

# **Barriers and Biases in Computer-Mediated Knowledge Communication**

# COMPUTER-SUPPORTED COLLABORATIVE LEARNING

---

VOLUME 5

---

*Series Editor:*

Pierre Dillenbourg, *Swiss Federal Institute of Technology, Lausanne, Switzerland*

*Editorial Board:*

Michael Baker, *CNRS & Université Lumière Lyon, France*  
Carl Bereiter, *Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Canada*  
Yrjö Engeström, *University of Helsinki, Finland*  
Gerhard Fischer, *University of Colorado, U.S.A.*  
H. Ulrich Hoppe, *University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany*  
Timothy Koschmann, *Southern Illinois University, U.S.A.*  
Naomi Miyake, *Chukyo University, Japan*  
Claire O'Malley, *University of Nottingham, U.K.*  
Roy Pea, *SRI International, U.S.A.*  
Clotilde Pontecorovo, *University 'La Sapienza', Italy*  
Jeremy Roschelle, *SRI International, U.S.A.*  
Daniel Suthers, *University of Hawaii, U.S.A.*

The *Computer-Supported Collaborative Learning Book Series* is for people working in the CSCL field. The scope of the series extends to 'collaborative learning' in its broadest sense; the term is used for situations ranging from two individuals performing a task together, during a short period of time, to groups of 200 students following the same course and interacting via electronic mail. This variety also concerns the computational tools used in learning: elaborated graphical whiteboards support peer interaction, while more rudimentary text-based discussion forums are used for large group interaction. The series will integrate issues related to CSCL such as collaborative problem solving, collaborative learning without computers, negotiation patterns outside collaborative tasks, and many other relevant topics. It will also cover computational issues such as models, algorithms or architectures which support innovative functions relevant to CSCL systems.

The edited volumes and monographs to be published in this series offer authors who have carried out interesting research work the opportunity to integrate various pieces of their recent work into a larger framework.

*The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.*

R. Bromme  
F.W. Hesse  
H. Spada  
(Editors)

# **Barriers and Biases in Computer-Mediated Knowledge Communication**

And How They May Be Overcome

 Springer

Rainer Bromme, University of Münster, Germany  
Friedrich W. Hesse, University of Tübingen, Germany  
Hans Spada, University of Freiburg, Germany

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available  
from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 0-387-24317-8      e-ISBN 0-387-24319-4      Printed on acid-free paper.

© 2005 Springer Science+Business Media, Inc.

All rights reserved. This work may not be translated or copied in whole or in part without the written permission of the publisher (Springer Science+Business Media, Inc., 233 Spring Street, New York, NY 10013, USA), except for brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis. Use in connection with any form of information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed is forbidden.

The use in this publication of trade names, trademarks, service marks and similar terms, even if they are not identified as such, is not to be taken as an expression of opinion as to whether or not they are subject to proprietary rights.

Printed in the United States of America.

9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1      SPIN 11161530

[springeronline.com](http://springeronline.com)

# CONTENTS

*Bromme, R., Hesse, F.W. & Spada, H.*

BARRIERS, BIASES AND OPPORTUNITIES OF COMMUNICATION AND COOPERATION WITH COMPUTERS: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	1
1. Why "communication and cooperation with computers"?	1
2. Why "barriers"	1
3. Why "biases"	2
4. Why "opportunities"?	3
5. The construction and use of technical artifacts is based on presumptions of barriers and how to overcome them	3
6. Three basic barrier-presumptions related to problems of communication and cooperation	4
6.1. The individual and mutual construction of "meaning" and the exchange of information in groups	4
6.2. The establishment and maintenance of structure in social interactions	4
6.3. The establishment and maintenance of motivation to cooperate and communicate	5
7. What is the impact of the computer environment on the mentioned barriers?	5
8. The chapters	6
9. A map for the localization of barriers, biases and opportunities	12
References	14

*Weinberger, A., Reiserer, M., Ertl, B., Fischer, F. & Mandl, H.*

FACILITATING COLLABORATIVE KNOWLEDGE CONSTRUCTION IN COMPUTER-MEDIATED LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS WITH COOPERATION SCRIPTS	15
1. Collaborative knowledge construction	15
2. Computer-mediated learning environments	16
3. Facilitating collaborative knowledge construction	17
3.1 Facilitating social and epistemic activities with scripts	19
3.2 Social cooperation scripts for collaborative knowledge construction	20
3.3 Epistemic cooperation scripts for collaborative knowledge construction	21

4. Implementing social and epistemic cooperation scripts in computer-mediated learning environments .....	21
5. Facilitating computer-mediated learning through scripts: Evidence from web-based discussion boards and videoconferencing .....	23
5.1 Study 1: Facilitating collaborative knowledge construction in text-based communication through cooperation scripts .....	23
5.2 Study 2: Facilitating collaborative knowledge construction in a videoconferencing environment through cooperation scripts .....	29
6. Discussion .....	33
References .....	35

*Pfister, H.-R.*

HOW TO SUPPORT SYNCHRONOUS NET-BASED LEARNING DISCOURSES: PRINCIPLES AND PERSPECTIVES .....	39
1. Learning discourses.....	39
1.1 Prototypical discourse: Face-to-face .....	40
1.2 Levels of discourse.....	41
2. Variants of support.....	44
2.1 The augmentation paradigm.....	44
2.2 The reduction paradigm .....	46
3. A cost-effort framework.....	49
3.1 The costs of grounding.....	50
3.2 The utility of grounding .....	50
3.3 Deciding to ground.....	51
4. Perspectives.....	53
References .....	55

*Rummel, N., & Spada, H.*

INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORT FOR COLLABORATION IN DESKTOP VIDEOCONFERENCE SETTINGS .....	59
1. Introduction.....	59
2. Challenges in computer-mediated collaboration .....	60
2.1 A first challenge: Problem-solving and learning in collaboration.....	60
2.2 A second challenge: Complementary expertise as a basis for collaboration .....	61
2.3 A third challenge: Collaborating in a computer-mediated setting.....	61
3. Overcoming the barriers: How to achieve good collaboration.....	64
3.1 Support during collaboration.....	64
3.2 Support prior to collaboration: An instructional approach.....	65

4. Assessing collaboration: How to test the effects of support measures .....	67
4.1 Assessing collaborative process .....	68
4.2 Assessing joint outcome.....	74
4.3 Assessing individual knowledge .....	75
5. An experiment illustrating instructional measures, experimental paradigm, and assessment methods.....	75
5.1 Task, participants, and setting .....	76
5.2 Experimental conditions .....	76
5.3 Assessing the dependent variables .....	77
5.4 Summary and discussion of results .....	78
6. Instructional support measures and methods of assessment: Lessons learned.....	80
6.1 Instructional support measures for achieving good computer-mediated collaboration .....	80
6.2 Methods of assessing process and outcome of collaboration.....	81
6.3 Challenges met, barriers overcome, chances realized? .....	83
References.....	84

*Bromme, R., Jucks, R. & Runde, A.*

BARRIERS AND BIASES IN COMPUTER-MEDIATED EXPERT- LAYPERSON-COMMUNICATION .....	89
1. Two vignettes and a short introduction .....	89
2. Opportunities and barriers.....	90
2.1. Opportunities for and barriers to distributing and finding specialized medical knowledge via the Internet. ....	90
2.2. Expert's specialist knowledge: Sources of advice – and mutual misunderstanding. ....	92
3. Knowledge differences and mutual understanding in text-based asynchronous computer mediated communication .....	94
3.1. Introducing Herbert H. Clark's communication model .....	94
3.2. Some doubts about the cooperative nature of communication.....	96
4. Expertise and the design of written medical explanations: studies on the use of the community membership heuristic and physical copresence heuristic in computer mediated settings .....	97
4.1. Our research questions .....	97
4.2. Study 1: Analyzing experts' audience design .....	99
4.3. The other side of the coin: Studies with layperson samples.....	106
5. Synthesis .....	114
References.....	116

*Anderson, A.H., Mullin, J., McEwan, R., Bal, J., Carletta, J., Grattan, E. & Brundell, P.*

EXPLORING WHY VIRTUAL TEAMWORKING IS EFFECTIVE IN THE LAB BUT MORE DIFFICULT IN THE WORKPLACE. .... 119

1. Introduction..... 119

    1.1 Overview of chapter ..... 120

    1.2. Study 1: Lab study of virtual team working..... 121

    1.3. Discussion ..... 125

2. Study 2: Workplace study of virtual teams. .... 127

    2.1. Background ..... 128

    2.2. Observing and analysing virtual meetings ..... 129

    2.3 Observations from virtual team meetings ..... 130

3. Study 3: Simulation study of virtual team meetings ..... 132

    3.1. Method ..... 133

    3.2. Results..... 135

    3.3. Discussion ..... 137

4. Conclusion ..... 138

References ..... 140

*Cress, U., Barquero, B., Buder, J. & Hesse, F.W.*

SOCIAL DILEMMA IN KNOWLEDGE COMMUNICATION VIA SHARED DATABASES ..... 143

1. Shared databases – knowledge communication of the third kind ..... 143

2. Knowledge exchange as public-goods dilemma ..... 146

3. Experimental investigation of the database dilemma ..... 149

    3.1. Experimental implementation of the database dilemma ..... 149

    3.2. Empirical results ..... 153

    3.3. Interpretation..... 156

4. Possible solutions to the communication dilemma ..... 157

    4.1. Individual solutions..... 157

    4.2. Structural solutions ..... 161

5. Summary ..... 164

References ..... 165

*Kirschner, P.A. & Kreijns, K.*

ENHANCING SOCIABILITY OF COMPUTER-SUPPORTED COLLABORATIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS..... 169

1. Introduction..... 169



2. An educational shift .....	170
3. Collaborative learning.....	171
3.1. Enhancing collaborative learning.....	171
3.2. The social basis for these approaches .....	173
4. Social interaction in CSCL-environments.....	175
5. Affordances .....	177
5.1. Technological affordances .....	178
5.2. Educational affordances .....	179
5.3. Social affordances .....	180
5.4. Affordances and useful CSCL-environments.....	181
6. Operationalising social affordances: Group awareness widgets .....	182
6.1 Group awareness .....	182
6.2 History awareness .....	182
6.3 Set of communication media.....	183
6.4 Group awareness widgets.....	184
6.5 A first prototype of the GAW .....	185
7. A study of the use of the GAW prototype.....	186
7.1 Method .....	187
7.2 Results.....	187
7.3 Discussion and conclusions.....	187
References .....	188

*Strube, G., Thalemann, S., Wittstruck, B. & Garg, K.*

KNOWLEDGE SHARING IN TEAMS OF HETEROGENEOUS EXPERTS .	193
1. Policies of sharing knowledge .....	194
2. Method .....	195
3. Web design, our domain of application .....	195
4. The structure of a web design project .....	196
4.1 Overall structure of the web design task .....	196
4.2 Subtask dependencies .....	199
5. Knowledge communication in web design teams .....	199
5.1 Parameter setting: a quasi-experiment .....	200
5.2 Examples of design options .....	202
6. Knowledge-level modelling .....	203
6.1 Representing design decisions .....	204
7. Supporting the web design process .....	205
7.1 Barriers and biases .....	205
7.2 Interviews.....	207

8. Discussion ..... 209

References ..... 211

*Fischer, G. & Ostwald, J.*

KNOWLEDGE COMMUNICATION IN DESIGN COMMUNITIES..... 213

1. Introduction..... 213

2. Design and design communities..... 214

    2.1 Design ..... 214

    2.2. Design communities..... 219

    2.3 Boundary objects ..... 224

3. Media in support of knowledge communication ..... 225

    3.1 Rich and lean media ..... 225

    3.2 Computer-mediated communication in CoPs ..... 227

    3.3 Computer-mediated communication in CoIs ..... 229

4. Lessons learned ..... 236

    4.1 Barriers and biases ..... 236

    4.2 CoIs: Beyond novices and experts ..... 237

5. Conclusions ..... 238

References ..... 239

*Dillenbourg, P.*

DESIGNING BIASES THAT AUGMENT SOCIO-COGNITIVE INTERACTIONS..... 243

1. Introduction..... 243

2. The imitation bias..... 245

3. Augmenting social interaction ..... 247

    3.1 Persistency creates shared working memory..... 247

    3.2 The context is stored with the message ..... 249

    3.3 The mirror for the group ..... 251

    3.4 Synthesis ..... 255

4. Augmenting collaborative learning ..... 255

    4.1 How to support collaborative learning? ..... 256

    4.2 Shaping interactions with interfaces ..... 257

    4.3 Shaping interaction with scripts ..... 258

    4.4 Regulating interactions ..... 258

References ..... 261

*Koschmann, T., Zemel, A., Conlee-Stevens, M., Young, N.,  
Robbs, J. & Barnhart, A.*

HOW DO PEOPLE LEARN?.....	265
1. Introduction.....	265
2. Data.....	268
2.1 Fragment 1: “What would be the risk?”.....	268
2.2 Fragment 2: “Salicylate toxicity”.....	275
3. Barriers and biases to understanding computer-mediated interaction.....	282
References.....	284
Appendix.....	287

*Suthers, D.*

TECHNOLOGY AFFORDANCES FOR INTERSUBJECTIVE LEARNING, AND HOW THEY MAY BE EXPLOITED.....	295
1. Introduction.....	295
2. Deconstructing the title.....	295
2.1 From “Knowledge communication” to an interactional epistemology.....	295
2.2 Computer mediation.....	297
2.3 From “Barriers and biases” to “affordances”.....	298
3. Representational affordances as a central topic for CSCL.....	300
3.1 Representational affordances for individual learning.....	300
3.2 Representational effects specific to groups.....	300
3.3 Representational differences lead to biases.....	303
3.4 Experimental evidence of representational affordances.....	304
4. Three approaches to the study of CSCL.....	306
4.1 studies of collaboration independent of learning.....	306
4.2 Scaffolding collaborative learning to remove barriers.....	307
4.3 Understanding and supporting processes of intersubjective learning.....	309
5. Assessing the field.....	310
5.1 What are we studying? A call to focus on intersubjective learning.....	310
5.2 How do we study it? A call for methodological fusion.....	311
5.3 What theory drives the research?.....	313
6. Conclusions.....	315
References.....	316
Name index.....	321
Subject Index.....	329