LAUNCHING SPACE OBJECTS:
ISSUES OF LIABILITY AND FUTURE PROSPECTS

SPACE REGULATIONS LIBRARY

VOLUME 1

EDITORIAL BOARD

Managing Editor

PROF. R. JAKHU, *Institute of Air and Space Law, McGill University, Montreal, Canada*

MEMBERS

M. DAVIS, *Ward & Partners, Adelaide, Australia*

S. LE GUEFF, *Le Goueff Law Office, Luxembourg*

P. NESGOS, *Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy, New York, U.S.A.*

S. MOSTESHAR, *Chambers of Sa'id Mosteshar, London, U.K. &*

Mosteshar Mackenzie, California, U.S.A.

L. I. TENNEN, *Law Offices of Sterns and Tennen, Phoenix, Arizona, U.S.A.*

LAUNCHING SPACE OBJECTS: ISSUES OF LIABILITY AND FUTURE PROSPECTS

by

VALÉRIE KAYSER

KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS

NEW YORK, BOSTON, DORDRECHT, LONDON, MOSCOW

eBook ISBN: 0-306-48405-6
Print ISBN: 1-4020-0061-8

©2004 Kluwer Academic Publishers
New York, Boston, Dordrecht, London, Moscow

Print ©2001 Kluwer Academic Publishers
Dordrecht

All rights reserved

No part of this eBook may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, recording, or otherwise, without written consent from the Publisher

Created in the United States of America

Visit Kluwer Online at: <http://kluweronline.com>
and Kluwer's eBookstore at: <http://ebooks.kluweronline.com>

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Aims and Context	1
1.1 Overall Approach	2
1.2 Risk in Launching Space Objects, An Overview	3
1.2.1 What Type of Risk?	4
1.2.2 Risk Location	7
1.2.3 Communities Exposed	7
1.3 Approaches to Risk	8
1.3.1 The Engineer's Approach	9
1.3.2 The Legal Council's Approach	11
1.3.3 The Insurer's Approach	12
1.4 Liability Risk Management: Looking to the Future	14
Annex 1. Summary of Main Types of Space Insurance	17

PART I: THE LABRYNTH OF DAEDALUS

Chapter 2: The International Legal Framework	23
2.1 Space Treaties and Resolutions	24
2.1.1 Main Principles of Space Law: the context	25
(i) Principle of freedom of exploration and use	25
(ii) Principle of non-appropriation	26
(iii) Principle of applicability of international law	28
(iv) Restriction on military activities	29
(v) Responsibility and liability	29
(vi) Common interest and common heritage principles	29
(vii) International cooperation	30
2.1.2 Responsibility and Liability in Space Law	31
(i) Entities subject to responsibility/liability	33
States	33
International organizations	37
Non-governmental entities	40
(ii) The compensable damage	44
(iii) Type of liability	50
(iv) Potential claimants	51
(v) Procedure for claiming compensation	53
2.2 Examples of International Practice	58
2.2.1 Definition of Objects and Link to a State or Organization	59
2.2.2 Reference to the Liability Convention	60
2.2.3 Liability Between the Parties	62
Annex 1. Summary Tables on the Space Treaties	67

Chapter 3: Domestic Launch Legislation and Regulations	77
3.1 Legal Framework for Launch Services in the United States	77
3.1.1 Evolution Towards the Development of a Concise Regulatory Framework	79
(i) Authority of US Government Agencies	79
(ii) Practical consequences of the multitude of Agencies	84
3.1.2 Initial Steps Towards Improvement of the Regulatory Framework for Launches	86
3.1.3 The First Regulatory Steps Put to the Test	89
3.1.4 The Consolidation Phase: the Commercial Space Launch Act (CSLA) and the Associated Regulatory Framework	90
(i) The Commercial Space Launch Act	91
(ii) When is a license required?	96
(iii) The licensing procedure	98
3.1.5 Liability and Insurance Issues	114
(i) Liability and insurance under the CSLA	114
(ii) The situation of private launch operators	118
(iii) The CLSA Amendments	122
(iv) Final Rule Concerning Financial Responsibility Requirements for Licensed Launch Activities	129
(v) Final Rule Effective 21 June 1999 for Codification of 14 CFR	132
3.2 European Legal Framework: The Ariane Launch Services	134
3.2.1 French Approach to Space Legislation	134
3.2.2 Overall Legal Framework for the Ariane Launch Services	135
(i) The initial phases of the program	136
(ii) The commercialization phase	137
3.2.3 Institutional Aspects of the Legal Control Exercised Over Arianespace	138
(i) Control via shareholding in the capital of Arianespace	138
(ii) The role of ESA	139
3.2.4 Liability for Ariane Activities	140
(i) Liabilities related to property of ESA and the participants	141
(ii) Third party liability	142
(iii) Contractual allocations	143

Chapter 4: General Rules of Common Law and Civil Law Susceptible of Governing Liability for Launch Services	149
4.1 Common Law: General US Law Applicable to Liability for Launch Activities	150
4.1.1 Contract Liability	151
(i) Liability for breach of contract	151
(ii) Warranties	152
(iii) Rules of contract interpretation	153
4.1.2 Tort Liability	155
(i) Negligence	156
(ii) Strict liability	161
4.1.3 Classical Means of Defense	168
(i) Defenses related to behavior or characteristics of the victim	168
(ii) Defenses related to limitation of the scope of the liability	171
(iii) Defenses related to time	175
4.1.4 Cumulation of Contract and Tort Claims	176
4.1.5 Vicarious Liability	177
4.1.6 Recoverable Damages	178
(i) Recoverable damages in general	178
(ii) Punitive damages	180
(iii) Liquidated damages, penalty clauses	181
4.1.7 Force Majeure	182
4.1.8 Judicial Procedure Aspects	182
4.1.9 A brief overview of US case law related to space activities	185
(i) Berg v. Reaction Motors Division	186
(ii) Smith v. Lockheed Propulsion	187
(iii) Pigott v. Boeing	187
(iv) Smith v. USA and Smith v. Morton Thiokol	187
(v) Lexington Insurance v. McDonnell Douglas	187
(vi) Appalachian Insurance v. McDonnell Douglas	188
(vii) Martin Marietta v. Intelsat	189
(viii) Hughes Communication Galaxy v. USA	192
(ix) American Satellite Co. v. USA	193
(x) Lloyds of London v. McDonnell Douglas	193
4.2 Civil Law: The Example of French Law	194
4.2.1 Contract Liability	195
(i) Liability for breach of contract	196
(ii) Warranty	202
(iii) Rules of contracts interpretation	204

4.2.2	Tort Liability	206
(i)	Provisions of the Civil Code: liability for fault and strict liability	206
(ii)	Product liability	214
4.2.3	Classical Means of Defense	217
(i)	Defenses related to the behavior of the victim	217
(ii)	Defenses related to the limitation of the scope of liability	220
(iii)	Defenses related to time	225
(iv)	Defenses available under the new product liability law	227
4.2.4	Cumulation of Contracts and Torts Claims	228
4.2.5	Vicarious Liability	230
(i)	Specific types of liability for others	230
(ii)	Towards a general principle of liability for others established by jurisprudence	233
4.2.6	Recoverable Damages	234
(i)	Recoverable damages in general	234
(ii)	Punitive damages	236
(iii)	Liquidated damages, penalty clauses	236
4.2.7	Force Majeure	237
(i)	Source in contracts and in torts	237
(ii)	Criteria to be met by force majeure events	238
(iii)	Effects of the force majeure	239
(iv)	Force majeure clauses	240
4.2.8	Judicial Procedure Issues	240
4.2	Practice in Spacecraft Development Contracts:	
	The European Space Agency	244
4.3.1	Applicable Law	244
4.3.2	Performance by Contractors and Control of Performance	245
4.3.3	Liability Provisions in the Contract	246
(i)	Liability of the Contractor concerning equipment, supplies and technical documents made available by the Agency	246
(ii)	Liability of the Contractor for damage caused to persons, goods or property	246
(iii)	Liability of the Contractor for infringements of the law and third-party rights	247
(iv)	Liability of the Contractor for performance of his subcontractors	247
(v)	Res perit domo	248

4.3.4	Limitation of Liability	248
4.3.5	Penalty Clauses	248
4.3.6	Warranty and Product Liability	249
4.3.7	International Space Station Provisions	252
4.3.8	Liability of the Contractor in case of serious Breach of Contract	253
4.3.9	Settlements of Disputes	253

PART II.- ESCAPING THE LABYRINTH

Chapter 5:	Issues in Liability Risk Management and Proposals De Lege Ferenda	257
5.1	An appraisal of the Legal Situation	258
5.1.1	A multitude of points of contact and an unadapted international legal environment	258
5.1.2	The Development of a Lex Mercatoria in the field of Launch Services	260
5.2	Methodology for our Further Discussions	261
5.3	Harmonizing the Practice of Inter-Participant Waivers of Liability	262
5.3.1	The Limitations of Inter-Participants Waivers of Liability	265
(i)	Their validity is controversial in certain legal systems	265
(ii)	Their validity may be contested in the absence of express acceptance	266
(iii)	They cannot exclude wilful misconduct and gross negligence	267
(iv)	They cannot exclude claims from individuals for bodily injury	268
(v)	They do not always deal clearly and consistently with consequential damages	268
(vi)	They are assessed in relation to the balance of the contract	268
(vii)	Their interpretation is strict	269
(viii)	Third-party liability allocations	269
(ix)	The relationship between inter-participant waivers of liability and product liability	270
(x)	Flow down requirements	273

5.3.2	Moving Forward with Inter-participant Waivers of Liability	278
(i)	Harmonization of inter-participant waivers of liability	278
(ii)	Clarification of the essential obligations of the launch provider and launch customers	280
(iii)	The validation of the inter-party waivers in the public order of States	281
5.4	The International Law Framework	283
5.4.1	The Outer Space Treaty and the Liability Convention	284
(i)	The current political atmosphere	285
(ii)	Should we patch or should we review?	287
(iii)	The need for addressing liability issues related to the launch of space objects	288
5.4.2	Issues and Proposals	292
(i)	The launching state: definition	292
(ii)	Liability of the launching State	297
(iii)	Appropriate State	297
(iv)	Establishing the liability of the operator and legal channeling with respect to claims by third-parties	298
(v)	Licensing requirements	300
(vi)	Actions in recourse between States	300
5.4.3	The Registration Convention	301
(i)	Shortcomings of the Registration Convention	301
(ii)	Proposals for an efficient registration system to improve the security of determination of the launching State	302
5.4.4	Conclusions on International Law Proposals	304
Chapter 6:	Some Concrete Proposals	307
6.1	-Harmonization of Inter-Participant Waivers of Liability	307
	Inter-Participants Liability Covenants in States with Licensing Requirements (US Model)	309
	-Inter-Participants Liability Covenants for States without Licensing Requirements	325
6.2	Implementation Arrangements for the Space Treaties	335
	Proposed Protocol	336
	CONCLUSIONS	347
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	351