

## AMERICAN EXCEPTIONALISM?

*Also by Rick Halpern*

DOWN ON THE KILLING FLOOR: Black and White Workers in  
Chicago's Packing Houses

*Also by Jonathan Morris*

THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF SHOPKEEPING IN MILAN

# American Exceptionalism?

**US Working-Class Formation in an  
International Context**

Edited by

**Rick Halpern**

*Lecturer in American History  
University College London*

and

**Jonathan Morris**

*Lecturer in Modern European History  
University College London*





First published in Great Britain 1997 by  
**MACMILLAN PRESS LTD**  
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and London  
Companies and representatives throughout the world

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-349-25586-3

ISBN 978-1-349-25584-9 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-25584-9



First published in the United States of America 1997 by

**ST. MARTIN'S PRESS, INC.,**  
Scholarly and Reference Division,  
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010

ISBN 978-0-312-17470-5

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

American exceptionalism? : US working-class formation in an  
international context / edited by Rick Halpern and Jonathan Morris.  
p. cm.

"This book arises out of the 1995 Commonwealth Fund Conference  
held at University College London and the series of roundtable  
discussions held by the seminar on Comparative Labour and Working  
Class History at London's Institute of Historical Research"—P.  
Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-312-17470-5 (cloth)

I. Working class—United States—History—Congresses.

I. Halpern, Rick. II. Morris, Jonathan, 1961—

HD8066.A727 1997

305.5'62'0973—dc21

97-5320

CIP

Selection, editorial matter and Chapter 1 © Rick Halpern and Jonathan Morris 1997

Chapters 2-12 © Macmillan Press Ltd 1997

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1997

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made  
without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with  
written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and  
Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by  
the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to  
criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in  
accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and  
sustained forest sources.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1  
06 05 04 03 02 01 00 99 98 97

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	viii
1 The Persistence of Exceptionalism: Class Formation and the Comparative Method <i>Rick Halpern and Jonathan Morris</i>	1
2 The Dodo and the Phoenix: A Fable of American Exceptionalism <i>Michael Zuckerman</i>	14
3 Working-Class Formation and American Exceptionalism, Yet Again <i>Ira Katznelson</i>	36
4 Why Is There No Labour Party? Class and Race in the United States and Australia <i>Robin Archer</i>	56
5 It Is 'the Working Class Who Fight All the Battles': Military Service, Patriotism, and the Study of American Workers <i>Roger Horowitz</i>	76
6 The Limits of Liberalism: Working-Class Formation in Britain and the United States <i>Neville Kirk</i>	101
7 Present at the Creation: Working-Class Catholics in the United States <i>Leslie Woodcock Tentler</i>	134
8 Religion and the Formation of the Italian Working Class <i>John Pollard</i>	158
9 Inbetween Peoples: Race, Nationality and the New Immigrant Working Class <i>James R. Barrett and David Roediger</i>	181
10 'Amiable Peasantry' or 'Social Burden': Constructing a Place for Black Southerners <i>James R. Grossman</i>	221

11	South African and US Labour in the Era of the Second World War: Similar Trends and Underlying Differences <i>Peter Alexander</i>	244
12	Apropos Exceptionalism: Imperial Location and Comparative Histories of South Africa and the United States <i>Robert Gregg</i>	270
	<i>Index</i>	307

# Acknowledgements

This book arises out of the 1995 Commonwealth Fund Conference held at University College London and the series of roundtable discussions held by the seminar on Comparative Labour and Working Class History at London's Institute of Historical Research. We would like to thank all those who attended and contributed to those sessions. Special thanks are extended to the University College London Graduate School for its support of both endeavours. The conference also received financial assistance from the British Academy, the David Bruce Centre for American Studies at the University of Keele, the History Faculty of Cambridge University, the *Journal of American Studies* and the Institute of United States Studies at the University of London. We also would like to thank the various members of the Commonwealth Fund Committee, Nazneen Razwi, Rachel Aucott and Simon Renton for their advice and assistance.

# Notes on the Contributors

**Peter Alexander** received his PhD from the University of London and was a postgraduate fellow at London's Institute of Commonwealth Studies. Currently, he is a Research Fellow at St Antony's College, Oxford, where he is working on a comparative study of miners in Alabama and the Transvaal.

**Robin Archer** is Fellow in Politics at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. He is the author of *Economic Democracy: The Politics of Feasible Socialism* (1995) and currently is working on a book about the failure of the American union movement to establish a labour party.

**James Barrett** teaches American and comparative labour history at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. His earlier works include *Steve Nelson, American Radical* (1981) and *Work and Community in the Jungle: Chicago's Packinghouse Workers* (1987). He is completing a biography of the American communist William Z. Foster and working on a book of essays dealing with the identities and personal lives of immigrant workers in the United States during the twentieth century.

**Robert Gregg** teaches American History at the Richard Stockton College of New Jersey. He is the author of *Sparks From the Anvil of Oppression: Philadelphia's African Methodists and Southern Migrants* (1993) and numerous articles on African-American history.

**James Grossman** is Director of the Dr William M. Scholl Center for Family and Community History at the Newberry Library, Chicago. He is the author of *Land of Hope: Chicago, Black Southerners, and the Great Migration* (1989) and, most recently, *'A Chance to Make Good': African Americans, 1900-1930* (1997). Currently he is working with Kathleen Neils Conzen on a project entitled 'Race and Citizenship: The Life and Death of Robert Cromwell'.

**Rick Halpern** is Lecturer in American History at University College London. He is the author of *Down on the Killing Floor: Black and White Workers in Chicago's Packinghouses* (1997) and co-author (with Roger Horowitz) of *Meatpackers: An Oral History of Black Packinghouse Workers*



*and Their Struggle for Racial and Economic Equality* (1996). Currently he is working on a study of racialised labour in the sugar industry.

**Roger Horowitz** is Associate Director of the Center for the History of Business, Technology, and Society at the Hagley Museum and Library in Wilmington, Delaware. He is the author of *'Negro and White, Unite and Fight!'* *A Social History of Industrial Unionism in Meatpacking* (1997), and co-author (with Rick Halpern) of *Meatpackers: An Oral History of Black Packinghouse Workers and Their Struggle for Racial and Economic Equality* (1996). His current research concerns the effect of military service on working-class formation.

**Ira Katznelson** is Ruggles Professor of Political Science and History at Columbia University. His most recent books include *Liberalism's Crooked Circle: Letters to Adam Michnik* (1996), and (co-edited with Pierre Birnbaum) *Paths of Emancipation: Jews, States, and Citizenship* (1995). He is finishing a book about the making and character of post-New Deal American liberalism.

**Neville Kirk** is Reader in Economic and Social History at Manchester Metropolitan University. He is the author of *The Growth of Working Class Reformism in Mid-Victorian England* (1985) and *Labour and Society in Britain and the USA* (1994). He is currently writing a book on labour in modern Britain, and developing his comparative research focus upon labour and society in Britain, the United States, and Australia, 1880–1940.

**Jonathan Morris** is Lecturer in Modern European History at University College London. His publications include *The Political Economy of Shop-keeping in Milan* (1993) and various articles on Italian and European history. He has co-edited (with Robert Lumley) a collection of essays on *Liberal Italy and the 'Mezzogiorno'* (1997). Currently he is working on a comparative study of the politics of the European petite bourgeoisie in the twentieth century.

**John Pollard** is Professor of History at Anglia Polytechnic University. He is the author of *The Vatican and Italian Fascism, 1929–32: A Study in Conflict* (1985). He is currently working on a biography of Pope Benedict XV (1914–22).

**David Roediger** teaches working-class history and chairs the American Studies Program at the University of Minnesota. His recent books include

*Towards the Abolition of Whiteness: Essays on Race, Politics, and Working Class History* (1994) and (co-edited with Martin Blatt) *The Meaning of Slavery in the North* (1997). He is at work on an edited volume of African-American thought and writing about whiteness in the twentieth-century US.

**Leslie Woodcock Tentler** is Professor of History at the University of Michigan at Dearborn. She is the author of *Wage-Earning Women: Industrial Work and Family Life in the United States* (1979) and *Seasons of Grace: A History of the Catholic Archdiocese of Detroit* (1990).

**Michael Zuckerman** is Professor of History at the University of Pennsylvania. His many publications include *Peaceable Kingdoms: New England Towns in the Eighteenth Century* (1970) and *Almost Chosen People: Oblique Biographies in the American Grain* (1993).