

RESPONSIBILITY AND PUNISHMENT  
THIRD EDITION

LIBRARY OF ETHICS AND APPLIED PHILOSOPHY

---

VOLUME 9

---

*Editor in Chief:*

Marcus Düwell, *Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands*

For other titles published in this series, go to  
[www.springer.com/series/6230](http://www.springer.com/series/6230)

# RESPONSIBILITY AND PUNISHMENT

## THIRD EDITION

*by*

J. ANGELO CORLETT

*Professor of Philosophy and Ethics,  
San Diego, CA, U.S.A.*



Springer

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-4020-9387-6 (PB)

ISBN 978-1-4020-4147-1 (HB)

ISBN 978-1-4020-4148-8 (e-book)

---

Published by Springer,  
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

*www.springer.com*

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved

© 2009 Springer Science+Business Media B.V.

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

*For My Mother*

*Diane Bellotto Corlett*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Introduction	1
CHAPTER 1: The Problem of Responsibility	11
CHAPTER 2: The Problem of Punishment	27
CHAPTER 3: Foundations of a Kantian Retributivism	49
CHAPTER 4: Assessing Retributivism	71
CHAPTER 5: Forgiveness, Apology, and Retributive Punishment	107
CHAPTER 6: Capital Punishment	131
CHAPTER 7: The Problem of Collective Responsibility	147
CHAPTER 8: Corporate Responsibility and Punishment	165
CHAPTER 9: Collective Wrongdoing, Reparations, and Native Americans	183
Conclusion	227
List of Sources	231
Index	249

## PREFACE TO THE THIRD EDITION

The contents of this book represent nearly twenty years of studying and assessing critically philosophical work in the areas related to responsibility and punishment theories. Certain chapters or sections of chapters of this book contain materials that I have contributed to various philosophy journals or other sources. For example, the contents of Chapter 3 consists of a revised version of an essay by the same title published in *The Southern Journal of Philosophy* to which thanks are expressed for the use of it herein. Substantial sections of Chapter 4 consist of my essay, "Making Sense of Retributivism," *Philosophy*, 76 (2001), pp. 77-110, and gratitude is expressed to the Royal Institute of Philosophy, London, and Cambridge University Press, for use of it here. Chapter 5 is a revised version of an article having the same title forthcoming in the *American Philosophical Quarterly*, and gratitude is expressed to North American Philosophical Publications, Inc., for kind permission to use the contents of that article herein. The content of Chapter 7 is a revised version of "Collective Moral Responsibility," in A. Jokic, Editor, *From History to Justice* (New York: Peter Lang Publishers, 2001), pp. 305-18. The contents of Chapters 7-8 are essentially revised forms of articles by the same titles from the *Journal of Social Philosophy*, and gratitude is expressed to Blackwell Publishers for use of both articles in this book. Chapter 9 contains substantial material from "Reparations to Native Americans?" in A. Jokic, Editor, *War Crimes and Collective Wrongdoing* (London: Blackwell Publishers, 2001), pp. 236-69. I am thankful to Blackwell Publishers for use of that material in this work. The "List of Sources" represents a comprehensive list of sources I have consulted over the years in my writing and revision of this book. I have made every attempt to give credit where credit is due concerning the ideas presented herein where ideas have, as far as I can discern, originated with authors other than myself. I beg the apologies of those philosophers whose work was not consulted or cited that pertains to the issues dealt with in this book. I have, however, made an ardent attempt to consult as many philosophical sources as possible that concern responsibility, punishment, and related topics.

I am grateful to Joel Feinberg and Keith Lehrer for incisive comments on an early version of the contents of Chapter 4. I am grateful to Feinberg, Margaret Gilbert, Lehrer, James Nickel, and Burleigh Wilkins for helpful comments on earlier sections or drafts of Chapter 7. A section of this chapter was presented at the Conference on War, Collective Responsibility, and Inter-Ethnic Reconciliation, University of Belgrade, Belgrade, Yugoslavia, 27 June 1998. Another section

was presented to The Serbian Philosophical Society, 1 July 1998. I am grateful to the participants of each session for their valuable comments, especially those from Jovan Babic, David Cooper, Aleksandar Jokic, Natalija Micunovic, Michael Slote, and Svetozar Stojanovic. For helpful comments on versions of Chapter 9, I am grateful to Robert Audi, Bernard Boxill, Anthony Ellis, Gilbert, Richard W. Miller, Jan Narveson, Nickel, Rodney C. Roberts, Slote, and Wilkins for incisive comments on earlier drafts of this chapter. Parts of this chapter in earlier draft forms were presented at the Canadian Society for the Study of Practical Ethics, Canadian Learned Society, 1997, and at the Conference on War Crimes: Legal and Moral Issues, University of California, Santa Barbara, 1997.

I am grateful to Ishtiyaque Haji who provided critical insights on the First Edition of this book by his supportive assessment of it in *Mind*, 111 (2002), pp. 847-52. I am also grateful to The Royal Institute of Philosophy in London for the adaptation of part of my "Making *More* Sense of Retributivism," *Philosophy*, 78 (2003), pp. 277-85, on the nature of desert to the discussion of desert in Chapter 4 of this edition. For final proofreading and indexing of this edition, I owe thanks to Eduardo Salazar and Fernando Serrano.

This edition features an updating of material on responsibility theory, a revision of some of the principles of proportional punishment in the defense of my own version of retributivism, some revisions concerning my conception of desert in light of recent philosophical work done on desert theory, a complete re-writing of the chapter on forgiveness and mercy in light of recent work done in this area, and a new chapter devoted to capital punishment. All in all, strong efforts have been made to address many of the issues found in the most recent philosophical literature on responsibility and punishment.

To those who might find the contents of this book, in whole or in part, worthy of their philosophical reflection and critical scrutiny, I express my sincere gratitude, in advance, to you.

J. Angelo Corlett  
San Diego, CA  
Autumn, 2005