

COMPARATIVE GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS

Series Editor: **Vincent Wright**

Published

Rudy B. Andeweg and Galen A. Irwin

Dutch Government and Politics

Nigel Bowles

Government and Politics of the United States (2nd edition)

Robert Elgie

Political Leadership in Liberal Democracies

Rod Hague, Martin Harrop and Shaun Breslin

Comparative Government and Politics (4rd edition)

Paul Heywood

The Government and Politics of Spain

B. Guy Peters

Comparative Politics: Theory and Methods

Anne Stevens

The Government and Politics of France

Ramesh Thakur

The Government and Politics of India

Forthcoming

Judy Batt

Government and Politics in Eastern Europe

Paul Brooker

Dictatorship and Democracy: The Theory and Practice of Authoritarian Government

Robert Leonardi

Government and Politics in Italy

Tony Saich

The Government and Politics of China

Douglas Webber

The Government and Politics of Germany

Comparative Government and Politics

Series Standing Order

ISBN 978-0-333-71693-9 hardcover

ISBN 978-0-333-69335-3 paperback

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in the case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Comparative Politics

Theory and Methods

B. Guy Peters





© B. Guy Peters 1998

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 1998 by
MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS
and London
Companies and representatives throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-66019-5 ISBN 978-1-349-26926-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007978-1-349-26926-6

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Copy-edited and typeset by Povey-Edmondson
Tavistock and Rochdale, England

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
07 06 05 04 03 02 01 00 99 98

Contents

<i>List of Tables and Figures</i>	vii
<i>List of Key Texts</i>	viii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
1 The Importance of Comparison	1
Forms of Comparative Analysis	5
Types of Comparative Studies	9
Regional Statistical Analyses	18
Global Statistical Studies	19
The Content of Comparisons	22
Cross-Time Comparisons	23
Summary	25
2 The Logic of Comparison	28
Comparative Research Design	30
Levels of Analysis	43
Conclusion	56
3 The Number of Cases	58
Strategies with Different Numbers of Cases	61
Summary and Conclusion	78
4 Measurement and Bias	80
The Travelling Problem	86
Typologies	93
Triangulation	97
Nominal Categories	103
Ideal-Type Analysis and Measurement	105
Summary	107

5	The Role of Theory	109
	Levels of Explanation	111
	Macro-Level Theories	111
	Meso-Level Theories	117
	Micro-Level Approaches	126
	Summary	135
6	The Case Study	137
	Improving Case Research	139
	Issues in Case Study Research	154
	The Role of the Case Researcher	154
7	Building on Case Analysis	156
	Meta-Analysis	160
	Boolean Algebra and Cumulation	162
	Summary	173
8	Events Data and Change Over Time	175
	Events Data	176
	Summary	190
9	Statistical Analysis	191
	Statistical Modes of Explanation in Comparative Politics	194
	Coping with Small N	206
	Secondary Analysis	208
	Summary	210
10	The Future of Comparative Politics	212
	Territory or Function: Choices in Comparison	216
	Theory and the Restriction of Perspective	218
	Methods and the Restriction of Vision	219
	The Exceptional and the Ordinary: What Can We Learn from Each?	221
	Modesty But Hope	222
	The Future of Comparative Politics	224
	<i>References</i>	227
	<i>Index</i>	255

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

1.1	Types of democratic systems	16
4.1	Typologies of democracy	88
4.2	Typologies of agrarian revolutions	95
4.3	Triangulation matrix	101

Tables

1.1	Classification of African political systems (early 1980s)	17
2.1	Economic characteristics of Anglo–American democracies	39
2.2	Political characteristics of Anglo–American democracies	39
7.1	Adoption of pay for performance	164
7.2	Logit estimates of impacts on probability of adoption of administrative reform	172
9.1	Internal diversity in the United States and the United Kingdom	193

List of Key Texts

1.1	Gabriel Almond and Bingham Powell, and Structural Functionalism	15
2.1	Gabriel Almond and Sidney Verba, and the Civic Culture	45
2.2	Philippe Schmitter and the Politics of Interest Intermediation	47
2.3	George Tsebelis and Game Theory	50
2.4	Vincent Wright and Reform of the State	55
3.1	Stein Rokkan and the Study of Centre–Periphery Politics	63
4.1	Philippe Schmitter and T.J. Karl, and Kinds of Democracy	89
4.2	Arend Lijphart and Consociationalism	94
4.3	Richard Rose and Party Government	102
5.1	Jeremy Richardson and Policy Styles	120
5.2	James March and John Olsen, and the New Institutionalism	122
5.3	Kent Weaver and Bert Rockman, and Institutions	124
5.4	Robert Putnam <i>et al.</i> , and Social Capital	132
6.1	Ronald Inglehart and the Study of Political Values	140
6.2	Jean Blondel and the Study of Political Institutions	143
6.3	Alfred Stepan and the Study of Democratisation and the Consolidation of Democracy	149
7.1	Arnold Heidenheimer <i>et al.</i> , and Comparative Policy Studies	158
9.1	Edward Page and Bureaucracy	192
9.2	François Goguel and André Siegfried, and Cartography	205
10.1	Gosta Esping-Anderson and the Welfare State	213
10.2	Giovanni Sartori and Party Systems	215

Preface

This book represents the culmination of an effort on my part to improve thinking about questions of comparative research in political science. One part of this was a pedagogical effort at my home institution as well as at Oxford. I found that even many of the best graduate students were beginning their dissertation research without a firm sense of the issues of comparative research in political science. Many of the students were well equipped with a statistical arsenal to attack any data set they might confront, but they were not thinking about more fundamental, and logically prior, questions such as conceptualisation, measurement and the selection of cases. Further, they still tended to think too much in terms of stark dichotomies of methods and approaches, despite the work of many leading methodologist pointing to the commonality of methods of research.

A graduate course on the subject at Pittsburgh, and a short seminar at Oxford, ameliorated some of these problems for two sets of students, but it was obvious that if these students were encountering these problems then there were almost certainly others who were as well. My publisher, Steven Kennedy, suggested that this book might be an appropriate response to the perceived need to encourage more explicit concern with questions of comparison and the comparative method. After several iterations, this manuscript is finally ready to go to press.

One thing that may require some explanation is the comparative politics 'hall of fame' that is included in the form of 'Key Texts' boxes throughout the text, largely at the prompting of Steven Kennedy. The selection is idiosyncratic on my part, but the intention is to give the reader a sense of what has been happening in this area of inquiry and where it may be going now. Most of the pieces were selected for their theoretical contributions, although several were chosen because they illustrate well the use of a particular mod of inquiry, For each of the selections included there is a description of the contribution made,

as well as some critique, As is repeatedly stressed throughout the text, there is no perfect method for investigation, and likewise there is no perfect theory for guiding those investigations.

A number of people deserve thanks for helping me to bring the book to this point. One is Steven Kennedy. Another is Vincent Wright of Nuffield College, Oxford. Vincent has been, in addition to a wonderful friend, a source of advice and guidance in the preparation of the manuscript. Seeing how he deals with these questions with his own graduate students has also helped me clarify some of the points. Gillian Peele at Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford, team-taught the seminar with me at Oxford and provided a number of insights into the material. Students at Pittsburgh and at Oxford have helped me to refine some of the presentation of the material and have raised questions that needed to be answered in the text. Finally, my wife Sheryn has suffered through yet another series of deadlines and worries about a book. Thanks to you all.

B. GUY PETERS

Acknowledgements

The author and publishers acknowledge with thanks permission from the following to reproduce copyright material: *Comparative Political Studies*, for Figure 1.1 and Figure 4.1, from A. Lijphart, 'Typologies of Democratic Systems' (1968); *Comparative Politics*, for Figure 4.1, from T. L. Karl, 'Dilemmas of Democratization in Latin America' (1990); Simon & Schuster, for Figure 4.2, from J. Paige, *Agrarian Revolution* (1975); *Comparative Political Studies*, for Table 1.1, from D. Berg-Schlosser, 'African Political Systems' (1984); Institute for East-West Studies, for Key Text 4.1, from P. C. Schmitter and T. L. Karl, 'The Types of Democracy Emerging in Southern and Eastern Europe and in South and Central America', in P. M. E. Volten (ed.), *Bound to Change* (1992). Every effort has been made to contact all the copyright-holders, but if any have been inadvertently omitted the publishers will be pleased to make the necessary arrangement at the earliest opportunity.