ECONOMICS OF HEALTH CARE FINANCING: THE VISIBLE HAND

ECONOMIC ISSUES IN HEALTH CARE

General editors

Professor Gavin Mooney

Department of Community Medicine

Westmead Hospital

Westmead, NSW 2145

Australia

Dr Alistair McGuire

Department of Economics

City University

Nottingham Square

London EC1V OHB

The Challenges of Medical Practice Variations

Edited by Tavs Folmer Andersen and Gavin Mooney (1990)

Competition in Health Care: Reforming the NHS

Edited by A. J. Culyer, Alan Maynard and John Posnett (1990)

Strategies for Health Care Finance in Developing Countries

By Guy Carrin with Marc Vereecke (1992)

Private Exchange and Public Interest

By John Forbes (1992)

Just Managing—Power and Culture in the NHS

By Stephen Harrison, David J. Hunter and Gordon Marnoch (1992)

Economics of Health Care Financing: The Visible Hand

By Cam Donaldson and Karen Gerard (1992)

Rationing and Rationality in the National Health Service

Edited by Stephen J. Frankel and R. R. West (1993)

Health Status Measurement: A Perspective on Change

By Richard Brooks (1995)

ECONOMICS OF HEALTH CARE FINANCING: THE VISIBLE HAND

Cam Donaldson

*Health Economics Research Unit
Department of Public Health
University of Aberdeen*

and

Karen Gerard

*Division of Epidemiology and Public Health
University of Newcastle-upon-Tyne
and formerly Health Economics Research Unit
University of Aberdeen*

© Cam Donaldson and Karen Gerard 1993

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 1993 by
THE MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-53870-8 ISBN 978-1-349-22512-5 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-22512-5

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

11 10 9 8 7 6
03 02 01 00 99 98 97

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
PART 1 MARKETS AND MARKET FAILURE IN HEALTH CARE	1
1 Health Care Financing Reforms: Moving into the 1990s	3
Introduction	3
The changing world of health care financing	4
<i>Western Europe</i>	4
<i>Eastern Europe</i>	5
<i>North America</i>	6
<i>Latin America</i>	7
<i>Australasia</i>	8
<i>Less-developed Countries (LDCs)</i>	9
Outline of the book	10
2 Markets and Health Care	12
Introduction	12
What is a market and how does it work?	13
Markets: the panacea for health care ills?	19
The crucial assumptions	20
<i>Certainty</i>	21
<i>No externalities</i>	21
<i>Perfect knowledge</i>	22
<i>Consumers act free of self-interested 'advice' from doctors</i>	23
<i>Numerous, small producers with no market power</i>	23
Consumer is sovereign?	24
Conclusions	25
3 Market Failure in Health Care	26
Introduction	26
Risk, uncertainty and the failure of private health care insurance	28
<i>Uncertainty and the demand for insurance</i>	28
<i>Diseconomies of small scale</i>	29

<i>Moral hazard</i>	31
<i>Adverse selection</i>	35
Externalities	37
Licensure and asymmetry of information	41
<i>The need for a profession</i>	41
<i>The problem of asymmetry</i>	42
<i>Are doctors perfect agents?</i>	43
Relevance of economics to government intervention	45
Conclusions	47
 PART 2 HEALTH CARE SYSTEMS AND THEIR OBJECTIVES	 49
 4 Alternatives for Funding Health Care	 51
Introduction	51
Public-private mix in finance and provision	52
Rewarding the providers	54
Private health care insurance	55
<i>Preferred provider organisations (PPOs)</i>	57
Direct tax system	58
Public health care insurance	61
Health maintenance organisations (HMOs)	63
Other financing mechanisms	64
Conclusions	65
 5 Economic Objectives of Health Care	 68
Introduction	68
Efficiency	68
<i>Effectiveness</i>	69
<i>Operational efficiency</i>	69
<i>Allocative efficiency</i>	70
Equity	72
Confronting the confusion: what do we mean by equity?	72
<i>Equity and externalities</i>	72
<i>Equity or equality?</i>	73
<i>Equity of health care or health?</i>	73
<i>Horizontal equity</i>	74
<i>Vertical equity</i>	76
<i>Muddying the waters: equity policies and pronouncements</i>	78
The economics and philosophy interface – theories of equity	81
Towards some operational equity goals	82
Interaction between equity and efficiency	83
Conclusions	83

PART 3 A REVIEW OF EMPIRICAL FINDINGS	85
6 Countering Consumer Moral Hazard	87
Introduction	87
Policy responses to consumer moral hazard	88
Evidence on countering consumer moral hazard	89
<i>Copayments</i>	89
<i>Fixed, periodic, per-capita payment</i>	94
<i>Preferred provider organisations</i>	96
<i>Fixed indemnity</i>	97
<i>Non-price rationing</i>	98
Conclusions	99
7 Countering Doctor Moral Hazard	101
Introduction	101
Methods of paying doctors	102
Fee for service: does supplier inducement really exist?	103
<i>Supplier-induced demand: evidence and explanations</i>	103
<i>Intervening to set fees</i>	107
Alternatives to fee for service	108
<i>Salaries</i>	108
<i>Special payments for 'good practice'</i>	109
<i>Capitation</i>	110
<i>Clinicians as budget holders</i>	112
<i>Government regulation</i>	113
Conclusions	114
8 Countering Moral Hazard in the Hospital Sector	116
Introduction	116
Theoretical perspectives	117
Methods of reimbursing hospitals: a case of minding our P 's and Q 's?	119
<i>Retrospective reimbursement at full cost (minding neither P_i nor Q_i)</i>	121
<i>Prospective reimbursement (minding P_i, P_iQ_i or $\sum P_iQ_i$)</i>	121
<i>Competition (minding P_i, Q_i or P_i and Q_i together)</i>	123
Empirical evidence on reimbursing hospitals	125
<i>Retrospective versus prospective reimbursement</i>	125
<i>Competition</i>	135
Does ownership make a difference?	136
Towards a solution: back to budgeting?	138
Conclusions	141

9	Achieving Equity	143
	Introduction	143
	The role of government in health care financing	144
	Evidence on vertical equity	145
	<i>Income and health care contributions</i>	145
	<i>Charges and community financing in LDCs</i>	148
	Evidence on equity as access	150
	<i>Some brief international comparisons</i>	150
	<i>USA: No explicit equity objective</i>	153
	<i>Canada: Objective – equality of utilisation</i>	157
	<i>UK: Objective – equal access for equal need</i>	158
	<i>Finland: Objective – equality of geographical utilisation</i>	161
	Conclusions	162
	PART 4 FUTURE CHALLENGES	165
10	Future Considerations: Setting the Health Care Budget	167
	Introduction	167
	What are the determinants of total health care spending?	168
	What is the appropriate level of spending?	173
	<i>Where do we go from here? Relating broad inputs to broad outputs</i>	174
	<i>Where do we go from here? Economic evaluation</i>	176
	<i>Where do we go from here? Other sectors' contributions to health</i>	179
	Conclusions	181
11	Health Care Financing Reforms: Challenges for the 1990s	183
	Introduction	183
	The contribution of economic theory	184
	Empirical findings – how health services should be financed	185
	<i>The financial intermediary</i>	186
	<i>Financing and the supply side</i>	186
	<i>Financing and the demand side</i>	188
	Determining the size of the budget	189
	Conclusions	189
	<i>Notes</i>	190
	<i>References</i>	193
	<i>Subject Index</i>	211
	<i>Author Index</i>	214

Acknowledgements

There are many people to thank for their help in producing this book.

First, we would like to thank the series editors, Gavin Mooney and Ali McGuire, for helping us through the final stages of the production process.

We would also like to thank our colleagues in various institutions; many of our ideas were formed and much writing was done while at these places. Therefore, we are grateful to our colleagues at the Department of Public Health at the University of Sydney, at the Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation at Westmead Hospital in Sydney, and at the Centre for Health Economics at the University of York. Special help at each of these sites was provided by Monika Bhatia, Jackie Dettman, Julie Glanville, Alan Maynard and Owen O'Donnell.

The following people provided us with valuable information on particular countries: Tamas Angelus (Hungary), Toni Ashton (New Zealand), Joan Artells (Spain), Ivar Sønbo Kristiansen (Norway), Ken Lee (USSR), Marian Matulewicz (Poland) and Frans Rutten (The Netherlands).

Thanks are also due to our colleagues in the Health Economics Research Unit: in particular Doreen Adams, Anne Bews and Shelley Farrar.

Finally, this book could not have been written without the support and inspiration provided by Tony Culyer of the University of York, and by Gavin Mooney. Much of the work presented here originated from a project on health care financing, carried out with the Institute for Health Services Management under Tony's supervision. All that Gavin did was to make us believe we could write a book in the first place!