, I have been glad of discussions with and support from colleagues, particularly Laura Considine, Derek Edyvane, Josh Hobbs, Jason Ralph and Kerri Woods. Members of the

Centre for Contemporary Political Theory at Leeds offered very helpful advice and support in the final stages of writing. When developing my argument in Chapter 5 of this book, I received useful guidance from Christina Nick, and I am grateful to Derek for the opportunity to try out an early version of that chapter at a MANCEPT workshop at the University of Manchester in September 2017.

I was also very appreciative of the opportunity to participate in a workshop on the draft manuscript of this book at the annual conference of the Association for Political Thought in Oxford in January 2020. In addition to the conference organisers, particularly large thanks are due to the two discussants at the workshop, David Owen and Clara Sandelind, for very helpful comments on a previous version of the whole manuscript. I am also grateful for detailed feedback from an anonymous reviewer.

Anne Birchley-Brun and Ambra Finotello at Palgrave Macmillan offered very useful and reliable support, as well as much patience, as I completed the manuscript. Earlier versions of some passages of this book were published in *Political Studies* as ‘Towards a Theory of Asylum as Reparation for Past Injustice’ (2014, 62(2), 326-342) and in the *Journal of Refugee Studies* as ‘Durable Solutions as Reparation for the Unjust Harms of Displacement: Who Owes What to Refugees?’ (2014, 27(2), 171-190). I am grateful for helpful feedback from anonymous reviewers for these journals, as well as to those for the *Journal of Social Philosophy*. The usual disclaimer—that any remaining errors and shortcomings are my responsibility alone—of course applies.

This work took shape during a long period of mental health difficulties, and I am very grateful to my family, friends and colleagues for their support throughout. Without ongoing support from my mother, Annette Souter, I doubt I would have completed the thesis at all, let alone this book. My brother, Andrew Souter, offered a valuable pair of eyes as I finished both projects. Finally, I am grateful to Agi for her love and support, and to Marianna and Robin: it is because of them all that I got there in the end.

PRAISE FOR *ASYLUM AS REPARATION*

“How should the role of external states in generating refugee flows inform our understanding of obligations to refugees? In this book James Souter provides a lucid and compelling response to this question that elaborates the place of reparations within the moral functions of asylum. Working through a range of cases, Souter demonstrates the scope and significance of this reparative function for state responsibilities and its important role in strengthening the international refugee regime. This is a vital contribution to the political ethics of asylum that significantly develops the field.”

—Professor David Owen, *Politics and International Relations, School of Economic, Social and Political Sciences, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Southampton*

“In this excellent book, James Souter explores the urgent question of state responsibility for asylum. Which countries should be responsible for refugees, and why? He provides an original, compelling, and nuanced case for viewing asylum as reparation for states’ role in the causes displacement, whether due to military intervention, climate change, or colonial legacies. *Asylum as Reparation* is a significant contribution to Political Theory and Refugee Studies, which will be of great interest to students, researchers, and practitioners interested in the design of more just refugee policies.”

—Alexander Betts, *Professor of Forced Migration and International Affairs, University of Oxford*

“This book fills an important gap in the literature on the ethics of asylum, by detailing how asylum can be a form of reparation rather than mainly a fulfilment of humanitarian obligations. Unlike dominant accounts of asylum, this book emphasises the role of refugee-receiving states in contributing to the production of refugees. This emphasis ought to strongly impact how the literature as a whole understands asylum, leading us towards a more political and historical understanding. The book is exceptionally well-written and, as the first account of asylum as reparation, will be one of the key texts in this field.”

—Clara Sandelind, *University of Manchester*

“Asylum as Reparation is an insightful, sophisticated, original work that forces us to rethink the traditional moral basis for protecting refugees. By highlighting the need to take the historical wrongs suffered by the displaced seriously, Souter has produced a book that is essential reading for anyone interested in the future of asylum.”

—Matthew J. Gibney, *Professor of Politics and Forced Migration,
University of Oxford*

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
	<i>Foregrounding the Causes of Forced Migration</i>	2
	<i>Military Intervention and Displacement</i>	3
	<i>Climate Change and Displacement</i>	4
	<i>Colonial Legacies and Displacement</i>	4
	<i>A Reparative Approach to Asylum</i>	5
	<i>Structure of the Argument</i>	11
	<i>References</i>	16
Part I Asylum as a Form of Reparation		
2	Asylum and its Humanitarian Function	23
	<i>Asylum's Moral Functions</i>	24
	<i>Asylum's Humanitarian Function</i>	29
	<i>Existing Understandings of Humanitarian Asylum</i>	30
	<i>A Revised Conception of Humanitarian Asylum</i>	37
	<i>References</i>	39
3	Asylum's Reparative Function	43
	<i>The Principle of Reparation</i>	43
	<i>The Case for Viewing Asylum Reparatively</i>	51
	<i>Asylum as Restitution, Compensation and Satisfaction</i>	53
	<i>What This Argument is Not</i>	59
	<i>References</i>	60

Part II The Conditions of Asylum as Reparation

4	Causality and Outcome Responsibility	69
	<i>Outcome Responsibility</i>	70
	<i>Causal Responsibility for Forced Migration</i>	75
	<i>Creating Refugee Movements</i>	76
	<i>Intensifying Refugee Movements</i>	78
	<i>Creating the Conditions for Refugee Movements</i>	79
	<i>Joint Responsibility</i>	80
	<i>Assigning Outcome and Reparative Responsibility</i>	81
	<i>References</i>	87
5	Unjustified Harm	91
	<i>Just Displacement</i>	95
	<i>Tragically Justified Displacement and Dirty Hands</i>	97
	<i>Features of Dirty Hands Cases</i>	101
	<i>Reparative Obligations and the International Context</i>	103
	<i>What Reparation Would Be Owed?</i>	108
	<i>References</i>	109
6	Reparative Fittingness	113
	<i>Reparative Alternatives to Asylum</i>	114
	<i>Other Considerations</i>	122
	<i>Refugees' Choice</i>	123
	<i>Rectifying Particular Harms of Displacement</i>	127
	<i>References</i>	130
7	Reparation and Capability	135
	<i>Absorptive Capacity</i>	136
	<i>Incapacity and Progressive Realisation</i>	142
	<i>From Reparation to Capability</i>	145
	<i>References</i>	148

Part III Domestic and International Implications

8	Reparative Justice and the Prioritisation of Refugees	153
	<i>Reparative and Humanitarian Asylum</i>	154
	<i>Reparative Asylum and Prioritisation in Refugee Admissions</i>	157

	<i>Humanitarian Duties and Reparative Obligations</i>	159
	<i>Asylum, Reparation and Prioritisation</i>	162
	<i>References</i>	166
9	Reparative Justice and International Refugee	
	Responsibility-Sharing	169
	<i>Situations of Full Compliance</i>	171
	<i>Situations of Partial Compliance</i>	176
	<i>Incentives</i>	178
	<i>Incentive 1: ‘Refugee Insurance’ and Moral Hazard</i>	179
	<i>Incentive 2: The ‘Blame Game’</i>	181
	<i>Incentive 3: Refusing Humanitarian Intervention</i>	182
	<i>Implications</i>	184
	<i>References</i>	185
10	Conclusion	189
	<i>References</i>	193