LAWYERS, SWAMPS, AND MONEY

Lawyers, Swamps, and Money

U.S. WETLAND LAW, POLICY, AND POLITICS

Royal C. Gardner

ISLANDPRESS

Washington | Covelo | London

Copyright © 2011 Royal C. Gardner

All rights reserved under International and Pan-American Copyright Conventions. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any means without permission in writing from the publisher: Island Press, 1718 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 300, Washington, DC 20009.

ISLAND PRESS is a trademark of the Center for Resource Economics.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gardner, Royal C.

Lawyers, swamps, and money : U.S. wetland law, policy, and politics / Royal C. Gardner.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN-13: 978-1-59726-814-1 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 1-59726-814-3 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-13: 978-1-59726-815-8 (pbk. : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 1-59726-815-1 (pbk. : alk. paper) 1. Wetlands—Law and legislation—United States. 2. Wetland conservation—Law and legislation—United States. 3. Wetland mitigation banking—United States. I. Title.

KF5624.G37 2011

333.91'80973—dc22

2010041634

Printed on recycled, acid-free paper

Manufactured in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Keywords: administrative law; Clean Water Act; wetland mitigation banking; in-lieu fee mitigation; dredge and fill; regulatory takings; Army Corps of Engineers; *Rapanos v. United States*; no net loss; watershed

For Mom and Dad
with love

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction	1
Chapter 1 The Ebb and Flow of Public Perceptions of Wetlands	5
Chapter 2 Administrative Law: The Short Course	15
What are agencies and who made them the boss?	17
What exactly does an agency do?	22
How are regulations made?	23
What's the difference between a regulation and mere guidance?	25
Navigating from statute to regulation to guidance	25
I'm mad as hell and not going to take it anymore: How to challenge agency actions	28
<i>Executive Branch</i>	28
<i>Legislative Branch</i>	29
<i>The Media</i>	29
<i>Judicial Branch</i>	30
CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS	30
STATUTORY STANDING	32
RIPENESS	33
CHEVRON DEFERENCE	33
Chapter 3 What's a Wetland (for purposes of Clean Water Act jurisdiction)?	35
The initial interpretation of "waters of the United States": We've always done it this way.	37
<i>United States v. Riverside Bayview Homes</i> : Unanimity on adjacent wetlands	39
<i>Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers</i> : A split decision on "isolated" waters	44

	<i>Rapanos v. United States</i> : A trifurcation of confusion	48
	Post- <i>Rapanos</i> response	52
	The constitutional limits of the Clean Water Act	54
Chapter 4	Dredge and Fill: The Importance of Precise Definitions	57
	A lesson for young lawyers: Read the statute.	57
	Does landclearing require a Clean Water Act permit?	58
	Does dredging (and sidecasting) require a Clean Water Act permit?	59
	Neatness counts: Exploiting a loophole	61
	The inevitable blowback: The regulated community responds.	62
	Deep plowing or deep ripping? The <i>Borden Ranch</i> case	64
	Fill, baby, fill	65
	Mountaintop removal and nationwide permit 21	67
	Strange things done in the midnight sun: Gold mining waste as fill	69
Chapter 5	Strange Bedfellows: The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers	73
	The misnamed 404(b)(1) Guidelines:	
	More than mere guidance	75
	The heart of the Guidelines: The alternatives analysis	76
	<i>Fund for Animals v. Rice</i> : The alternatives analysis in practice	78
	Defining the project purpose of a golf course: Jack Nicklaus takes a mulligan.	79
	Mississippi casinos: Is gambling a water-dependent activity?	81
	Sweedens Swamp and the market-entry theory: “It depends on what the meaning of the word ‘is’ is.”	84
	The mitigation MOA: Resolving the buy-down and sequencing dispute	86
	The old Corps returns: The EPA vetoes the Yazoo River Project	89
Chapter 6	No Net Loss: Lies, Damned Lies, and Statistics	93
	The starting point: A nation of farmers	94
	If you build it, they will come.	95
	The other illegal alien problem: Invasive species	97
	Agricultural sticks and carrots: Swampbuster and the Wetlands Reserve Program	100

	Offsetting development impacts: Compensatory mitigation	101
	The Cajun solution: Eat a nutria, save a wetland.	102
	Net gains on agricultural lands	104
	Paper gains, real losses: The failure of permittee-responsible compensatory mitigation	105
	No net loss: Mission accomplished?	109
Chapter 7	Wetland Mitigation Banking: Banking on Entrepreneurs	111
	What is wetland mitigation banking?	112
	The legal status of mitigation banking (the early years)	114
	Pembroke Pines: The first sale of credits from an entrepreneurial mitigation bank	115
	The 1995 mitigation banking guidance	117
	Congress provides a market (and ratifies the guidance).	119
	How much can I sell a wetland credit for?	120
	The good, the bad, and the ugly	123
	<i>Panther Island Mitigation Bank (Florida)</i>	123
	<i>Mud Slough (Oregon)</i>	124
	<i>Black River Basin Mitigation Bank (South Carolina)</i>	124
	<i>Woodbury Creek (New Jersey)</i>	125
	They're only in it for the money (and other criticisms of mitigation banking).	126
Chapter 8	In-lieu Fee Mitigation: Money for Nothing?	129
	What is in-lieu fee mitigation?	129
	The legal status of in-lieu fee mitigation (the early years)	132
	"Educational" mitigation	133
	Conflict of interest: Agency as regulator and competitor?	134
	Timing in life is everything.	135
	But they're the good guys!	136
	The 2000 in-lieu fee guidance	137
	Tracking in-lieu fee performance (or the lack thereof)	138
Chapter 9	Leveling the Mitigation Playing Field	141
	An initial attempt at standards for permittee-responsible mitigation: The Halloween guidance	141
	You could have at least called . . .	142
	Lack of public input: Perhaps ill-advised, but legal	143
	Out of chaos comes order: The National Mitigation Action Plan	144
	Congress (re-)enters the fray.	145

Proposed compensatory mitigation rule	146
O'Hare Airport and the return of CorLands	147
Reconsidering in-lieu fee mitigation	149
Finally, the final rule emerges.	151
Sequencing and avoidance	151
Equivalency in mitigation plans	152
Nonequivalency in the timing of the use of mitigation credits	153
The mitigation hierarchy	155
But is the compensatory mitigation regulation good for the environment?	156
Chapter 10 Wetland Enforcement: The Ultimate Discretionary Act	159
Who is the lead enforcement agency?	159
Every day is a new day: The continuing violation theory	161
Hobson's choice: No pre-enforcement review of administrative orders	163
After-the-fact permits: All is forgiven.	164
Administrative penalties: Adjudication by the agencies	165
Civil penalties: Potentially real money, rarely invoked	166
Settlements, supplemental environmental programs, and other payments	168
Criminal penalties: Muddy jackboots?	169
The least sympathetic defendants	171
Citizen suits: Backing up the government	172
Enforcement of permit conditions: A gap in citizen suits	172
Enforcement of third-party mitigation providers: Does responsible mean liable?	173
Chapter 11 Regulatory Takings in the Wetland Context	177
Preliminary hurdles: Ripeness	178
Choosing a forum: U.S. District Court or the U.S. Court of Federal Claims	180
The <i>Penn Central</i> factors	181
Applying the <i>Penn Central</i> factors: The <i>Florida Rock</i> saga	181
Of rats, rabbits, and reasonable investment-backed expectations	183
<i>Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council</i> : No need to balance factors	184
The irrelevance of <i>Lucas</i>	186
Reasonable investment-backed expectations revisited	187

The most sympathetic takings plaintiffs	188
How should the Corps weigh the risks of a takings case?	189
Chapter 12 Concluding Thoughts and Recommendations	191
Epilogue: Where Are They Now?	199
<i>Appendix</i>	209
Clean Water Act (excerpts)	209
EPA Regulations 40 CFR Part 230 (excerpts)	211
Corps Regulations 33 CFR Parts 320–332 (excerpts)	214
Clean Water Act Guidance Document (excerpts)	220
<i>Endnotes</i>	223
<i>Selected References and Further Reading</i>	229
<i>Index</i>	245

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Writing a book can be like wading through a swamp. It is full of surprises and discoveries, and one should not do it alone. That has certainly been the case for me.

I have been fortunate to have had a host of outstanding research assistants and Biodiversity Fellows who have helped me over the years. I especially would like to thank Marcela Bonells, Stephanie Broad, Michael Dema, Leah Ellington, Joshua Holmes, Melody James, Kristine Jones, Christine Krohn, Ezequiel Lugo, Noelle Nasif, and Michelle Sabin for their able research and dedication. Stephanie, Michael, and Marcela were particularly instrumental in finishing up this project.

I very much appreciate the support provided by Stetson University College of Law. It is a great place to work in part because of my wonderful colleagues. Dean Darby Dickerson, Ellen Podgor (past Associate Dean of Faculty Development), and Jamie Fox (current Associate Dean of Faculty Development) have always offered welcome encouragement. And the Office of Faculty Support and Stetson's law librarians have no peer.

The University of Granada Faculty of Law kindly afforded me a refuge to write during my sabbatical. My family and I treasure our time there and our dear friends, especially Antonio Sánchez Aranda and Yolanda Quesada Morillas.

Many, many people have educated me about wetland science and policy, including truly dedicated state and federal agency employees. In particular, I have benefitted immensely from working with my colleagues on the National Research Council Committee on Mitigating Wetland Losses, my previous co-authors Kim Diana Connolly and Theresa Pulley Radwan, Melanie Riedinger-Whitmore of the University of South Florida (with whom I team-teach an interdisciplinary wetland seminar), and my friends on the U.S. National Ramsar Committee and the Ramsar Scientific and Technical Review Panel. Earl Stockdale was my early mentor, and Michael Davis and Palmer Hough have always been willing to discuss and debate wetland issues with me.

Jessica Wilkinson and Michael Davis provided valuable comments on portions of drafts of this book, for which I am very appreciative.

I would also like to thank my editor, Emily Davis, and the staff of Island Press for their thoughtful guidance and advice. Any errors or omissions are of course my responsibility alone.

Finally, I would like to express my love and gratitude to my wife, Mary Fahy, and our children, Colin and Meggie. The book was a team effort. Meggie contributed mythological references, Colin suggested opening each chapter with a quotation, and Mary reviewed and provided insightful comments on innumerable drafts. I am most thankful for their love and support (and patience) during this journey.