EDITOR'S EPILOGUE

All of the foregoing can be distilled down to three themes:

1. Must every uremic patient be treated with dialysis or a kidney transplant irrespective of mitigating circumstance such as citizenship, age, mental incapacity, or severity of illness?
2. Are some patients "more equal than others" (rich, politically well positioned, religious consideration) in terms of priority for a solid organ allograft or acceptance for dialytic therapy?
3. Are there conditions that permit the renal team to disengage from therapy once begun (noncompliance, vegetative state, futile prognosis, irreversible psychosis)?

Each of these questions could be selected for substantive deliberation. Debate surrounding the issues comprises the substance of this work. What is intended in sharing our experience is that the reader will be provoked to address the disturbing and often distressing front line decisions that arise in the practice of nephrology and transplant medicine. Feel free to contact the editor to convey your feelings whether they be outrage or concurrence. There are neither simple nor easy answers. Good luck!

REFERENCES

1. Brown v Bower, No. J86-0759(B) (SD Miss Dec 21, 1987).
2. Bower, John D., The Yangtze Syndrome: "Pull Man From Yangtze, Responsible for Man's Life", Contemporary Dialysis and Nephrology, February, Pages 30 & 37, 1989.
3. Orentlicher, David, Denying Treatment To The Noncompliant Patient. JAMA 1991:265: 1579-1582.
4. Bender W. Abraham Flexner--a crusader against medical maleducation. J Cancer Educ 1993;8:183-189.
5. Channel 4000, 1997 James Michener Dies at 90 Internet Broadcasting Systems, Inc.
6. Neumann ME. Novelist Michener dies after withdrawing from dialysis. Nephrol News Issues 1997;11:60-62.
7. Orenlicher D.1991 Denying treatment to the noncompliant patient. JAMA;266: 1579-1582.
8. Williams DI, Williams DJ, Williams IG, Unwin RJ, Griffiths MH, Miller RF. Presentation, pathology, and outcome of HIV associated renal disease in a specialist centre for HIV/AIDS. Sex Transm Infect 1998;74:179-184.
9. Rao TKS, Manis T, Friedman EA. Dismal prognosis despite maintenance hemodialysis in AIDS nephropathy and chronic uremia. Trans Amer Soc Artif Internal Organs 31:160-3, 1985.
10. Ahuja TS, Borucki M, Funtanilla M, Shahinian V, Hollander M, Rajaraman S. Is the prevalence of HIV-associated nephropathy decreasing? Am J Nephrol 1999;19:655-659.
11. Schneiderman LJ, Jecker NS, Jonsen AR. Medical futility: response to critiques. Ann Intern Med 1996;125:669-674.
12. Brody BA, Halevy A. Is futility a futile concept? J Med Philos 1995;20:123-144.
13. Caesar N. It's OK to ignore referral bans in certain cases, HCFA indicates.anag Care 1999 Feb;8:55-56.
14. Davis JP. Fraud and abuse. Understanding the Stark II proposed regulations. Healthc Financ Manage. 1998 Apr;52:65-69.
15. Garg PP, Frick KD, Diener-West M, Powe NR. Effect of the ownership of dialysis facilities on patients' survival and referral for transplantation. N Engl J Med 1999;341: 1653-1660.
16. Agodoa LY, Wolfe RA, Port FK. Reuse of dialyzers and clinical outcomes: fact or fiction. Am J Kidney Dis 1998;32(6 Suppl 4):S88-S92.
17. Collins AJ, Ma JZ, Constantini EG, Everson SE. Dialysis unit and patient characteristics associated with reuse practices and mortality: 1989-1993. J Am Soc Nephrol 1998; 9:2108-2117.
18. Friedman EA. ESRD therapy: An American success story. JAMA 1996, 275:1118-1122.
19. El Sayed NM, Gomatos PJ, Beck-Sague CM, Dietrich U, von Briesen H, Osmanov S, Esparza J, Arthur RR, Wahdan MH, Jarvis WR. Epidemic transmission of human immunodeficiency virus in renal dialysis centers in Egypt. J Infect Dis 2000;181:91-97.
20. Wreghitt TG. Blood-borne virus infections in dialysis units--a review. Rev Med Virol 1999;9(2):101-109
21. Purgus R, Tamalet C, Poignard P, Spire B, George F, Robert A, Olmer M. Long-term

nonprogressive human immunodeficiency virus-1 infection in a kidney allograft recipient. Transplantation 1998;66:1384-1386.

22. Hooi LS. Human immunodeficiency virus infection in recipients of living unrelated donor renal transplants--a report of 4 cases. Med J Malaysia 1993;48:232-235.

23. Simonds RJ, Holmberg SD, Hurwitz RL, Coleman TR, Bottenfield S, Conley LJ, Kohlenberg SH, Castro KG, Dahan BA, Schable CA, et al. Transmission of human immunodeficiency virus type 1 from a seronegative organ and tissue donor. N Engl J Med 1992;326:726-732.

24. Fellner CH, Schwartz SH.. Altruism in disrepute. Medical versus public attitudes toward the living organ donor. N Engl J Med. 1971;284:582-585.

25. Thiel G. Emotionally related living kidney donation: pro and contra.Nephrol Dial Transplant 1997;12(9):1820-1824.

26. Said MR, Curtis JJ. Living unrelated renal transplantation: progress and potential. J Am Soc Nephrol 1998;9:2148-2152.

27. Binet I, Bock AH, Vogelbach P, Gasser T, Kiss A, Brunner F, Thiel G. Outcome in emotionally related living kidney donor transplantation. Nephrol Dial Transplant 1997; 12:1940-1948.

28. Kjellstrand CM., Logan G: Racial, sexual and age inequalities in chronic dialysis. Nephron 1987;45:257-263.

29. Craft PP. Charles Drew: dispelling the myth. South Med J 1992;85:1236-1240, 1246.

30. Ayanian JZ, Cleary PD, Weissman JS, Epstein AM. The effect of patients' preferences on racial differences in access to renal transplantation. N Engl J Med 1999;341: 1661-1669.

31. Roberts KY. Black American attitudes toward organ donation and transplantation. J Natl Med Assoc 1988;80:1121, 1123-1124, 1126.

32. Siminoff LA, Arnold R. Increasing organ donation in the African-American community: altruism in the face of an untrustworthy system. Ann Intern Med 1999;130:607-609.

33. American community to provide organs for transplantation. Mt Sinai J Med 1999;66:273-276.

34. Arnason WB. Directed donation. The relevance of race. Hastings Cent Rep 1991 Nov-Dec;21:13-19.

35. Friedman EA. Advanced glycsoylated end products and hyperglycemia in the pathogenesis of diabetic complications. Diabetes Care 1999;22 Supplement 2:B65-B71.

36. Frishberg Y, Feinstein S, Drukker A. Living unrelated (commercial) renal transplantation in children. J Am Soc Nephrol 1998;9:1100-1103.

37. Cohen B, Persijn GG, Vanrenterghem Y. Commerce in transplantation: how does it affect European legislation? Clin Transplant 2000;14:28-31.

38. Orwell George, Animal Farm : A Fairy Story May 1996, 50th Anniversary Edition, Harcourt Brace, Boston.

39. Pageaux GP, Michel J, Coste V, Perney P, Possoz P, Perrigault PF, Navarro F, Fabre JM, Domergue J, Blanc P, Larrey D. Alcoholic cirrhosis is a good indication for liver transplantation, even for cases of recidivism. Gut 1999;45(3):421-426.

40. Fabrega E, Crespo J, Casafont F, De las Heras G, de la Pena J, Pons-Romero F. Alcoholic recidivism after liver transplantation for alcoholic cirrhosis. J Clin Gastroenterol 1998;26:204-206.

41. Glover JJ, Moss AH. Rationing dialysis in the United States: possible implications of capitated systems. Adv Ren Replace Ther 1998;5:341-349.

42. Nilstun T, Ohlsson R.1995 Should health care be rationed by age? Scand J Soc Med; 23:81-84.

43. Hestin D, Frimat L, Hubert J, Renoult E, Huu TC, Kessler M.1994 Renal transplantation in patients over sixty years of age.Clin Nephrol;42(4):232-236.

44. Morris GE, Jamieson NV, Small J, Evans DB, Calne R.1991 Cadaveric renal transplantation in elderly recipients: is it worthwhile? Nephrol Dial Transplant;6:887-892.

45. Lynn J, Teno JM, Phillips RS, Wu AW, Desbiens N, Harrold J, Claessens MT, Wenger N, Kreling B, Connors AF Jr. Perceptions by family members of the dying experience of older and seriously ill patients. SUPPORT Investigators. Study to Understand Prognoses and Preferences for Outcomes and Risks of Treatments. Ann Intern Med 1997;126:97-106.

46. Wolfe J, Grier HE, Klar N, Levin SB, Ellenbogen JM, Salem-Schatz S, Emanuel EJ, Weeks JC. Symptoms and suffering at the end of life in children with cancer. N Engl J Med 2000;342:326-333.

47. Ventafridda V, Ripamonti C, De Conno F, Tamburini M, Cassileth BR. Symptom prevalence and control during cancer patients' last days of life. J Palliat Care 1990;6:7-11.

48. Lederberg MS. Disentangling ethical and psychological issues--a guide for oncologists. Acta Oncol 1999;38:771-779.