

## ESTABLISHING MEDICAL REALITY

# Philosophy and Medicine

---

VOLUME 90

---

*Founding Co-Editor*

Stuart F. Spicker

*Editor*

H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., *Department of Philosophy, Rice University, and  
Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas*

*Associate Editor*

Kevin Wm. Wildes, S.J., *Department of Philosophy and Kennedy Institute of  
Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.*

*Editorial Board*

George J. Agich, *Department of Bioethics, The Cleveland Clinic Foundation,  
Cleveland, Ohio*

Nicholas Capaldi, *Department of Philosophy, University of Tulsa, Tulsa,  
Oklahoma*

Edmund Erde, *University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, Stratford,  
New Jersey*

Eric T. Juengst, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, Case Western Reserve University,  
Cleveland, Ohio*

Christopher Tollefsen, *Department of Philosophy, University of South Carolina,  
Columbia, South Carolina*

Becky White, *Department of Philosophy, California State University, Chico,  
California*

# ESTABLISHING MEDICAL REALITY

ESSAYS IN THE METAPHYSICS  
AND EPISTEMOLOGY OF BIOMEDICAL  
SCIENCE

*edited by*

HAROLD KINCAID

*University of Alabama at Birmingham, Birmingham, Alabama, USA*

*and*

JENNIFER McKITRICK

*University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, Nebraska, USA*

 Springer

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN-10 1-4020-5215-4 (HB)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-5215-6 (HB)  
ISBN-10 1-4020-5216-2 (e-book)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-5216-3 (e-book)

---

Published by Springer,  
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

*www.springer.com*

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved

© 2007 Springer

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
CHAPTER 1: Introduction <i>Harold Kincaid and Jennifer McKittrick</i>	1
CHAPTER 2: Normality, Disease and Enhancement <i>Theodore M. Benditt</i>	13
CHAPTER 3: Holistic Theories of Health as Applicable to Non-Human Living Beings <i>Lennart Nordenfelt</i>	23
CHAPTER 4: Disease and the Concept of Supervenience <i>Robert D'Amico</i>	35
CHAPTER 5: Decision and Discovery in Defining 'Disease' <i>Peter H. Schwartz</i>	47
CHAPTER 6: Race and Scientific Reduction <i>Mark Risjord</i>	65
CHAPTER 7: Towards an Adequate Account of Genetic Disease <i>Kelly C. Smith</i>	83
CHAPTER 8: Why Disease Persists: An Evolutionary Nosology <i>Robert L. Perlman</i>	111
CHAPTER 9: Creating Mental Illness in Non-Disordered Community Populations <i>Allan V. Horwitz</i>	123
CHAPTER 10: Gender Identity Disorder <i>Jennifer McKittrick</i>	137
CHAPTER 11: Clinical Trials as Nomological Machines: Implications for Evidence-Based Medicine <i>Robyn Bluhm</i>	149
CHAPTER 12: The Social Epistemology of NIH Consensus Conferences <i>Miriam Solomon</i>	167
CHAPTER 13: Maternal Agency and the Immunological Paradox of Pregnancy <i>Moira Howes</i>	179

CHAPTER 14:	Violence and Public Health: Exploring the Relationship Between Biological Perspectives on Violent Behavior and Public Health Approaches to Violence Prevention <i>Jonathan Kaplan</i>	199
CHAPTER 15:	Taking Equipoise Seriously: The Failure of Clinical or Community Equipoise to Resolve the Ethical Dilemmas in Randomized Clinical Trials <i>Fred Gifford</i>	215
Index		235

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank the Center for Ethics and Values in the Sciences at the University of Alabama at Birmingham for financial support and Pam Williams, Minnie Randle, and Lisa Rasmussen for editorial and logistical support. Chapter 8 is reprinted with permission from Robert Perlman, Why Disease Persists: An Evolutionary Nosology, *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy* Volume 8, Number 3/November, 2005.