Diversity, Ethnicity, Migration and Work

This page intentionally left blank

Diversity, Ethnicity, Migration and Work

International Perspectives

Geraldine Healy

and

Franklin Oikelome

palgrave
macmillan

© Geraldine Healy and Franklin Oikelome 2011

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2011 978-0-230-25218-9

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6-10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2011 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-32176-6 ISBN 978-0-230-32147-2 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230321472

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Healy, Geraldine (Geraldine Mary)

Diversity, ethnicity, migration, and work : international perspectives / Geraldine Healy, Franklin Oikelome.

p. cm.

Includes index.

Summary: "Providing a comprehensive picture of diversity, ethnicity, and migration in the health sector this book analyses the key themes of career and career structures, social processes, segregation, racism and sexism at international, national and local levels" — Provided by publisher.

1. Health services administration. 2. Diversity in the workplace.

I. Oikelome, Franklin, 1969— II. Title.

RA971.H463 2011

331.7'613621—dc23

2011016925

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Glossary of Abbreviations</i>	xii
1 Working in the Health Services – Troubles, Issues, Migration and Ethnicity	1
2 Different Health Care Systems – Different Conditions? A Comparative Perspective	16
Introduction	16
Setting the scene in the United Kingdom and United States – the debate on Obama’s health care reform	16
Nigerian, UK and US health care through a comparative lens	19
The international health care workforce	25
Conclusion	34
3 Diversity, Ethnicity, Migration and Work: UK and US Perspectives	36
Introduction	36
Diversity management – background	37
UK inequalities: historical and institutional responses	40
Migration and the British legislative response	42
Inequalities in health care work	47
US inequalities: historical and institutional responses	54
Working in health care in the United States	62
Conclusions	65
4 Diversity, Ethnicity, Migration and Health in a Developing Country – The Case of Nigeria	67
Introduction	67
Ethnic diversity in Nigeria: issues, past and present	68
Managing diversity in Nigeria: policies and initiatives	73
An assessment of the policies	76

The case of the health sector in Nigeria	79
Administration	80
Financing	81
Workforce and recruitment	81
Migration of health workers	83
Inequality and diversity issues	86
Conclusions	89
5 International Medical Graduates – Working in a Two-Tier System?	92
Introduction	92
International and UK Medical Graduates	94
Medical career grades	96
Reward, workload, autonomy and morale	99
Discussion in comparative context	106
Conclusions	107
6 Gender and International Medical Graduates: Historical, Contemporary and Intersectional Perspectives	111
Introduction	111
Women’s historical struggle into medicine	113
Women doctors: growth, segregation and international medical graduates	117
Gender, inequality, morale and career aspiration	122
Discussion and international perspectives	126
Conclusions	128
7 Front-line Hospital Workers and Inequalities: Social Processes, Racism and Career Development	130
Introduction	130
Researching Greenfield and Brownfield	132
Attitudes and experiences of working on the front-line in health care	136
Manifestations of racism	142
Challenging unfair treatment	153
Conclusions	159
8 Challenging Inequality Issues: The Union Role	162
Introduction	162
Labour unions	163
Union identity networks	164

Returning to Greenfield and Brownfield – perceptions and experiences of unions	169
Union membership in Greenfield and Brownfield	171
Experiencing trade unions in the workplace	176
How does the American experience compare?	180
At the front line	184
A journey to union involvement in the American health care sector	187
Conclusions	190
9 Identity Social Networks – Formal, Informal, Professional and Community	192
Introduction	192
Management-sponsored networks – back to Greenfield and Brownfield	193
Informal and external networks and social capital	200
Community organizations	204
Professional identity networks	207
Discussion	212
10 Managing Diversity in UK and US Health Care Sector	214
Introduction	214
Revisiting the management of diversity contexts	215
Diversity management initiatives	217
Equality and diversity projects in UK and US health care organizations	225
Discussion and conclusions	232
11 Reflections on Diversity, Ethnicity and Migration at Work at a Time of Change	236
<i>Appendices</i>	249
<i>Notes</i>	301
<i>Bibliography</i>	317
<i>Index</i>	343

List of Tables

2.1	The Nigerian, UK and US health systems compared	24
2.2	Top 20 countries of medical education for US IMG physicians	27
2.3	US and IMG physician population overview	27
2.4	First-time, foreign-trained Registered Nurse (RN) candidates for US Licensure Examination, by top six exporting countries, 1997–2001	28
2.5	Top 20 countries of qualification for UK IMGs	30
2.6	Total number of nurses and midwives on UK register from 2004 to 2008	32
2.7	Initial admissions to the UK register: European economic area and overseas countries	32
2.8	Initial UK nursing admissions figures for 32 source overseas countries	33
3.1	UK non-medical staff by ethnic group	50
3.2	UK Hospital and Community Health Service (HCHS) medical and dental staff by grade and ethnicity	52
3.3	Race-based charges: 1997–2007	59
3.4	Key changes for African Americans since Civil Rights Act (1964)	61
4.1	Nigerian health worker population at national level	82
4.2	Nurses seeking employment outside Nigeria from 2004 to 2006	84
4.3	Nigerian doctors who requested for certificate of good standing and their destination countries for the years 2005–2007	85
4.4	Gender distribution by health occupation in Nigeria 2007	87
4.5	Number of health training schools by geographical distribution in Nigeria	88
4.6	Regional distribution of health workers: north and south of Nigeria	89
5.1	UK medical and dental staff	97

5.2	UK medical staff by grade and country of qualification	98
5.3	Comparative experience of UKMGs and IMGs of reward, workload, autonomy and morale	102
6.1	UK doctors and IMGs by gender and grade	120
6.2	Medical and dental staff by speciality and gender (SAS only)	121
7.1	Characteristics of interviewees in Greenfield and Brownfield	135
8.1	Representation of women and BME members in UNISON structures	169
8.2	Union membership of Brownfield and Greenfield interviewees by sex	172
10.1	Cox and Blake (1991) and Dreachslin's (1999) diversity initiatives approaches	219

Appendices

A2.1	Top 20 US states IMGs practice (% of state physician workforce)	249
A2.2	NHS HCHS and general practice workforce, 1998–2008	250
A2.3	Guide for doctors new to the UK (2008)	252
A2.3.1	How to get started: Immigration regulations for international doctors coming to the UK	252
A5.1	Definitions of variables used in regression models	256
A5.2	Regression coefficients of success, autonomy and workload on independent variables	257
A5.3	Proportion currently receiving discretionary points by qualification and gender	258
A5.4	Autonomy indicators by qualification and age groups	258
A5.5	Characteristics of survey respondents in full-time employment	259
A6.1	Physicians in the US by gender: 1970–2008	261
A6.2	Medical and dental staff NHS hospital and community health services	261
A6.3	Top Primary specialties: All IMG, male and female physicians	262
A6.4	Medical and dental staff by grade, gender and nature of contract	263
A6.5	Characteristics of survey respondents	263

A6.6	Perception of inequality, morale and career aspiration	265
A6.7	Dependent variables by gender	265
A6.8	Dependent variables by gender and nature of contract	266
A6.9	Dependent variables by gender and place of qualification	268
A6.10	Dependent variables by place of qualification and nature of contract	269
A10.1	Diversity and race initiatives in NHS Trusts (UK)	271
A10.2	Diversity and race initiatives in US hospitals	286

Acknowledgements

This book has its origins in a European Social Fund (ESF) project. We are grateful to the ESF for co-financing the original project. We would like to thank the various people who took part in the fieldwork, including officials from the Department of Health, NHS Employers, trade unions, trusts and NHS workers. We are particularly grateful to Professor Aneez Esmail and the BMA for enabling access to the data explored in Chapters 5 and 6. We also thank the hospitals and the staff who took part in the interview programme. The ESF project has since been developed to include a comparative focus and a broader sweep.

We are particularly grateful to those who took the time to read and comment on chapters in the book: Myrtle Bell (University of Texas) – Chapter 3, Jonathan Harle (Association of Commonwealth Universities) – Chapter 4; Gill Kirton (Queen Mary, University of London) – Chapter 10, Anne Munro (Napier University) – Chapter 7 and Ciara Silke – Chapter 2. Thanks too are due to Aideen Silke (Greenwich PCT) and Michael Brannan (Department of Health) for helpful discussions on key issues in the book and Terry Silke for proof reading the manuscript. We are grateful to Gloria Oikelome who undertook administrative work associated with the book. Thanks too are due to Virginia Thorp from Palgrave Macmillan for her early interest and support.

We would like to dedicate the book to the very young in our lives, to Patrick Silke Brannan and Sam Nayan Jackson, to Elizabeth Oluwakemi and David Oluwatosin Oikelome, with the hope that they will find a more just and fairer society as they reach adulthood.

Glossary of Abbreviations

A & E	Accident and Emergency
AAMC	Association of American Medical Colleges
AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labour and Congress of Industrial Organisations
AFGE	American Federation of Government Employees
AFSME	American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees
AFT	American Federation of Teachers
AMA	American Medical Association
ANPA	Association of Nigerian Physicians in the Americas
AMMP	Association of Multicultural Members of Partners
BACH	Baltimore Alliance for Careers in Health
BCTGM	Bakery, Confectionary, Tobacco workers and Grain Millers Union
BMA	British Medical Association
BME	Black and Minority Ethnic
BAPIO	British Association of Physicians of Indian Origin
BWC	Black Workers' Conference
CERD	(United Nations) Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CGFNS	Commission on Graduates of Foreign Nursing Schools
CPR	Conservatives for Patients' Rights
CRE	Commission for Racial Equality
DH	Department of Health
DWF	Diverse Workforce Facilitators
EEA	European Economic Area
EHRC	Equality and Human Rights Commission
EMAS	East Midlands Ambulance Service
EOC	Equal Opportunities Commission
ESL	English as a Second Language
EU	European Union
EWT	European Working Time
EWTD	European Working Time Directive
FCC	Federal Character Commission
FCT	Federal Capital Territory

GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GED	Gender Equality Duty
GMC	General Medical Council
HCHS	Hospital and Community Health Service
HOPE	Having an Opportunity to Prepare for Employment
HPERU	Health Policy and Economic Research Unit (BMA)
HRM	Human Resource Management
HSMP	Highly Skilled Migrant Programme
IELTS	International English Language Testing System
IMG	International Medical Graduate
IQPC	International Quality and Productivity Centre
IBEW	International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers
IWL	Improving Working Lives
LGBT	Lesbian Gay Bisexual and Transgender
LINC	Ladders in Nursing Careers
LREAP	Leadership and Race Equality Action Plan
LGA	Local Government Area
LSA	Local Supervising Authority
MANSAG	Medical Association of Nigerian Specialists and General Practitioners in the British Isles
MBA	Masters of Business Administration
MPU	Medical Practitioner's Union
NANNM	National Association of Nigeria Nurses and Midwives
NCCG	Non-Consultant Career Grades
NCLEX	National Council Licensure Examination
NEA	National Education Association
NEC	National Executive Council
NHS	National Health Service
NMC	Nursing and Midwifery Council
NPF	Nigeria Police Force
NSCDC	Nigerian Security and Civil Defence Corps
NVQ	National Vocational Qualification
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OVQ	Overseas Qualified
PCT	Primary Care Trust
PLAB	Professional and Linguistic Assessment Board
PRN	Physicians for Responsible Negotiation
PSI	Policy Studies Institute
RRAA	Race Relations (Amendment) Act
RCN	Royal College of Nursing

RED	Race Equality Duty
RN	Registered Nurse
SAS	Staff and Associate Specialist
SASG	Staff and Associate Specialist Group
SCOPME	Standing Committee on Postgraduate Medical and Dental Education
SCPMDE	Scottish Council for Postgraduate Medical and Dental Education
SDA	Sex Discrimination Act
SEIU	Service Employees International Union
SHO	Senior House Officer
SHA	Strategic Health Authority
SHB	Surrey Hampshire Borders
SOG	Self Organising Group
SYAS	South Yorkshire Ambulance Services
TELCO	The East London Communities Organisation
TUC	Trade Union Congress
UAW	United Automobile Workers
UCRIHC	Urban Central Region of Intermountain Health Care
UKMG	United Kingdom Medical Graduate
UKQ	United Kingdom Qualified
USMG	United States Medical Graduate
USW	United Steel Workers
WHO	World Health Organisation
WEHAG	Wirral Ethnic Health Advisory Group
WEHUG	Wirral Ethnic Health User Group
WILD	Women in Leadership Development
WYMAS	West Yorkshire Metropolitan Ambulance Service