International Political Economy Series

General Editor: **Timothy M. Shaw**, Professor of Political Science and International Development Studies, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia

Titles include:

Leslie Elliott Armijo (*editor*)

FINANCIAL GLOBALIZATION AND DEMOCRACY IN EMERGING MARKETS

Robert Boardman

THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF NATURE

Environmental Debates and the Social Sciences

Gordon Crawford

FOREIGN AID AND POLITICAL REFORM

A Comparative Analysis of Democracy Assistance and Political Conditionality

Matt Davies

INTERNATIONAL POLITICAL ECONOMY AND MASS COMMUNICATION
IN CHILE

National Intellectuals and Transnational Hegemony

Martin Doornbos

INSTITUTIONALIZING DEVELOPMENT POLICIES AND RESOURCE
STRATEGIES IN EASTERN AFRICA AND INDIA

Developing Winners and Losers

Fred P. Gale

THE TROPICAL TIMBER TRADE REGIME

Keith M. Henderson and O. P. Dwivedi (*editors*)

BUREAUCRACY AND THE ALTERNATIVES IN WORLD PERSPECTIVES

Angela W. Little

LABOURING TO LEARN

Towards a Political Economy of Plantations, People and Education
in Sri Lanka

John Loxley (*editor*)

INTERDEPENDENCE, DISEQUILIBRIUM AND GROWTH

Reflections on the Political Economy of North-South Relations at the
Turn of the Century

Don D. Marshall

CARIBBEAN POLITICAL ECONOMY AT THE CROSSROADS

NAFTA and Regional Developmentalism

Susan M. McMillan

FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT IN THREE REGIONS OF THE SOUTH AT
THE END OF THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

James H. Mittelman and Mustapha Pasha (*editors*)

OUT FROM UNDERDEVELOPMENT

Prospects for the Third World (Second Edition)

Lars Rudebeck, Olle Törnquist and Virgilio Rojas (*editors*)

DEMOCRATIZATION IN THE THIRD WORLD

Concrete Cases in Comparative and Theoretical Perspective

Howard Stein (*editor*)

ASIAN INDUSTRIALIZATION AND AFRICA

Studies in Policy Alternatives to Structural Adjustment

International Political Economy Series

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-333-71708-0

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke,
Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Foreign Aid and Political Reform

A Comparative Analysis of Democracy Assistance and Political Conditionality

Gordon Crawford

*Lecturer in Development Studies
University of Leeds*

palgrave

© Gordon Crawford 2001

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2001 978-0-333-91982-8

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2001 by

PALGRAVE

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE is the new global academic imprint of
St. Martin's Press LLC Scholarly and Reference Division and
Palgrave Publishers Ltd (formerly Macmillan Press Ltd).

ISBN 978-1-349-42424-5 ISBN 978-0-230-50924-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230509245

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and
made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Crawford, Gordon, 1952—

Foreign aid and political reform : a comparative analysis of democracy
assistance and political conditionality / Gordon Crawford.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Economic assistance—Political aspects—Developing countries. 2.
Democracy—Developing countries. 3. Human rights—Developing
countries. 4. Developing countries—Politics and government. 5.
Conditionality (International relations) I. Title.

HC60 .C669 2000

327.1'11—dc21

00-055685

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
10 09 08 07 06 05 04 03 02 01

To mum and dad for their love and support at all times

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction	1
Part I The Emergence of the New Policy Agenda	9
1 Themes and Issues in the 'New Policy Agenda'	11
1.1 Policy origins	11
1.2 Policy coherence	15
1.3 Policy legitimacy	30
1.4 Policy implementation and impact	44
1.5 Some concluding (and preceding) remarks	51
2 Policy Evolution	53
2.1 Donor policy shifts	53
2.2 Explaining donor policy trends	64
3 Policy Operationalisation	66
3.1 Defining concepts	66
3.2 Developing strategies	75
Part II Political Aid	87
4 Implementing Political Aid Programmes	89
4.1 Financial instruments and institutional structures	89
4.2 Total expenditure	94
5 Political Aid: a Comparative Analysis	96
5.1 Methodology	96
5.2 Purpose of political aid	101
5.3 Geographical distribution	104
5.4 Implementers	124–5
5.5 Beneficiaries	137
6 Evaluation	150
6.1 Aid contribution to democratic development	150
6.2 Political aid findings	156

Part III	Aid Sanctions	161
7	Sanctions Imposed	163
7.1	Institutional procedures and actors	163
7.2	Implementation of sanctions	169
7.3	Comparative analysis	177
8	Effectiveness	182
8.1	Lessons from economic conditionality	183
8.2	Methodology	185
8.3	Key findings	187
8.4	Stokke's propositions – confirmed or refuted?	200
9	Consistency	209
9.1	Regional breakdown	209
9.2	Level of sanctions	211
9.3	The non-cases	214
9.4	Summary of findings: inconsistency and legitimacy	225
Part IV	Conclusion	229
10	Conclusion	231
10.1	Political aid programmes	231
10.2	Aid sanctions	240
10.3	Democracy promotion and neo-liberal hegemony	245
	<i>Appendix: Database Categorisation Codes</i>	248
	<i>Notes</i>	254
	<i>Bibliography</i>	269
	<i>Index</i>	284

List of Tables

3.1	Donor definitions of human rights, democracy and good governance	67
3.2	Donor strategies – checklists of measures	76
4.1	Total expenditure on political aid – a comparison	95
5.1	Distribution of political aid by purpose	103
5.2	Proportions of human rights expenditure to state and non-state institutions	103
5.3	Regional distribution of political aid (by individual donor, 1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	105
5.4	Top ten recipient countries of political aid (by individual donor)	109
5.5	Distribution of political aid by beneficiary sector (as a percentage of sectoral expenditure, 1992/93–1993/94 combined)	138
5.6	Political aid to central government beneficiaries (as a percentage of sectoral expenditure, 1992/93–1993/94 combined)	140
5.7	Swedish and UK political aid to sectors of central government executive (1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	142
5.8	Political aid to human rights non-government beneficiaries (1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	143
5.9	Political aid to non-government beneficiaries for the <i>promotion</i> of human rights (1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	144
5.10	Political aid to pro-democracy non-government beneficiaries (1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	144
5.11	US political aid to non-state beneficiaries	145
6.1	UK political aid to strengthening the rule of law (1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined)	153
7.1	Aid sanctions – January 1990 to January 1996	170
8.1	Effectiveness of aid sanctions 1990–95	188–96
9.1	Regional breakdown of aid sanctions (donors combined)	210

List of Figures

1.1	The democratic pyramid	18
1.2	Democracy – the central concept	29
5.1	Expenditure by purpose: human rights, democracy and good governance (1992/93–1993/94 combined)	102
5.2	Regional distribution of political aid (all donors, 1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined, US\$m)	105
5.3	Top twenty recipient countries of political aid (all donors, 1992/93–1993/94 expenditure combined, US\$m)	114
5.4	Political aid expenditure by implementer (by individual donor)	124–5

Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge and to extend sincere thanks to all those who have helped with completion of this book. Professors David Beetham and Lionel Cliffe provided intellectual guidance and support, including constructive and detailed commentary on draft chapters. Professor Tim Shaw provided encouragement and most useful suggestions. Gratitude is due to the many government officials and other individuals contacted who generously gave their time and provided assistance in a courteous manner, often when faced with more urgent tasks. Any mistakes, of course, are solely mine.

Very special thanks are due to Dan Farrar for his assistance on computing matters. His contribution was invaluable and without his expertise the database analysis and construction of tables and figures would have floundered. A very deep thank you to Dot Moss for putting up with me and for her own most astute intellectual advice. Apologies to Callum for being an absent dad at times when working overtime to meet deadlines.

I am grateful to Frank Cass (Publishers, London) for permission to reproduce material previously published in an article entitled 'Political Conditionality: Issues of Effectiveness and Consistency' in *Democratization*, Vol. 3, No. 4, 1997. Figure 1.1, 'The democratic pyramid', from D. Beetham and K. Boyle (1995) *Introducing Democracy: 80 Questions and Answers*, is reproduced by kind permission of Blackwell Publishers/Polity Press.