VISION AND TEXTUALITY

Also by Stephen Melville

PHILOSOPHY BESIDE ITSELF: On Deconstruction and Modernism

Also by Bill Readings

INTRODUCING LYOTARD: Art and Politics

POSTMODERNISM ACROSS THE AGES: Essays for a Postmodernity that
Wasn't Born Yesterday (*co-editor with Bennet Schaber*)

VISION AND TEXTUALITY

Edited by

Stephen Melville
and
Bill Readings

Selection and editorial matter © Stephen Melville and the Estate of Bill Readings 1995

Individual chapters (in order) © Griselda Pollock,
Michael Ann Holly, John Tagg, Irit Rogoff, Mieke Bal, Norman
Bryson, the estate of Louis Marin, Hal Foster, Françoise Lucbert,
John Bender, Peter de Bolla, Thomas Crow, Bennet Schaber,
Rosalind Krauss, Martin Jay, Victor Burgin 1995

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of
this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or
transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with
the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988,
or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying
issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court
Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this
publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil
claims for damages.

First published 1995 by
MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-60970-5 ISBN 978-1-349-24065-4 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-24065-4

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

Typeset by EXPO Holdings, Malaysia

10	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	1
04	03	02	01	00	99	98	97	96	95

In memory of Louis Marin

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	xvi

Part I

1 General Introduction	3
<i>Stephen Melville and Bill Readings</i>	

Part II

2 Basic Concepts. Of Art History	31
<i>Stephen Melville</i>	
3 Beholding Art History: Vision, Place and Power	38
<i>Griselda Pollock</i>	
4 Past Looking	67
<i>Michael Ann Holly</i>	
5 A Discourse (With Shape of Reason Missing)	90
<i>John Tagg</i>	
6 The Aesthetics of Post-History: A German Perspective	115
<i>Irit Rogoff</i>	

Part III

7 How Obvious is Art? Kitsch and the Semiotician	143
<i>Bill Readings</i>	
8 Reading the Gaze: The Construction of Gender in 'Rembrandt'	147
<i>Mieke Bal</i>	
9 Philostratus and the Imaginary Museum	174
<i>Norman Bryson</i>	
10 Topic and Figures of Enunciation: It is Myself that I Paint	195
<i>Louis Marin</i>	

- 11 Armour Fou 215
Hal Foster

Part IV

- 12 The Pen and the Eye: The Politics of the Gazing Body 251
Françoise Lucbert
- 13 Impersonal Violence: The Penetrating Gaze and
the Field of Narration in *Caleb Williams* 256
John Bender
- 14 The Visibility of Visuality: Vauxhall Gardens and
the Siting of the Viewer 282
Peter de Bolla
- 15 B/G 296
Thomas Crow

Part V

- 16 Vision Procured 317
Bennet Schaber
- 17 In the Master's Bedroom 326
Rosalind Krauss
- 18 Photo-unrealism: The Contribution of the Camera
to the Crisis of Ocularcentrism 344
Martin Jay
- 19 Chance Encounters: *Flâneur* and *Detraquée* in Breton's *Nadja* 361
Victor Burgin

- Index* 373

List of Illustrations

1	Poster for Vision and Textuality Conference, 1989	5
2	Kirk Douglas as Vincent Van Gogh in <i>Lust for Life</i> , MGM Minnelli 1956; Publicity Still, British Film Institute	40
3	Vincent Van Gogh, <i>Peasant Woman Stooping Seen from Behind and from the Side</i> , 1985; Rijksmuseum Kroeller-Mueller	47
4	Gustave Caillebotte, <i>Man Looking out of a Window</i> , 1876; Private Collection	52
5	Mary Cassatt, <i>Woman in Black</i> , 1880; Museum of Fine Arts, Boston	54
6	Barbara Kruger, <i>Your Gaze Hits the Side of My Face</i> , 1981	55
7	Edgar Degas, <i>Young Woman with Binoculars</i> , c. 1866; British Museum, London	56
8	Anonymous, <i>Morisot's Studio</i> , c. 1890; Collection Sirot-Angel, Paris	57
9	Mary Kelly, <i>On the Insistence of the Letter</i> , detail: <i>Post-Partum Document</i> , 1979; Arts Council of Great Britain, London	60
10	Mary Kelly, <i>Corpus: Appel</i> , detail: <i>Interim</i> , 1990; Collection of the Artist	63
11	Giorgione da Castelfranco, <i>Sleeping Venus</i> , 1506–8; Gemäldegalerie, Dresden	69
12	Raphael, <i>School of Athens</i> , c. 1509; Vatican, Rome	71
13	Diego Velasquez, <i>Las Meninas</i> , 1656; Museo del Prado, Madrid	72
14	Édouard Manet, <i>Olympia</i> , 1863; Musée d'Orsay, Paris	73
15	Jean-Baptiste Siméon Chardin, <i>The Young Schoolmistress</i> , 1740; National Gallery, London	74
16	Gustave Courbet, <i>The Corn Sifters</i> , 1854; Musée des Beaux Arts, Nantes	75
17	Piero della Francesca, <i>The Flagellation of Christ</i> , c. 1450; Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Palazzo Ducale, Urbino	77
18	Raphael, <i>Marriage of the Virgin</i> , 1504; Brera Gallery, Milan	79
19	Peter Blake, <i>The Meeting, or Have a Nice Day</i> , <i>Mr. Hockney</i> , 1981–3. Tate Gallery, London	82

20	Gustave Courbet, <i>The Meeting, or Bonjour, Monsieur Courbet</i> , 1854; Musée Fabre, Montpellier	83
21	René Magritte, <i>The False Mirror</i> , 1928; Collection, The Museum of Modern Art, New York	86
22	Titian, <i>Venus of Urbino</i> , c. 1538; Uffizi Gallery, Florence	87
23–25	John Baldessari, <i>Two Crowds (With Shape of Reason Missing)</i> , 1984	91
26	Pages 64–5 of Jacques Derrida, 'Parergon', in <i>The Truth in Painting</i> , showing a plate of Antonio Fantuzzi, <i>Ornamental Panel with Empty Oval</i> , 1542–3	99
27–28	Discourse (With Shape of Reason Missing)	100
29	Installing the 25th Anniversary Exhibition at the National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, 1966	101
30	Installation view of <i>Kazimir Malevich 1878–1935</i> ; National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, 1990	102
31	Installation view of <i>The Treasure Houses of Britain: Five Hundred Years of Private Patronage and Art Collecting</i> ; The Waterloo Gallery, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, 1985	103
32	Entrance to <i>Matisse: The Early Years in Nice 1916–1930</i> ; National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC	103
33	Exhibition panel, <i>Kazimir Malevich 1878–1935</i> ; National Gallery of Art, Washington DC, 1990	104
34	West Building, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, 1947	106
35	Wild Mob Looks for Zoot Suiters, <i>Los Angeles Times</i> , 1943; Jailed Zoot Suiters, <i>Los Angeles Daily News</i> , 1943	110
36	Joseph Beuys, <i>Bathtub (Show Your Wound)</i> , 1960; <i>Wrapped Body</i> , 1971; Private Collection	123
37	Joseph Beuys, <i>Auschwitz</i> , 1958; Stroher Collection, Hessisches Landesmuseum, Darmstadt	124
38	Jörg Immendorf, <i>Café Deutschland I</i> , 1978; Neue Gallery Ludwig Collection, Aachen	125
39	Jörg Immendorf, <i>Let's go to the 38th Party Conference</i> , 1983; Ulli Knecht Collection, Stuttgart	127
40	Jochen Gerz, <i>Monument Against Fascism</i> ; Hamburg; Collection of the Artist	132
41	Jochen Gerz, <i>EXIT\Dachau Project</i> , 1972–4; Collection of the Artist	135
42	Jochen Gerz, <i>Two images of Saarbrücken, 2146 Stones – Memorial Against Racism</i> ; Collection of the Artist	137
43	Rembrandt, <i>Female Nude Seated</i> , c.1654–6 (Benesch 1122); The Art Institute of Chicago	153
44	Rembrandt, <i>Female Nude Seated</i> , c.1660–1 (Benesch 1142); Rijksprentenkabinet, Amsterdam	154
45	Rembrandt, <i>Female Nude Seated</i> , c.1630–1 (Benesch 21); British Museum, London	155

46	Rembrandt, <i>Woman Standing Up</i> (Susanna?) no date (Benesch 590); Kupferstichkabinett, Berlin	157
47	Rembrandt, <i>Joseph and Potiphar's Wife</i> , 1634; Teyler Museum, Haarlem	159
48	Rembrandt, <i>Judith Beheading Holophernes</i> , c. 1652 (Benesch 897); Meso di Capodimonte, Naples	161
49	Rembrandt, <i>The Toilet of Bathsheba</i> , 1643 (Bredius 513); Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York	162
50	Rembrandt, <i>Danae</i> , 1636 (Bredius 474); Hermitage, Saint Petersburg	163
51	Rembrandt, <i>The Blinding of Samson</i> , 1636 (Bredius 501); Städelsches Kunstinstitut, Frankfurt am Main	167
52	The Room of Herakles	177
53	The Room of Dionysos	178
54	Diagram of overlapping areas in the <i>Imagines</i>	184
55	Diego Velasquez, <i>The Fable of Arachne</i> , 1644–8; Museo del Prado, Madrid	185
56	Albrecht Dürer, <i>The Martyrdom of the Ten Thousand Christians</i> , 1598; Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna	198
57	Vittore Carpaccio, <i>Sant'Agostino nello studiolo</i> , 1485?; Scuola di San Giorgio degli Schiavoni, Venice	207
58	Jan van Eyck, <i>The Arnolfini Wedding</i> , 1434; National Gallery, London	208
59	Sandro Botticelli, <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> , 1475; Uffizi Gallery, Florence	210
60	Fra Filippo Lippi, <i>Crowning of the Virgin</i> , c. 1445; Uffizi Gallery, Florence	211
61	Joseph Thorak, <i>Comraderie</i>	217
62	Max Ernst, <i>Le Muggissement des féroces soldats</i> , 1919	219
63	Max Ernst, <i>Trophée hypertrophique</i> , 1919–20	220
64	Max Ernst, <i>Petite machine construite par lui-même</i> , 1919	222
65	Max Ernst, <i>Ca me fait pisser</i> , 1919	224
66	Max Ernst, <i>Adieu mon beau pays de Marie Laurencin</i> , 1919	225
67	<i>Drawing of a machine devised by the autistic child Joey</i> , from Bruno Bettelheim, <i>The Empty Fortress</i> , 1967	226
68	Max Ernst, <i>Untitled</i> (Airplane) 1920	228
69	Hans Bellmer, <i>Machine-Gunneress in a State of Grace</i> , 1937	231
70	Hans Bellmer, 'Variations sur le montage d'une mineure articulée', <i>Minotaure</i> , 6 (Winter 1934–5)	232
71	Hans Bellmer, <i>Doll</i> (second), 1935	235
72	Hans Bellmer, <i>Doll</i> (first), 1934	236
73	Hans Bellmer with <i>La Poupée</i> , 1934; From 'Variations sur le montage d'une mineure articulée', <i>Minotaure</i> , 6	238
74	William Hunter, <i>Anatomy of the Human Gravid Uterus</i> , Tab. IV; The Trustee of the Wellcome Trust, London	258
75	William Hunter, <i>Anatomy of the Human Gravid Uterus</i> , Tab. VI; The Trustee of the Wellcome Trust, London	259
76	Gautier d'Agoty, <i>Myologie complete en couleur et grandeur</i>	

	<i>naturelle</i> , Plate 4; The Trustee of the Wellcome Trust, London	260
77	Gautier d'Agoty, <i>Myologie complete en couleur et grandeur naturelle</i> , Plate 7; The Trustee of the Wellcome Trust, London	261
78	William Hogarth, <i>The Four Stages of Cruelty</i> , Plate 4; by permission of the Trustees of the British Museum	262
79–83	<i>Wax female figure with moveable parts</i> ; The Trustee of the Wellcome Trust, London	273
84	Anne-Louis Girodet-Trioson, <i>The Sleep of Endymion</i> ; Giroudon/ Bridgeman Art Library	297
85	Adèle Chavassieu, <i>Girodet painting Pygmalion and Galatea</i> , Copy after lost painting by F.L. Dejuinne; Civiche Raccolte d'Arte, Castello Sforzesco, Milan, Deposito Pinacoteca di Brera	309
86	Diagram of Klein group	323
87	Diagram of the relation of figure to ground (Klein group)	329
88	Diagram of castration-fear (Klein group)	340
89	Jacques Lacon, L-Schema	341
90	Diagram of the relation of figure to ground (L-Schema)	342

Acknowledgements

The lecture series from which this book proceeds was originally sponsored by the Ray Smith Endowment for the Humanities and the Office of the Vice President for Research and Graduate Affairs at Syracuse University, along with the Kress Foundation. Further financial support came from the School of Visual and Performing Arts and the Departments of English and Fine Arts at the University of Syracuse. Diane Elam also made a major culinary contribution to the success of the series.

The production of this volume was made possible by grants from the Québec Fonds pour la formation des chercheurs et l'aide à la recherche (FCAR) and the Canadian Conseil de la Recherche en Sciences Humaines (CRSH/SSHRC). We are particularly grateful to Gilles Dupuis for his editorial work.

Portions of Mieke Bal's essay have appeared in different form in her book *Reading Rembrandt: Beyond the Word/Image Opposition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991). A shorter version of John Bender's essay, 'Impersonal Violence: The Penetrating Gaze and the Field of Narration in Caleb Williams' appears in Polhemus and Henkle (eds.), *Critical Reconstructions: The Relationship of Fiction and Life*, published by Stanford University Press (1994). We are grateful to Cambridge University Press for permission to reproduce Norman Bryson's essay from a volume edited by S. Goldhill and R. Osborne. Michael Ann Holly's essay originally appeared in *Critical Inquiry* 16 (Winter 1990): 371–96. We are grateful to the following institutions for permission to reproduce works from their collections:

The Arts Council of Great Britain, London, for *On the Insistence of the Letter* by Mary Kelly.

The Arts Institute of Chicago, for *Female Nude Seated* (Benesch 1122) by Rembrandt van Rijn.

The Brera Gallery, Milan, for *Marriage of the Virgin* by Raphael.

The British Museum, London for *Female Nude Seated* (Benesch 21) by Rembrandt van Rijn, *The Four Stages of Cruelty* by William Hogarth and *Young Woman with Binoculars* by Edgar Degas.

Civiche Raccolte d'Arte, Castello Sforzesco, Milan, for *Girodet painting Pygmalion and Galatea* by Adèle Chavassieu.

The Collection Sirot-Angel for *Morisot's Studio* (Anonymous).

Galleria Nazionale delle Marche, Palazzo Ducale, Urbino, for *The Flagellation of Christ* by Piero della Francesca.

Gemäldegalerie, Dresden, for *Sleeping Venus* by Giorgione da Castelfranco.

Hessisches Landesmuseum, Darmstadt, for *Auschwitz* by Joseph Beuys.

Kunsthistorisches Museum, Wien, for *The Martyrdom of the Ten Thousand*, by Albrecht Dürer.

Kupferstichkabinett, Berlin, for *Woman Standing Up* (Benesch 590) by Rembrandt van Rijn.

Meso di Capodimonte, Napoli, for *Judith Beheading Holophernes* (Benesch 897) by Rembrandt van Rijn.

The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, for *The Toilet of Bathsheba* by Rembrandt van Rijn.

Musée des Beaux Arts, Nantes, for *The Corn Sifters* by Gustave Courbet.

Musée d'Orsay, Paris, for *Olympia* by Édouard Manet.

Musée Fabre, Montpellier, for *The Meeting, or Bonjour, Monsieur Courbet* by Gustave Courbet.

Museo del Prado, Madrid, for *The Fable of Arachne* and *Las Meninas* by Diego Velazquez.

The Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, for *Woman in Black* by Mary Cassatt.

The Museum of Modern Art, New York, for *The False Mirror* by René Magritte.

The National Gallery, London, for *The Arnolfini Wedding* by Jean van Eyck and *The Young Schoolmistress* by Jean-Baptiste Siméon Chardin.

The National Gallery of Art, Washington DC, for numerous installations and exhibits.

Neue Gallery, Aachen, for *Cafe Deutschland I* by Jorg Immendorf.

Rijksmuseum Kroeller-Mueller, for *Peasant Woman Stooping Seen from Behind and from the Side* by Vincent van Gogh.

Rijksprentenkabinet, Amsterdam, for *Female Nude Seated* (Benesch 1142) by Rembrandt van Rijn.

Scuola di San Giorgio degli Schiavoni, Venezia, for *Sant'Agostino nello Studio* by Vittore Carpaccio.

Städelsches Kunstinstitut, Frankfurt am Main, for *The Blinding of Samson* by Rembrandt van Rijn.

State Hermitage Museum, Saint Petersburg, for *Danae* (Bredius 474) by Rembrandt van Rijn.

The Tate Gallery, London, for *The Meeting, or Have a Nice Day, Mr Hockney* by Peter Balke.

Teyler Museum, Haarlem, for *Joseph and Potiphar's Wife* by Rembrandt van Rijn.

The Uffizi Gallery, Firenze, for *Adoration of the Magi* by Sandro Botticelli, *Crowning of the Virgin* by Fra Filippo Lippi and *Venus of Urbino* by Titian.

Ulli Knecht collection, Stuttgart, for *Let's go to the 38th Party Conference* by Jorg Immendorf.

The Vatican Museum, Rome, for *School of Athens* by Raphael.

The Wellcome Trust, London, for *Anatomy of the Human Gravid Uterus* by William Hunter, *Myologie complete en couleur et grandeur naturelle* by Gautier d'Agoty and *Wax female figure with moveable parts*.

Notes on Contributors

Mieke Bal is Professor of the Theory of Literature at the University of Amsterdam, and Adjunct Visiting Professor of Visual and Cultural Studies, University of Rochester. Her interests include narrative theory, semiotics, and cultural studies, in particular the relations between discourse and image. Her most recent book is *Reading 'Rembrandt': Beyond the Word-Image Opposition* (1991). She is currently preparing a book on images in Proust.

John Bender is Professor of English and Comparative Literature at Stanford University. He is the author of *Spenser and Literary Pictorialism* (1972) and *Imagining the Penitentiary: Fiction and the Architecture of the Mind in Eighteenth century England* (Chicago, 1987), which was awarded the Gottschalk Prize by the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies. He is co-editor of *The Ends of Rhetoric: History, Theory, Practice* (1990) and of *Chronotypes: The Construction of Time* (1991).

Norman Bryson teaches art history at Harvard University. He is the author of *Word and Image: French Painting of the Ancien Régime* (1981) and *Looking at the Overlooked: Four Essays on Still Life Painting* (1990).

Victor Burgin teaches in the Art History and History of Consciousness programmes at the University of California at Santa Cruz. He is the author of *The End of Art Theory: Criticism and Postmodernity* (Humanities Press International, 1986), and editor of *Thinking Photography* (1982) and *Formations of Fantasy* (1986).

Thomas Crow is Professor of Art History at Sussex University. He is the author of *Painters and Public Life in Eighteenth Century Paris* (1985).

Peter de Bolla teaches English at King's College, Cambridge. He is the author of *The Discourse of the Sublime* (1989) and *Harold Bloom: Towards Historical Rhetorics* (1988).

Hal Foster is Professor of Art History and Comparative Literature at Cornell University. He is the author of *Recodings* (Bay Press 1985), and *Compulsive Beauty* (1993). He is the editor of *The Anti-Aesthetic: Essays on Postmodern Culture* (1983), *Discussions in Contemporary Culture* (1987), and *Vision and Visuality* (1988).

Michael Ann Holly is Professor of Art History and Visual and Cultural Studies at the University of Rochester. She is the author of *Panofsky and the Foundations of Art History* (1984) and co-editor of *Visual Theory* (1992) and *Visual Culture* (1994).

Martin Jay is Professor of History at UC, Berkeley. He is the author of *The Dialectical Imagination* (1973), *Marxism and Totality* (1984), *Adorno* (Harvard 1984), *Permanent Exiles* (1985), *Fin-de-Siècle Socialism* (1988), *Force Fields* (1992) and *Downcast Eyes* (1993).

Rosalind Krauss is professor of Art History at Columbia University. Co-founder and co-editor of *October* magazine, her books include *Passages in Modern Sculpture* (1977), *The Originality of the Avant Garde and Other Modernist Myths* (1985) and *The Optical Unconscious* (1993).

Françoise Lucbert works in Comparative Literature and Art History at the Université de Montréal. She is the author of essays on French symbolist art criticism and fin-de-siècle painting.

The late **Louis Marin** taught at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales and Johns Hopkins University. Among his books are *Etudes Sémiologiques: Ecriture, Peinture* (1971), *Utopics, Spatial Plays* (1982), *La Critique du Discours* (1975), *Le Récit est un Piège* (1977), *Détruire la Peinture* (1977), *La Voix Excommuniée* (1978), *The Portrait of the King* (1988), *Food for Thought* (1988), *Opacité de la Peinture* (1989).

Stephen Melville teaches Art History at Ohio State University, Columbus. He is the author of *Philosophy Beside Itself*.

Griselda Pollock is Professor of Social and Critical History of Art at The University of Leeds. Her books include *Old Mistresses* (1981), *Framing Feminism* (1987), *Vision and Difference* (1988), and *Avant-Garde Gambits: Gender and the Colour of Art History*.

Bill Readings was Associate Professor of Comparative Literature at the Université de Montréal until his untimely death in 1994, as this book went to press. He taught in Switzerland and the United States and published on philosophy, literary theory, renaissance studies and art history. He was the author of *Introducing Lyotard: Art and Politics* and editor, with Bennet Schaber, of *Postmodernism Across the Ages*.

Irit Rogoff teaches critical theory and visual culture at the University of California – Davis. She is the editor of *The Divided Heritage – Problems in German Modernism* (1991) and of *Museum Culture* (1994) and author of the forthcoming *Terra Infirma – Geographies and Identities*.

Bennet Schaber teaches English at SUNY, Oswego. He is the co-editor of *Postmodernism Across the Ages* (1993), and author of a forthcoming study of Chaucer.

John Tagg is Professor of Art History at SUNY, Binghamton. He is the author of *The Burden of Representation* (1988), and editor of *The Cultural Politics of 'Postmodernism'* (1989).