Developments in Russian and Post-Soviet Politics

Also available from Macmillan Education

**Patrick Dunleavy, Andrew Gamble, Ian Holliday and
Gillian Peele (eds)**

DEVELOPMENTS IN BRITISH POLITICS 4

Peter A. Hall, Jack Hayward and Howard Machin (eds)

DEVELOPMENTS IN FRENCH POLITICS

**Gillian Peele, Christopher Bailey, Bruce Cain and
B. Guy Peters (eds)**

DEVELOPMENTS IN AMERICAN POLITICS 2

**Gordon Smith, William E. Paterson, Stephen Padgett and
Peter H. Merkl (eds)**

DEVELOPMENTS IN GERMAN POLITICS

Stephen White, Judy Batt and Paul G. Lewis (eds)
DEVELOPMENTS IN EAST EUROPEAN POLITICS

Forthcoming

Patrick Dunleavy
ANALYSING BRITISH POLITICS

Developments in Russian and Post-Soviet Politics

Third Edition

Edited by

Stephen White

Alex Pravda

Zvi Gitelman

M
MACMILLAN

Selection and editorial matter © Stephen White, Alex Pravda and Zvi Gitelman 1990, 1992, 1994

Individual chapters (in order) © Stephen White, John P. Willerton, Thomas F. Remington, Ronald J. Hill, Robert Sharlet, Peter Rutland, Simon Clarke, Mary Buckley, Alex Pravda, Zvi Gitelman, Darrell Slider, Richard Sakwa, Leslie Holmes 1994

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 1990 as *Developments in Soviet Politics*

Reprinted 1990, 1991

Second edition (*Developments in Soviet and Post-Soviet Politics*) 1992

Reprinted 1993

Third edition (*Developments in Russian and Post-Soviet Politics*) 1994

Published by

THE MACMILLAN PRESS LTD

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS

and London

Companies and representatives

throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-61690-1

ISBN 978-1-349-23461-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-23461-5

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

Typeset by Acorn Bookwork, Salisbury, Wilts

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations and Maps</i>	x
<i>List of Tables and Exhibits</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xii
<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations and Terms</i>	xvi

1 Introduction: From Communism to Democracy?	1
<i>Stephen White</i>	
The Gorbachev Agenda	3
A Presidential Republic?	11
Citizens or Subjects?	16

PART ONE: THE RUSSIAN POLITICAL SYSTEM

2 Yeltsin and the Russian Presidency	25
<i>John P. Willerton</i>	
The Political Executive in the Russian and Soviet Past	28
Yeltsin and the Russian Political Elite	33
The Executive: Institutions and Personalities	43
System-building Amidst Political Uncertainty	53
3 Representative Power and the Russian State	57
<i>Thomas F. Remington</i>	
Constitutional Crisis	63
From Soviet to Representative Democracy	65
Presidential Power	72
Confrontation and Collapse	77
Prospects, Constraints and Opportunities	84

4	Parties and the Party System	<i>Ronald J. Hill</i>	88
	The Legacy of Communist Party Rule		88
	The Emergence of Pluralism of Interests		94
	<i>Glasnost</i> and the Articulation of Interests		96
	The Emergence of Parties		98
	Towards a Party System		99
	The Party System and the Political System		103
	Party Orientation and Party Politics		106

5	Citizen and State Under Gorbachev and Yeltsin		109
	<i>Robert Sharlet</i>		
	Soviet Rule of Law Policy and Practice Under Gorbachev		110
	Russian Constitutionalism Under Yeltsin		119
	Constitution and Press in the Final Crisis of the First Republic		125
	The State and the Press During the Interregnum		126

PART TWO: PATTERNS OF PUBLIC POLICY

6	The Economy: The Rocky Road from Plan to Market		131
	<i>Peter Rutland</i>		
	The Origins of the Soviet Economic System		132
	The Centrally Planned Economy		136
	Gorbachev's Economic Reforms		138
	The Struggle for Market Reform		143
	1991: The Collapse of the Planned Economy		146
	The Decision to Launch Shock Therapy		150
	Conclusion		161
7	Privatisation: The Politics of Capital and Labour		162
	<i>Simon Clarke</i>		
	<i>Privatizatsiya</i> or <i>Prikhvatizatsiya</i> ?		164
	The Disintegration of the Soviet System and the Destatisation of Property		166
	From Destatisation to Privatisation		170
	First Steps in Privatisation: Russia's Managerial Revolution		171
	Privatisation and the Struggle for Power		173

Privatisation and the Labour Collective	176
Privatisation and the Emergence of Class Conflict	181
8 The Politics of Social Issues <i>Mary Buckley</i>	187
The Legacy of the Soviet State	188
A Changing Social Structure	190
Healthcare	195
Crime	200
Drugs	202
Prostitution	203
Conclusion	205
9 The Politics of Foreign Policy <i>Alex Pravda</i>	208
Public Politics	210
The Great Debate	213
The Role of Parliament	220
Executive Dominance	225
The Military	227
Disarray and Coordination	230
Trends	232
 PART THREE: POST-SOVIET NATIONS AND STATES	
10 Nationality and Ethnicity in Russia and the Post-Soviet Republics <i>Zvi Gitelman</i>	237
The Disintegration of the USSR	238
The Ethnic Map of the Former USSR	242
Soviet Nationalities Policy: Ideology and History	247
Soviet Nationality Policy	252
Ethnopolitics in the Post-Soviet Period	258
Ethnopolitics in the Russian Federation	261
Conclusion	265
11 Politics Outside Russia <i>Darrell Slider</i>	266
The Baltic	269
Moldova and the Caucasus	271
Ukraine and Belarus	273
Central Asia and Kazakhstan	274
The Commonwealth of Independent States	276

Military Ties	278
Economic Ties	281
Conclusion	283

PART FOUR: CONCEPTUALISING THE POLITICS OF POST-SOVIET RUSSIA

12	Russia, Communism, Democracy	<i>Richard Sakwa</i>	287
	The Russian Tradition		287
	Russia and Communism		292
	Nationalism, Democracy and the West		297
	Conclusion		306
13	Normalisation and Legitimation in Postcommunist Russia		309
	<i>Leslie Holmes</i>		
	On 'Normal' Politics		309
	Legitimation Crisis and Post-Communism		323
	Conclusions		330
	<i>Guide to Further Reading</i>		331
	<i>Bibliography</i>		338
	<i>Index</i>		355

List of Illustrations and Maps

Illustrations

1.1	Trust in government, 1993	19
3.1	The Russian Federal Assembly, 1993	81

Map of the Former Soviet Union	xviii–xix
---------------------------------------	------------------

List of Tables and Exhibits

Tables

1.1	Political interest and participation, 1988–92	17
2.1	Political spectrum of leading Russian Federation politicians and officials	35
2.2	Leading Russian Federation politicians and officials	36–7
3.1	Groups and factions in the Federal Assembly, 1994	83
4.1	The CPSU in 1990	90
4.2	The Russian political spectrum, 1993	102
6.1	Soviet economic performance, 1971–88	135
6.2	Economic performance of the Commonwealth of Independent States, 1989–92	146
6.3	Russian prices and wages, 1991–3	154
7.1	Privatisation: the public response	184
8.1	Illness rates, medical provision and mortality in the Soviet republics, 1989–91	197
8.2	Health indicators in the Russian Federation, 1990–June 1993	198
10.1	The major Soviet nationalities, 1989	243
11.1	The Commonwealth of Independent States, 1994	268

Exhibits

1.1	Russia's republics and regions (according to the 1993 Constitution)	12
2.1	The Russian presidency, 1993	47
3.1	The Russian Federal Assembly, 1993	80

Preface

In our preface to the first edition of this book we explained that this was above all a guide for students, but hoped it might be considered more than 'just' a textbook. As befitted a volume on developments, we made no attempt to cover every aspect of what could still be described as the Soviet political system; our aim, then and now, was to allow ourselves a little more room in which to concentrate upon the more important changes in a rapidly evolving system, and to deal with the (often controversial) issues of interpretation to which they give rise. We also thought it proper, dealing with issues of this kind, to allow for a diversity of approach within a common framework.

As we wrote in 1990, our assumptions about Soviet politics were 'changing almost daily'. But not even we could claim to have foretold the changes with which we deal in this third edition, with the end of Communist Party rule and of the former USSR, and with privatisation, an emerging party system and (from December 1993) a strongly presidential Russian republic. This is accordingly a very different book: all of the chapters have been rewritten, most of them are entirely different, and several of the contributors as well as the subjects with which they deal are new to this edition. Our aim, however, remains the same: to offer an interpretative framework for what is now a group of political systems whose evolution – in an age of nuclear weapons and telecommunications – matters almost as much to the outside world as to their own citizens.

Once again, for this third edition, we would like to thank our chapter authors for their contributions and for their willingness to provide us with revisions almost to the point of publication so that this book can be as up-to-date as possible. We would like particularly to thank our publisher, Steven Kennedy, whose commitment to this series and to this book in particular has been a great inspiration. We hope that not just our students, but

a wider circle of scholars and members of the general public, will find that the outcome justifies the effort that has been invested in it.

Stephen White
Alex Pravda
Zvi Gitelman

Notes on the Contributors

Mary Buckley is Reader in Politics at the University of Edinburgh. Her books include *Soviet Social Scientists Talking* (1986), *Women and Ideology in the Soviet Union* (1989), *Pere-stroika and Soviet Women* (edited, 1992) and most recently *Redefining Russian Society and Polity* (1993).

Simon Clarke is Reader in Sociology at the University of Warwick and the author of *What about the Workers?* (with others, 1993). With Peter Fairbrother he has been researching the restructuring of management, industrial relations and labour organisation in Russia since 1990, in collaboration with teams of Russian researchers in four contrasting Russian regions.

Zvi Gitelman is Professor of Political Science and Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. A specialist in Soviet and Russian political sociology and ethnic issues, his books include *Jewish Nationality and Soviet Politics* (1972), *Public Opinion in European Socialist Systems* (coedited, 1977), *Becoming Israelis* (1982), *A Century of Ambivalence: The Jews of Russia and the Soviet Union* (1988), and *The Politics of Nationality and the Erosion of the USSR* (edited, 1992).

Ronald J. Hill is Professor of Comparative Government at Trinity College, Dublin. His books include *The Soviet Communist Party* (with Peter Frank, 3rd ed., 1987), *The USSR: Politics, Economics and Society* (1989), *Communism under the Knife: Autopsy or Surgery?* (1991); he is also the author of numerous contributions to professional journals and symposia, with particular reference to local government and the CPSU, and a member of the board of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*.

Leslie Holmes has been Professor of Political Science at the University of Melbourne since 1988, and is currently acting Director of the Centre for Russian and Euro-Asian Studies. Among his many publications are *Politics in the Communist World*

(1986), *The End of Communist Power* (1993), and a forthcoming study of *Post-Communism*.

Alex Pravda is a Fellow of St Antony's College and Lecturer in Politics at Oxford University, and was previously Director of the Soviet foreign policy programme at the Royal Institute of International Affairs (Chatham House). His books include *Trade Unions in Communist States* (with Blair Ruble, 1986), *British-Soviet Relations since the 1970s* (coedited, 1990), *Perestroika: Soviet Domestic and Foreign Policies* (coedited, 1990), and *The End of the Outer Empire: Soviet-East European Relations in Transition* (edited, 1992).

Thomas F. Remington is Professor of Political Science at Emory University, Atlanta. His books include *Politics in the USSR* (with Frederick Barghoorn, 1986), *The Truth of Authority: Ideology and Communication in the Soviet Union* (1988), *Politics and the Soviet System* (edited, 1989) and *Parliaments in Transition: New Legislative Politics in the Former USSR and Eastern Europe* (edited, 1994); he is also a member of the board of *Russian Review*.

Peter Rutland is Associate Professor in the Department of Government at Wesleyan University, Middletown, Connecticut. A specialist on Soviet and Russian political economy, his books include *The Myth of the Plan* (1985), *The Politics of Economic Stagnation in the Soviet Union* (1993) and a forthcoming study entitled *Russia, Eurasia and the Global Economy*.

Richard Sakwa is Senior Lecturer in the Faculty of Social Sciences at the University of Kent, Canterbury. His many publications include *Soviet Politics* (1989), *Gorbachev and his Reforms 1985-1990* (1990) and *Russian Politics and Society* (1993), as well as contributions to journals and symposia. He is a member of the board of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*.

Robert Sharlet is Professor of Political Science at Union College in Schenectady, New York, and an Associate of the Harriman Institute of Columbia University. A specialist on Soviet and Russian law and politics, he has published six books of which the most recent is *Soviet Constitutional Crisis: From De-Stalinization to Disintegration* (1992).

Darrell Slider is Associate Professor of International Studies at the University of South Florida, Tampa. He is the author of a

number of articles on Soviet and post-Soviet politics and is the coauthor, with Stephen White and Graeme Gill, of *The Politics of Transition: Shaping a Post-Soviet Future* (1993).

Stephen White is Professor and Head of the Department of Politics at the University of Glasgow. His recent books include *After Gorbachev* (4th ed., 1993), *The Soviet Transition: From Gorbachev to Yeltsin* (coedited, 1993), *Developments in East European Politics* (coedited, 1993), and *The Politics of Transition: Shaping a Post-Soviet Future* (with Graeme Gill and Darrell Slider, 1993); he is also chief editor of *Coexistence* and of the *Journal of Communist Studies and Transition Politics*.

John P. Willerton is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Tucson, Arizona. A specialist on Russian and post-Soviet elite politics and the policy process, he is the author of *Patronage and Politics in the USSR* (1992); his other publications have appeared in *Slavic Review*, *Soviet Studies*, *Studies in Comparative Communism* and other journals and professional symposia.

List of Abbreviations and Terms

<i>Apparat</i>	Party administrative apparatus
<i>Apparatchik</i>	Full-time party official
<i>Arbitrazh</i>	Tribunal system for disputes between state enterprises
<i>birzhy</i>	commodity exchanges
<i>Bolshevik</i>	Radical ('majority') faction of Russian Social Democratic Labour (later Communist) Party
CC	Central Committee
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency (USA)
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CPD	Congress of People's Deputies
CPE	Centrally planned economy
CPSU	Communist Party of the Soviet Union
CSCE	Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe
<i>Glasnost</i>	Openness, publicity
GNP	Gross national product
<i>Gorkom</i>	City party committee
<i>Gosagroprom</i>	State Agroindustrial Committee
<i>goskazy</i>	state orders
<i>Gospriemka</i>	State quality control
<i>Gossnab</i>	State Committee on Supplies
<i>gosudarstvennost</i>	statehood
<i>Goszakaz</i>	State order
INF	Intermediate-range nuclear force
<i>gosudarstvenniki</i>	national democrats
<i>Ispolkom</i>	Executive committee of a soviet
<i>Kadry</i>	Cadres, staff
KGB	Committee of State Security
<i>Khozaschet</i>	Cost accounting
<i>Kolkhoz</i>	Collective farm

Komsomol	Young Communist League
Krai	Territory
Menshevik	Moderate (minority) faction of the Russian Social Democratic Labour (later Communist) Party
<i>mir</i>	peasant land commune
NEP	New Economic Policy (1921–8)
<i>Nomenklatura</i>	List of party-controlled posts
<i>Oblast</i>	Region, province
<i>Obshchestvennik</i>	Activist
<i>obshchina</i>	community
<i>Okrug</i>	Area, district
<i>Perestroika</i>	Restructuring
Plenum	Full (plenary) meeting
<i>Podmena</i>	Substitution, supplantation
PPO	Primary party organisation
<i>pravovoe gosudarstvo</i>	law-based state
<i>privatizatsiya</i>	privatisation
<i>prikhvatizatsiya</i>	asset grabbing
<i>Raikom</i>	District party committee
RSFSR	Russian Soviet Federal Socialist Republic (now Russian Federation)
<i>samizdat</i>	underground literature
<i>Sblizhenie</i>	Drawing together (of nationalities)
<i>Sliyanie</i>	Fusion (of nationalities)
<i>sobornost</i>	communality
<i>sovnarkhozy</i>	economic regions
<i>soyuz</i>	union
<i>zemstvo</i>	local government unit
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
<i>Val</i>	Gross output
WTO	Warsaw Treaty Organisation
<i>Zastoi</i>	Stagnation

The Former

Soviet Union