Reassessing Egalitarianism

Also by Jeremy Moss

CLIMATE CHANGE AND SOCIAL JUSTICE (*editor*)

RISK AND RESPONSIBILITY (*edited with Greg Marston and John Quiggin*)

Reassessing Egalitarianism

Jeremy Moss

The Social Justice Initiative, University of Melbourne, Australia

palgrave
macmillan

© Jeremy Moss 2014

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2014 978-1-137-38597-0

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2014 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC,
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries

ISBN 978-1-349-48144-6

ISBN 978-1-137-38598-7 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9781137385987

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
Introduction	1
The value of equality	3
Equality of what?	4
Equality and responsibility	7
Global egalitarianism	9
Scope and focus	14
1 The Value of Equality	17
1.1 Introduction	17
The importance of equality	19
1.2 Equality as intrinsically valuable	24
1.3 Equality and sufficiency	26
Scarcity	27
Thresholds	28
1.4 Prioritarianism	29
Leveling down	30
1.5 Egalitarian responses	33
Pluralism	33
Fairness	34
1.6 Valuing equality	38
1.7 Conclusion	39
2 Equality of What?	41
2.1 Introduction	41
2.2 Equality of welfare	45
Actual preferences	47
Success theories	49
Responses	51
2.3 Equality of resources	54
Rawls and primary goods	55
Criticisms of Rawls's account of primary goods	56
2.4 Dworkin: auctioning resources	58
Insurance and endowment insensitivity: luck and handicaps	60
Dworkin's equality of resources: preferences and the market	62

	Dworkin on the market and the role of preferences	63
2.5	Capabilities	65
	Sen and capabilities	65
	Nussbaum and capabilities	69
2.6	Assessment of the capability approach	71
	Freedom	71
	Selection and weighting	74
	Hard cases, heterogeneity, and disrespect	77
2.7	Conclusion	79
3	Egalitarianism and Responsibility	85
3.1	Introduction	85
	Different kinds of responsibilities	88
	Two roles for equality: Rawls and the luck egalitarians	90
3.2	Motivating luck egalitarianism	91
	The harshness objection and lack of respect	92
	Limiting the role of chance and choice	93
3.3	Relational egalitarianism	96
	Equality as equal standing	96
3.4	Luck egalitarian responses	98
3.5	Conclusion: assessing the debate	103
4	Global Egalitarianism	108
4.1	Introduction	108
4.2	Justice as association: the basic structure	111
4.3	Assessing the cooperation/reciprocity argument	113
	Reciprocity	113
	Pervasive impact	115
	Coercion	115
4.4	Moral personality	118
	Moral persons	119
4.5	Equality of natural resources	123
4.6	Equality and the carbon budget	129
	The atmosphere and equal shares	132
	Assessing the equal per capita approach	134
4.7	Conclusion	136
	Conclusion: Assessing the Prospects for Egalitarianism	139
	<i>Notes</i>	144
	<i>Bibliography</i>	165
	<i>Index</i>	175

Acknowledgements

This book has benefited from numerous discussions and opportunities to present the material. For discussing parts of the book, I thank audiences at the universities of ANU, Beijing, Graz, Hong Kong, Lisbon, Oxford, Macquarie, McGill, Melbourne, Queensland, Sydney, UNESCO, and Wellington. The book was written in part while I visited the universities of Oxford and McGill, and they provided very congenial research environments. I particularly thank the participants of the Crash Course on Egalitarianism at Université catholique de Louvain in 2012 and Axel Gosseries for organizing it, as well as the participants of the Just Equality Workshop: Dan Halliday, Sanyar Sagal, Greg Bognar, Axel Gosseries, and Robert Young. I would also like to thank Graham Brown, Director of the Nossal Institute of Global Health, for his support during the research for this book. Some of the many people who have discussed parts of the book with me are Dave Archard, Dick Arneson, John Baker, Paula Casal, Tony Coady, Simon Caney, Garrett Cullity, Iwao Hirose, Simon Keller, Uwe Steinhoff, Adam Swift, Andrew Williams, and Jo Wolff. I thank them for their input. I also particularly thank Robert Young for many conversations on the topics collected in this book; they have been instrumental in making it a better work.

Earlier versions of some of the material have appeared in print as follows. I thank the publishers for permission to republish.

Moss, Jeremy. "Egalitarianism and the Value of Equality." *Journal of Ethics and Social Philosophy*, 2 (2009): 1–6.

Moss, Jeremy, "Against Fairness." *Journal of Value Inquiry*, 41 (2007): 309–324.

The book has also had the crucial support of a number of grants from the Australian Research Council – they enabled me to have time off for research and travel to other universities – in particular an ARC Future Fellowship and a Discovery grant, *Reassessing Egalitarianism*. I thank the Council for its generous support.