

# SpringerBriefs in Complexity

## Series Editors:

Henry D. I. Abarbanel, University of California, Institute for Nonlinear Science,  
La Jolla, CA, USA

Dan Braha, New England Complex Systems Institute,  
University of Massachusetts, North Dartmouth, MA, USA

Péter Érdi, Department of Physics, Center for Complex Systems Studies,  
Kalamazoo College, Kalamazoo, MI, USA

Karl J Friston, University College London, Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience,  
London, UK

Hermann Haken, University of Stuttgart, Center of Synergetics,  
Stuttgart, Germany

Viktor Jirsa, Université de la Méditerranée, Centre National de la Recherche  
Scientifique (CNRS), Marseille, France

Janusz Kacprzyk, Systems Research Institute, Polish Academy of Sciences,  
Warsaw, Poland

Kunihiko Kaneko, Research Center for Complex Systems Biology,  
The University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan

Scott Kelso, Florida Atlantic University, Center for Complex Systems and Brain  
Sciences, Boca Raton, FL, USA

Markus Kirkilionis, Mathematics Institute and Centre for Complex Systems,  
University of Warwick, Coventry, UK

Jürgen Kurths, University of Potsdam, Nonlinear Dynamics Group,  
Potsdam, Brandenburg, Germany

Ronaldo Menezes, Department of Computer Science, University of Exeter,  
Exeter, UK

Andrzej Nowak, Department of Psychology, Warsaw University,  
Warszawa, Poland

Hassan Qudrat-Ullah, School of Administrative Studies, York University,  
Toronto, Canada

Peter Schuster, University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

Frank Schweitzer, ETH Zurich, System Design, Zürich, Switzerland

Didier Sornette, ETH Zurich, Entrepreneurial Risk, Zürich, Switzerland

Stefan Thurner, Section for Science of Complex System,  
Medical University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

Linda Reichl, University of Texas, Center for Complex Quantum Systems,  
Austin, TX, USA

SpringerBriefs in Complexity are a series of slim high-quality publications encompassing the entire spectrum of complex systems science and technology. Featuring compact volumes of 50 to 125 pages (approximately 20,000–45,000 words), Briefs are shorter than a conventional book but longer than a journal article. Thus Briefs serve as timely, concise tools for students, researchers, and professionals.

Typical texts for publication might include:

- A snapshot review of the current state of a hot or emerging field
- A concise introduction to core concepts that students must understand in order to make independent contributions
- An extended research report giving more details and discussion than is possible in a conventional journal article,
- A manual describing underlying principles and best practices for an experimental or computational technique
- An essay exploring new ideas broader topics such as science and society

Briefs allow authors to present their ideas and readers to absorb them with minimal time investment. Briefs are published as part of Springer's eBook collection, with millions of users worldwide. In addition, Briefs are available, just like books, for individual print and electronic purchase. Briefs are characterized by fast, global electronic dissemination, straightforward publishing agreements, easy-to-use manuscript preparation and formatting guidelines, and expedited production schedules. We aim for publication 8-12 weeks after acceptance.

SpringerBriefs in Complexity are an integral part of the Springer Complexity publishing program. Proposals should be sent to the responsible Springer editors or to a member of the Springer Complexity editorial and program advisory board ([springer.com/complexity](http://springer.com/complexity)).

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/8907>

Michael Golosovsky

# Citation Analysis and Dynamics of Citation Networks

 Springer

Michael Golosovsky  
Racah Institute of Physics  
Hebrew University of Jerusalem  
Jerusalem, Israel

ISSN 2191-5326

ISSN 2191-5334 (electronic)

SpringerBriefs in Complexity

ISBN 978-3-030-28168-7

ISBN 978-3-030-28169-4 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-28169-4>

© The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

# Preface

This book belongs to the science of science. The idea of this book appeared in 2007–2010 when I attended the interdisciplinary seminar of Prof. Sorin Solomon in the Racah Institute of Physics, Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The purpose of the seminar was to construct physical models of social phenomena. My long experience with Web of Science suggested me to look for citations to scientific papers and to try to model their dynamics as physicists do. The modeling of citation dynamics has been popular among physicists, and almost all such models were built by theoreticians. These models were quite general and mathematically rigorous but lacked proper calibration, namely, comparison to measurements was insufficient. I set my goal to build a fully calibrated and validated model of citation dynamics. To achieve this goal, I hoped to use my background and experience in experimental solid-state physics which should help me to design special measurements for model validation.

This book presents a stochastic model of citation dynamics which is based on the well-known copying or redirection mechanism and which was built using methods of network science. The combination of modeling and measurement revealed that citation dynamics of scientific papers is nonlinear. This nonlinearity has far-reaching consequences including nonstationary citation distributions, diverging citation trajectories of similar papers, and runaways or “immortal papers” with an infinite citation life-span.

This book presents a fully calibrated and validated model of citation dynamics. It can serve as a practical tool for quantitative analysis and forecasting of citations and impact factors. This book appeals to students and researchers in network science, citation analysis, and bibliometrics.

I am indebted to Sorin Solomon who introduced me into the wonderful world of complexity, supported me through all stages of this research, and induced me to write this book. I am grateful to Sidney Redner and Peter Richmond for their encouragement and advices.

Jerusalem, Israel  
December 2018

Michael Golosovsky

# Abstract

We consider network of citations of scientific papers and use a combination of theoretical and experimental tools to uncover microscopic details of its growth. Namely, we develop a stochastic model of citation dynamics based on copying/redirection/triadic closure mechanism. In a complementary and coherent way, the model accounts both for statistics of references of scientific papers and for their citation dynamics. Originating in empirical measurements, the model is cast in such a way that it can be verified quantitatively in every aspect. Such verification is performed by measuring citation dynamics of Physics papers. The measurements revealed nonlinear citation dynamics, the nonlinearity being intricately related to network topology. The nonlinearity has far-reaching consequences including non-stationary citation distributions, diverging citation trajectory of similar papers, runaways or “immortal papers” with infinite citation lifetime etc. Nonlinearity in complex network growth is our most important finding. In a more specific context, our results can be a basis for quantitative probabilistic prediction of citation dynamics of individual papers and of the journal impact factor.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
1.1	The Place of Citation Analysis in Science	1
1.1.1	Bibliometrics	1
1.1.2	Discrete Power-Law Statistical Distributions	3
1.1.3	Complex Networks	4
1.2	The Purpose of the Book: A Quantitative Microscopic Model of Citation Dynamics	4
<b>2</b>	<b>Complex Network of Scientific Papers</b>	7
2.1	Statistics of References and Citations	7
2.2	Expanding Science	10
2.3	Temporal Aspect of the Citation Network	12
2.3.1	Age Distribution of References	12
2.3.2	Age Distribution of Citations	13
2.3.3	Reference-Citation Duality	15
<b>3</b>	<b>Stochastic Modeling of References and Citations</b>	19
3.1	Copying/Recursive Search Model of the Citation Process	19
3.1.1	Scenario: The Author's Strategy to Compose the Reference List of a Paper	19
3.1.2	Recursive Search Model: Mathematical Formalism	21
3.1.3	Recursive Search Algorithm	24
3.2	Modeling Age Distribution of References in the Reference Lists of Scientific Papers	24
3.2.1	A Mean-Field Model for References	24
3.2.2	Model Calibration: Direct and Indirect References	26
3.3	Stochastic Model of Citation Dynamics of Individual Papers	28
3.4	Continuous Approximation of the Model	31
3.4.1	Relation to the Bass Model	31
3.4.2	Analytic Solution	32

- 4 Citation Dynamics of Individual Papers: Model Calibration** ..... 35
  - 4.1 Measurements ..... 35
    - 4.1.1 Methodology ..... 35
    - 4.1.2 Direct Citations ..... 37
    - 4.1.3 Indirect Citations..... 38
  - 4.2 Degree-Degree Correlations in the Citation Network ..... 39
    - 4.2.1 Statistics of the Second-Generation Citing Papers ..... 39
    - 4.2.2 Probability of Indirect Citation..... 41
- 5 Model Validation** ..... 45
  - 5.1 Numerical Simulation of Stochastic Model..... 45
    - 5.1.1 Methodology ..... 46
    - 5.1.2 Citation Distributions ..... 47
    - 5.1.3 Citation Trajectories ..... 48
  - 5.2 Stochastic Component of Citation Dynamics..... 49
    - 5.2.1 Methodology ..... 49
    - 5.2.2 Statistical Distribution of Additional Citations..... 50
    - 5.2.3 Uncited Papers ..... 55
- 6 Comparison of Citation Dynamics for Different Disciplines** ..... 57
  - 6.1 Extension of the Model to Other Disciplines ..... 57
    - 6.1.1 Mean Number of Citations ..... 58
    - 6.1.2 Citation Distributions and the Aging Function  
for Citations ..... 59
    - 6.1.3 Indirect Citations..... 61
  - 6.2 Citation Lifetime ..... 63
  - 6.3 Universality of Citation Distributions ..... 64
  - 6.4 Uncited Papers ..... 66
  - 6.5 Summary ..... 68
- 7 Prediction of Citation Dynamics of Individual Papers**..... 69
  - 7.1 Introduction ..... 69
    - 7.1.1 Our Goal ..... 70
  - 7.2 Probabilistic Character of the Citation Process and Its  
Implications with Respect to Predictability of Future Citations ..... 71
    - 7.2.1 Divergence of Citation Dynamics of Similar  
Papers: Measurements ..... 71
    - 7.2.2 Divergence of Citation Dynamics of the Papers  
with the Same Fitness: Numerical Simulation ..... 72
    - 7.2.3 Fitness Estimation ..... 74
  - 7.3 Fitness Estimation Basing on Paper’s Content ..... 75
  - 7.4 Timeliness of Results ..... 76
  - 7.5 Summary ..... 78



- 8 Power-Law Citation Distributions are Not Scale-Free** ..... 81
  - 8.1 Introduction ..... 81
    - 8.1.1 Power-Law Distributions ..... 81
    - 8.1.2 Experimental Assessment of the Fat Tailed Distributions .... 83
  - 8.2 Empirical Characterization of Citation Distributions ..... 84
  - 8.3 Recursive Search Model Explains the Shape of Citation Distributions ..... 86
    - 8.3.1 Citation Distributions ..... 86
    - 8.3.2 Citation Lifetime ..... 88
  - 8.4 Discussion ..... 90
- 9 Comparison to Existing Models** ..... 93
  - 9.1 Preferential Attachment Mechanism ..... 93
    - 9.1.1 Theoretical Model ..... 93
    - 9.1.2 Model Validation by Measurements ..... 94
  - 9.2 Fitness-Based Preferential Attachment ..... 96
    - 9.2.1 Multiplicative Fitness ..... 96
    - 9.2.2 Additive Fitness ..... 97
  - 9.3 Fitness-Only Models ..... 98
  - 9.4 Explanatory Models ..... 98
  - 9.5 Equivalence Between Preferential Attachment and Fitness Models ..... 100
  - 9.6 The Genuine Preferential Attachment Exists and is Related to Nonlinear Citation Dynamics ..... 104
- A Details of Numerical Simulation** ..... 107
- References** ..... 109
- Index** ..... 119

# List of Symbols

$A(t)$	Aging function for references
$\tilde{A}(t)$	Aging function for citations
$a$	Prefactor in the expression for the probability of indirect citations
$\tilde{a}$	Parameter of the $s(K)$ dependence
$a_{mn}$	Adjacency matrix
$B(t)$	Generalized aging function
$b$	Coefficient in the expression for the probability of indirect citations
$\tilde{b}$	Parameter of the $s(K)$ dependence
$C$	Total number of citations in a citation network
$c_{t,t-1}$	Pearson autocorrelation coefficient for additional citations
$f_l$	Fraction of the second-generation citing papers connected to their progenitor by $l$ two-hop paths
$f_{uncited}(t)$	Fraction of uncited papers
$G$	The slope of the $\Gamma(K)$ dependence
$K(t)$	Cumulative number of citations of a paper after $t$ years
$K^\infty$	Longtime limit of citations of an individual paper
$K_r$	Onset of the runaway behavior
$K_0$	Initial attractivity in the preferential attachment mechanism
$k(t)$	Annual citation rate of an individual paper at year $t$
$k^{nn}(t)$	Mean annual number of the second-generation citations per one first-generation citing paper (the nearest-neighbor connectivity)
$M(t)$	Mean number of cumulative citations after $t$ years
$m(t)$	Mean annual citation rate at year $t$
$m_{dir}(t)$	Mean annual direct citation rate
$m_{indir}(t)$	Mean annual indirect citation rate
$N(t)$	Annual number of publications in one discipline
$N^{nn}$	Mean number of the second-generation citing papers per one first-generation citing paper
$n^{nn}(t)$	Mean annual number of the second-generation citing papers per one first-generation citing paper
$P(t)$	Probability of indirect citation through a paper $t$ years old

$P_0$	Probability amplitude of indirect citation
$Q$	Community size
$q$	Reduced probability of indirect citation
$R_{0i}$	Reference list length of paper $i$
$R_0(t_0)$	Average reference list length of the papers published in year $t_0$
$R(t)$	Age distribution of references
$R_{dir}(t)$	Age distribution of direct references
$R_{indir}(t)$	Age distribution of indirect references
$r(t)$	Reduced age distribution of references
$r_{dir}(t)$	Reduced age distribution of direct references
$r_{indir}(t)$	Reduced age distribution of indirect references
$s$	The number of two-hop paths connecting a second-generation citing paper to its progenitor
$s_0$	Intercept of the $P_0(s)$ dependence
$T(t)$	Memory function for indirect citations
$t_0$	Publication year of a paper
$\alpha$	Exponent characterizing the growth of the number of publications
$\beta$	Exponent characterizing the growth of the reference list length
$\gamma, \tilde{\gamma}$	Exponent of the memory function
$\Gamma$	Obsolescence rate
$\Gamma_0$	Obsolescence rate of the low-cited papers
$\delta$	Exponent of the aging function for direct citations
$\epsilon, \zeta$	Exponent of the preferential attachment
$\eta$	Paper's fitness
$\Theta_{ikj}$	Probability of indirect citation: paper $i$ cites paper $j$ through the intermediate paper $k$
$\lambda$	Probabilistic citation rate
$\lambda_{dir}$	Probabilistic direct citation rate
$\lambda_{indir}$	Probabilistic indirect citation rate
$\mu$	Mean of the log-normal distribution
$\nu$	Exponent of the power-law distribution
$\Pi_{ij}$	Probability of citation of paper $j$ by paper $i$
$\Pi_{ij}^{dir}$	Probability of direct citation of paper $j$ by paper $i$
$\Pi_{ij}^{indir}$	Probability of indirect citation of paper $j$ by paper $i$
$\pi_l$	Probability of indirect citation in $l$ -multiplet
$\rho(\eta)$	Fitness distribution
$\sigma$	Standard deviation of the log-normal distribution
$\tau_0$	Citation lifetime