

Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

Series Editors
Marcello Musto
York University
Toronto, ON, Canada

Terrell Carver
University of Bristol
Bristol, UK

The Marx renaissance is underway on a global scale. Wherever the critique of capitalism re-emerges, there is an intellectual and political demand for new, critical engagements with Marxism. The peer-reviewed series *Marx, Engels and Marxisms* (edited by Marcello Musto & Terrell Carver, with Babak Amini and Kohei Saito as Assistant Editors) publishes monographs, edited volumes, critical editions, reprints of old texts, as well as translations of books already published in other languages. Our volumes come from a wide range of political perspectives, subject matters, academic disciplines and geographical areas, producing an eclectic and informative collection that appeals to a diverse and international audience. Our main areas of focus include: the oeuvre of Marx and Engels, Marxist authors and traditions of the 19th and 20th centuries, labour and social movements, Marxist analyses of contemporary issues, and reception of Marxism in the world.

More information about this series at
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14812>

Igor Shoikhedbrod

Revisiting Marx's Critique of Liberalism

Rethinking Justice, Legality and Rights

palgrave
macmillan

Igor Shoikhedbrod
Ethics, Society & Law
Trinity College, University of Toronto
Toronto, ON, Canada

ISSN 2524-7123

ISSN 2524-7131 (electronic)

Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

ISBN 978-3-030-30194-1

ISBN 978-3-030-30195-8 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-30195-8>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer
Nature Switzerland AG 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover credit: Alexander Kirch/EyeEm/Getty Images

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature
Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

SERIES EDITORS' FOREWORD

THE MARX REVIVAL

The Marx renaissance is underway on a global scale. Whether the puzzle is the economic boom in China or the economic bust in 'the West', there is no doubt that Marx appears regularly in the media nowadays as a guru, and not a threat, as he used to be. The literature dealing with Marxism, which all but dried up twenty-five years ago, is reviving in the global context. Academic and popular journals and even newspapers and online journalism are increasingly open to contributions on Marxism, just as there are now many international conferences, university courses, and seminars on related themes. In all parts of the world, leading daily and weekly papers are featuring the contemporary relevance of Marx's thought. From Latin America to Europe, and wherever the critique to capitalism is reemerging, there is an intellectual and political demand for a new critical encounter with Marxism.

TYPES OF PUBLICATIONS

This series bring together reflections on Marx, Engels and Marxisms from perspectives that are varied in terms of political outlook, geographical base, academic methodologies, and subject-matter, thus challenging many preconceptions as to what 'Marxist' thought can be like, as opposed to what it has been. The series will appeal internationally to intellectual communities that are increasingly interested in rediscovering

the most powerful critical analysis of capitalism: Marxism. The series editors will ensure that authors and editors in the series are producing overall an eclectic and stimulating yet synoptic and informative vision that will draw a very wide and diverse audience. This series will embrace a much wider range of scholarly interests and academic approaches than any previous 'family' of books in the area.

This innovative series will present monographs, edited volumes and critical editions, including translations, to Anglophone readers. The books in this series will work through three main categories:

Studies on Marx and Engels

The series will include titles focusing on the *oeuvre* of Marx and Engels which utilize the scholarly achievements of the ongoing *Marx-Engels Gesamtausgabe*, a project that has strongly revived the research on these two authors in the past decade.

Critical Studies on Marxisms

Volumes will awaken readers to the overarching issues and world-changing encounters that shelter within the broad categorization 'Marxist'. Particular attention will be given to authors such as Gramsci and Benjamin, who are very popular and widely translated nowadays all over the world, but also to authors who are less known in the English-speaking countries, such as Mariátegui.

Reception Studies and Marxist National Traditions

Political projects have necessarily required oversimplifications in the twentieth century, and Marx and Engels have found themselves 'made over' numerous times and in quite contradictory ways. Taking a national perspective on 'reception' will be a global revelation and the volumes of this series will enable the worldwide Anglophone community to understand the variety of intellectual and political traditions through which Marx and Engels have been received in local contexts.

Toronto, Canada
Bristol, UK

Marcello Musto
Terrell Carver

TITLES PUBLISHED

1. Terrell Carver and Daniel Blank, *A Political History of the Editions of Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts*, 2014.
2. Terrell Carver and Daniel Blank, *Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts: Presentation and Analysis of the "Feuerbach chapter,"* 2014.
3. Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The History and Theory of Fetishism*, 2015.
4. Paresh Chattopadhyay, *Marx's Associated Mode of Production: A Critique of Marxism*, 2016.
5. Domenico Losurdo, *Class Struggle: A Political and Philosophical History*, 2016.
6. Frederick Harry Pitts, *Critiquing Capitalism Today: New Ways to Read Marx*, 2017.
7. Ranabir Samaddar, *Karl Marx and the Postcolonial Age*, 2017.
8. George Comninel, *Alienation and Emancipation in the Work of Karl Marx*, 2018.
9. Jean-Numa Ducange and Razmig Keucheyan (Eds.), *The End of the Democratic State: Nicos Poulantzas, a Marxism for the 21st Century*, 2018.
10. Robert Ware, *Marx on Emancipation and the Socialist Transition: Retrieving Marx for the Future*, 2018.
11. Xavier LaFrance and Charles Post (Eds.), *Case Studies in the Origins of Capitalism*, 2018.
12. John Gregson, *Marxism, Ethics, and Politics: The Work of Alasdair MacIntyre*, 2018.

13. Vladimir Puzone and Luis Felipe Miguel (Eds.), *The Brazilian Left in the 21st Century: Conflict and Conciliation in Peripheral Capitalism*, 2019.
14. James Muldoon and Gaard Kets (Eds.), *The German Revolution and Political Theory*, 2019.
15. Michael Brie, *Rediscovering Lenin: Dialectics of Revolution and Metaphysics of Domination*, 2019.
16. Gustavo Moura de Cavalcanti Mello and Mauricio de Souza Sabadini (Eds.), *Financial Speculation and Fictitious Profits: A Marxist Analysis*, 2019.
17. Shaibal Gupta, Marcello Musto & Babak Amini (Eds.), *Karl Marx's Life, Ideas, and Influences: A Critical Examination on the Bicentenary*, 2019.
18. August H. Nimtz, *Marxism versus Liberalism: Comparative Real-Time Political Analysis*, 2019.

TITLES FORTHCOMING

- Juan Pablo Rodríguez, *Resisting Neoliberal Capitalism in Chile: The Possibility of Social Critique*
- Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The Bourgeois and the Savage: A Marxian Critique of the Image of the Isolated Individual in Defoe, Turgot and Smith*
- Antonio Oliva, Ivan Novara & Angel Oliva (Eds.), *Marx and Contemporary Critical Theory: The Philosophy of Real Abstraction*
- Ducange, Jean-Numa, *Jules Guesde: The Birth of Socialism and Marxism in France*
- Spencer A. Leonard, *Marx, the India Question, and the Crisis of Cosmopolitanism*
- Kevin B. Anderson, Kieran Durkin & Heather Brown (Eds.), *Raya Dunayevskaya's Intersectional Marxism: Race, Gender, and the Dialectics of Liberation*
- Kaan Kangal, *Friedrich Engels and the Dialectics of Nature*
- Vesa Oittinen, *Marx's Russian Dimension*
- Ryuji Sasaki, *A New Introduction to Karl Marx: New Materialism, Critique of Political Economy, and the Concept of Metabolism*
- Victor Wallis, *Socialist Practice: Histories and Theories*
- Giuseppe Vacca, *Alternative Modernities: Antonio Gramsci's Twentieth Century*

Francesco Biagi, *Henri Lefebvre's Critical Theory of Space*

Gianfranco Ragona & Monica Quirico, *Borderline Socialism: Self-organisation and Anti-capitalism*

Marcello Mustè, *Marxism and Philosophy of Praxis: An Italian Perspective from Labriola to Gramsci*

Francesca Antonini, *Reassessing Marx's Eighteenth Brumaire: Dictatorship, State, and Revolution*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book grew out of a doctoral dissertation in the Department of Political Science at the University of Toronto. I am grateful to Simone Chambers, Margaret Kohn, and Alan Brudner, who served on my thesis committee, and whose mentorship and intellectual guidance helped pave the way for *Revisiting Marx's Critique of Liberalism*. I also thank Joseph Carens and Carol Gould, who served as examiners and have provided valuable feedback both at the doctoral defence and in the years after.

In the course of writing this book, I received sage advice and encouragement from Edward Andrew, Ronald Beiner, William Conklin, Frank Cunningham, Richard Day, and Irving Zeitlin. I owe a special thanks to Terell Carver, who is to be commended for his generous insights and intellectual curiosity as co-editor of the *Marx, Engels and Marxisms* series, and has been an indefatigable supporter of this book project since its inception. I am also grateful to Michelle Chen and John Stegner of Palgrave Macmillan for their patience and their confidence in the project, as well as to two anonymous reviewers, who offered incisive commentaries on my manuscript. For his meticulous copy-editing, I thank Ian Drummond. Ilija Mondovski took on the onerous task of assisting me with the preparation of the index, for which I am grateful. Any errors are of course my own.

My family has been in my corner since even before I showed any interest in legal and political theory, and they deserve credit for motivating me every step of the way. Thanks are due especially to my loving

parents, Irina and Michael, my brother Arik, my sister Elena, and my nephew Aiden, who continues to keep me on my toes. Iulia Mihaila had the mixed blessing of living with me during the arduous process of writing, and I cannot thank her enough for her affection, which has helped bring this book to fruition.

PRAISE FOR *REVISITING MARX'S*
CRITIQUE OF LIBERALISM

“Igor Shoikhedbrod’s book offers a masterful analysis of the role of rights in the thinking of Karl Marx and an original defense of Marx’s commitment to rights and the rule of law. To my knowledge, there is no comparable extended treatment of Marx’s conception of right in the existing literature, at least from a sympathetic point of view.”

—Carol C. Gould, *Distinguished Professor of Philosophy,*
City University of New York, USA

“This is an important and timely work. It gives a detailed and wide-ranging account of Marx’s ideas on justice and rights—the best that I know of—and engages critically with recent discussions of them in philosophy, politics and legal theory. It develops a Hegelian and Marxist theory of justice and challenges a number of widely held views. It is a pleasure to read. It makes a major original contribution in this area and will become central to the discussion of these topics.”

—Sean Sayers, *Emeritus Professor of Philosophy,*
the University of Kent, UK

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
1.1	<i>The Theoretical Background: Then and Now</i>	2
1.2	<i>The Aims of this Book</i>	4
1.3	<i>Summary of Chapters</i>	11
Part I Rethinking Justice, Legality, and Rights		
2	Situating Marx with Respect to Justice and Right	21
2.1	<i>Conceptualizing Recht</i>	22
2.2	<i>The Influence of Hegelian Rational Law</i>	24
2.3	<i>From Rational Law to the New Materialist Conception of Right</i>	33
2.4	<i>A New Materialist Basis for Right</i>	40
2.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	47
3	Marx's Radical Critique of Liberalism and the Supersession of Bourgeois Rights	55
3.1	<i>"On the Jewish Question": Marx's Selective Critique of Bourgeois Rights</i>	58
3.2	<i>Marx's Assessment of Rights in the Grundrisse and in Capital</i>	67

3.3	<i>Rights, Revolution, and Communist Society</i>	74
3.4	<i>The Supersession of Rights and the Conceptual Relevance of Aufhebung</i>	84
3.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	88
4	The Normative Argument for Communist Legality	97
4.1	<i>Forecasting the “Withering Away” of Law: The Theoretical Deviations of Evgeny Pashukanis</i>	98
4.2	<i>Pitting Pashukanis Against Marx</i>	106
4.3	<i>The Dubiousness of Technical Regulation</i>	109
4.4	<i>Defining the Terms of Recognition: Cognitive and Normative Considerations</i>	111
4.5	<i>Alienated Production Versus Associated Production: Marx’s Radical Account of Recognition</i>	112
4.6	<i>Mutual Recognition and the Reconstitution of Juridical Personhood</i>	117
4.7	<i>The Preliminary Case for Communist Legality</i>	121
4.8	<i>Legality Without Organized Coercion?</i>	123
4.9	<i>In Search of Marx’s Social Ontology: Lukács and the Ethical Necessity of Legal Mediation</i>	124
4.10	<i>Conclusion</i>	127

Part II The Contemporary Context

5	Contemporary Responses to Marx’s Critique of Liberal Justice	137
5.1	<i>John Rawls: Property-Owning Democracy and the Aporia of Concentrated Capital</i>	141
5.2	<i>Jürgen Habermas: Systemic Colonization and the Tension Between Democracy and Capitalism</i>	150
5.3	<i>Axel Honneth: Market Morality, Social Freedom, and the “Marx Problem”</i>	159
5.4	<i>Nancy Fraser: The Crisis of Financialized Capitalism and “De-Democratization”</i>	169
5.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	173

6	Democracy and the Riddle of All Constitutions: Marx's Enduring Lessons	181
6.1	<i>Unjust Laws and the Norms Underpinning the Rule of Law: Marx and E.P. Thompson</i>	182
6.2	<i>The Rule of Law and the Struggle for a "Normal" Working Day</i>	186
6.3	<i>The Struggle Over the Constitution</i>	191
6.4	<i>Solving the Riddle of All Constitutions: The Renewed Urgency of Transformative Politics</i>	195
6.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	201
7	Conclusion	207
	Bibliography	217
	Index	229