
MACHINE LEARNING: A Guide to Current Research

**THE KLUWER INTERNATIONAL SERIES
IN ENGINEERING AND COMPUTER SCIENCE**

**KNOWLEDGE REPRESENTATION, LEARNING
AND EXPERT SYSTEMS**

Consulting Editor

Tom M. Mitchell

MACHINE LEARNING

A Guide to Current Research

edited by

Tom M. Mitchell
Rutgers University

Jaime G. Carbonell
Carnegie-Mellon University

Ryszard S. Michalski
University of Illinois



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS
Boston/Dordrecht/Lancaster

Distributors for North America:

Kluwer Academic Publishers
101 Philip Drive
Assinippi Park
Norwell, Massachusetts 02066, USA

Distributors for the UK and Ireland:

Kluwer Academic Publishers
MTP Press Limited
Falcon House, Queen Square
Lancaster LA1 1RN, UNITED KINGDOM

Distributors for all other countries:

Kluwer Academic Publishers Group
Distribution Centre
Post Office Box 322
3300 AH Dordrecht, THE NETHERLANDS

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data:

Machine learning.

(The Kluwer international series in engineering and
computer science ; SECS 12)

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

1. Machine learning—Addresses, essays, lectures.
2. Artificial intelligence—Addresses, essays, lectures.
- I. Mitchell, Tom M. (Tom Michael), 1951–
- II. Carbonell, Jaime G. (Jaime Guillermo)
- III. Michalski, Ryszard Stanislaw, 1937–
- IV. Series.

Q325.M318 1986 006.3'2 86-2766

ISBN-13: 978-1-4612-9406-1 e-ISBN-13: 978-1-4613-2279-5

DOI: 10.1007/978-1-4613-2279-5

Copyright © 1986 by Kluwer Academic Publishers

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1986

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission of the publisher, Kluwer Academic Publishers, 101 Philip Drive, Assinippi Park, Norwell, MA 02061.

Third printing 1988

Table of Contents

CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS	xi
PREFACE	xiii
JUDGE: A CASE-BASED REASONING SYSTEM William M. Bain	1
CHANGING LANGUAGE WHILE LEARNING RECURSIVE DESCRIPTIONS FROM EXAMPLES Ranan B. Banerji	5
LEARNING BY DISJUNCTIVE SPANNING Gary L. Bradshaw	11
TRANSFER OF KNOWLEDGE BETWEEN TEACHING AND LEARNING SYSTEMS P. Brazdil	15
SOME APPROACHES TO KNOWLEDGE ACQUISITION Bruce G. Buchanan	19
ANALOGICAL LEARNING WITH MULTIPLE MODELS Mark H. Burstein	25
THE WORLD MODELERS PROJECT: OBJECTIVES AND SIMULATOR ARCHITECTURE Jaime Carbonell and Greg Hood	29
THE ACQUISITION OF PROCEDURAL KNOWLEDGE THROUGH INDUCTIVE LEARNING Kaihu Chen	35
LEARNING STATIC EVALUATION FUNCTIONS BY LINEAR REGRESSION Jens Christensen	39
PLAN INVENTION AND PLAN TRANSFORMATION Gregg C. Collins	43
A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF EXPLANATORY SCHEMA ACQUISITION Gerald Dejong	47
THE EG PROJECT: RECENT PROGRESS Thomas G. Dietterich	51

LEARNING CAUSAL RELATIONS Richard J. Doyle	55
FUNCTIONAL PROPERTIES AND CONCEPT FORMATION J. Daniel Easterlin	59
EXPLANATION-BASED LEARNING IN LOGIC CIRCUIT DESIGN Thomas Ellman	63
A PROPOSED METHOD OF CONCEPTUAL CLUSTERING FOR STRUCTURED AND DECOMPOSABLE OBJECTS Douglas Fisher	67
EXPLOITING FUNCTIONAL VOCABULARIES TO LEARN STRUCTURAL DESCRIPTIONS Nicholas S. Flann and Thomas G. Dietterich	71
COMBINING NUMERIC AND SYMBOLIC LEARNING TECHNIQUES Richard H. Granger, Jr. and Jeffrey C. Schlimmer	75
LEARNING BY UNDERSTANDING ANALOGIES Russell Greiner	81
ANALOGICAL REASONING IN THE CONTEXT OF ACQUIRING PROBLEM SOLVING EXPERTISE Rogers Hall	85
PLANNING AND LEARNING IN A DESIGN DOMAIN: THE PROBLEMS PLAN INTERACTIONS Kristian J. Hammond	89
INFERENCE OF INCORRECT OPERATORS Haym Hirsh and Derek Sleeman	93
A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR CONCEPT IDENTIFICATION Robert C. Holte	99
NEURAL MODELING AS ONE APPROACH TO MACHINE LEARNING Greg Hood	103
STEPS TOWARD BUILDING A DYNAMIC MEMORY Larry Hunter	109

LEARNING BY COMPOSITION Glenn A. Iba	115
KNOWLEDGE ACQUISITION: INVESTIGATIONS AND GENERAL PRINCIPLES Gary S. Kahn	119
PURPOSE-DIRECTED ANALOGY: A SUMMARY OF CURRENT RESEARCH Smadar Kedar-Cabelli	123
DEVELOPMENT OF A FRAMEWORK FOR CONTEXTUAL CONCEPT LEARNING Richard M. Keller	127
ON SAFELY IGNORING HYPOTHESES Kevin T. Kelly	133
A MODEL OF ACQUIRING PROBLEM SOLVING EXPERTISE Dennis Kibler and Rogers P. Hall	137
ANOTHER LEARNING PROBLEM: SYMBOLIC PROCESS PREDICTION Heedong Ko	141
LEARNING AT LRI ORSAY Yves Kodratoff	145
COPER: A METHODOLOGY FOR LEARNING INVARIANT FUNCTIONAL DESCRIPTIONS Mieczyslaw M. Kokar	151
USING EXPERIENCE AS A GUIDE FOR PROBLEM SOLVING Janet L. Kolodner and Robert L. Simpson	155
HEURISTICS AS INVARIANTS AND ITS APPLICATION TO LEARNING Richard E. Korf	161
COMPONENTS OF LEARNING IN A REACTIVE ENVIRONMENT Pat Langley, Dennis Kibler, and Richard Granger	167
THE DEVELOPMENT OF STRUCTURES THROUGH INTERACTION Robert W. Lawler	173

viii

COMPLEX LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS: HIERARCHIES AND THE USE OF EXPLANATION	179
Michael Lebowitz	
PREDICTION AND CONTROL IN AN ACTIVE ENVIRONMENT	183
Alan J. MacDonald	
BETTER INFORMATION RETRIEVAL THROUGH LINGUISTIC SOPHISTICATION	189
Michael L. Mauldin	
MACHINE LEARNING RESEARCH IN THE ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE LABORATORY AT ILLINOIS	193
Ryszard S. Michalski	
OVERVIEW OF THE PRODIGY LEARNING APPRENTICE	199
Steven Minton	
A LEARNING APPRENTICE SYSTEM FOR VLSI DESIGN	203
Tom M. Mitchell, Sridhar Mahadevan, and Louis I. Steinberg	
GENERALIZING EXPLANATIONS OF NARRATIVES INTO SCHEMATA	207
Raymond J. Mooney	
WHY ARE DESIGN DERIVATIONS HARD TO REPLAY?	213
Jack Mostow	
AN ARCHITECTURE FOR EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING	219
Michael C. Mozer, Klaus P. Gross	
KNOWLEDGE EXTRACTION THROUGH LEARNING FROM EXAMPLES	227
Igor Mozetic	
LEARNING CONCEPTS WITH A PROTOTYPE-BASED MODEL FOR CONCEPT REPRESENTATION	233
Donna J. Nagel	
RECENT PROGRESS ON THE MATHEMATICIAN'S APPRENTICE PROJECT	237
Paul O'Rorke	
ACQUIRING DOMAIN KNOWLEDGE FROM FRAGMENTS OF ADVICE	241
Bruce W. Porter, Ray Bareiss, and Adam Farquhar	

CALM: CONTESTATION FOR ARGUMENTATIVE LEARNING MACHINE J. Quinqueton and J. Sallantin	247
DIRECTED EXPERIMENTATION FOR THEORY REVISION AND CONCEPTUAL KNOWLEDGE ACQUISITION Shankar A. Rajamoney	255
GOAL-FREE LEARNING BY ANALOGY Alain Rappaport	261
A SCIENTIFIC APPROACH TO PRACTICAL INDUCTION Larry Rendell	269
EXPLORING SHIFTS OF REPRESENTATION Patricia J. Riddle	275
CURRENT RESEARCH ON LEARNING IN SOAR Paul S. Rosenbloom, John E. Laird, Allen Newell, Andrew Golding, and Amy Unruh	281
LEARNING CONCEPTS IN A COMPLEX ROBOT WORLD Claude Sammut and David Hume	291
LEARNING EVALUATION FUNCTIONS Patricia A. Schooley	295
LEARNING FROM DATA WITH ERRORS Jakub Segen	299
EXPLANATION-BASED MANIPULATOR LEARNING Alberto Maria Segre	303
LEARNING CLASSICAL PHYSICS Jude W. Shavlik	307
VIEWS AND CAUSALITY IN DISCOVERY: MODELLING HUMAN INDUCTION Jeff Shrager	311
LEARNING CONTROL INFORMATION Bernard Silver	317
AN INVESTIGATION OF THE NATURE OF MATHEMATICAL DISCOVERY Michael H. Sims	321

LEARNING HOW TO REACH A GOAL: A STRATEGY FOR THE MULTIPLE CLASSES CLASSIFICATION PROBLEM Henri Soldano and Hélène Pigot	327
CONCEPTUAL CLUSTERING OF STRUCTURED OBJECTS R. E. Stepp	333
LEARNING IN INTRACTABLE DOMAINS Prasad V. Tadepalli	337
ON COMPILING EXPLAINABLE MODELS OF A DESIGN DOMAIN Christopher Tong	343
WHAT CAN BE LEARNED? L.G. Valiant	349
LEARNING HEURISTIC RULES FROM DEEP REASONING Walter Van De Velde	353
LEARNING A DOMAIN THEORY BY COMPLETING EXPLANATIONS Kurt VanLehn	359
LEARNING IMPLEMENTATION RULES WITH OPERATING- CONDITIONS DEPENDING ON INTERNAL STRUCTURES IN VLSI DESIGN Masanobu Watanabe	363
OVERVIEW OF THE ODYSSEUS LEARNING APPRENTICE David C. Wilkins, William J. Clancey, and Bruce G. Buchanan	369
LEARNING FROM EXCEPTIONS IN DATABASES Keith E. Williamson	375
LEARNING APPRENTICE SYSTEMS RESEARCH AT SCHLUMBERGER Howard Winston, Reid Smith, Michael Kleyn, Tom Mitchell, and Bruce Buchanan	379
LANGUAGE ACQUISITION: LEARNING PHRASES IN CONTEXT Uri Zernik and Michael Dyer	385
REFERENCES	391
INDEX	425

CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS

William M. Bain	Ranan B. Banerji	Ray Bareiss
Gary L. Bradshaw	P. Brazdil	Bruce G. Buchanan
Mark H. Burstein	Jaime Carbonell	Kaihu Chen
Jens Christensen	William J. Clancey	Gregg C. Collins
Gerald Dejong	Thomas G. Dietterich	Richard J. Doyle
Michael Dyer	J. Daniel Easterlin	Thomas Ellman
Adam Farquhar	Douglas Fisher	Nicholas S. Flann
Andrew Golding	Richard H. Granger, Jr.	Russell Greiner
Klaus P. Gross	Rogers Hall	Kristian J. Hammond
Haym Hirsh	Robert C. Holte	Greg Hood
David Hume	Larry Hunter	Glenn A. Iba
Gary S. Kahn	Smadar Kedar-Cabelli	Richard M. Keller
Kevin T. Kelly	Dennis Kibler	Michael Kleyn
Heedong Ko	Yves Kodratoff	Mieczyslaw M. Kokar
Janet L. Kolodner	Richard E. Korf	John E. Laird
Pat Langley	Robert W. Lawler	Michael Lebowitz
Alan J. MacDonald	Sridhar Mahadevan	Michael L. Mauldin
Ryszard S. Michalski	Steven Minton	Tom M. Mitchell
Raymond J. Mooney	Jack Mostow	Michael C. Mozer
Igor Mozetic	Donna J. Nagel	Allen Newell
Paul O'Rorke	Hélène Pigot	Bruce W. Porter
J. Quinqueton	Shankar A. Rajamoney	Alain Rappaport
Larry Rendell	Patricia J. Riddle	Paul S. Rosenbloom
J. Sallantin	Claude Sammut	Jeffrey C. Schlimmer
Patricia A. Schooley	Jakub Segen	Alberto Maria Segre
Jude W. Shavlik	Jeff Shrager	Bernard Silver
Robert L. Simpson	Michael H. Sims	Derek Sleeman
Reid Smith	Henri Soldano	Louis I. Steinberg
R. E. Stepp	Prasad V. Tadepalli	Christopher Tong
Amy Unruh	L.G. Valiant	Walter Van De Velde
Kurt VanLehn	Masanobu Watanabe	David C. Wilkins
Keith E. Williamson	Howard Winston	Uri Zernik

PREFACE

One of the currently most active research areas within Artificial Intelligence is the field of Machine Learning, which involves the study and development of computational models of learning processes. A major goal of research in this field is to build computers capable of improving their performance with practice and of acquiring knowledge on their own.

The intent of this book is to provide a snapshot of this field through a broad, representative set of easily assimilated short papers. As such, this book is intended to complement the two volumes of *Machine Learning: An Artificial Intelligence Approach* (Morgan-Kaufman Publishers), which provide a smaller number of in-depth research papers. Each of the 77 papers in the present book summarizes a current research effort, and provides references to longer expositions appearing elsewhere. These papers cover a broad range of topics, including research on analogy, conceptual clustering, explanation-based generalization, incremental learning, inductive inference, learning apprentice systems, machine discovery, theoretical models of learning, and applications of machine learning methods. A subject index is provided to assist in locating research related to specific topics.

The majority of these papers were collected from the participants at the Third International Machine Learning Workshop, held June 24-26, 1985 at Skytop Lodge, Skytop, Pennsylvania. While the list of research projects covered is not exhaustive, we believe that it provides a representative sampling of the best ongoing work in the field, and a unique perspective on where the field is and where it is headed.

We wish to express our thanks to the many authors who contributed research summaries. Special thanks go to Chris Tong, who generously contributed the subject index for the book, and to Patricia Riddle and Michael Barley who pulled off a minor miracle by collecting and reformatting the authors' papers and text files, and producing the camera-ready manuscript copy for the book.

We also wish to acknowledge those involved in supporting the Third International Machine Learning Workshop: Jo Ann Gabinelli and the rest of the Local Arrangements Committee, who organized a very smoothly run workshop, and the Office of Naval Research and the Rutgers University Laboratory for Computer Science Research, who provided financial support.

This book was prepared at Rutgers University, using the text processing and printing facilities in the Laboratory for Computer Science Research.

Tom M. Mitchell
Jaime G. Carbonell
Ryszard S. Michalski

MACHINE LEARNING: A Guide to Current Research