FAITH AND THE PHILOSOPHERS

FAITH AND THE PHILOSOPHERS

EDITED BY

JOHN HICK

*Stuart Professor of Christian Philosophy
Princeton Theological Seminary*

Palgrave Macmillan

1964

ISBN 978-1-349-81672-9 ISBN 978-1-349-81670-5 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-81670-5

Copyright © Princeton Theological Seminary 1964

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1964 978-0-333-07888-4

MACMILLAN AND COMPANY LIMITED

St Martin's Street London WC2

also Bombay Calcutta Madras Melbourne

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY OF CANADA LIMITED

70 Bond Street Toronto 2

ST MARTIN'S PRESS INC

175 Fifth Avenue New York 10 NY

PREFACE

THIS volume is the product of a two-day conference attended by some fifty philosophers and theologians, held at the Princeton Theological Seminary, Princeton, New Jersey, in December 1962. The conference was one of a series of events marking the Seminary's one hundred and fiftieth year of theological teaching and research.

The majority of the philosophers present — some of whom were religious believers, some sceptics — were among those who have been significantly influenced by the contemporary movement of philosophical analysis; that is to say, their aims and methods could hardly have been what they are if such men as Russell, Moore and Wittgenstein had never written. But there were also others who are critical of these modes of philosophizing. The theologians were for the most part Protestants of various denominations, but included also two Jesuit priests who contributed notably to the proceedings. It is probable that there have been few such extensive confrontations in recent times between such high-calibre representatives of Christian belief and of philosophical criticism. Perhaps it is worth recording that the discussions were as friendly as they were frank; above all they represented a co-operative search for greater clarity on some very important issues in the philosophy of religion.

The members of the conference were: Virgil Aldrich (Kenyon College); William Alston (University of Michigan); Brand Blanshard (Yale University); Richard Brandt (Swarthmore College); Norris Clarke, S.J. (Fordham University); Malcolm Diamond (Princeton University); E. A. Dowey (Princeton Theological Seminary); Joel Feinberg (Princeton University); Frederick Ferré (Dickinson College); Keith Gunderson (Princeton University); Charles Hartshorne (University of Texas); Peter Heath (University of Virginia); George Hendry (Princeton Theological Seminary); John Hick (Princeton Theological Seminary); Paul Holmer (Yale University); Paul M. Hurrell (Michigan State University); Robert Johann, S.J. (Loyola Seminary); Samuel Keen (Louisville Presbyterian Theological

Faith and the Philosophers

Seminary); Charles Kegley (Wagner College); William Kennick (Amherst College); Hugh T. Kerr (Princeton Theological Seminary); Martin Lean (Brooklyn College); Richard Luecke (Princeton, New Jersey); Alasdair MacIntyre (Oxford University); Norman Malcolm (Cornell University); James I. McCord (Princeton Theological Seminary); Kai Nielsen (New York University); Dennis O'Brien (Princeton University); George Pitcher (Princeton University); Alvin Plantinga (Wayne State University); William Poteat (Duke University); Jean A. Potter (Bryn Mawr College); Victor Preller (Princeton University); H. H. Price (Oxford University); Cyril Richardson (Union Theological Seminary); Mrs. Richard Rorty (Rutgers University); Richard Rorty (Princeton University); Paul Schmidt (Oberlin College); Fadlou Shehadi (Rutgers University); James Ward Smith (Princeton University); Elmer Sprague (Brooklyn College); W. T. Stace (Princeton University); Walter Stromseth (St. Olaf's College); Paul W. Taylor (Brooklyn College); George Thomas (Princeton University); Linwood Urban (Swarthmore College); Gregory Vlastos (Princeton University); Charles West (Princeton Theological Seminary); Walter Wiest (Pittsburgh Theological Seminary); Daniel D. Williams (Union Theological Seminary); and Willem Zuurdeeg (McCormick Theological Seminary).

The present volume includes papers which were written for the conference and which were circulated in advance of the meetings, together with some extracts from the subsequent discussions. Only limitations of space have prohibited a fuller use of the tapes on which the always interesting and often exciting discussions were recorded.

The thanks of any who profit from these pages are due to President James I. McCord of Princeton Seminary; to the Seminary's Sesquicentennial Committee, of which General Dwight D. Eisenhower was the Honorary Chairman; to the Director of the Sesquicentennial Program, the Reverend Roy Pfautch, and his staff; and to Miss Mary McAnally, who has done valuable editorial work on the manuscript.

JOHN HICK,
Conference Chairman

CONTENTS

PREFACE	PAGE V
 I. RELIGIOUS EXPERIENCE AND ITS PROBLEMS	
H. H. Price : FAITH AND BELIEF	3
Charles Hartshorne : IS GOD'S EXISTENCE A STATE OF AFFAIRS ?	26
DISCUSSION :	
H. H. Price : <i>Response to Hartshorne</i>	33
Virgil C. Aldrich : TINKLING SYMBOLS	38
DISCUSSION :	
H. H. Price : <i>Response to Aldrich</i>	53
Keith Gunderson : <i>Are there Criteria for 'Encountering God' ?</i>	57
Norris Clarke, S.J. : <i>Some Criteria Offered</i>	58
 II. PSYCHOLOGICAL EXPLANATIONS OF RELIGIOUS BELIEF	
William Alston : PSYCHOANALYTIC THEORY AND THEISTIC BELIEF	63
Norman Malcolm : IS IT A RELIGIOUS BELIEF THAT 'GOD EXISTS' ?	103
DISCUSSION :	
Alasdair MacIntyre : <i>Freudian and Christian Dogmas as Equally Unverifiable</i>	110
 III. CAN ONE BE A BELIEVER TODAY ?	
Alasdair MacIntyre : IS UNDERSTANDING RELIGION COMPATIBLE WITH BELIEVING ?	115
Norris Clarke, S.J. : IT IS COMPATIBLE !	134
DISCUSSION :	
Norris Clarke, S.J. : <i>A Further Critique of MacIntyre's Thesis</i>	147
Richard Brandt : <i>Critique of MacIntyre's Starting-Point</i>	150
William Alston : <i>On Sharing Concepts</i>	154

Faith and the Philosophers

	PAGE
IV. IRRATIONALISM IN THEOLOGY	
Brand Blanshard : CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON KARL BARTH	159
Edward A. Dowey : 'BUT IS IT BARTH?'	201
George S. Hendry : ON BARTH, THE PHILOSOPHER	210
DISCUSSION:	
Linwood Urban : <i>Barth's Epistemology</i>	218
Malcolm Diamond : <i>The Pragmatic Validation of Religious Assertions</i>	222
Alvin Plantinga : <i>The Sceptics' Strategy</i>	226
C. C. Richardson : <i>The Sceptics' Myths</i>	228
Kai Nielsen : <i>A Sceptic's Reply</i>	229
Dennis O'Brien : <i>On the Limitations of Reason</i>	232
CHAIRMAN'S RETROSPECT	
John Hick : SCEPTICS AND BELIEVERS	235
THE CONTRIBUTORS	251
INDEX	255