Macmillan Law Masters

Legal Theory

MACMILLAN LAW MASTERS

Series editor: **Marise Cremona**

- 0-333-53251-1 *Basic English Law* (2nd edn) W. T. Major
0-333-61734-7 *Business Law* (2nd edn) Stephen Judge
0-333-71095-9 *Company Law* (3rd edn) Janet Dine
0-333-61883-1 *Constitutional and Administrative Law* (2nd edn) John Alder
0-333-71980-8 *Contract Law* (3rd edn) Ewan McKendrick
0-333-59374-X *Conveyancing* (2nd edn) Priscilla Sarton
0-333-62075-5 *Criminal Law* (2nd edn) Jonathan Herring and
Marise Cremona
0-333-63758-5 *Economic and Social Law and Policy of the European Union*
Jo Shaw
0-333-67097-3 *Employment Law* (2nd edn) Deborah J. Lockton
0-333-67491-X *Environmental Law and Ethics* John Alder and
David Wilkinson
0-333-71979-4 *Family Law* (2nd edn) Kate Standley
0-333-66489-2 *Intellectual Property Law* Tina Hart and Linda Fazzani
0-333-69180-6 *Land Law* (3rd edn) Kate Green
0-333-69286-1 *Landlord and Tenant Law (3rd edn)* Margaret Wilkie and
Godfrey Cole
0-333-66481-7 *Law of the European Union* (2nd edn) Jo Shaw
0-333-61735-5 *Law of Succession* Catherine Rendell
0-333-54232-0 *Law of Trusts* Patrick McLoughlin and Catherine Rendell
0-333-67696-3 *Legal Method* (2nd edn) Ian McLeod
0-333-67490-1 *Legal Theory* Ian McLeod
0-333-71577-2 *Social Security Law* Robert East
0-333-71903-4 *Torts* (2nd edn) Alastair Mullis and Ken Oliphant

Legal Theory

Ian McLeod

LLB, BA, BPhil,

Solicitor

Department of Law, London Guildhall University

Law series editor: Marise Cremona

Senior Fellow, Centre for Commercial Law Studies

Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London

© Thomas Ian McLeod 1999

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 1999 by
MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

ISBN 978-0-333-67490-1 ISBN 978-1-349-14269-9 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-14269-9

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and
made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
08 07 06 05 04 03 02 01 00 99

Typeset by Ian Kingston Editorial Services, Nottingham

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
1 The nature of legal theory: from laws to law	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Law and legal theory	1
1.3 A question of terminology: <i>jurisprudence</i> , <i>legal philosophy</i> , or <i>legal theory</i> ?	2
1.4 The sources of legal theory	4
1.5 Legal theory as a culture-specific subject	6
1.6 Classifications of legal theories	8
1.7 Why study legal theory?	9
Summary	11
2 The nature and functions of law	12
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Natural law and positivism	12
2.3 The functions of law	18
Summary	23
3 The natural law tradition	24
3.1 Introduction	24
3.2 Ancient Greece	24
3.3 Rome	32
3.4 The Christian contribution	34
3.5 The secularization of natural law	38
3.6 The logical attack on the natural law tradition	42
3.7 Natural law and natural rights in English and European Community law	43
Summary	52

4	English analytical positivism	54
4.1	Introduction	54
4.2	Austin's command theory of law	54
4.3	Hart's <i>Concept of Law</i>	59
	Summary	67
5	Kelsen's hierarchy of norms	68
5.1	Introduction	68
5.2	The nature and elements of the pure theory of law	68
5.3	The nature of the <i>Grundnorm</i>	71
5.4	The <i>Grundnorm</i> of the British constitution	77
	Summary	83
6	The revival of natural law: Fuller and Finnis	84
6.1	Introduction	84
6.2	Fuller's <i>The Morality of Law</i>	84
6.3	Finnis's <i>Natural Law and Natural Rights</i>	91
	Summary	98
7	Policies, principles, rights and interpretation: Dworkin's theory of adjudication	99
7.1	Introduction	99
7.2	The inadequacy of seeing law as a system of rules	100
7.3	Policies, principles and rights	101
7.4	Interpretation: <i>justification</i> and <i>fit</i>	107
7.5	The problem of identifying rights in practice	108
7.6	A footnote on Dworkin	112
	Summary	113
8	American realism	114
8.1	Introduction	114
8.2	The basis of American realism	115
8.3	Law as prophecy	115
8.4	Rule-scepticism	116
8.5	Fact-scepticism	119
8.6	Law-jobs	120
	Summary	123
9	Critical perspectives on law	125
9.1	Introduction	125
9.2	Marxism	125
9.3	The critical legal studies movement	127

9.4	Feminism in legal theory	129
	Summary	133
10	Theories of justice	134
10.1	Introduction	134
10.2	Utilitarianism	135
10.3	The economic analysis of law	138
10.4	Rawls' <i>Theory of Justice</i> and <i>Political Liberalism</i>	143
10.5	Nozick and the minimal state	146
	Summary	147
11	Legal regulation of morality	148
11.1	Introduction	148
11.2	The debate in the 19th century	149
11.3	The <i>Wolfenden Report</i>	150
11.4	The Hart–Devlin debate	151
11.5	The report of the Williams Committee	154
11.6	Dworkin's argument on <i>Political Integration</i>	155
11.7	Some practical applications	156
11.8	Abortion and euthanasia	171
	Summary	176
	<i>Appendix: Extracts from the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms</i>	177
	<i>Selected Further Reading</i>	183
	<i>Index</i>	184

Preface

This book seeks to combine an explanation of the main topics commonly encountered in courses on Legal Theory or Jurisprudence, with, wherever possible, practical illustrations drawn from English, and where appropriate, European Community law.

The emphasis on practical application stems from my experience of teaching the subject within a modularized and semesterized system, the nature of which denies students the luxury of that leisurely reflection which might enable at least some of them to make the connections between legal theory and substantive law for themselves.

Turning to the happy task of acknowledgment, many people have helped, sometimes unwittingly, in the writing of this book. It would be impossible to name them all, and invidious to name only some. By way of exception, however, I must record a significant debt to Hamish Armour, who made many perceptive and helpful comments on the manuscript, although, of course, he cannot be held responsible for any errors, omissions, confusions or infelicities which remain. My principal acknowledgment must, as always, be to my wife Jacqui, who has once again been patient and supportive, particularly in respect of the more tedious aspects of authorship, such as proof-reading and compiling tables. She understands fully what the Roman poet Juvenal meant when he replied to the question 'Is writing an art or a craft?', with 'Neither: it is a disease'. She looks forward to the day when I may be cured.

IAN MCLEOD
September 1998

Acknowledgments

The author and publishers wish to thank the following for permission to use copyright material: Yale University Press for extracts from Fuller *The Morality of Law* (1969), The Harvard Law Review Association for extracts from Holmes *The Path of Law* (1897) and Kelsen *General Theory of Law and State* (1946), HarperCollins Publishers for extracts from Dworkin *Law's Empire* (1986), W.W. Norton & Company for lines from *of all the blessings known to man* from *Complete Poems 1904–1962*, by E.E. Cummings, and Oxford University Press for passages from *The Republic and the Laws* and *The Concept of Law*, second edition.

Table of Cases

Airedale National Health Service Trust v. Bland [1993] 1 All ER 821	173
Anisminic v. Foreign Compensation Commission [1969] 1 All ER 208	31
Associated Provincial Picture Houses v. Wednesbury Corporation [1947] 2 All ER 680	29
Atalanta [1979] ECR 2137	28
Baines, Re (1840) 41 ER 401	87
Barracough v. Brown [1895–99] All ER Rep 239	142
Beatty v. Gillbanks (1882) 9 QBD 308	121, 122
Behrendt v. Burridge [1976] 3 All ER 285	163
Bird v. Holbrook (1828) 4 Bing 628	6, 7
Bismag Ltd v. Amblins (Chemists) Ltd [1940] Ch 667	86
Black-Clawson International Ltd v. Papierwerke Waldhof-Aschaffenberg AG [1975] 1 All ER 810	56
Bolton v. Stone [1951] 1 All ER 1078	139
Bourne v. Norwich Crematorium Ltd [1967] 1 All ER 576	117
Bowman v. Secular Society Ltd [1917] AC 406	6
British Railways Board v. Picken [1974] 1 All ER 609	45
Brutus v. Cozens [1972] 2 All ER 1297	164, 165
Bucocke v. Greater London Council [1971] 2 All ER 254	17
Burmah Oil v. Lord Advocate [1964] 2 All ER 348	86
Calder (John) Publications Ltd v. Powell [1965] 1 All ER 159	167
Coltman v. Bibby Tankers Ltd [1987] 3 All ER 1068	46
Costa v. ENEL [1964] CMLR 425	81
Cowan v. Milburn (1867) LR 2 Exch 230	6
Daborn v. Bath Tramways [1946] 2 All ER 333	140
Day v. Savadge (1614) Hob 85	45
Donoghue v. Stevenson [1932] AC 562	107
Dowling, Re [1967] AC 725	57
DPP v. A and BC Chewing Gum Ltd [1967] 2 All ER 504	166, 167

DPP v. Jordan [1976] 3 All ER 775	168
DPP v. Whyte [1972] 3 All ER 12	166, 168
Dr Bonham's Case (1610) 8 Co Rep 114	45
Duke of Buccleuch v. Alexander Cowan & Sons (1866) LR 2 AC 344	127
Duncan v. Jones [1936] 1 KB 218	121, 122
Dunlop Pneumatic Tyre Co Ltd v. New Garage & Motor Co Ltd [1914–15] All ER Rep 739	29
Ellen Street Estates Ltd v. Minister of Health [1934] All ER Rep 385	87
Elphinstone v. Monkland Iron & Coal Co (1886) 11 App Cas 342	29
Entick v. Carrington [1558–1774] All ER Rep 41	47, 48
Factortame Ltd v. Secretary of State for Transport (No 2) [1991] 1 All ER 70	45, 83
Fitzpatrick v. Sterling Housing Association Ltd [1997] 4 All ER 991	110, 111
Fromançais SA v. FORMA [1983] ECR 395	28
Gammon (Hong Kong) Ltd v. Attorney-General for Hong Kong [1984] 2 All ER 503	87
Harrogate Borough Council v. Simpson (1986) 2 FLR 91	108, 110, 111
Hyde v. Hyde (1866) LR 1 P&D 130	160
Internationale Handelsgesellschaft mbH [1974] 2 CMLR 540	82
Jones v. Secretary of State for Social Services [1972] 1 All ER 145	56
Kammins Ballrooms Co Ltd v. Zenith Investments Ltd [1970] 2 All ER 871	56
Kneller v. DPP [1972] 2 All ER 898	157, 158
L'Office Cherifien des Phosphates and Another v. Yamashita-Shinnihon Steamship Co Ltd: The Boucraa [1994] 1 All ER 20	86
Madzimbamuto v. Lardner-Burke (1968) 2 SA 284	74
Malone v. Metropolitan Police Commissioner (No 2) [1979] 2 All ER 620	48
Manuel v. Attorney-General [1983] 3 All ER 822	79
Masterson and Another v. Holden [1986] 3 All ER 39	163, 165
Maunsell v. Olins [1975] 1 All ER 16	103

Moss, Re [1949] 1 All ER 495	161
National Anti-Vivisection Society v. Inland Revenue Commissioners [1948] AC 31	161
Nold v. Commission [1974] 2 CMLR 338	51
O'Reilly v. Mackman [1982] 3 All ER 1124	50
Paris v. Stepney Borough Council [1951] 1 All ER 42	139
Pearce v. Brookes (1866) LR 1 Exch 213	148
Practice Statement: Judicial Precedent [1966] 3 All ER 77	88, 158
R v. Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council <i>ex parte</i> Hook [1976] 3 All ER 452	29
R v. Brown [1993] 2 All ER 75	158, 160
R v. Calder & Boyars Ltd [1968] 3 All ER 644	166
R v. Curl (1727) 2 Stra 788	165
R v. Ndhlovu (1968) 4 SA 515	75
R v. Parole Board <i>ex parte</i> Wilson (1992) 4 Admin LR 525	49
R v. R. (Rape: Marital Exemption) [1991] 4 All ER 481	111
R v. Registrar-General <i>ex parte</i> Smith [1991] 2 All ER 88	47
R v. Secretary of State for Social Security <i>ex parte</i> B and Another [1996] 4 All ER 38	47
R v. Secretary of State for the Home Department and Another <i>ex parte</i> Norney and Others (1995) 7 Admin LR 861	49
R v. Secretary of State for the Home Department <i>ex parte</i> Brind and Others [1991] 1 All ER 720	30, 49
R v. Secretary of State for Transport <i>ex parte</i> Factortame Ltd [1991] 3 All ER 769	87
R v. Somerset County Council <i>ex parte</i> Fewings and Others [1995] 1 All ER 513	161
R. v. West Dorset District Council <i>ex parte</i> Poupard (1987) 19 HLR 254, (1998) 20 HLR 295	118
R v. Wilson [1996] 2 Cr App R 241	159
Riggs v. Palmer 115 NY 506 (1889)	102
Roberts v. Hopwood [1925] All ER Rep 24	29
Secretary of State for Social Services v. Tunnicliffe [1991] 2 All ER 712	86
Shaw v. DPP [1961] 2 All ER 446	157, 166
Sigsworth, Re [1934] All ER Rep 113	46, 70, 102
Smith v. Hughes [1960] 1 WLR 830	162
Stauder v. City of Ulm [1969] ECR 419	51

Stovin v. Wise (Norfolk County Council, Third Party) [1996] 3 All ER 801	140
Sturges v. Bridgman (1879) 4 CPD 172	141
SW v. United Kingdom and CR v. United Kingdom [1995] <i>The Times</i> , December 12	112
Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill 437 US 153 (1973)	102
The State v. Dosso 1958 (2) PSCR 180	75
Uganda v. The Commissioner of Prisons, 1966 EA 514	75
United States v. Carroll Towing Co 159 F2d 169 (2nd Cir 1947)	138
van Gend en Loos [1963] CMLR 105	81
Watt v. Hertfordshire County Council [1954] 2 All ER 368	139, 140
Weisz v. Monahan [1962] 1 WLR 262	163
Wennhak v. Morgan (1888) 20 QBD 635	168