

# Intersex Rights

Nikoletta Pikramenou

# Intersex Rights

Living Between Sexes

 Springer

Nikoletta Pikramenou  
Athens, Greece

ISBN 978-3-030-27553-2      ISBN 978-3-030-27554-9 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-27554-9>

© Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

# Acknowledgements

I became aware of the issues that intersex people encounter in 2014, while at a seminar on human rights and bioethics at the European Inter-University Centre for Human Rights and Democratisation in Venice, Italy. The struggle of intersex people for equal rights immediately sparked my interest, and I felt the need to contribute to their pursuit of justice by aiming to fulfil the “gap” that exists in the field of legal research and intersex rights. In 2015, when I talked with Prof. Lina Papadopoulou about intersex and elaborated on the idea to write a doctoral thesis on the topic, she was highly interested in supporting this research as the main supervisor. At that time, one of my goals was to analyse the case of Greece as despite the fact that legislation on intersex existed, nothing was ever written about it. Prof. Papadopoulou suggested to collaborate with a foreign university and the first person that I thought of was Prof. Anna Sara Lind from Uppsala University as our previous collaboration during my master’s on human rights was excellent. Therefore, words cannot describe my gratitude to both Prof. Papadopoulou and Prof. Lind for believing in this project from the very beginning. Prof. Papadopoulou supported this project significantly with her invitations to present parts of my research to different audiences as she always believed in its international impact and potential. At the same time, my annual visits at Uppsala University were extremely valuable, Prof. Lind was always enormously welcoming, and I would like to thank her for her warmth and psychological support (and delicious princess tårta). At that point, I would also like to thank the medical law team at Uppsala University for their great feedback and Jameson Garland in particular for our conversations on intersex. The contribution of the third member of the supervising committee, Prof. Katerina Fountedaki, was equally important and her feedback was much appreciated. I would also like to thank the members of the examination Committee: Theofano Papazissi from the Law Faculty of Aristotle University, Rosie Harding from Birmingham Law School, Giorgos Karavokiris from the Law Faculty of Aristotle University and Neda Kanelopoulou from Panteion University.

The outcome of this research wouldn’t be the same without my stays in Germany and the United States. First, my research visits at European University Viadrina and Humboldt University allowed me to comprehend the exact situation on intersex

rights in Germany, the first European country that legislated on the matter. I would like to thank Prof. Eva Kocher and Prof. Carmen Thiele who invited me to Viadrina and Rebekka Manke who supported me during my research fellowship in the best possible way. At Humboldt University, I would like to thank Prof. Anja Schmidt who was delighted to learn about my research and provide her feedback. In New York, I thank Charles Whiteley, who offered me the opportunity to work at the Delegation of the European Union to the United Nations in New York and promote intersex rights. Moreover, I would like to thank Dörthe Wacker for the excellent collaboration during the organisation of the first event on intersex rights at the Delegation. I am also grateful to Kimberly Zieselman and Hanne Gaby Odiele from InterAct, for sharing their personal experience as intersex activists. In addition, I would like to thank Hayley Gorenberg from Lambda Legal and Siri May from OutRight International for their valuable inputs on intersex rights and the situation in the . I also thank Charles Radcliffe for our fruitful discussions on intersex in Australia. Lastly, I would like to thank Rinio Simeonidou for her contribution on the situation of intersex rights in Greece and Dan Christian Ghattas for his valuable comments.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the eternal love of my parents who supported me during all these years by all means: my dad, in particular, for his scientific inputs with regard to intersex and justice. This research wouldn't have been possible without you two.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction: Trapped in the Binary</b> . . . . .	1
1.1	Intersex and the Sex Binary . . . . .	1
1.2	Research Purposes and Legal Questions . . . . .	6
1.3	Sex and Gender: When Biology and Society Meet . . . . .	8
1.3.1	The Attempt to Define Sex and Gender . . . . .	9
1.3.2	Sex, Gender and the Law . . . . .	11
1.4	Intersex Bodies . . . . .	15
1.4.1	The Emergence and Evolution of Intersex . . . . .	15
1.4.2	Intersex Definitions and Terminology . . . . .	18
1.4.3	Intersex in Numbers . . . . .	20
1.4.4	Pathologisation of Intersex . . . . .	21
1.4.5	Intersex and Sexual Minorities . . . . .	23
1.5	Remarks . . . . .	24
<b>2</b>	<b>Eliminating the “Abnormal”</b> . . . . .	27
2.1	“Preventing” Intersex . . . . .	29
2.1.1	Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis (PGD) Based on Sex . . . . .	30
2.1.2	The Right to Life of Intersex Embryos . . . . .	33
2.1.3	Reproductive Liberty vs Intersex Rights . . . . .	35
2.2	“Fixing” Intersex . . . . .	37
2.2.1	Background of Sex/Gender “Normalising” Surgeries . . . . .	37
2.2.2	Current Medical Trends . . . . .	38
2.2.3	Intersex Surgeries and Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting (FGM/C) . . . . .	40
2.3	Human Rights Implications of Intersex Surgeries . . . . .	43
2.3.1	Torture and Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment (CIDT) . . . . .	44
2.3.2	The Right to Bodily Integrity . . . . .	46
2.3.3	The Right to Individual Self-determination . . . . .	49
2.3.4	The Right to Health . . . . .	51

2.4	When Others Decide for Intersex Persons . . . . .	55
2.4.1	Parents/Physicians vs Intersex: Decision-Making and Informed Consent. . . . .	55
2.4.2	Intersex vs Parents/Physicians: Access to Medical Records and Justice . . . . .	57
2.5	Living As Intersex . . . . .	58
2.5.1	Access to Identification Documents . . . . .	60
2.5.2	Families Beyond the Binary . . . . .	62
2.5.3	Discrimination Against Intersex People . . . . .	64
2.5.3.1	Employment. . . . .	67
2.5.3.2	Access to Sports . . . . .	68
2.6	Remarks . . . . .	71
<b>3</b>	<b>Towards Intersex Legal Protection Beyond Europe . . . . .</b>	<b>73</b>
3.1	SOGI and Intersex Rights in the United Nations . . . . .	73
3.2	Africa . . . . .	79
3.2.1	Kenya . . . . .	82
3.2.1.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	82
3.2.1.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	83
3.2.2	South Africa . . . . .	86
3.2.2.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	86
3.2.2.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	87
3.2.3	Uganda . . . . .	89
3.2.3.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	89
3.2.3.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	91
3.3	Americas. . . . .	92
3.3.1	Argentina . . . . .	94
3.3.1.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	94
3.3.1.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	95
3.3.2	Chile . . . . .	97
3.3.2.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	97
3.3.2.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	99
3.3.3	Colombia. . . . .	101
3.3.3.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	101
3.3.3.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	104
3.3.3.3	The Particular Case of “Judicial Activism” in Colombia . . . . .	106
3.3.4	United States. . . . .	107
3.3.4.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	107
3.3.4.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	110
3.4	Oceania. . . . .	112
3.4.1	Australia . . . . .	113
3.4.1.1	Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . .	113
3.4.1.2	Intersex Rights . . . . .	115

- 3.4.2 New Zealand . . . . . 117
  - 3.4.2.1 Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . . 117
  - 3.4.2.2 Intersex Rights . . . . . 118
- 3.5 Asia . . . . . 119
  - 3.5.1 Intersex and “Hijras” . . . . . 121
    - 3.5.1.1 Bangladesh . . . . . 122
    - 3.5.1.2 India . . . . . 123
    - 3.5.1.3 Nepal . . . . . 125
    - 3.5.1.4 Pakistan . . . . . 126
  - 3.5.2 Philippines . . . . . 128
    - 3.5.2.1 Situation of SOGI Rights . . . . . 128
    - 3.5.2.2 Intersex Rights . . . . . 130
  - 3.5.3 Viet Nam . . . . . 131
    - 3.5.3.1 SOGI and Intersex Rights in “Confusion” . . . . . 131
- 3.6 Remarks . . . . . 133
  - 3.6.1 The Impact of SOGI Rights on Intersex Persons . . . . . 133
  - 3.6.2 Opening the Pandora’s Box: Intersex and the  
“Third Gender” . . . . . 135
  - 3.6.3 Recognising Intersex Rights Through “Cherry-Picking” . . . . . 136
- 4 Intersex in Europe.** . . . . . 139
  - 4.1 The Fundamental Values of the EU and the Protection of SOGI . . . . . 142
    - 4.1.1 Sexual Orientation Under EU Law . . . . . 144
    - 4.1.2 Gender Identity Under EU Law . . . . . 147
    - 4.1.3 Intersex in the EU . . . . . 149
  - 4.2 The Council of Europe on SOGI and Intersex . . . . . 152
    - 4.2.1 Sexual Orientation . . . . . 153
    - 4.2.2 Gender Identity . . . . . 155
    - 4.2.3 Intersex Rights . . . . . 159
  - 4.3 EU Countries That Explicitly Protect Intersex Rights . . . . . 161
    - 4.3.1 Austria . . . . . 162
      - 4.3.1.1 Sexual Orientation . . . . . 162
      - 4.3.1.2 Gender Identity . . . . . 164
      - 4.3.1.3 Intersex . . . . . 165
    - 4.3.2 Germany . . . . . 166
      - 4.3.2.1 Sexual Orientation . . . . . 166
      - 4.3.2.2 Gender Identity . . . . . 167
      - 4.3.2.3 Intersex . . . . . 170
        - 4.3.2.3.1 Reparations . . . . . 171
        - 4.3.2.3.2 Identification Documents . . . . . 173
        - 4.3.2.3.3 Marriage . . . . . 175
    - 4.3.3 Greece . . . . . 176
      - 4.3.3.1 Sexual Orientation . . . . . 176
      - 4.3.3.2 Gender Identity . . . . . 178



4.3.3.3	Intersex . . . . .	180
4.3.3.3.1	Non-discrimination and Violence . . . . .	181
4.3.3.3.2	Civil Unions . . . . .	182
4.3.4	Malta . . . . .	183
4.3.4.1	Sexual Orientation . . . . .	183
4.3.4.2	Gender Identity . . . . .	183
4.3.4.3	Intersex . . . . .	185
4.3.4.3.1	Physical Integrity and Bodily Autonomy . . . . .	185
4.3.4.3.2	Identification Documents . . . . .	186
4.3.4.3.3	The Right to Found a Family . . . . .	186
4.3.5	Portugal . . . . .	187
4.3.5.1	Sexual Orientation . . . . .	187
4.3.5.2	Gender Identity . . . . .	187
4.3.5.3	Intersex . . . . .	188
4.3.6	Regional Protections . . . . .	189
4.3.6.1	The Basque Country, Spain . . . . .	189
4.3.6.1.1	Intersex . . . . .	189
4.3.6.2	Scotland, United Kingdom . . . . .	190
4.3.6.2.1	Intersex . . . . .	190
4.4	EU Countries That Implicitly Protect Intersex Rights . . . . .	190
4.4.1	Belgium . . . . .	191
4.4.2	Denmark . . . . .	191
4.4.3	Finland . . . . .	193
4.4.4	Ireland . . . . .	194
4.4.5	Luxembourg . . . . .	195
4.4.6	Netherlands . . . . .	196
4.4.7	Romania . . . . .	200
4.4.8	Slovenia . . . . .	201
4.4.9	Sweden . . . . .	202
4.5	Intersex Rights in Progress . . . . .	204
4.5.1	France . . . . .	204
4.5.2	The Non-discrimination “Trap” . . . . .	205
4.6	Remarks: Intersex and the EU Fundamentals . . . . .	208
4.6.1	Explicit Frameworks and “Limited” Intersex Expectations . . . . .	208
4.6.1.1	The Emergence of the “Third Gender” in the EU . . . . .	208
4.6.1.2	The Need for Comprehensive Intersex Laws . . . . .	210
4.6.2	Turning a Blind Eye on Human Rights: Implicit Frameworks on Intersex . . . . .	212
4.6.2.1	The Impact of “Sex” and “Gender” on Statutory Interpretation . . . . .	212
4.6.2.2	All Roads Do Not Lead to Intersex . . . . .	213
4.6.3	Securing Intersex Rights in Line with the EU Values . . . . .	214

- 5 The Future: Intersex Shaping Inclusive Laws** ..... 217
  - 5.1 Intersex Rights: Expectations and Realities ..... 217
    - 5.1.1 Intersex Surgeries: The Source of Gross and Unchallenged Violations ..... 219
    - 5.1.2 Legal Recognition or When the State Decides for Intersex Bodies ..... 221
    - 5.1.3 The Genderless Right to Found a Family ..... 226
    - 5.1.4 Discriminated Repeatedly ..... 228
  - 5.2 Concluding Thoughts: Towards Equality for All ..... 231
  
- Bibliography** ..... 235

# Abbreviations

AIS	Androgen Insensitivity Syndrome
ART	Assisted Reproductive Technologies
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BC	Before Christ
CAH	Congenital Adrenal Hyperplasia
CEDAW	Convention or Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
DEVAW	Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women
CoE	Council of Europe
CIDT	Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic acid
DSD	Disorders of Sex Development or Disorders of Sex Differentiation or Differences of Sex Development
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ESC	European Social Charter
EU	European Union
FGM/C	Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting
FRA	European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IAAF	International Association of Athletics Federations
IOC	International Olympic Committee
IVF	In Vitro Fertilisation
LGBTQ	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights

PACE	Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
PGD	Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SOGI	Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity
SOGIESC	Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Expression and Sex Characteristics
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TEU	Treaty on European Union
UDHR	Universal Declaration on Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCAT	Convention Against Torture
UNFPA	United Nations Fund for Population Activities
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UN Women	United Nations Women
UN Aids	United Nations Aids
U.S.	United States
WHO	World Health Organization