Studies in Military and Strategic History

General Editor: **Michael Dockrill**, Professor of Diplomatic History, King's College, London

Published titles include:

Nigel John Ashton

EISENHOWER, MACMILLAN AND THE PROBLEM OF NASSER
Anglo-American Relations and Arab Nationalism, 1955–59

Christopher M. Bell

THE ROYAL NAVY, SEAPOWER AND STRATEGY BETWEEN THE WARS

Peter Bell

CHAMBERLAIN, GERMANY AND JAPAN, 1933–34

Antony Best

BRITISH INTELLIGENCE AND THE JAPANESE CHALLENGE IN ASIA, 1914–1941

Philippe Chassaigne and Michael Dockrill (*editors*)

ANGLO-FRENCH RELATIONS, 1898–1998
From Fashoda to Jospin

Michael J. Cohen and Martin Kolinsky (*editors*)

BRITAIN AND THE MIDDLE EAST IN THE 1930s
Security Problems, 1935–39

Paul Cornish

BRITISH MILITARY PLANNING FOR THE DEFENCE OF GERMANY, 1945–50

Michael Dockrill

BRITISH ESTABLISHMENT PERSPECTIVES ON FRANCE, 1936–40

Michael Dockrill and John Fisher

THE PARIS PEACE CONFERENCE, 1919
Peace without Victory?

Robert Frazier

ANGLO-AMERICAN RELATIONS WITH GREECE
The Coming of the Cold War, 1942–47

John P.S. Gearson

HAROLD MACMILLAN AND THE BERLIN WALL CRISIS, 1958–62

John Gooch

ARMY, STATE AND SOCIETY IN ITALY, 1870–1915

G.A.H. Gordon

BRITISH SEA POWER AND PROCUREMENT BETWEEN THE WARS
A Reappraisal of Rearmament

Raffi Gregorian

THE BRITISH ARMY, THE GURKHAS AND COLD WAR STRATEGY IN
THE FAR EAST, 1947–1954

Stephen Hartley
THE IRISH QUESTION AS A PROBLEM IN BRITISH FOREIGN POLICY, 1914–18

Brian Holden Reid
J.F.C. FULLER: Military Thinker

Ashley Jackson
WAR AND EMPIRE IN MAURITIUS AND THE INDIAN OCEAN

Stewart Lone
JAPAN'S FIRST MODERN WAR
Army and Society in the Conflict with China, 1894–95

Thomas R. Mockaitis
BRITISH COUNTERINSURGENCY, 1919–60

Bob Moore and Kent Fedorowich
THE BRITISH EMPIRE AND ITS ITALIAN PRISONERS OF WAR, 1940–47

T.R. Moreman
THE ARMY IN INDIA AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF FRONTIER WARFARE,
1849–1947

Kendrick Oliver
KENNEDY, MACMILLAN AND THE NUCLEAR TEST-BAN DEBATE, 1961–63

Elsbeth Y. O'Riordan
BRITAIN AND THE RUHR CRISIS

G.D. Sheffield
LEADERSHIP IN THE TRENCHES
Officer–Man Relations, Morale and Discipline in the British Army in the Era
of the First World War

Adrian Smith
MICK MANNOCK, FIGHTER PILOT
Myth, Life and Politics

Martin Thomas
THE FRENCH NORTH AFRICAN CRISIS
Colonial Breakdown and Anglo-French Relations, 1945–62

Simon Trew
BRITAIN, MIHAILOVIC AND THE CHETNIKS, 1941–42

Steven Weiss
ALLIES IN CONFLICT
Anglo-American Strategic Negotiations, 1938–44

Studies in Military and Strategic History
Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–71046–0
(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke,
Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

British Intelligence and the Japanese Challenge in Asia, 1914–1941

Antony Best

palgrave
macmillan

© Antony Best 2002

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2002 978-0-333-94551-3

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2002 by

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and

175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan® is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is a registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-42598-3

ISBN 978-0-230-28728-0 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230287280

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Best, Antony, 1964–

British intelligence and the Japanese challenge in Asia, 1914–1941 / Antony Best.
p. cm. – (Studies in military and strategic history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Military intelligence—Great Britain—History—20th century. 2. World War, 1914–1918—Military intelligence—Great Britain. 3. World War, 1939–1945—Causes. 4. Japan—Military policy. 5. Asia—Strategic aspects. I. Title. II. Series. UB251.G7 B47 2002

327.1241051'09'041—dc21

2002019507

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

11 10 09 08 07 06 05 04 03 02

This book is dedicated with all my love to Saho

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Maps</i>	viii
<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	ix
<i>Usages and Abbreviations</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
1 Introduction	1
2 The British Empire in East Asia in 1914	11
3 The Erosion of the Anglo-Japanese Alliance, 1914–21	22
4 ‘A Cubist Picture’: The Soviet Menace in China, 1918–27	49
5 Dealing with the Comintern Threat, 1927–31	70
6 From ‘Weak Power’ to Potential Enemy: Japan, 1921–33	83
7 ‘The Situation in the Far East Has Changed Completely’, 1933–37	105
8 The Sino-Japanese War, 1937–40	133
9 The Immediate Origins of the Pacific War	160
10 ‘The Jap is Good’: Epilogue and Conclusions	188
<i>Notes</i>	198
<i>Bibliography</i>	237
<i>Index</i>	252

List of Maps

1 East and South-East Asia in 1914	12
2 China and Manchukuo in 1939	126
3 South-East Asia in 1941	161

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

1 Intelligence flow into and around Whitehall, 1924	7
2 Intelligence flow into and around Whitehall, 1941	7

Tables

1 Language officers sent to Japan, 1917–29	94
2 Language officers sent to Japan, 1930–39	108
3 MI2 officers, 1931–41	117

Usages and Abbreviations

In this book I have followed the Japanese style of putting the family name first (except in the acknowledgements); Chinese names are given in Wade-Giles as this was the contemporary usage. Formosa has been used in preference to Taiwan. Persia is used for Iran, and Siam for Thailand until these countries changed their names. The following abbreviations appear in the text:

AID	Air Intelligence Directorate
AMA	Assistant Military Attaché
ANA	Assistant Naval Attaché
BAT	British-American Tobacco Company
BJ	Blue Jacket (the name given to British decrypts of foreign diplomatic correspondence)
BSC	British Security Coordination
'C'	Designation for the head of the Secret Service
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CER	Chinese Eastern Railway
CIB	China Intelligence Bureau
CID	Committee of Imperial Defence
C-in-C	Commander-in-Chief
CMC	Chinese Maritime Customs Service
COIC	Combined Operational Intelligence Centre, Australia
COIS	Chief of Intelligence Staff at the FECB
COS	Chiefs of Staff
DCI	Directorate of Criminal Intelligence
DCOIS	Deputy Chief of Intelligence Staff at the FECB
DIB	Delhi Intelligence Bureau, India
DMI	Director of Military Intelligence
DMOI	Director of Military Intelligence and Operations
DNI	Director of Naval Intelligence
DSO	Defence Security Officer
ECCI	Executive Committee of the Comintern
FEIB	Far East Intelligence Bureau
FECB	Far East Combined Bureau
FESS	Far Eastern Security Service
FMS	Federated Malay States
GCCS	Government Code and Cipher School
GOC	General Officer Commanding
IB	Intelligence Bureau, Shanghai, 1916–20

IDCEU	Inter-Departmental Committee on Eastern Unrest
IGP	Inspector-General of Police
IIC	Industrial Intelligence Centre
IJA	Imperial Japanese Army
IJN	Imperial Japanese Navy
JIC	Joint Intelligence Sub-Committee
JN-25	IJN Operational Code from 1939
JNMIB	Joint Naval and Military Intelligence Bureau, Hong Kong
JPS	Joint Planning Staff
KMT	Kuomintang
MBPI	Malayan Bureau of Political Intelligence
MCIB	Malayan Combined Intelligence Bureau
MCP	Malayan Communist Party
MEW	Ministry of Economic Warfare
MI1c	Designation for the Secret Service during the Great War
MI2c	Section within MID dealing with East Asia
MI5	The Security Service
MID	Military Intelligence Directorate
MLC	Motorized Landing Craft
NCP	Nanyang Communist Party
NCO	Non-Commissioned Officer
NID	Naval Intelligence Directorate
NRA	National Revolutionary Army
ODC	Overseas Defence Sub-Committee
OM	Oriental Mission (SOE Far East in 1941)
PKI	Indonesian Communist Party
PNIO	Pacific Naval Intelligence Organization
POW	Prisoner of war
RAF	Royal Air Force
RAN	Royal Australian Navy
RDF	Radio Direction-Finding
RNZN	Royal New Zealand Navy
SAC	Strategic Appreciation Sub-Committee
Shaforce	Shanghai Defence Force
SIC	Shanghai Intelligence Centre (from 1935)
SIGINT	Signals Intelligence
SIS	Secret Intelligence Service (Designation for the Secret Service from 1921)
SMP	Shanghai Municipal Police
SMR	South Manchurian Railway
SOE	Special Operations Executive
TSR	Trans-Siberian Railway
USN	United States Navy
WT	Wireless Transmission
'Y' work	Wireless Interception Intelligence

Acknowledgements

It is a pleasure to show my appreciation to those who have assisted me in the writing of this book. First I would like to thank the staff at the following institutions for their kind assistance: the Public Record Office; the India Office Library; the Australian War Memorial in Canberra; the Australian National Archives in Canberra and Melbourne (particularly Rosemary Reddick); Birmingham University Library; the Bodleian Library, Oxford; the British Museum Manuscripts Section (particularly Ann Summers for help with the Layton papers); Churchill College, Cambridge; the Imperial War Museum, London; the Liddell Hart Centre for Military Archives, Kings College, London; the Middle East Centre and the Library at St Antony's College, Oxford; the National Maritime Museum, London; Rhodes House Library, Oxford; and Sheffield University Library. I would also like to thank I.D. Goode at the Ministry of Defence, Alan Glennie at the Cabinet Office and the staff of the Foreign Office's Record and Historical Department for declassifying records on my behalf. I am also appreciative to Frank Cass & Company for permission to base Chapter 9 of this book on my article: "This Probably Over-Valued Military Power": British Intelligence and Whitehall's Perception of Japan, 1939–41', *Intelligence and National Security*, 12 (1997) and to use material from my article 'Intelligence, Diplomacy and the Japanese Threat to British Interests, 1914–41', *Intelligence and National Security*, 17 (2002).

Records from the Public Record Office and the India Office Library appear by permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office. I would like to acknowledge the Trustees of the Liddell Hart Centre for Military Archives for permission to use quotations from the papers in their care; the Trustees of the National Maritime Museum for the Tait papers, the Avon Trustees for the Avon papers; the Department of Documents at the Imperial War Museum and the individual copyright holders for the Grimsdale, Penney, Percival and Vinden papers (every effort has been made to gain permission to use quotations from the Drage, Eady, Godfrey, Maunsell, Pollard, Ross and Ward's papers); and the Director of the Middle East Centre at St. Antony's College for the Lampson papers.

This book has been written and researched in a number of 'homes' and many kind people have provided assistance. Professor Takahiko Tanaka at Hitotsubashi University kindly looked after me during my sabbatical in Tokyo in 1997, and as usual provoked me into deep thinking; he has my profound gratitude. From the summer of 1999 until the spring of 2000 I was given the honour of being invited as a visiting research scholar to the Institute for Research into Humanities (Jinbunken) at Kyoto University and I would like to express my great appreciation to Professor Yuzo Yamamoto

and his colleagues for their kindness towards me. In May 2000 I had the chance to visit Australia for research and would like to thank Dr Frank Cain of the Royal Military College and Professor David Horner at Australian National University for their assistance. Words are not enough to thank Joe Straczek of the Naval History Directorate in the Department of Defence in Canberra who steered me towards numerous invaluable documents, who provided guidance on the history of Australian intelligence during the last stages of this book, and who nearly bankrupted me by taking me to all the second-hand bookshops in the city.

Among the many fellow historians who have helped to point me towards interesting sources and to understand the issues raised in this book and their wider ramifications for Anglo-Japanese relations, I would particularly like to thank Lorne Breitenhohlner, Douglas Ford, Peter Lowe, Naoko Shimazu, and lastly Richard Aldrich, who told me that I ought to write a book on this subject. Among historians based in Japan I have benefited from conversations with and advice from Professors Makoto Iokibe, Chihiro Hosoya, Yoichi Kibata, and Ken Ishida, and Associate Professors Masataka Matsuura, Hiroshi Nakanishi, Harumi Goto-Shibata, Kiyoshi Aizawa and Tadashi Kuramatsu. In particular I would like to thank Naoto Kagotani, Shigeru Akita and Kaoru Sugihara who helped to look after me in Kyoto for their stimulating ideas and good companionship. Special thanks go to Joe Maiolo and John Ferris, who were kind enough to read this manuscript for me, to Professor Donald Cameron Watt for his support, and most of all to Professor Ian Nish for all his help and guidance over the years.

I would like to thank Masataka, Ryoko and Kyuma Matsuura for their company in London and Sapporo and I hope to give Kyuma his first English lesson in the near future. Andrew Bell, Tracy Dowson and Tim Pope have as always entertained and kept me sane, and 'Arthur', Sue and Frederick Clarke are simply wonderful friends. Jasper the Dog still insists that walking is the best time to engage in thinking and he may be right. My heartfelt thanks also go to my parents, Philip and Muriel Best, for all their support and particularly my father for doing untold wonders to my tortured prose, and to my parents-in-law, Toru and Midori Matsumoto, who have been so kind to me and tolerant of my struggling attempts to communicate in Japanese. Lastly, my warmest thanks and deepest love go to my wife and fellow historian, Saho Matsumoto-Best, who has done more for me than I could ever record and to whom this book is dedicated.

ANTONY BEST