

# CITIZENSHIP, PARTICIPATION AND DEMOCRACY



# **Citizenship, Participation and Democracy**

**Changing Dynamics in Chile  
and Argentina**

Lucy Taylor

*Lecturer*

*Department of International Politics*

*University of Wales, Aberystwyth*

*Wales*





First published in Great Britain 1998 by  
**MACMILLAN PRESS LTD**  
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and London  
Companies and representatives throughout the world

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-349-40618-0 ISBN 978-0-230-37609-0 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230376090

---



First published in the United States of America 1998 by  
**ST. MARTIN'S PRESS, INC.**,  
Scholarly and Reference Division,  
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data  
Taylor, Lucy, 1963–  
Citizenship, participation, and democracy : changing dynamics in  
Chile and Argentina / Lucy Taylor.  
p. cm.  
Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Citizenship—Chile. 2. Citizenship—Argentina. 3. Political  
participation—Chile. 4. Political participations—Argentina.

I. Title.

JL2683.T39 1997

323.6'0982'09049—dc21

97-38270

CIP

---

© Lucy Taylor 1998

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1998 978-0-333-72769-0

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1  
07 06 05 04 03 02 01 00 99 98

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	viii
<b>1 Introduction</b>	1
Why Chile and Argentina?	3
Citizens and Social Movements	5
Overview of Contents	7
<b>2 Models of Citizenship</b>	10
Models of Citizenship	13
<i>The Welfare Model</i>	13
<i>The Elite Model</i>	17
<i>The Participatory Model</i>	20
<i>The Neo-liberal Model</i>	23
Difference, Equality and the Centrality of Politics	27
<b>3 Models of Citizenship in Context</b>	31
Historical Context	31
<i>Chile</i>	31
<i>Argentina</i>	34
Citizenship and Military Rule: The View from the Top	37
<i>The Chilean Military Project</i>	39
<i>The Argentine Military Project</i>	43
Social Movements and Military Rule: The View from Below	47
<i>The Emergence of Dissent</i>	48
<i>The Participatory Model and its Weakness</i>	51
Conclusion: Citizenship and the Dynamics of Power	58
<b>4 Rights and Sovereignty in Formal Politics</b>	60
Constitutions and Rights	61
<i>The Chilean Constitution</i>	61
<i>The Argentine Constitution and its Reform</i>	65
<i>Constitutions, Rights and Ideology</i>	68
Democratic Institutions and Sovereignty	70
<i>Institutional Legacy in Chile</i>	71
<i>Institutional Change in Argentina</i>	73
<i>Developments in Formal Sovereignty</i>	76

	Sovereignty and Political Culture	78
	<i>Chilean Political Practice: Distorted by Institutional Constraints?</i>	78
	<i>Argentine Political Practice: In Spite of Institutional Constraints?</i>	84
	Conclusion: Dynamics of Rights and Sovereignty	91
<b>5</b>	<b>Decline of Participation</b>	93
	Dynamics of Participation	93
	Participation and Political Parties	96
	<i>Chile</i>	96
	<i>Argentina</i>	99
	The decline of Participation in Civil Society	104
	<i>Social Movements and Decline</i>	105
	<i>The Peripheral Supporter and Decline</i>	111
	Social Movements and the New Institutions of State	114
	<i>Human Rights</i>	114
	<i>Women in Chile</i>	120
	Conclusion: The Decline of Participation	123
<b>6</b>	<b>New Forms of Citizenship</b>	125
	New Models of Citizenship	125
	<i>The Chilean Citizen</i>	126
	<i>The Argentine Citizen</i>	130
	The New Citizenship and Government Policy	135
	<i>Human Rights</i>	135
	<i>Women's Issues</i>	142
	<i>Social Issues: Poverty and Pensions</i>	147
	Social Responses to Ideological Change	154
	<i>Human Rights and Citizenship Movements</i>	154
	<i>Women's Movements in Argentina</i>	157
	<i>Chile: Professionalization and NGOs</i>	162
	<i>Jubilados: Fighting Neo-liberalism in Argentina</i>	164
	Conclusion: Ideology, State and Society	167
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusion: Contemporary Citizenship in Chile and Argentina</b>	170
	Models of Citizenship	170
	Rights, Sovereignty and Participation	172
	What does it Mean to be a Citizen?	177
	What does Democracy Mean?	179

*Contents*

vii

*Notes*

183

*Bibliography*

195

*Index*

201

# Preface

This book draws much from doctoral research conducted in Chile and Argentina in 1993/4. During that period I conducted around 100 interviews with a wide variety of people: social movement activists from the human rights movement, women's and feminist groups, shanty town dweller's and pensioner's organizations; all the major political parties; local government activists, representatives and officials; and state agencies. Research also included the gathering and analysis of documentation and newspaper archives. The research was successfully submitted for doctoral examination in December 1996.

This research was financially supported by the ESRC, for which assistance I would like to express sincere gratitude and thanks. This research project would not have been possible, though, without the very kind assistance and support of many people. Firstly, my deep thanks go to all those whose interviews form the basis of the empirical research. In particular, I'd like to thank the activists in numerous social movements who gave up their time to speak to me and who shared their ideas, ideals and concerns. Also I'd like to thank the activists in political parties, government agencies and local government, all of whom went out of their way to assist me. Without all these people there would have been no thesis and no subsequent book. Secondly, I'd like to thank my supervisor and friend Paul Cammack, whose invaluable advice and irrepressible good humour contributed a great deal to the success of this project. My gratitude also goes out to the many of the members of staff and graduate students of Manchester, Salford, Sheffield and Aberystwyth who gave support, encouragement and advice on both the research and the publication of this book. The translation of this project into a book has been a tremendous bonus, for which I would like to thank the team at Macmillan for their extremely helpful advice and assistance. Last, but by no means least, I'd like to thank my family and friends for their understanding and unerring encouragement; they keep my feet on the ground and my head to the sky.

LUCY TAYLOR  
*Aberystwyth*