CRITICAL ACCOUNTS

Also edited by David J. Cooper and Trevor M. Hopper

DEBATING COAL CLOSURES

Critical Accounts

Edited by

David J. Cooper

Professor of Accounting

University of Alberta

and

Trevor M. Hopper

*Peat Marwick McLintock Professor of Management
Accounting*

University of Manchester

M
MACMILLAN

© David J. Cooper & Trevor M. Hopper 1990
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1990

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission
of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied
or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance
with the provisions of the Copyright Act 1956 (as amended),
or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying
issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 33–4 Alfred Place,
London WC1E 7DP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to
this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and
civil claims for damages.

First published 1990

Published by
THE MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Critical accounts.

1. Accounting

I. Cooper, David J. II. Hopper, Trevor M.

657

ISBN 978-1-349-09788-3 ISBN 978-1-349-09786-9 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-09786-9

Contents

<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
1. Stimulating Research in Critical Accounts <i>Trevor M. Hopper and David J. Cooper</i>	1
PART I: MAJOR ISSUES IN THEORY AND POLICY	
2. A Critical Analysis of Accounting Thought: Prognosis and Prospects for Understanding and Changing Accounting Systems Design <i>Richard Laughlin and Tony Lowe</i>	15
3. Displacing the Corporation with Deconstructionism and Dialectics <i>Tony Tinker and Marilyn Neimark</i>	44
4. Accounting for Feasible Socialism: Accounting, Industrial Democracy and the Theory of the Firm <i>Jim Tomlinson</i>	64
PART II: ACCOUNTING AND THE CONTROL OF LABOUR	
5. Factories of the Past and of the Future: The Impact of Robotics on Workers and Management Accounting Systems <i>Mark Young and Jon Davis</i>	87
6. Accounting as Discipline <i>John Roberts and Robert Scapens</i>	107
7. Joint Consultation and the Disclosure of Information: An Historical Perspective <i>Philip Bougen and Stuart Ogden</i>	126

8. Annual Reports in an Ideological Role: A Critical Theory Analysis <i>Norman Macintosh</i>	153
9. Power/Accounts and Ideology <i>Gavin Murray</i>	173
PART III: ALTERNATIVE ACCOUNTING CALCULATIONS	
10. Accounting: Tool of Business or Tool of Society? <i>Derek Bailey</i>	193
11. A Marxian Analysis of National Income and Expenditure <i>Jon Gubbay</i>	216
12. Measuring the Performance of Worker Co-operatives <i>Keith Jefferis and Alan Thomas</i>	233
13. Consequences of the Failure to Account for Externalities <i>Martin Freedman and A. J. Stagliano</i>	260
14. Corporate Social Accounting and the Capitalist Enterprise <i>Colwyn Jones</i>	272
15. Value for Money Auditing: Some Observations on its Origins and Theory <i>Brendan McSweeney and Michael Sherer</i>	294
PART IV: THE ACCOUNTING PROFESSION AND POWER	
16. Serving the Public Interest? A Critical Analysis of a Professional Claim <i>Hugh Willmott</i>	315
17. The Accountancy Profession in the Class Structure <i>Anthony Puxty</i>	332

18. Understanding the Development of the Accountancy Profession in the United Kingdom <i>Keith Robson and David Cooper</i>	366
19. Power and the Study of the Accounting Profession <i>Peter Booth and Neil Cocks</i>	391
<i>Index</i>	409

Notes on the Contributors

Bailey, Derek Lecturer in Accounting, University of Birmingham. His major research interests lie in accounting in socialist countries and accounting history. He has close contacts with accounting specialists in Poland and other socialist countries, and he is editor of an abstracting quarterly, *The Soviet and East European Accounting Bulletin*. He is also editor of a recent book, *Accounting in Socialist Countries*.

Booth, Peter Senior Lecturer in Accounting in the School of Accounting, University of New South Wales, Australia. His major research interest is in management control systems within not-for-profit organisations. He has published several articles on this topic. Recently he has concentrated upon power and accounting, of which the chapter in this volume is an offshoot.

Bougen, Philip D. Lecturer in Accounting at the University of Leeds and Visiting Associate Professor of Accounting, Rice University of Texas. His principal research interest is the use of accounting in industrial relations. He has published several articles in leading journals on this topic. His current interest is in the emergence of accounting systems.

Cocks, Neil Associate Professor in Accounting, Bond University, Gold Coast, Australia. Prior to this, he was at Griffith University and has held various positions as an auditor and a management accountant. His major research interests lie in applying Critical Theory to the study of the accounting profession, and the social psychology of portfolio investment behaviour.

Cooper, David J. Professor of Accounting, University of Alberta. He has held appointments at the Universities of Manchester, East Anglia, UMIST, British Columbia, California (Berkeley), Uppsala, and the Copenhagen School of Business. He has published extensively, predominantly on the organisational and social aspects of accounting. He is an Associate Editor of *Accounting, Organizations and Society* and joint editor of *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*. His current principal research interests are management budgeting in the

National Health Service and accounting regulation in the UK, USA, West Germany, and Sweden.

Davis, Jon S. Assistant Professor of Accounting at the University of Illinois in Champaign. His research interests include the behavioural impact of management control systems in organisations, experimental tests of economic models of the market for auditing and the impact of taxes upon investment.

Freedman, Martin Associate Professor of Accounting in the School of Management at the State University of New York at Binghamton. His publications and research interests lie in the measurement and reporting of the social costs of production, especially those dealing with occupational health and air and water pollution.

Gubbay, Jon Lecturer in Sociology at the University of East Anglia. A mathematics graduate from the University of Manchester. His research interest is in political economy, with particular concern for class structure and the economic activities of the state. He has published in this area and is currently doing research on the curriculum in higher education. He is a member of the Socialist Workers Party.

Hopper, Trevor M. Peat Marwick McLintock Professor of Management Accounting at the University of Manchester. He has also held positions at the Universities of Michigan (Ann Arbor) and Sheffield, and Wolverhampton Polytechnic. He was secretary of the Management Control Workshop for five years. His past research and publications have been on organisational approaches to management control. His current interests include management accounting history and the socio-economic consequences of management accounting within the public sector.

Jefferis, Keith Lecturer in Economics at Kingston Polytechnic, London and formerly a research student in the Co-operatives Research Unit at the Open University, Milton Keynes. He was awarded a PhD in 1988 for research on the economics of British worker co-operatives. His interests are the social and economic performance of worker co-operatives; the potential for changes to the labour process in co-operatives; and socialist methods of resource allocation.

Jones, T. Colwyn Senior Lecturer in Economic Sociology at Bristol Polytechnic where, since 1975, he has taught sociology to accounting undergraduates. His interests include 'the social construction of accounting' and 'accounting versus engineering rationales for investment in computer-aided manufacturing technology'.

Laughlin, Richard C. Lecturer in Accounting and Financial Management in the School of Management and Economic Studies at the University of Sheffield. His current research interests lie in accounting methodology as well as in exploring the social and historical base underlying accounting system design. He has published in these and related areas in a wide range of accounting, management and organisation journals.

Lowe, E. Anthony Professor Emeritus of Accounting and Financial Management at the University of Sheffield. He retired from his position at Sheffield in 1985. Subsequently he was a Research Associate at UMIST working on an ESRC research study of international accounting regulation. Tony Lowe has been a leading researcher for over three decades in management control, accounting methodology, and accounting education, and he has published widely in these and other areas. His current academic interests concern the social and political consequences of accounting and accountancy practice.

Macintosh, Norman B. Professor of Accounting and Information Systems at Queen's University, Canada. He researches and publishes widely in the area of behavioural accounting where he has developed several theories including a path-goal theory of financial controls, a technology-personal decision-style model of information systems, and a paradigm based on Jungian personality traits of managerial response to accounting and information systems. His book, *The Social Software of Accounting Systems*, has received wide acclaim.

McSweeney, Brendan Lecturer in Accounting and Finance, Warwick Business School, University of Warwick. Previously Senior Technical Officer of the Chartered Association of Certified Accountants. His major research interests include accounting and organisational change, and the organisational and social influences on accounting. His publications include the joint authorship of a book on accounting and multinational corporations, and many articles in academic, professional, and business journals.

Murray, Gavin Lecturer in Interdisciplinary Studies at the University of Kent at Canterbury. Gavin's teaching and research focuses upon the problem of ideology; his research interest in accounting concerns the practical strategies of accounts users and methodological debates within accounting. He believes that accounting is more intelligible as drama than it is as an attempt to establish scientific objectivity.

Neimark, Marilyn Associate Professor of Accountancy, Baruch College, The City University of New York. She received her PhD from New York University in 1983 and is a Certified Public Accountant. She is General Editor of *Advances in Public Interest Accounting*, a research annual published by JAI Press, and she writes extensively on the social and historical origins and consequences of accounting theory and practice.

Ogden, Stuart Lecturer in Industrial Relations at the University of Leeds. His research and publications include studies of accounting within industrial relations. He is currently researching the disclosure of information in collective bargaining.

Puxty, Anthony G. Professor of Accounting at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow. Prior to this, he was a lecturer in the School of Management and Economic Studies at the University of Sheffield. He is the author/editor of four books and monographs, and some forty academic and professional papers. His major current research interest is the relationship between the accounting profession and the state.

Roberts, John Research Fellow at the Management Studies Group at Cambridge University. He received his PhD from the University of Manchester Institute of Science and Technology in 1982. Subsequent to this, he was a Research Fellow in the Department of Accounting and Finance at the University of Manchester and at London Business School. His research has focussed on issues of management control and the uses of accounting information, and he is currently concerned with understanding the organisational processes involved in the formulation and implementation of strategic decisions.

Robson, Keith Lecturer in the School of Management at the University of Manchester Institute of Science and Technology. He obtained a BA and MA in Accounting and Finance from the University of

Manchester and a PhD on the Accounting Standards Committee in its social context from UMIST.

Scapens, Robert W. Professor of Accounting at the University of Manchester. He is currently researching the role of accounting and accountability in large organisations. His publications include *Management Accounting: A Review of Recent Developments* and papers in *The Accounting Review*, *Accounting Organizations and Society*, and various other journals.

Sherer, Michael Royal London Professor of Finance, University of Essex. His major research interests include the role of accounting information in the management control processes of public sector organisations and the efficacy of auditing as a means of accountability. His publications include two books on auditing and articles on the political economy of accounting.

Stagliano, A. J. Edward G. Sutula Professor of Accounting in the College of Business and Administration at Saint Joseph's University in Philadelphia. Formerly the Chairman of the Department of Accounting at George Mason University, he has also served on the faculties at the University of Maryland and the University of Illinois.

Thomas, Alan Lecturer in Systems at the Open University, Milton Keynes, where he has worked on course teams in Systems Management, Systems Modelling, Control of Technology, and Third World Studies. He had been researching UK worker co-operatives since 1977, and from 1984 to 1988 he co-directed a major project on 'Creating Successful Co-operative Businesses'.

Tinker, Tony Professor of Accounting at Baruch College, City University of New York. He is the author of *Paper Prophets: A Social Critique of Accounting* and *Social Accounting for Corporations: Private Enterprise versus the Public Interest*. Together with David Cooper he is editor of *Critical Perspectives in Accounting*. He is an editorial board member of *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, *The Journal of Accounting and Public Policy*, and *The Employee Responsibilities and Rights Journal*. A graduate of Manchester University, Tony has taught at the Universities of Sheffield, Washington (Seattle), UCLA, and NYU. He has published in a variety of fields

including sociology, finance, accounting, cybernetics, organisation theory, and systems theory.

Tomlinson, Jim Senior Lecturer in Economics, Brunel University. His main interests lie in the history of economic policy, and in industrial democracy. His six books include *The Unequal Struggle? British Socialism and the Capitalist Enterprise* (1982), *Monetarism: Is There an Alternative?* (1986), and *Employment Policy: The Crucial Years 1939–55* (1987).

Willmott, Hugh C. Lecturer in the School of Management, UMIST having previously been at the Management Centre, Aston University. He has published widely in sociology, political science and accounting journals. Together with David Knights, he has organised the UMIST/ASTON Labour Process Conferences and edited a series of volumes in this area including *Job Redesign* (1985), *Managing the Labour Process* (1986), *New Technology and the Labour Process* and *Labour Process Theory*. He is currently engaged in research into management control within the life-insurance industry and in an international study of the regulation of accounting.

Young, S. Mark Associate Professor of Accounting and Peat Marwick Faculty Fellow at the University of Colorado in Boulder. He received a PhD from the University of Pittsburgh. His current research interests are in the area of the impact of new manufacturing technology on control systems. His recent work has been published in *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, *Journal of Accounting Research*, and *Journal of Marketing Research*.

Acknowledgements

This book is a product of the First Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Accounting Conference held at the University of Manchester in July 1985. The editors would like to acknowledge the financial assistance given to the conference by the Economic and Social Research Council.

Every paper submitted was subjected to referees' comments and, if presented at the conference, written discussant's comments. Unfortunately, space precluded inclusion of the latter. Nevertheless, our thanks go to the necessarily anonymous referees and the discussants for their major contributions to developing the contents of this book. The discussants were Simon Archer, Peter Armstrong, Derek Bailey, Phil Bougen, Roger Bryant, Rob Bryer, Dave Collinson, Andrew Coulson, Laurence Harris, Tony Hope, Keith Hoskin, David Knights, Richard Laughlin, Anne Loft, Tony Lowe, Richard Macve, Jim McGoldrick, Brendan McSweeney, Gareth Morgan, Gavin Murray, Marilyn Neimark, Stuart Ogden, David Owen, Bob Perks, Mike Power, Tony Puxty, John Roberts, Mike Sherer, John Storey, Graham Thompson, Tony Tinker, Jim Tomlinson, Stuart Turley, Richard Whitley, Hugh Willmott and Mark Young.

Neither the Conference nor this book would have been possible without the moral and administrative support of the editors' respective departments, the School of Management at UMIST, and the Department of Accounting and Finance at the University of Manchester. The final stages of editing were eased considerably by the administrative support provided by the School of Business at The University of Michigan (Ann Arbor), where Trevor Hopper was a visitor during 1987. The exemplary secretarial services of Mary Hardy require a special debt of gratitude.