of goal approaches, within 3 sec. of a bar press, were 1.63 for the E group and 1.13 for the C group. None of these differences approached significance.

Discussion

This study failed to find secondary reinforcing effects in the absence of discriminative effects of a stimulus. This finding would be expected in the light of the work of Schoenfeld, Antonitis, & Bersh (1950) as well as of Dinsmoor (1952), Coate (1956) and others.

A ready explanation of the failure of this study to replicate the findings of Ratner is not apparent.

Ratner's brief report does not mention on what basis the Ss were divided for testing. A random division could possibly have capriciously resulted in a more active control group whose generalized level of goal responses cancelled out the effects of any discriminative operant in the experimental group. The matching of Ss on the basis of degree of discriminative control, in the present study, should have made the occurrence of this unlikely here.

Myers (1958) has suggested that the Ratner results might indicate that the S^D effects extinguished before the S^R effects. Although some evidence indicates this is not likely (Dinsmoor, 1952; Coate, 1956) this possibility has not, as yet, received adequate test. The present results would argue against Myer's suggestion, however, and lend support to the general line of evidence that points to the necessity of discriminative effects of a stimulus as a precondition to any reinforcing effects it might show.

References

- COATE, W. B. Weakening of conditioned bar-pressing by prior extinction of its subsequent discriminated operant. *J. comp. physiol. Psychol.*, 1956, 49, 135-138.
- DINSMOOR, J. A. Resistance to extinction following periodic reinforcement in the presence of a discriminative stimulus. *J. comp. physiol. Psychol.*, 1952, 45, 31-35.
- KELLER, F. S., & SCHOENFELD, W. N. *Principles of psychology*. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1950.
- MYERS, J. L. Secondary reinforcements: a review of recent experimentation. *Psychol. Bull.*, 1958, 55, 284-301.
- RATNER, S. C. Reinforcing and discriminative properties of the click in a Skinner box. *Psychol. Rep.*, 1956, 2, 332.
- SCHOENFELD, W. N., ANTONITIS, J. J., & BERSH, P. J. A preliminary study of training conditions necessary for secondary reinforcement. *J. exp. Psychol.*, 1950, 40, 40-45.
- ZIMMERMAN, D. W. Sustained performance in rats based on secondary reinforcement. *J. comp. physiol. Psychol.*, 1959, 52, 353-358.

Note

1. The authors are grateful for the invaluable assistance of Professor J. D. Keehn on this project.

Erratum

BOSSOM, J. The effect of brain lesions on prism-adaptation in monkey. *Psychon. Sci.*, 1965, 2, 45-46.—As most readers will probably have recognized, the two figures (but not their legends) were, regrettably, reversed. The picture appearing in Fig. 1 should have been in Fig. 2, and vice versa.—Editor.