

# Works Cited in the Text

---

## Abbreviations

ASP: *Aristotelian Society—Proceedings*.

ASS: *Aristotelian Society—Supplementary Volume*.

- ACTON, H. B. (1955), *The Illusion of the Epoch* (London).
- ACTON, Lord (1907), *Historical Essays and Studies* (London).
- ARON, R. (1938, 1948), *Introduction to the Philosophy of History*; English translation of the 1948 revision (London, 1961).
- ASHLEY, M. (1968), *Churchill as Historian* (London).
- ATKINSON, R. F. (1972), 'Explanation in History', ASP, LXXII.
- AYER, A. J. (1936, 1946), *Language, Truth and Logic* (2nd edition, London, 1946).
- (1952), 'Statements about the Past', ASP, LII.
- (1956), *The Problem of Knowledge* (London).
- BEARD, C. A. (1935), 'The Case for Historical Relativism'; reprinted in Nash (1969); originally called 'That Noble Dream'.
- BECKER, C. L. (1955), 'What Are Historical Facts?'; reprinted in Nash (1969).
- BLAKE, C. (1955), 'Can History Be Objective?', *Mind*, LXIV; reprinted in Gardiner (1959).
- BLOCH, M. (1941), *The Historian's Craft*; English translation (Manchester, 1954).
- BOBER, M. M. (1927, 1948), *Karl Marx's Interpretation of History* (2nd, enlarged, edition, Cambridge, Mass., 1948).
- BRADLEY, F. H. (1874), 'The Presuppositions of Critical History'; reprinted in *Collected Essays of F. H. Bradley*, vol. I (Oxford, 1935).
- BRODBECK, M. (1958), 'Methodological Individualisms: Definition and Reduction'; reprinted in Dray (1966).
- BUTLER, R. J. (1959), 'Other Dates', *Mind*, LXVIII.

- BUTTERFIELD, H. (1931), *The Whig Interpretation of History* (London).  
 — (1955), *Man on His Past* (Cambridge).
- CARR, E. H. (1961), *What Is History?* (London; paperback edition, Harmondsworth, 1964).
- CHATEAUBRIAND, F.-R. de (1802), *Le Génie du Christianisme* (Paris).
- COLLINGWOOD, R. G. (1938), 'On the So-called Idea of Causation', *ASP*, xxxviii.  
 — (1939), *Autobiography* (Oxford).  
 — (1940), *Essay on Metaphysics* (Oxford).  
 — (1946), *The Idea of History* (Oxford).  
 — (1965), *Essays in the Philosophy of History* (Austin, Texas).
- CROCE, B. (1938), *History as the Story of Liberty*; English translation (London, 1941).
- DANTO, A. C. (1965), *Analytical Philosophy of History* (Cambridge).
- DOWNIE, R. S. (1971), *Roles and Values* (London).
- DRAY, W. (1957), *Laws and Explanation in History* (Oxford).  
 — (1963), 'The Historical Explanation of Actions Reconsidered'; reprinted in Gardiner (1974).  
 — (1964), *Philosophy of History* (Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey).  
 — (1966, ed.), *Philosophical Analysis and History* (New York).
- ELTON, G. R. (1967), *The Practice of History* (Sydney; paperback edition, London, 1969).  
 — (1970), *Political History* (New York and London).
- ENGELS, F. (1878), *Anti-Dühring*; English translation (Moscow, 1954).
- FAIN, H. (1970), *Between Philosophy and History* (Princeton, New Jersey).
- FEUER, L. S. (1969, ed.), *Marx and Engels: Basic Writings in Philosophy and Politics* (London, 1969).
- FISHER, H. A. L. (1936), *History of Europe* (London).
- GALLIE, W. B. (1964), *Philosophy and the Historical Understanding* (London).
- GARDINER, P. (1952), *The Nature of Historical Explanation* (Oxford).  
 — (1959, ed.), *Theories of History* (Urbana, Illinois).  
 — (1974, ed.), *The Philosophy of History* (Oxford).
- GELLNER, E. (1956), 'Holism vs Understanding in History and Sociology'; reprinted in Gardiner (1959).  
 — (1959), *Words and Things* (London).
- GEYL, P. (1955), *Use and Abuse of History* (New Haven, Connecticut).
- GINSBERG, M. (1954), 'The Individual and Society'; reprinted in his *The Diversity of Morals* (London, 1956).
- GOLDSTEIN, L. J. (1976), *Historical Knowing* (Austin, Texas).

- GOSSE, E. (1907), *Father and Son*; reprint (Oxford, 1974).
- GREEN, J. R. (1878–80), *A History of the English People* (London).
- HALE, J. R. (1967, ed.), *The Evolution of British Historiography* (London).
- HAMPSHIRE, S. (1954), 'Logic and Appreciation', in W. Elton (ed.), *Aesthetics and Language* (Oxford, 1954).
- HART, H. L. A. and HONORÉ, A. M. (1959), *Causation in the Law* (Oxford).
- HAYEK, F. A. von (1942–4), *The Counter-Revolution of Science*; reprinted (Urbana, Illinois, 1952).
- HEMPEL, C. J. (1942), 'The Function of General Laws in History'; reprinted in Gardiner (1959) and in other collections.
- (1963), 'Reasons and Covering Laws in Historical Explanations'; reprinted in Gardiner (1974).
- HOSPERS, J. (1956, 1967), *An Introduction to Philosophical Analysis*, 2nd edition, 1967 (London).
- HUME, D. (1739–40), *A Treatise of Human Nature*, 1888 edition (Oxford).
- KUHN, T. S. (1962, 1970), *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 2nd edition, 1970 (Chicago).
- LEFF, G. (1961), *The Tyranny of Concepts* (London).
- (1969), *History and Social Theory* (London).
- LUCAS, P. G. (1956), 'Explanation in History', *ASS*, xxx.
- MCCULLAGH, C. B. (1969), 'Narrative and Explanation in History', *Mind*, LXXVIII.
- MACKIE, J. L. (1974), *The Cement of the Universe* (Oxford).
- MANDELBAUM, M. (1938), *The Problem of Historical Knowledge* (New York).
- (1955), 'Societal Facts'; reprinted in Gardiner (1959).
- (1957), 'Societal Laws'; reprinted in Dray (1966).
- MARROU, H.-I. (1954, 1962), *De la Connaissance Historique*, 4th edition, 1962 (Paris).
- MARWICK, A. (1970), *The Nature of History* (London).
- MARX, K. (1850), *Class Struggles in France*; English translation (London, 1937).
- (1852) *The Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Bonaparte*; English translation (New York, 1926).
- (1859), Preface to *A Critique of Political Economy*; English translation (London, 1971).
- (1867), *Capital*, vol. 1; English translation (Moscow, 1954).

- MARX, K. and ENGELS, F. (1846), *The German Ideology*; English translation (Moscow, 1964).  
 Relevant excerpts from these works are to be found in Feuer (1969) — see above. Page references to these works in the text are to this collection.
- MEILAND, J. W. (1965), *Skepticism and Historical Knowledge* (New York, 1965).
- MILL, J. S. (1859), *On Liberty*; reprinted in *Utilitarianism etc.* (London, 1910); paperback edition, ed. G. Himmelfarb (Harmondsworth, 1974).
- NAGEL, E. (1961), *The Structure of Science* (London).
- NASH, R. H. (1969, ed.), *Ideas of History* (New York).
- NOWELL-SMITH, P. H. (1957), 'Are Historical Events Unique?', *ASP*, LVII.  
 — (1971), *What Actually Happened* (Lawrence, Kansas).
- OAKESHOTT, M. (1933), *Experience and its Modes* (Cambridge).  
 — (1962), 'The Activity of Being an Historian', in his *Rationalism and Politics* (London).
- PEARS, D. (1956), 'Time, Truth and Inference', *ASP*, LVI.
- PLAMENATZ, J. (1961), *Man and Society*, vol. II (London).
- PLEKHANOV, G. (1895), *The Development of the Monist View of History*; English translation (Moscow, 1956).  
 — (1897), *The Materialist Conception of History*; English translation (New York, 1940).  
 — (1898), *The Role of the Individual in History*; English translation (New York, 1940).
- PLUMB, J. H. (1969), *The Death of the Past* (London).
- POPPER, K. R. (1934), *The Logic of Scientific Discovery*; English translation (London, 1959).  
 — (1944-5, 1957), *The Poverty of Historicism*; articles in *Economica* subsequently published in book form (London, 1957; 2nd edition, 1961).  
 — (1945), *The Open Society and Its Enemies*, vol. II (London, with subsequent editions).
- RANKE, L. VON (1824), *History of the Latin and Teutonic Nations*; English translation (London, 1915).
- RENIER, G. J. (1950), *History: Its Purpose and Method* (London).
- RUSSELL, B. (1921), *The Analysis of Mind* (London).
- RYLE, G. (1949), *The Concept of Mind* (London).

- SCRIVEN, M. (1966), 'Causes, Connections, and Conditions in History', in Dray (1966).
- STRAWSON, P. F. (1961), 'Social Morality and Individual Ideal', *Philosophy*, xxxvi.
- TAYLOR, A. J. P. (1961), *The Origins of the Second World War* (London; paperback edition, Harmondsworth, 1964).
- (1965), *English History, 1914-1945* (Oxford).
- THOMSON, D. (1950), *England in the Nineteenth Century* (London).
- (1969), *The Aims of History* (London).
- THUCYDIDES, *The Peloponnesian War*; English translation (Harmondsworth, 1972).
- TOYNBEE, A. (1934-54), *A Study of History*, 10 vols (Oxford); abridgement of vols I-VI and VII-X by D. C. Somervell (Oxford, 1946, 1957).
- TREVELYAN, G. M. (1930), *Clio: A Muse* (London).
- WALSH, W. H. (1951, 1967), *An Introduction to the Philosophy of History* (London; 3rd edition, revised, 1967).
- (1967) 'Colligatory Concepts in History'; reprinted in Gardiner (1974).
- WATKINS, J. W. N. (1957), 'Historical Explanation in the Social Sciences'; reprinted in Gardiner (1959).
- WHITE, M. (1943), 'Historical Explanation'; reprinted in Gardiner (1959).
- (1965), *Foundations of Historical Knowledge* (New York and London).
- WISDOM, J. (1952), 'Metaphysics', in *Other Minds* (Oxford).
- WISDOM, J. O. (1953), *The Unconscious Origins of Berkeley's Philosophy* (London).
- WRIGHT, G. H. von (1971), *Explanation and Understanding* (Ithaca, N.Y.).

# Index

- actions in the past II sect. 6 (63-6)
- Acton, H. B. 124, 219
- Acton, Lord 3, 15, 16, 17, 19, 174, 198-202, 205, 219
- Aristotle 37, 114, 184
- Aron, R. 11, 28, 36, 57, 85, 175, 219
- Ashley, M. 123, 219
- assimilationist (positivist) conception of history 23, 29-33
- Atkinson, R. F. 219
- Augustine 52
- autonomist (idealist) conception of history 23, 24-9
- Ayer, A. J. 40, 44, 50, 55, 219
- Beard, C. A. 70, 73n., 219
- 'because':  
    universalisability of 112-13  
    use of 100-1
- Becker, C. L. 66, 70, 219
- Berkeley 179
- bias 72
- Blake, C. 78, 219
- Bloch, M. 17, 34, 40, 50, 159, 219
- Bober, M. M. 174, 219
- Boswell 209
- Bradley, F. H. 91, 219
- Brodbeck, M. 168, 173, 219
- Bury, J. B. 17
- Butler, R. J. 40, 219
- Butterfield, H. 14, 16, 33, 34, 35, 37, 58, 74, 90, 212, 220
- Carlyle, T. 16
- Carr, E. H. 28, 34, 36, 37, 58, 128, 220
- causal connections, particular v sect. 3 (151-8)
- causal explanation v *passim*; cf. law explanation IV sect. 2 (102-15)  
    levels of 143, 146, v sect. 5 (167-80)  
    of actions 185-7
- causation: Hume's regularity theory 144-5, v sect. 3 (151-8), 181  
    and agency 148  
    and practice 155-8  
    and responsibility 147, 163-4  
    and values 148, 159, 160, 163-4
- cause(s): as necessary and/or sufficient conditions 105, 143, 145-51  
    contributory (partial) 105, 108-9, 159  
    in history v *esp.* sect. 1 (140-3)  
    plurality of 142, 149-51  
    'true' v sect. 4 (158-67); abnormalism 159-60
- 'cause', use of 100-1, v sect. 2 (143-51), 134, 164, 182; cf. 'because'
- chance v sect. 6 (180-7)
- Chateaubriand, F.-R. de 54, 220
- chronicle 20, 21
- chronology 20, 21, 133
- Clapham, J. 17
- Clarendon 15
- classification 21, 22
- coherence in historical writing 131, 133-7
- colligation 139n.
- Collingwood, R. G. x, 23, 25-8, 30, 32, 36, 37, 50, 53, 64, 91, 93, 96, 97, 142, 148, 160, 182, 197, 205-

- 6, 208, 209, 215, 217, 220  
 constraint v sect. 6 (180-7)  
 constructionism (constitutionism) 40,  
 41, and II sect. 1-3 *passim*  
 Croce, B. 15, 17, 23, 24, 25, 34, 37,  
 50, 124, 182, 220
- Danto, A. C. 9, 23, 32, 40, 43, 45,  
 56, 57, 59, 72, 87, 96, 130, 132,  
 168, 173, 220
- description, interpretation and explana-  
 tion 75-7, IV sect. 1 (95-  
 102)  
 and causal explanation 144
- determinism 12-13, 104-5, v sect. 6  
 (180-7)
- Downie, R. S. 200, 220
- Dray, W. x, 23, 25, 31-2, 34, 35, 37,  
 59, 65, 70, 72, 83, 86, 96, 102,  
 120, 121, 153, 155, 159, 162, 163,  
 220
- Elton, G. R. 7, 8, 15, 20, 21, 22, 27,  
 35-6, 37, 40, 58, 87, 125, 130,  
 132, 220
- Engels, F. 174-80, 220, 222
- evidence 11, 41-2  
 and imaginative identification with  
 the past 64-5  
 documentary and nomological  
 59-62, 107
- existential regularism (White) 108-  
 10
- explanation 12, 18-9, IV and v  
*passim*  
 and necessary and/or sufficient con-  
 ditions 65, 103-5  
 and prediction 30, 129  
 causal v *passim*; see cause  
 dispositional 115-19, reducibility  
 to law model 117-18; whether  
 rational 118; how far  
 historical 118-19, 171  
 law 23, 29-33, 97, 99, 101, IV sect.  
 2 (102-15), 137-9, 189  
 narrative 24, 32, 33-4, 97, 102, IV  
 sect. 4 (128-39)  
 rational 25, 97, 99, 101, 102, IV  
 sect. 3 (115-28), 137-9, 155,  
 168-74  
 types of in history IV sect. 1 (95-  
 102), 139n.
- 'explanation', common use of 98-9,  
 111-12, 128, 136, 137-9, see  
 'because'
- explanation sketch (Hempel) 108
- Fain, H. 28, 32, 36, 132, 133, 134,  
 220
- Febvre, L. 17
- Feuer, L. S. 174, 177, 220, 222
- Fisher, H. A. L. 211, 220
- free will 12-13, 104-5, v sect. 6  
 (180-7)
- Freeman, A. E. 24
- future:  
 knowledge of, contrasted with that  
 of past II sect. 5 (58-62)  
 statements about 40, 46
- Gallie, W. B. x, 23, 25, 29, 32, 34,  
 37, 65, 88, 96, 130, 132, 220
- Gardiner, P. 23, 31, 32, 96, 102,  
 103, 105, 110, 111, 115, 120, 121,  
 152, 153, 159, 165, 189, 220
- Gellner, E. 122, 168, 172, 220
- generalisations in history 30-1, 34-  
 5, 36-7, 74, 111, 116, 153, 154;  
 see laws  
 compared with canons of taste  
 114-15
- Geyl, P. 58, 220
- Gibbon 15
- Ginsberg, M. 168, 220
- Goldstein, L. J. 40, 41, 53, 69, 220
- Gosse, E. 54, 221
- Gosse, P. 54
- Green, J. R. 17, 221
- Hale, J. R. 22n., 221
- Hampshire, S. 207, 221
- Hart, H. L. A. 145, 147, 221
- Hayek, F. A. von 168-70, 171, 182,  
 221
- Hegel 8, 9, 92, 110, 177, 181, 210
- Hempel, C. J. 23, 29-31, 37, 64, 96,  
 103, 105, 108, 110, 121, 152, 221

- Herodotus 13  
hindsight 58, 87, 187  
historical materialism 74, 143, 174-80, 211  
historical method, Collingwood's rules of 36  
history I sect. 2 (13-22)  
  and aesthetic values 206-8  
  and legal thinking 139, 145, 147  
  and literature 6, 15, 65-6, 87-8, 96-7, 133  
  and natural and social science 5-6, 6-7, 30-1, 193, 195-6  
  and prophecy (prediction) II sect. 5 (58-62)  
  and sociology 35, 36-7, 108  
  as an art 6  
  as factual VI sect. 2 (188-98)  
  autonomy of 8, 25, 27, 61-2, 82, 89, 91  
  concerned with individual 30, 35, 37, 118-19, 200  
  contemporary 34, 58, 147  
  general and specialised 18, 84, 178-80  
  historians on 33-7  
  history of 14-17  
  identification with philosophy 24, 91  
  moral judgement in 24, 35, 124-5, VI sect. 3 (198-210)  
  narrative and analytical 19-22, 83, 130-1, 136  
  philosophy of I sect. I (4-13), and *passim*  
  practical attitudes in 123-5  
  professional standards in 82, 92  
  value neutrality of VI sect. 2 (188-98)  
  varieties of 17-19, 128  
  Whig interpretation of 16, 33, 34, 35, 58, 87, 212-13  
'history':  
  ambiguity of 9-13, 189  
  dictionary definition of 13  
Hobbes 208  
Honoré, A. M. 145, 147, 201  
Hospers, J. 119, 145, 148, 221  
Hume 15, 16, 45, 49, 144, 145, 152, 209, 221  
idealist (autonomist) philosophy of history 23, 24-9  
importance in history III sect. 4 (85-8), 159, 180  
individualism, methodological 76-7, 127-8, 167-74  
  moral 170-1, 173, 200  
interpretation 20, 21, IV sect. I (95-102)  
intuitive knowledge of past 27-8, 64-5; *see* memory  
judgement, historical 77, 91, 93, 115; contrasted with evaluation 115, 163, 196-7  
  causal V sect. 3 (151-8)  
Kant 4, 9, 125, 179, 203, 204  
knowledge of past II *passim*  
Kuhn, T. S. 80, 212-13, 221  
law explanation *see* explanation  
laws:  
  availability of in history 110-15  
  specifically historical 110  
  universal and statistical 105-6  
Leff, G. 15, 34, 35, 36, 37, 57, 58, 65, 96, 111, 130, 174, 221  
legal and historical thinking 139, 145, 147  
Lenné 34  
Livy 15  
logic of the situation (Popper) 29, 32, 120, 125  
Lucas, P. G. 12, 96, 102, 221  
Maclay, T. B. 15, 16  
McCullagh, C. B. 128, 129, 221  
Mackie, J. L. 145, 221  
Maitland, F. W. 15  
Mandelbaum, M. 72, 152, 153, 154, 168, 172, 221  
Marrou, H. -I. 14, 221  
Marwick, A. 22n., 74, 84, 221  
Marx 8, 9, 110, 169, 170, 174-80, 221-2



- Marxism 12, 81, 92-4, 174-80, 210  
 materialism, historical 74, 143, 174-80, 211  
 mathematics, history of 211-12  
 Meiland, J. W. 40, 41, 53, 69, 72, 222  
 memory 28, 41-2, II sect. 2 (45-51), 65, 131-2  
 Meyer, E. 26  
 Mill, J. S. 162, 170, 171, 207, 222  
 Nagel, E. 77, 168, 169, 172, 173, 222  
 Namier, L. 15, 58, 84  
 narrative as explanatory 24, 32, 33-4, 97, 102, IV sect. 4 (128-39)  
 Nash, R. H. 70, 73n., 222  
 necessity v sect. 6 (180-7)  
 Niebuhr, B. G. 16  
 Nowell-Smith, P. H. 31, 32, 36, 40, 42, 96, 111, 222  
 Oakeshott, M. 10-11, 23, 24, 25, 32, 34, 37, 40, 96, 111, 124, 158, 222  
 'objective', meanings of 70-2  
 objectivity 17-18  
     and causes in history v *esp.* sect. 4 and 5  
     and selective reporting III (69-94); logical and practical questions 72; disagreement among historians 73-4; objective historical consciousness 81-2; objectivity in history and morality 88-90  
     and values vi *passim*  
     variety of problems concerning 69-70  
 observation II *esp.* sect. 2 (45-51)  
 partiality 72  
 past, actions in the II sect. 6 (63-6)  
     as it really was 11, 16, 57-8  
     concept of 40  
     existence of II sect. 3 (51-5)  
     knowledge of II *passim*; contrasted with knowledge of future II sect. 5 (58-63)  
     scepticism about II *esp.* sect. 1-3 (39-55)  
     statements about, how to be understood 42-4; and those about future 46; compared with those about present 56-7  
 Pears, D. 43, 222  
 philosophical differences among historians 81-3, 92-4  
 philosophy, autonomy of 8  
     history of 121-3, 179-80  
 philosophy of history I sect. I (4-13), and *passim*  
     analytical and substantive (critical and speculative) 8-9, 10-13  
     and philosophy of mind II sect. 6 (63-6)  
     and philosophy of science 4  
     as 'meta-' (second order) study 6-7  
     assimilationist (positivist) 23, 29-33  
     autonomist (idealist) 23, 24-9  
 Pirenne, H. 74  
 Plamenatz, J. 174, 222  
 Plato 67, 210  
 Plekhanov, G. 174, 176, 178, 179, 222  
 Plumb, J. H. 7, 222  
 Popper, K. R. 2, 23, 29-31, 35, 78-81, 83, 95, 96, 110, 120, 125, 129, 168, 170-4, 212, 222  
 prediction II sect. 5 (58-63), and explanation 30, 129  
 probability II sect. 7 (66-8)  
 progress VI sect. 4 (210-18)  
 psychologism 167-74  
 purposive explanation *see* explanation, rational  
 Ranke, L. von 14, 15, 16, 17, 222  
 rational explanation *see* explanation  
 rationality, assumption of 125-7  
 reasons, compared and contrasted with causes 142, 164-7, 185  
 'relative', meaning of 72  
 relativity, and objectivity in history 72, 80-1, 83, 89, 159, and III *passim*  
     and explanation in history 134-6,

- v *esp.* sect. 4
- religious differences among historians 73, 90-2
- Renier, G. J. 15, 25, 30, 34, 36, 37, 54, 96, 103, 123, 132, 222
- Robertson 15
- Russell, B. 53-4, 222
- Ryle, G. 63, 222
- science, history of 179-80, 212-13
- Scott, Walter 15
- Scriven, M. 144, 223
- selection 18, 38, 40, III *passim*  
 absolute basis for 85-8  
 in science and history 79-85
- Snow, C. P. 156
- statements, historical (about the past) II *passim*
- Strawson, P. F. 207, 223
- Stubbs, W. 14
- 'subjective', meanings of 70-2
- subjectivism, significance of 78-9
- Tacitus 198
- Taine 144
- Tawney, R. H. 17
- Taylor, A. J. P. 13, 103, 115, 141-2, 145, 149, 190, 223
- technology, history of 214
- testimony 41-2, II sect. 2 (45-51)
- Thomson, D. 22n., 141, 142, 147, 223
- Thucydides 140-1, 223
- Tolstoy, L. 171
- Toynbee, A. 8, 9, 110, 210, 223
- Trevelyan, G. M. 15, 17, 223
- truth 11, 66-8, 131-2  
 impossibility of whole truth III sect. 2 (73-9)
- values 35, VI *passim*  
 aesthetic '206-8  
 intellectual 188, 194-5  
 moral 198-206  
 religious 208-10
- Vico 210
- Voltaire 215
- Walsh, W. H. x, 2, 9, 23, 81-2, 83, 93, 111, 223
- Watkins, J. W. N. 168, 172, 223
- Whig interpretation of history 16, 33, 34, 35, 58, 87, 212-13
- White, M. 23, 33, 37, 96, 105, 107, 108-10, 115, 121, 159, 162, 163, 164, 223
- Windelband, W. 30
- Wisdom, J. 52, 223
- Wisdom, J. O. 122, 223
- Wright, G. H. von 23, 33, 223