Developments in Russian Politics 4

***Developments** titles available from Macmillan*

Patrick Dunleavy, Andrew Gamble, Ian Holliday and
Gillian Peele (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN BRITISH POLITICS 5

Peter A. Hall, Jack Hayward and Howard Machin (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN FRENCH POLITICS

(REVISED EDITION)

Gillian Peele, Christopher Bailey, Bruce Cain and B. Guy Peters (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN AMERICAN POLITICS 2

Martin Rhodes, Paul Heywood and Vincent Wright (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN WEST EUROPEAN POLITICS

Gordon Smith, William E. Paterson and Stephen Padgett (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN GERMAN POLITICS 2

Stephen White, Judy Batt and Paul G. Lewis (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN EAST EUROPEAN POLITICS

Stephen White, Alex Pravda and Zvi Gitelman (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN RUSSIAN POLITICS 4

If you have any comments or suggestions regarding this list or other **Developments** titles, please write to Steven Kennedy, Publishing Director, Macmillan Press Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke RG21 6XS, UK.

Developments in Russian Politics 4

Edited by

**Stephen White
Alex Pravda
Zvi Gitelman**

Selection and editorial matter © Stephen White, Alex Pravda and Zvi Gitelman 1997

Individual chapters (in order) © Richard Sakwa, Stephen White, John P. Willerton Jr, Thomas F. Remington, Ronald J. Hill, Matthew Wyman, Robert Sharlet, Peter Rutland, Judith Shapiro, Mary Buckley, Alex Pravda, Kathryn Stoner-Weiss, Darrell Slider, Zvi Gitelman 1997

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published (*Developments in Soviet Politics*) 1990

Second edition (*Developments in Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics*) 1992

Third edition (*Developments in Russian and Post-Soviet Politics*) 1994

Fourth edition (*Developments in Russian Politics 4*) 1997

Published by

MACMILLAN PRESS LTD

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS

and London

Companies and representatives
throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-69470-1 ISBN 978-1-349-25852-9 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-25852-9

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and
made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

10	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	1
06	05	04	03	02	01	00	99	98	97

Copy-edited and typeset by Povey-Edmondson
Tavistock and Rochdale, England

Contents

<i>List of Figures, Maps and Tables</i>	viii
<i>Preface</i>	x
<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Glossary of Terms</i>	xvi
1 From the USSR to Postcommunist Russia	1
<i>Richard Sakwa</i>	
The Flawed Beginning	2
Features of Communist Rule	5
Patterns of Communist Rule	11
The Fall of Soviet Power	13
2 From Communism to Democracy?	19
<i>Stephen White</i>	
Reforming Communism	20
Constructing Postcommunism	28
PART ONE: THE RUSSIAN POLITICAL SYSTEM	
3 Presidential Power <i>John P. Willerton Jr</i>	35
The Strong Executive and Political Past	39
The Political Executive and the Transition Period	41
Institutions of the Hegemonic Presidency	45
Regime Norms and the Changing Yeltsin Coalition	51
Yeltsin's Second Term	55
4 From Soviets to Parliamentarism	61
<i>Thomas F. Remington</i>	
Reform and the Transition Period	63
Parties and the Parliamentary Process	75

5	Parties and Public Organisations	<i>Ronald J. Hill</i>	82
	The Legacy of the CPSU		82
	Parties and Democracy		84
	Challenges to the Communist Monopoly		88
	A Plethora of Parties		89
	Parties in the New Power Framework		91
	Parties in the 1995 Duma Election		93
	Party Identity and Membership		98
	Associations and Groups		101
	Conclusion		103
6	Elections and Voting Behaviour	<i>Matthew Wyman</i>	104
	The Electoral Process in Postcommunist Russia		105
	Electoral Dynamics, 1993–6		109
	Electoral Participation		118
	The Social Basis of Voting		119
	Regional Voting Patterns		123
	Conclusion: The Function of Elections in the New Russia		128
7	The Progress of Human Rights	<i>Robert Sharlet</i>	129
	Gorbachev's Legacy		129
	The Importance of Rights in Russia		131
	What the Russian Constitution Says: Human Rights in Theory		134
	Russia's Progress: Hopes and Difficulties		139
	Conclusion		145
PART TWO: THE POLICY PROCESS			
8	The Rocky Road from Plan to Market	<i>Peter Rutland</i>	149
	The Soviet Economic System		151
	The Strategy of Postcommunist Reform		156
	Assessing Postcommunist Reform		164
	Conclusion		168
9	Health and Health Care Policy	<i>Judith Shapiro</i>	169
	The Legacy		170
	1992: Maturing Crisis		176
	Debates and Prospects		184
	Soft States and Soft Social Policies		187

10 Women and Public Life	<i>Mary Buckley</i>	189
Women in the Soviet Past		189
Women and Work in the 1990s		192
Women and Politics		196
Women of Russia in the Duma		198
Women Activists outside the Duma		203
Conclusion		206
11 The Politics of Foreign Policy	<i>Alex Pravda</i>	208
Political Debate		211
Elections		217
Parliament		218
Executive Politics		222
PART THREE: POLITICAL ISSUES IN POSTCOMMUNIST RUSSIA		
12 Federalism and Regionalism		229
<i>Kathryn Stoner-Weiss</i>		
The Problematic Legacy of the Soviet System		229
Democratisation, Marketisation and the Devolution of Power, 1990–6		233
The Ongoing Challenges to the Development of Russian Federalism		246
13 Regional and Local Politics	<i>Darrell Slider</i>	251
The Institutional Framework		252
Executive Powers at the Local Level		258
Conclusion		265
14 The Democratisation of Russia in Comparative Perspective	<i>Zvi Gitelman</i>	266
What is Democracy?		266
Transition, Democratisation and Consolidation		268
The Prospects for Democracy in Russia		269
Democratisation in Russia in Comparative Perspective		273
<i>Guide to Further Reading</i>		279
<i>Bibliography</i>		285
<i>Index</i>		301

List of Figures, Maps and Tables

Figures

2.1	Satisfaction with the market economy, the direction Russia is taking, human rights performance and the development of democracy, 1990–6	33
9.1	Mortality of work-age men in Russia, 1959–94	174

Maps

6.1	Vote for Yeltsin in the 1996 presidential elections, round one	125
6.1	Vote for Zyuganov in the 1996 presidential elections, round one	126
6.3	Nationalist vote in the 1996 presidential elections, round one	127

Tables

3.1	Leading strategists of economic policy during Yeltsin's first term, 1991–6	52
3.2	The 1996 Russian presidential election	56
3.3	Leading members of Yeltsin's second term government, January 1997	58
4.1	Political factions in the State Duma, April 1994	70
4.2	Party factions in the State Duma, 16 January 1996	72
4.3	Leadership posts in the Second Duma, by faction, January 1996	74
5.1	The range of Russian parties and electoral blocs, 1995	96
6.1	Greatest social problems: survey results, 1991–6	111
6.2	Russian parliamentary and presidential elections, 1993–6	112

6.3	1996 presidential election: movement of votes between the two rounds	118
6.4	Voting trends, 1993–5	120
8.1	Soviet economic performance 1971–88	153
8.2	Russian economic performance 1991–6	165
9.1	Russian life expectancy at birth	177
9.2	Alcohol consumption, Russia 1981–93	181
9.3	Proportion of GDP spent on health care, 1990–5	182
9.4	Spending on health care in constant ruble prices, 1990–4	183
10.1	Seats in the Duma from the party list, 1995 election	197
10.2	Political affiliation of women elected to the Duma in the single-member constituencies, 1995 election	198
12.1	Russia's republics and regions (according to the 1993 Constitution)	232
13.1	Background of Russian regional leaders, January 1997	258

Preface

This is a book that has gone through three new editions and three changes of title. It began as developments 'in Soviet politics'; it became developments 'in Soviet and post-Soviet politics' in 1992; and in our third edition in 1994 it changed again to 'Russian and post-Soviet politics'. This fourth edition, as its title suggests, is concerned with Russian politics alone, not with those of the former Soviet republics; and it places its emphasis squarely upon postcommunist Russia, and upon the system that has developed since the end of the USSR in 1991. We hope, at the same time, not to have lost a longer perspective of which Russians are themselves very aware: not just of seventy years of communist rule, but of attempts over many centuries to limit the powers of the state and strengthen those of ordinary citizens. The establishment of a postcommunist system has, in this sense, been another 'revolution from above'; and the chapters in this book take a cautious view about the extent to which it has represented a transition not *just* from communist rule but *to* a form of government that gives Russians, for the first time, a real degree of influence over the leaders that speak in their name.

The editors would like to acknowledge the assistance in preparing the maps that was provided by Sarah Oates, and the skill with which the final manuscript was generated electronically by Jeanette Berrie. Most of all, we would like to thank our contributors, in different countries and continents, for their commitment to this project, and our publisher, Steven Kennedy, for his close and constructive interest in a succession of draft chapters as well as in the overall design. Several chapters and contributors are new to this edition, and all the other chapters have been entirely rewritten; our aim, as before, is to concentrate upon patterns of change rather than minor detail, and to emphasise the issues of interpretation to which they give rise. We hope that not just our students, but a wider circle of scholars and members of the general public, will find that this new and very different edition will justify the considerable effort that has been invested in it.

Stephen White
Alex Pravda
Zvi Gitelman

Notes on the Contributors

Mary Buckley is Reader in Politics at the University of Edinburgh. Her books include *Women and Ideology in the Soviet Union* (1989), *Redefining Russian Society and Polity* (1993), *Perestroika and Soviet Women* (edited, 1992) and, more recently, *Post-Soviet Women: from the Baltic to Central Asia* (edited, 1997). In 1995/96 she was recipient of an ESRC research grant to work on rural stakhanovism of the 1930s.

Zvi Gitelman is Professor of Political Science and Preston Tisch Professor of Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, where he is director of the Frankel Center for Judaic Studies. Author or editor of eight books, he is editor of *Bitter Legacy: Confronting the Holocaust in the USSR* (1997). He is currently researching the meanings of Jewish identity and communal reconstruction in Russia and Ukraine.

Ronald J. Hill is Professor of Comparative Government and Fellow of Trinity College, Dublin. His recent publications include *The Soviet Communist Party* (with Peter Frank, 3rd edn, 1987), *Restructuring Eastern Europe: Towards a New European Order* (co-edited, 1990) and *Beyond Stalinism: Communist Political Evolution* (edited, 1992). He is also a managing editor of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics* and general editor of a monograph series, *Studies of Communism in Transition*.

Alex Pravda is Director of the Russian and East European Centre and Fellow of St Antony's College, Oxford University, where he is also Lecturer in Russian and East European Politics. His books include *The End of the Outer Empire: Soviet-East European Relations in Transition* (edited, 1992) and *Internal Factors in Russian Foreign Policy* (with Neil Malcolm, Roy Allison and Margot Light, 1996).

Thomas F. Remington is Professor of Political Science at Emory University, Atlanta. He has written a number of articles and books on Russian and Soviet politics. His books include *The Truth of Authority: Ideology and Communication in the Soviet Union* (1988); *Politics and the Soviet System* (edited, 1989); and *Parliaments in Transition* (edited, 1994). He is associate editor of *Russian Review*.

Peter Rutland is Associate Professor of Department of Government at Wesleyan University, Connecticut. He is author of *The Myth of the Plan* (1985), *The Politics of Economic Stagnation in the Soviet Union* (1992), and of a forthcoming study, *Russia, Eurasia and the Global Economy*.

Richard Sakwa is Professor of Russian and European Politics at the University of Kent, Canterbury. His recent publications include *Soviet Communists in Power* (1987), *Gorbachev and his Reforms* (1990), and a second edition of *Russian Politics and Society* (1996). He is also a member of the editorial board of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*.

Judith Shapiro is Senior Lecturer in Economics at Goldsmiths College, University of London, and is currently also an advisor with the Russian-European Centre for Economic Policy in Moscow, where she has been living or commuting since 1993. Her recent publications include *Transformation and Integration: Shaping the Future of Central and Eastern Europe* (with others, 1994) and a series of papers on Russian mortality and socioeconomic trends.

Robert Sharlet is Chauncey Winters Professor of Political Science at Union College in Schenectady, New York, and a member of the Professional Advisory Board of the Harriman Institute of Columbia University. During 1994–6, he worked on legal reform in the post-Soviet states as Senior Coordinator of the Rule of Law Consortium of Washington, DC. He is author and editor of a number of books and numerous articles on Soviet and Russian law and politics, including *Soviet Constitutional Crisis* (1992).

Darrell Slider is Professor of Government and International Affairs at the University of South Florida, Tampa. His publications include *The Politics of Transition: Shaping a Post-Soviet Future* (with others, 1993) and a series of papers on regional issues, public opinion, elections and privatisation in *Soviet Studies*, *Slavic Review*, *Post-Soviet Affairs* and other professional journals and symposia.

Kathryn Stoner-Weiss is Assistant Professor of Politics and International Affairs at Princeton University. She is the author of *Local Heroes: The Political Economy of Russian Regional Governance*

(1997), and is currently engaged in research on Russian federalism and the impact of demands for subnational autonomy on state integration. She holds a PhD in Government from Harvard University.

Stephen White is Professor of Politics at the University of Glasgow, and was President of the British Association for Slavonic and East European Studies in 1994–7. He is chief editor of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics* and general editor of the Cambridge Russian, Soviet and Post-Soviet monographs series; his recent publications include *Russia Goes Dry* (1996) and *How Russia Votes* (with Richard Rose and Ian McAllister, 1997).

John P. Willerton is an Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Arizona, Tucson. His articles have appeared in *Slavic Review*, *Soviet Studies*, *Studies in Comparative Communism*, *International Politics* and other journals and professional symposia. A specialist on Russian and post-Soviet elite politics and the policy process, he is the author of *Patronage and Politics in the USSR* (1992).

Matthew Wyman is Lecturer in Politics at the University of Keele. His study of *Public Opinion in Post-Communist Russia* appeared in 1997, and he has also authored or coauthored papers in *Europe-Asia Studies*, the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*, *Electoral Studies* and *Party Politics*.

MAP *Russia and the Former Soviet Republics*

List of Abbreviations

APR	Agrarian Party of Russia
ASSRs	Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republics
CC	Central Committee
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CPE	Centrally Planned Economy
CPRF	Communist Party of the Russian Federation
CPSU	Communist Party of the Soviet Union
CSCE	Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe
GKI	State Property Committee
GNP	Gross National Product
KRO	Congress of Russian Communities
LDPR	Liberal Democratic Party of Russia
NEP	New Economic Policy (1921–8)
NEZDHI	Independent Women's Democratic Initiative
NPUR	National Patriotic Union of Russia
OHIR	Our Home is Russia party
PR	Proportional Representation
RC	Russia's Choice party
RCB	Russian Central Bank
RDC	Russia's Democratic Choice party
RSFSR	Russian Soviet Federated Socialist Republic
SAFO	Free Association of Feminist Organisations
SWC	Soviet Women's Committee
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Yabloko	Yavlinsky–Boldyrev–Lukin bloc (party)

Glossary of Terms

<i>Apparat</i>	Party administrative apparatus
<i>Apparatchik</i>	Full-time party official
<i>Bolshevik</i>	Radical ('majority') faction of Russian Social Democratic Labour (later Communist) Party
<i>Duma</i>	Lower house of Federal Assembly (parliament)
<i>Glasnost</i>	Openness, publicity
<i>Goskomstat</i>	State Statistics Committee
<i>Kolkhozy</i>	Collective farms
<i>Komsomol</i>	Young Communist League
<i>Krai</i>	Territory
<i>Kulaks</i>	Rich peasants
<i>Magnitizdat</i>	Underground literature – circulation of words and songs on audio tape
<i>Nomenklatura</i>	List of party-controlled posts
<i>Obkom</i>	Regional CPSU committee
<i>Oblast</i>	Region, province
<i>Perestroika</i>	Restructuring
<i>Plenum</i>	Full (plenary) meeting
<i>Politburo</i>	Key decision-making body in the Communist Party
<i>Postanovleniya</i>	Resolutions
<i>Razdel produktsii</i>	Production sharing
<i>Reglament</i>	Standing orders (of the State Duma)
<i>Samizdat</i>	Underground literature – self-publication
<i>Soviets</i>	Councils
<i>Tamizdat</i>	Underground literature – publishing abroad
<i>Ustavy</i>	Statutes
<i>Zastoi</i>	Stagnation
<i>Zemskii sobor</i>	Assembly of nobility, clergy and merchants
<i>Zemstvo</i>	Local representative assembly
<i>Zhensovety</i>	Women's councils