After the Nation?

International Political Theory Series

Series Editor: **Gary Browning**, Professor of Politics, Department of International Relations, Politics and Sociology, Oxford Brookes University, UK

The **Palgrave International Political Theory Series** provides students and scholars with cutting-edge scholarship that explores the ways in which we theorise the international.

Political theory has by tradition implicitly accepted the bounds of the state, and this series of intellectually rigorous and innovative monographs and edited volumes takes the discipline forward, reflecting both the burgeoning of IR as a discipline and the concurrent internationalization of traditional political theory issues and concepts. Offering a wide-ranging examination of how international politics is to be interpreted, the titles in the series thus bridge the IR – political theory divide.

The aim of the series is to explore international issues in analytic, historical and radical ways that complement and extend common forms of conceiving international relations such as realism, liberalism and constructivism.

Titles in the series include:

Keith Breen and Shane O'Neill (*editors*)

AFTER THE NATION?

Critical Reflections on Nationalism and Postnationalism

Michaela Neacsu

HANS J. MORGENTHAU'S THEORY OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

Disenchantment and Re-Enchantment

International Political Theory Series

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-230-20538-3 hardcover

978-0-230-20539-0 paperback

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills,
Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

After the Nation?

Critical Reflections on Nationalism and Postnationalism

Edited by

Keith Breen

*Lecturer in Political Theory, School of Politics, International Studies, and Philosophy,
Queen's University, Belfast, Northern Ireland*

and

Shane O'Neill

*Professor of Political Theory and Dean, Faculty of Arts, Humanities, and Social
Sciences, Queen's University, Belfast, Northern Ireland*

palgrave
macmillan

Editorial matter, selection and introduction © Keith Breen and
Shane O'Neill 2010

All remaining chapters © respective authors 2010

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2010 978-0-230-57653-7

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this
publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted
save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the
Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence
permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency,
Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication
may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this
work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2010 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited,
registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke,
Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC,
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies
and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States,
the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-36641-5 ISBN 978-0-230-29317-5 (eBook)
DOI 10.1057/9780230293175

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully
managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing
processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the
country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

After the nation?: critical reflections on nationalism and postnationalism/
edited by Keith Breen, Shane O'Neill.

p. cm. — (International political theory series)

Includes bibliographical references.

1. Nationalism. 2. Self-determination, National. I. Breen, Keith.
- II. O'Neill, Shane, 1965–
JC311.A3549 2010
320.54—dc22

2010027573

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 11 10

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Notes on Editors and Contributors</i>	viii
Introduction: A Postnationalist Era? <i>Keith Breen and Shane O'Neill</i>	1
Part I Nationalism Now – Theoretical and Empirical Reflections	
1 Nationalism, Ethnicity, and Self-Determination: A Paradigm Shift <i>Ephraim Nimni</i>	21
2 Consociation and Self-Determination Disputes: The Evidence from Northern Ireland and Other Recent Cases <i>John McGarry and Brendan O'Leary</i>	38
3 Iraq as a New Multinational State: A Cautious Defence <i>Brendan O'Leary</i>	60
4 Non-Territorial Cultural Autonomy in Contemporary Europe: Reflections on the Revival of an Idea <i>David J. Smith</i>	84
5 The End of Union? Scottish Nationalism and the UK State <i>Michael Keating</i>	103
6 Nationalism and Violence <i>John Hutchinson</i>	120
Part II Normative Challenges – Democracy, Identity, and Justice	
7 Against Global Democracy <i>David Miller</i>	141
8 Postnationalist Democratization: Rethinking Nationality, Trust, and Accountability <i>Cillian McBride</i>	161
9 On Voting Ethics for Dual Nationals <i>Daniel M. Weinstock</i>	177

10	Nations, Sovereignty, and Democratic Legitimacy: On the Boundaries of Political Communities <i>Geneviève Nootens</i>	196
11	Dilemmas of Belonging: Multiculturalism in Plural Societies <i>Catherine Frost</i>	214
12	National Commitments and Universal Duties: On the Interrelationship between Domestic and Global Justice <i>Margaret Moore</i>	234
13	Global Egalitarianism or National Self-Determination? <i>Chris Armstrong</i>	253
	<i>Index</i>	269

Acknowledgements

This book grew out of an international conference, 'Beyond the Nation? Critical Reflections on Nations and Nationalism', held in Queen's University, Belfast, in September 2007. The editors would like to thank the British Academy and the Community Relations Council of Northern Ireland for generously funding that event.

We would also like to thank those whose enthusiastic support made that event and this publication possible: Jeff Archer, Lucian Ashworth, Andrew Baker, Roberto Belloni, Guy Ben-Porat, Dan Bulley, Alistair Clark, Galina Cornelisse, Mary Geday, Vincent Geoghegan, Adrian Guelke, Robert Harmsen, Jonathan Hearn, Debbie Lisle, Neophytos Loizides, Michael Mann, Cathal McCall, Susan McManus, Issam Nassar, Margaret O'Callaghan, George Philip, David Phinnemore, Katherine Smits, Jennifer Todd, Brian Walker, and Oren Yiftachel. Our gratitude, too, to Gary Browning, Liz Blackmore, Jurgen De Wispelaere, Alison Howson, and Amber Stone-Galilee for their efforts in bringing the book to completion, and, of course, to the contributors for their commitment throughout.

Finally, our thanks to Wiley-Blackwell for permission to reproduce Ephraim Nimni's chapter, first appearing in *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism* (2009, 9(2)), and to Palgrave Macmillan for permission to print an updated version of John McGarry and Brendan O'Leary's contribution, which originally appeared in Guy Ben-Porat (ed.) *The Failure of the Middle East Peace Process?* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).

Notes on Editors and Contributors

Chris Armstrong is Senior Lecturer in Politics at the University of Southampton. He has recently completed a Leverhulme Research Fellowship on global egalitarianism and has published papers defending that view in *The Journal of Political Philosophy*, *The Journal of Social Philosophy*, and *Social Theory and Practice*. He is currently working on a monograph on the political theory of global egalitarianism.

Keith Breen is Lecturer in Political Theory at Queen's University, Belfast. His interests lie in democratic theory, violence, and the ethics of work. He has published in a number of journals on the thought of Alasdair MacIntyre and Hannah Arendt, critical theory, and philosophies of work. He is the author of *Under Weber's Shadow: Modernity, Subjectivity and Politics in the Work of Arendt, Habermas and MacIntyre* (Ashgate, 2011).

Catherine Frost is Associate Professor of Political Science at McMaster University, Hamilton, Canada. She writes on contemporary normative theory, including nationalism, multiculturalism, and representation, as well as on communications theory and new media. Her work has appeared in *The Journal of Political Philosophy*, *The Review of Politics*, *The Information Society*, *The Canadian Journal of Communication*, and *Irish Political Studies*. She is the author of *Morality and Nationalism* (Routledge, 2006).

John Hutchinson is Reader in Nationalism in the Department of Government at the London School of Economics. He is the author of *The Dynamics of Cultural Nationalism* (Allen & Unwin, 1987), *Modern Nationalism* (Fontana Press, 1994), and *Nations as Zones of Conflict* (SAGE, 2005). He has co-edited a number of works, the most recent being (with Anthony Smith) *Nationalism: Critical Concepts in Political Science* (Routledge, 2000), (with Montserrat Guibernau) *Understanding Nationalism* (Polity Press, 2001), and (with Montserrat Guibernau) *History and National Destiny: Ethnosymbolism and its Critics* (Blackwell, 2004). He is currently completing a monograph on nationalism and warfare.

Michael Keating is Professor of Politics at the University of Aberdeen and has taught in England, Scotland, Canada, Spain, and at the

European University Institute in Florence. He has published widely on urban and regional politics, comparative nationalism, and public policy. His most recent book is *The Independence of Scotland: Self-Government and the Shifting Politics of Union* (Oxford University Press, 2009).

Cillian McBride is Lecturer in Political Theory at Queen's University, Belfast. His research focuses on deliberative democracy and on the politics and philosophy of recognition. He has published in *The European Journal of Political Theory*, *Irish Political Studies*, *The Journal of Political Ideologies*, *Political Studies*, and *Res Publica*. He is currently working on two books, the first on inclusion and democracy, and the second on the concept of recognition.

John McGarry is Canada Research Chair in Nationalism and Democracy in the Department of Political Studies at Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario. He has edited, co-edited, and co-authored 12 books on ethnic conflict, nationalism, and the politics of Northern Ireland, the latest of which are (with Michael Keating) *European Integration and the Nationalities Question* (Routledge, 2006) and (with Brendan O'Leary and Khaled Salih) *The Future of Kurdistan in Iraq* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005). From 2008 to 2009 he served as Senior Advisor on Power-Sharing to the UN's Mediation Support Unit.

David Miller is Professor of Political Theory at the University of Oxford and an Official Fellow of Nuffield College. His books include *On Nationality* (Clarendon Press, 1995), *Principles of Social Justice* (Harvard University Press, 1999), and *National Responsibility and Global Justice* (Oxford University Press, 2007). He is continuing to work on questions of global justice, as well as on the issues of boundaries in democratic theory and territorial rights.

Margaret Moore is Professor of Political Theory at Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario. She is the author of *Foundations of Liberalism* (Oxford University Press, 1993) and *The Ethics of Nationalism* (Oxford University Press, 2001) and is currently working on issues of citizenship, territorial rights, and global justice.

Ephraim Nimni is Reader at the School of Politics, International Studies, and Philosophy, Queen's University, Belfast. He has published widely on questions of nationalism, multiculturalism, cultural autonomy, and Jewish identity. He is the editor of *National-Cultural Autonomy and its Contemporary Critics* (Routledge, 2005) and *The Challenge of Post-Zionism*

(Zed Press, 2003). His new book, *Multicultural Nationalism*, will be published by Routledge in 2011.

Geneviève Nootens holds the Canada Research Chair in Democracy and Sovereignty at Université du Québec à Chicoutimi. Her research interests are contemporary liberalism, nationalism, plurinational societies, and democracy. She is the author of *Désenclaver la démocratie: Des huguenots à la paix des Braves* (Québec Amérique, 2004). She has co-edited (with Alain-G. Gagnon and André Lecours) *Les nationalismes majoritaires contemporains: Identité, mémoire, pouvoir* (Québec Amérique, 2007) and (with André Lecours) *Dominant Nationalism, Dominant Ethnicity: Identity, Federalism, Democracy* (Peter Lang, 2009). She has also published papers in *Nations and Nationalism* and *Contemporary Political Theory*.

Brendan O'Leary is Lauder Professor of Political Science and Director of the University of Pennsylvania Program in Ethnic Conflict, University of Pennsylvania. Recent books include *How To Get Out of Iraq with Integrity* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009), (with Marianne Heiberg and John Tirman) *Terror, Insurgency and the State: Ending Protracted Conflicts* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), and (with John McGarry and Khaled Salih) *The Future of Kurdistan in Iraq* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005). In 2009–10 he was the Senior Advisor on Power Sharing to the Standby Team of the UN's Mediation Support Unit.

Shane O'Neill is Professor of Political Theory and Dean of the Faculty of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences at Queen's University, Belfast. He is the author of *Impartiality in Context: Grounding Justice in a Pluralist World* (SUNY, 1997) and of numerous articles in politics, law, and philosophy journals. He is co-editor (with Iain Mackenzie) of *Reconstituting Social Criticism: Political Morality in an Age of Scepticism* (Palgrave Macmillan, 1999) and (with Jurgen De Wispelaere and Cillian McBride) *Recognition, Equality and Democracy* (Routledge, 2008).

David J. Smith is Professor of Baltic History and Politics at the Department of Central and East European Studies, University of Glasgow. He has a long-standing interest in issues of statehood, nationality, and identity in Central and Eastern Europe, and is currently completing a monograph on the theory and practice of non-territorial cultural autonomy during the inter-war period. Previous works include (co-edited with Karl Cordell) *Cultural Autonomy in Contemporary Europe* (Routledge, 2008) and *Estonia: Independence and European Integration* (Routledge, 2001).

Daniel M. Weinstock holds the Canada Research Chair in Ethics and Political Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy, Université de

Montréal. He is also the Director of the Centre de Recherche en Éthique de l'Université de Montréal. He has written extensively on the normative challenges facing multicultural and multinational societies. Other research interests include global justice and global democracy, distributive justice in the areas of health and education, and issues that arise in the relationship between children, families, and the liberal democratic state.