Consumption, Media and the Global South

This page intentionally left blank

Consumption, Media and the Global South

Aspiration Contested

Mehita Iqani

University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa

palgrave
macmillan

© Mehita Iqani 2016

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2016 978-1-137-39012-7

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2016 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-55701-1 ISBN 978-1-137-39013-4 (eBook)
DOI 10.1057/9781137390134

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Iqani, Mehita, author.

Consumption, media and the Goba South : aspiration
contested / Mehita Iqani.

pages cm

1. Consumption (Economics)—Social aspects—Developing countries.
2. Mass media—Social aspects—Developing countries.
3. Capitalism and mass media—Developing countries. I. Title.

HC59.72.C6173 2015

338.4'7091724—dc23

2015023263

For my parents, Anne and Bijan

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	x i
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	xiv
1 Introduction: The Mediation of Global South Consumption	1
The global south: Experimental term, analytical opportunity	2
Transnational comparative case studies: Challenges and prospects	9
Chapter outline	13
The materiality of mediated consumption	16
2 Globalization, Consumption and Power: Why Media Matter	18
Media and global culture	19
Theorizing mediated globalization	19
Media discourse and power	22
Consumer culture and globalization	23
The legacy of colonialism	23
The political economy of globalized consumption	29
Moralizing southern consumption	32
The developmentalist ethic: Can consumption save the south?	33
Inequality and avarice: Consumption as globalized exploitation	38
Studying the mediation of southern consumption:	
A conceptual matrix	44
Consumption as power: Manipulation and empowerment reloaded	44
Consumption as aspiration: Poverty and wealth depolarized	46
Consumption as communication: Semiotic doubling in distinction and mediation	47
Summing up: Consumption, inequality and aspiration	49

3 Slum Tourism and the Consumption of Poverty in TripAdvisor Reviews: The Cases of Langa, Dharavi and Santa Marta	51
Slum tourism: Globalized gazing and the mediation of poverty	54
Global mobility and the exploitative gaze: Who looks and who is looked at?	57
Ethical witnessing? Politics, development and social realism in slum tours	59
The mediation of slum tourism: Glamorous or realist aesthetics?	62
Case studies: Dharavi, Santa Marta and Langa tours on TripAdvisor.com	65
Slum tours reviewed: Discourses on value, morality and learning	68
“Highlight”: Value for money and the commoditized experience	68
“Humbling”: Material poverty, spiritual wealth and questions of perspective	73
“Eye-opening”: Dealing with reality and the geopolitics of the class encounter	77
Slum tours: Commoditized, moralized and mediated (a conclusion)	82
 4 New Yuppies? Documentary Film Representations of Middle-Class Consumer Lifestyles in China and South Africa	 87
Global south “yuppies”? Middle-class culture and capital	88
The middle class: Contested, constructed, relational	90
Salaried and spending: Economic capital, income and agency	92
Taste and mobility: Cultural capital, globalization and identity	95
“Yuppies” on film: Documenting social mobility in China and South Africa	99
The dream, success and morality: The representation of Chinese and black South African yuppie subjectivities	101
Prosperity and time: Narratives of the dream	102
On the symbolism of the luxury car: Spending and success	109

Living it up, playing it down: Deserving and democratizing wealth	113
Mediating the yuppie: Neoliberal culture and southern upward mobility	117
5 Allegations of Consumption: Wealth and Luxury in News Reports of Corruption in South Africa and India	121
Corruption, society and the media: Interdisciplinary debates	126
Abusing power: Defining corruption and its consequences	126
Stereotypes of instability? Framing global south corruption	131
Exposing corruption, demanding accountability: The role of the media	133
Consumption or corruption in the spotlight? Four cases	137
Winnie and the diamond deal	140
Yengeni and the luxury Mercedes-Benz 4×4	142
Mayawati and the rupee garland	144
Jagan and the lavish mansion	146
Theorizing corrupt consumption: Excess, aspiration and power	148
Taking it too far? The symbolism of excess	149
Signifying aspiration: Populism and pleasure	152
Agency or betrayal? The power of expenditure	154
Corrupt consumers or consuming corruption? Concluding thoughts	157
6 Celebrity Skin: Race, Gender and the Politics of Feminine Beauty in Celebrity Selfies	160
Celebrities in/and the global south: Development and desire	163
Celebrity aid, humanitarianism and development	165
“Exotic” stars: Southern celebrities on the western stage	167
The aesthetics of success: Race and beauty in the global south	169
Case studies: Black stars’ celebrity selfies	173
Black/bleached beauties: The aesthetics and politics of individualism, consumption and sexiness	176
Me, myself and I: Selfies, intimacy and the ethic of individualism	179

Consumer queens: Fashion, styling and the world of feminine goods	183
The sexiness queue? Post-feminist aesthetics and classed desirability	188
Empowered role models? Sexy southern stars, race and the politics of post-femininity	192
7 Contesting Aspiration: Equality, Empowerment and Media Narratives about Consumption	196
Consumption as communication: Relinking consumer culture and media	199
The politics of aspiration: Negotiating between the dream and reality	202
Consumption as power: Getting it, exercising it, resisting it	208
Looking ahead: New avenues for researching the mediation of global south consumption	212
<i>Works Cited</i>	215
<i>Index</i>	233

Tables

4.1 Documentaries analysed for Chapter 4	100
--	-----

Acknowledgements

Writing this book has been a most collaborative and a most solitary experience. The hundreds of hours I've spent alone, disciplining myself to just write, have been in counterpoint with the many formative, stimulating and indispensable conversations about it that I've had with friends, colleagues and friends of friends. I owe thanks to so many, and have endeavoured to remember everyone who helped me along the way, no matter how small they may have seen their contributions to be. In particular, I am hugely grateful to colleagues who took time out of their busy schedules to read and comment on draft chapters, sharing their valuable thoughts and suggestions: Nicky Falkof, Dina Ligaga, Cobus van Staden, Glenda Daniels, Isabel Hofmeyr, Tommaso Milani, Ufuoma Akpojivi and Charne Lavery.

To those who helped me think through case studies or access archival media material, suggested a particular empirical route, listened to me present on work in progress, had exploratory chats over coffee, explained something about India, Brazil or China, gave me pep talks, encouraged me, or suggested things to read, thank you: Innocentia Mhlambi, Hennie van Vuuren, Amanda Gilbertson, Sarah Chiumbu, Nic Dawes, Ranjana Das, Shilpa Phadke, Dilip Menon, Srila Roy, Marcia Tondato, Gisela Castro, Bridget Kenny, Zhiyan (Maggie) Wu, Michael Griffiths, Pamila Gupta, Gilles Baro and Gen-Nam Chow. My deep thanks also go to my "transnational mentors", Rosalind Gill, Lilie Chouliaraki and Jonathan Schroeder, who provided me with extremely helpful feedback at the conceptualization stage and who I know will always be at the other end of the email when I need their advice. I'd also like to thank colleagues who participated in the May 2014 Global South Workshop in the Wits-Michigan 'Sugarman' network for helping me to shape my contribution to that topic. My thanks also go to Simon Wood and Saskia Vredefeld for giving me copies of their films, *Foreunners* and *Black Diamonds*, respectively, as well as to archivists at the *Times of India* and the *Mail & Guardian*, who helped me access historical material.

I am indebted to the collegiate and intellectually stimulating work of the Critical Research in Consumer Culture network – the reading groups, seminars, writing retreats, workshops and conferences we've organized and attended together have shaped my thinking in the past few years. I am also indebted to the marvellous research environment

created by the University of the Witwatersrand. In my four years of service there, I have been awarded a number of grants which allowed me to do all the empirical work for this book and balance my teaching responsibilities with the intensive effort required to do this research and writing. I am deeply thankful for the resources provided by the National Research Foundation's Thuthuka Grant (2012–2014), the University of the Witwatersrand's Friedel Sellschop Award (2014–2016), the Faculty of Humanities Research Promotion Grant (2014), the SPARC fund (2013), the Wits Carnegie Young Scholars Grant (2012) and the AW Mellon Young Researcher Grant administered by the Wits Faculty of Humanities (2012).

This book would not be this book were it not for my students, who have taught me so much and inspired me in so many ways. In particular, I am grateful to Katlego Disemelo and Simphiwe Rens for research assistance at various stages in the work that has led to this volume. I also owe a big shout-out to the brilliant Critical Media Analysis class of the honours 2014 cohort, who enthused me with their passionate engagement with research into crucial contemporary questions in media and cultural studies. In particular, Chapter 6 is my response to their provocations to think more about globalized narratives of feminine beauty, race, shade-ism and celebrity.

I would not have been able to achieve anything careerwise without the support and care of everyone in my personal life. To my family, all the in-laws and all my friends, thanks for asking how the book was going and listening when I answered, for being there to distract me when I needed it, and for understanding when I had to hide away and work. To Davey, you're my number one, my favourite person, my best teammate: thank you again and always for everything.

Acronyms

AAP	Aam Aadmi Party
ANC	African National Congress
AP	Andhra Pradesh
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
BMW	Bavarian Motor Works
BRICS	Brazil Russia India China South Africa
BSP	Bahujan Samaj Party
CAPP	Co-ordinated Anti Poverty Programme
CBI	Central Bureau of Investigation
CPI	Corruption Perceptions Index
FHM	For Him Magazine
FIR	First Information Report
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IMF	International Monetary Fund
I-T	Income Tax
MP	Member of Parliament
MTV	Music Television
NAM	Non-Aligned Movement
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NWICO	New World Information and Communications Order
SUV	Sports Utility Vehicle
TI	Transparency International
UK	United Kingdom
UP	Uttar Pradesh
US	United States
YSR (Congress Party)	Yuvajana, Shramika, Rythu Congress Party