Science, Technology and Medicine in Modern History

General Editor: **John V. Pickstone**, Centre for the History of Science, Technology and Medicine, University of Manchester, England (www.man.ac.uk/CHSTM)

One purpose of historical writing is to illuminate the present. In the late twentieth century, science, technology and medicine are enormously important, yet their development is little studied. Histories of politics and literature abound, and historical biography is established as an effective way of setting individuals in context. But the historical literature on science, technology and medicine is relatively small, and the better studies are rarely accessible to the general reader. Too often one finds mere chronicles of progress, or scientific biographies which do little to illuminate either the science or the society in which it was produced, let alone their interactions.

The reasons for this failure are as obvious as they are regrettable. Education in many countries, not least in Britain, draws deep divisions between the sciences and the humanities. Men and women who have been trained in science have too often been trained away from history, or from any sustained reflection on how societies work. Those educated in historical or social studies have usually learned so little of science that they remain thereafter suspicious, overawed, or both.

Such a diagnosis is by no means novel, nor is it particularly original to suggest that good historical studies of science may be peculiarly important for understanding our present. Indeed this series could be seen as extending research undertaken over the last half-century, especially by American historians. But much of that work has treated science, technology and medicine separately; this series aims to draw them together, partly because the three activities have become ever more intertwined. This breadth of focus and the stress on the relationships of knowledge and practice are particularly appropriate in a series which will concentrate on modern history and on industrial societies. Furthermore, while much of the existing historical scholarship is on American topics, this series aims to be international, encouraging studies on European material. The intention is to present science, technology and medicine as aspects of modern culture, analysing their economic, social and political aspects, but not neglecting the expert content which tends to distance them from other aspects of history. The books will investigate the uses and consequences of technical knowledge, and how it was shaped within particular economic, social and political structures.

Such analyses should contribute to discussions of present dilemmas and to assessments of policy. 'Science' no longer appears to us as a triumphant agent of Enlightenment, breaking the shackles of tradition, enabling command over nature. But neither is it to be seen as merely oppressive and dangerous. Judgement requires information and careful analysis, just as intelligent policy-making requires a community of discourse between men and women trained in technical specialities and those who are not.

This series is intended to supply analysis and to stimulate debate. Opinions will vary between authors; we claim only that the books are based on searching historical study of topics which are important, not least because they cut across conventional academic boundaries. They should appeal not just to historians, nor just to scientists, engineers and doctors, but to all who share the view that science, technology and medicine are far too important to be left out of history.

Titles include:

Roberta E. Bivins

ACUPUNCTURE, EXPERTISE AND CROSS-CULTURAL MEDICINE

Roger Cooter

SURGERY AND SOCIETY IN PEACE AND WAR

Orthopaedics and the Organization of Modern Medicine, 1880–1948

David Edgerton

ENGLAND AND THE AEROPLANE

An Essay on a Militant and Technological Nation

Jean-Paul Gaudillière and Ilana Löwy (*editors*)

THE INVISIBLE INDUSTRIALIST

Manufacture and the Construction of Scientific Knowledge

Crosbie Smith and Jon Agar (*editors*)

MAKING SPACE FOR SCIENCE

Territorial Themes in the Shaping of Knowledge

Science, Technology and Medicine in Modern History

Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–71492–X hardcover

Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–80340–X paperback

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Acupuncture, Expertise and Cross-Cultural Medicine

Roberta E. Bivins

Wellcome Research Associate

Centre for the History of Science, Technology and Medicine

University of Manchester

palgrave

in association with

Centre for the History of Science,
Technology and Medicine,
University of Manchester

© Roberta E. Bivins 2000

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2000 978-0-333-91893-7

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 0LP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2000 by

PALGRAVE

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and

175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE is the new global academic imprint of

St. Martin's Press LLC Scholarly and Reference Division and

Palgrave Publishers Ltd (formerly Macmillan Press Ltd).

ISBN 978-1-349-42390-3

ISBN 978-0-230-28751-8 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230287518

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Bivins, Roberta E., 1970—

Acupuncture, expertise, and cross-cultural medicine / Roberta E. Bivins.
p. cm. — (Science, technology, and medicine in modern history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-349-42390-3

1. Acupuncture—Great Britain—History. 2. Transcultural medical care—Great Britain. I. Title. II. Series.

RM184 .B55 2000

615.8'92'0941—dc21

00-033326

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
09 08 07 06 05 04 03 02 01 00

To my colleague, mentor, and author: Mary Wren Bivins

And with what interest will a future generation peruse these concentrated records of the medical science of the present aera, distinguished as it is, by intensity of thought, accuracy of observation, rigour of deduction, intrepidity of experiment, fertility of resource, and emancipation from prejudice!

The Medico-Chirurgical Review, 1820

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
Introduction: Cultural Specificity and the Cross-Cultural Transmission of Expert Knowledge	1
Sources for the study of ‘medical orientalism’	5
Overview	9
Understanding the needle: tool, technique and techne	12
1 Expectations and Expertise: Early British Responses to Chinese Medicine and Technology	15
The Macartney mission: commerce and discovery	16
Encountering illness: lay expectations of Chinese medicine	18
Cultural specificity and diagnostic consensus	20
The professional opinion: prepared for failure	20
Chinese stories: narratives of contention and narratives of change	28
The power of the pulse: an early response to Chinese diagnostics	29
Through the eye of the needle: medical politics and the Gillan report	34
Anderson and Eades – perceptions of China below the salt	38
Medicine’s mirror	41
2 The Needle Transfixed: Ten Rhyne, Kaempfer and the European Gaze	46
Trade winds: Wilhelm Ten Rhyne and the cartography of the needle	48
Engelbert Kaempfer: observation and acupuncture	65
Strangely familiar: western responses to moxibustion	72
Curiosity pricked: lay responses in France and Britain	76
Eying the needle: medical interpretations of acupuncture	81
Galvanizing the needle	87

3 Sharpening the Needle: British Interpretations of Acupuncture, 1802–30	95
Chinese whispers: lay accounts of Chinese medicine, 1810–40	99
Acupuncture in the medical periodicals, 1810–22	
‘for which it is most particularly recommended’:	104
James Churchill and the singular needle	106
Interpretive responses to <i>A Treatise On Acupuncturation</i>	112
‘Any means, however ridiculous . . .’: analysing acupuncture, 1822–30	115
Acupuncture established?	129
4 Networks and Innovations: the Persistence of British Acupuncture, 1828–90	134
Networks and witnesses: persuasion and diffusion beyond the printed page	134
The declining visibility of acupuncture, 1828–70	142
Acupuncture, empiricism and scepticism	149
1829–40: subsidence	153
1840–70: submergence	159
The visible needle: sites of persistence, 1840–70	161
Medical periodicals and the limits of local culture	169
The end of the beginning: British acupuncture, 1890–1901	179
Conclusions: Continuities in Cross-Cultural Medicine	182
‘Acupuncture’ and assimilation	183
Acupuncture after the National Health Service	186
Continuities in the cross-cultural transmission of medical knowledge	193
<i>Notes</i>	199
<i>Bibliography</i>	241
<i>Index</i>	255

List of Illustrations

2.1	Ten Rhyne's 'Japanese' figure	55
2.2	Ten Rhyne's 'Chinese' figure, front view	56
2.3	Ten Rhyne's 'Chinese' figure, back view	57
2.4	Wilhelm Ten Rhyne	58
2.5	Acupuncture needles, case and patient	66
2.6	Kaempfer's acupuncture map	69

All the illustrations are reproduced courtesy of the Wellcome Trust Medical Photographic Library.

Acknowledgements

I began my research on the history of acupuncture in Britain under the pleasant delusion that it began in 1971, and would provide a nice introduction to a detailed analysis of the contemporary use of therapeutic needling and traditional Chinese medicine in the UK. Since coming to my senses with a bang some time in 1993, I have accumulated countless debts of gratitude to the scholars known and unknown who have made this history possible. First and foremost, I must thank the patient souls who guided me through my dissertation: Harriet Ritvo, the supervisor every student hopes for, and the generous and creative reader every scholar needs; Allan Brandt, without whose encouragement I would not have begun (much less finished) this project; and Evelynnn Hammonds, whose rigorous and insightful reading helped me discover the meaning underneath the story. Roy Porter introduced me to the riches of the Wellcome Library and the Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine, and has subsequently advised me on everything from scholarship to publication; the bibliography of this volume only begins to illustrate my scholarly debt to him. Rima Apple, Londa Schiebinger and Andrew Wear cheered me on (and cheered me up), sharing juicy sources in the parched hours of 'preparing for publication'. Kan-Wen Ma's deep knowledge of acupuncture's history and practice – not to mention his unfailing kindness and collegial generosity – saved me from many errors and steeled me to face the challenge of Chinese medicine. My time at the Wellcome Institute was enriched by conversations with many others; to name a few: David Allan, Sue Ferry, Kim Pelis, Cheryce Kramer, Bridie Andrews, Rhodri Hayward, Alan Yoshioka, Gita Tailor and Sally Bragg, and the fantastic librarians and archivists of the Wellcome Library. Dominic Wujastyk, in particular, answered countless questions about South Asian medicine with aplomb and erudition.

I owe a very special debt to staff at Lewisham Hospital's Health Services Research and Evaluation Unit and Complementary Therapy and Research Centre, and especially to Janet Richardson. Without her early enthusiasm, her dedicated and rigorous research, and her help in collecting information about the Centre and about complementary medicine in the National Health Service, my task in writing about twentieth-century British acupuncture would have been much more difficult (and far less fun). I am also grateful to Richard Hughes-Rowlands, of the

Special Trustees of the General Infirmary at Leeds for kindly permitting me to use the Infirmary's archives, and for his hospitality to me while I worked there.

Since coming to Manchester, I have benefited enormously from John Pickstone's advice and encouragement, his deep knowledge of medicine in Britain, and many (many!) invaluable arguments about the nature and process of making history. My colleagues, Claudia Castañeda, Lyn Schumaker and Helen Valier made me feel at home – and forced me talk about theory, for which I am immeasurably grateful. This book would have been much the poorer without Ian Burney's generosity with last-minute readings and insights. Thanks also to Penny Gouk, Roger Cooter, Steve Sturdy and others here in the beautiful North.

Without the financial support of the Wellcome Trust, both to me as an individual and to the discipline of the history of medicine, this book would never have been written. Thanks are due also to the Wellcome Trust Medical Photographic Library for kindly permitting me to reproduce crucial images from rare seventeenth- and eighteenth-century texts. Similarly, I must thank the *History of Science* for allowing me to reprint a slightly revised version of 'Expectations and Expertise: Early British Responses to Chinese Medicine and Technology', *History of Science* 37 (1999) here as Chapter 1; and the *Journal for the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences* for allowing me to quote (by permission of Oxford University Press) at length from Robert Carrubba and John Z. Bowers, 'The Western World's First Detailed Treatise on Acupuncture: Willem Ten Rhijne's *De Acupunctura*', *Journal of the History of Medicine*, 29 (1974): 371–98.

Finally I take great pleasure in thanking the family and friends who put up with me through dissertations, articles and the endless frustrations of re-writing. Such thanks can never repay but can only acknowledge them for their support, intelligence, patience and love: Mary, to whom this book is dedicated; Linda, my sister, who managed not to kill me; my grandparents; Julie; Carolyn; Dave; Kate; Rebecca; Betty; John and Toni; Jenny; the Mabey family; Maria; Aya; and perhaps most deservedly of all, the brilliant and charming Dr Mouse, who has kept me sane, fed me chip butties, and read me the book of the twentieth century.