

# Palgrave Studies in Victims and Victimology

## **Series Editors**

Matthew Hall  
University of Lincoln  
Lincoln, UK

Pamela Davies  
Department of Social Sciences  
Northumbria University  
Newcastle upon Tyne, UK

In recent decades, a growing emphasis on meeting the needs and rights of victims of crime in criminal justice policy and practice has fuelled the development of research, theory, policy and practice outcomes stretching across the globe. This growth of interest in the victim of crime has seen victimology move from being a distinct subset of criminology in academia to a specialist area of study and research in its own right.

*Palgrave Studies in Victims and Victimology* showcases the work of contemporary scholars of victimological research and publishes some of the highest-quality research in the field. The series reflects the range and depth of research and scholarship in this burgeoning area, combining contributions from both established scholars who have helped to shape the field and more recent entrants. It also reflects both the global nature of many of the issues surrounding justice for victims of crime and social harm and the international span of scholarship researching and writing about them.

### **Editorial Board**

Antony Pemberton, Tilburg University, Netherlands

Jo-Anne Wemmers, Montreal University, Canada

Joanna Shapland, Sheffield University, UK

Jonathan Doak, Durham University, UK

More information about this series at  
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14571>

Julia Maria Muraszekiewicz

# Protecting Victims of Human Trafficking From Liability

The European Approach

palgrave  
macmillan

Julia Maria Muraszkiewicz  
Trilateral Research & Consulting  
London, UK

Palgrave Studies in Victims and Victimology  
ISBN 978-3-030-02658-5      ISBN 978-3-030-02659-2 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-02659-2>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018959730

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover image: © Ewing Galloway/Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

*This is the first fruits of our efforts; let us persevere and our triumph will be complete. Never, never will we desist till we have wiped away this scandal from the Christian name, released ourselves from the load of guilt, under which we at present labour, and extinguished every trace of this bloody traffic, of which our posterity, looking back to the history of these enlightened times, will scarce believe that it has been suffered to exist so long a disgrace and dishonour to this country.*

—William Wilberforce before the House of Commons, 18 April 1791

*As punishments are only inflicted for the abuse of that free will, which God has given a man, it is just that a man should be excused for those act, which are done through unavoidable force and compulsion.*

—Blackstone in his Commentaries on the Laws of England (1941)

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
	How Trafficked Persons Commit Crimes	3
	Aims of the Book Through the Prism of Multiple Looking Glasses	5
	Terminology	10
	References	12
<b>2</b>	<b>Human Trafficking</b>	15
	Introduction	15
	What Is Human Trafficking: The Legal Definitions	16
	Breaking Down the Definition	20
	Framing of the Definition	20
	Action Element of the Definition	23
	Means Element of the Definition	24
	Exploitation Element of the Definition	27
	Exploitation Is Not a Crime in the Context of Directive 2011/36 on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and Protecting Its Victims	33
	A Few Words on the Context of Human Trafficking	35

Conclusion	38
References	40
<b>3 Rationale for the Non-liability Principle</b>	<b>45</b>
Introduction	45
Who Is a Victim of Human Trafficking: The Legal Definition	46
Examples of Trafficked Victims Held Liable	50
Criminal Law Theory	53
Human Rights Law and the Non-liability Principle	59
Human Rights Law and the Non-liability Principle: Dignity	60
Human Rights Law and the Non-liability Principle: Human Rights Instruments	61
Human Rights Law and the Non-liability Principle: Case Law	64
Human Rights Law and the Non-liability Principle: Final Points	68
Need to Fight Human Trafficking	70
Are We Impending the Rights of the Accused Traffickers?	71
Conclusion	72
References	74
<b>4 Non-liability in European and International Law</b>	<b>79</b>
Introduction	79
Article 26 of the 2005 Council of Europe Convention	80
Article 26 of the 2005 Council of Europe Convention and Its Drafting	80
The Content of Article 26 of the 2005 Council of Europe Convention	84
Article 8 of the 2011 EU Directive on Human Trafficking	84
Non-liability in International Law	86
Relation to Similar Provisions	91

Defences for Other Special Category Victims	93
Comparison with Persons in Abusive Relationships	93
Child Soldiers	96
Conclusion	98
References	99
<b>5 Dissecting Article 26 of the 2005 Council of Europe Convention</b>	101
Introduction	101
First Component of Article 26: “Each Party Shall, in Accordance with the Basic Principles of Their Legal System...”	103
Second Component of Article 26: “Provide for the Possibility...”	107
Third Component of Article 26: “Of Not Imposing Penalties”	108
Fourth Component of Article 26: “On Victims...”	111
Fifth Component of Article 26: “...for Their Involvement in Unlawful Activities, to the Extent That They Have Been Compelled to Do So”	113
Missing Element: Children	116
Conclusion	117
References	118
<b>6 Dissecting Article 8 of the 2011 EU Human Trafficking Directive</b>	121
Introduction	121
First Component of Article 8: “In Accordance with the Basic Principles of Their Legal System”	122
Second Component of Article 8: “Take Necessary Measures to Ensure Competent National Authorities Are Entitled Not to...Prosecute or Impose Penalties”	124
Third Component of Article 8: “Prosecute or Impose Penalties...for Their Involvement in Criminal Activities”	126



Fourth Component of Article 8: “On Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings”	128
Fifth Component of Article 8: “For Their Involvement in Criminal Activities Which They Have Been Compelled to Commit as a Direct Consequence of Being Subjected to Any of the Acts Referred to in Article 2”	130
Conclusion	137
References	142
<b>7 How States Have Implemented the Non-liability Provision</b>	<b>145</b>
Introduction	145
The Use of Guidance Directed at Relevant Authorities	146
A Specific Non-liability Provision	150
The Use of Existing Legislation	156
The Use of Existing Legislation: Necessity	156
The Use of Existing Legislation: Duress	160
Conclusion	164
References	166
<b>8 What Thwarts the Use of the Non-liability Provision?</b>	<b>169</b>
Introduction	169
Ideal Victim Theory	170
Ideal Victim Theory: First Characteristic	171
Ideal Victim Theory: Second Characteristic	174
Ideal Victim Theory: Third Characteristic	175
Ideal Victim Theory: Fourth Characteristic	176
Ideal Victim Theory: Fifth Characteristic	177
How Do Perceptions About a Trafficked Person Impact the Application of the Non-liability Principle	179
Victim’s Perceptions: The Other Barriers for Using the Non-liability Provision	181
Modern Slavery Can Harm Victims	182
Distinguishing Between Victim and Perpetrator: How Do We Move Beyond the Binary Perceptions of Victim Versus the Criminal?	186

Take into Account Advice from Civil Societies	190
Conclusion	191
References	193
<b>9 An Alternative Provision</b>	197
Introduction	197
What Happened to the Protection?	202
What Can Be Done to Improve the Law?	203
References	206
<b>Index</b>	209

# Abbreviations

CJEU	The Court of Justice of the European Union
CoE	Council of Europe
CPS	Crown Prosecution Service
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
EU Charter	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
GRETA	Group of Experts on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
MSA	Modern Slavery Act 2015
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
OHCHR	The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
OJ	Official Journal
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

**xiv      Abbreviations**

THB	Trafficking in Human Beings
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDHR	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Emergency Fund
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime